

Faculty of Philosophy in Sarajevo

**A FESTSCHRIFT
FOR
PROFESSOR
SNEŽANA BILBIJA**

Sarajevo 2014

A FESTSCHRIFT FOR PROFESSOR SNEŽANA BILBIJA/
ZBORNİK RADOVA U ČAST PROFESORICE SNEŽANE BILBIJE

Za izdavača/For the Publisher:
Prof. dr. Salih Fočo

Glavni i odgovorni urednik/Editor-in-Chief:
Merima Osmankadić

Uređivački odbor/Editorial Board:
Nedžad Leko
Amira Sadiković
Sanja Šoštarić
Ksenija Kondali

UDK/UDC:
Senija Mujić

Izdavač/Publisher:
Filozofski fakultet u Sarajevu/
Faculty of Philosophy in Sarajevo

Sarajevo, 2014.

Elektronsko izdanje/Electronic edition

CIP - Katalogizacija u publikaciji
Nacionalna i univerzitetska biblioteka
Bosne i Hercegovine, Sarajevo

811.111(082)
929 Bilbija S.(082)

A FESTSCHRIFT for professor Snežana Bilbija
[Elektronski izvor] / [glavni i odgovorni urednik,
editor-in-chief Merima Osmankadić]. - Sarajevo :
Filozofski fakultet, 2014. - 1 elektronski optički disk
(CD-ROM) : tekst, slike ; 12 cm

Način pristupa (URL):
<http://www.ff-eizdavastvo.ba/Knjige.aspx>. - Nasl.
s naslovnog ekrana.

ISBN 978-9958-625-47-3
COBISS.BH-ID 21177350

Filozofski fakultet u Sarajevu

**ZBORNİK RADOVA
U ČAST
PROFESORICE
SNEŽANE BILBIJE**

Sarajevo, 2014.

Contents

Merima Osmankadić
PREDGOVOR/FOREWORD vii

Prof. dr. Snežana Bilbija – biography and bibliography xiv

Part one

Ifeta Čirić-Fazlija
MEMORY EDITING AND FRAGMENTED IDENTITY IN
SAMUEL BECKETT'S *KRAPP'S LAST TAPE*, A SEMIOTIC
APPROACH 3

Srebren Dizdar
CAN FICTION BE CONSIDERED AS A NEW FORM OF
LITERARY EXPRESSION? 15

Lejla Mulalić
HISTORY, HERITAGE AND LITERARY THEORY IN HILARY
MANTEL'S *BRING UP THE BODIES* 27

Zvonimir Radeljković
CULTURAL ENCOUNTERS: BOSNIAN/CROATIAN/SERBIAN
WRITERS AND AMERICA 39

Sanja Šoštarić
REPRESENTATIONS OF AFRICAN-AMERICANS IN
AMERICAN CINEMA 51

Part two

Kamiah Arnaut-Karović
A BRIEF SURVEY ON THE GRAMMATICAL CATEGORY OF
–EN/–ED PARTICIPLES 73

Željka Babić
COMPUTER-BASED ASSESSMENT – A PERSONAL VIEW 91

Adi Fejzić PRAGMATIC INTERPRETATION OF SOCIAL CLASS AS A SOCIOLINGUISTIC VARIABLE OF TV COMEDY	101
Ljerka Jeftić MANAGEMENT OF KNOWLEDGE IN OBAMA'S SPEECH ON SYRIA	111
Olja Jojić COMPARATIVE CONSTRUCTIONS AS A RESOURCE FOR AGGRESSIVE HUMOR	125
Nejla Kalajđžisalihović THREATENING LANGUAGE IN THREAT LETTERS	139
Maja Kujundžić THE USE OF NON-FINITE PASSIVES IN THE BRITISH DAILY PRESS: SOCIOLINGUISTIC AND PRAGMATIC APPROACH	149
Tatjana Marjanović THEMATIC STRUCTURE, ONE STORY AND TWO VERY DIFFERENT LANGUAGES	163
Jelena Marković ON THE INTERPRETIVE PROGRESSIVE IN ACADEMIC ENGLISH	177
Melisa Okičić ON REFORM OF <i>SHALL</i> IN LEGAL ENGLISH	191
Merima Osmankadić THE STRATEGY OF NEGATIVE OTHER-PRESENTATION IN POLITICAL DISCOURSE	205
Amira Sadiković and Selma Đuliman DIZDAR AND JONES: CONGRUENCE OF SOUND, SIGN AND MEANING	221
Nataša Stojaković MOOD AND TENSE IN HYPOTHETICAL NARRATIVE IN THE PERIOD OF MODERN ENGLISH	231
Edina Špago-Ćumurija HYBRIDITY IN GLOBAL COMMUNICATION: LANGUAGE OF CNN FINANCIAL ADVERTISEMENTS	249

PREDGOVOR

Ovaj zbornik radova predstavlja izraz najdubljeg poštovanja i zahvalnosti koje kao studenti i kolege osjećamo prema profesorici Snežani Bilbiji. Također, ovim zbornikom želimo da obilježimo 42 godine rada i 65 godina života profesorice Bilbije, koje je najvećim dijelom provela upravo na Odsjeku za anglistiku Filozofskog fakulteta u Sarajevu.

Gotovo svi koji se bave anglistikom u Bosni i Hercegovini znaju ko je profesorica Bilbija. Ime profesorice Bilbije stoji kao zajednički nazivnik na brojnim lingvističkim konferencijama i stručnim skupovima širom regije. Ona je most koji spaja i ono za što često mislimo da je nespojivo. Kada je ideja o objavljivanju ovakvog jednog zbornika bila tek u začetku, svi s kojima sam razgovarala o mogućnosti učestvovanja u ovom projektu bili su bez izuzetka oduševljeni njime. Nažalost, morali smo na neki način ograničiti učešće u ovom zborniku, i izbor je pao na članove Odsjeka za anglistiku u Sarajevu i doktorande profesorice Bilbije, što je u krajnjem ishodu rezultiralo s 19 radova iz različitih filoloških disciplina. Najprimjereniji način izražavanja zahvalnosti prema svome mentoru i kolegi u akademskoj zajednici jeste objavljivanje naučnih radova u njegovu ili njenu čast. Profesorica Bilbija je mnoge od nas zadužila svojom naučnom kompetencijom, erudicijom, entuzijazmom, ljubavlju prema lingvistici, zalaganjem za dobrobit svog matičnog Odsjeka, a nadasve svojom ljudskošću. Ponosna sam što sam bila doktorand profesorice Bilbije i njen asistent, i sretna sam što mi se pružila prilika da zajedno s kolegicama i kolegama priredim ovaj zbornik.

Zbornik u čast profesorice Bilbije se sastoji od radova članova Odsjeka za anglistiku u Sarajevu kao i od radova doktoranada profesorice Bilbije sa univerziteta širom Bosne i Hercegovine. Zbornik smo podijelili u dva dijela: u prvom dijelu nalaze se radovi iz polja književno-historijskih nauka i kulturoloških studija, dok drugi dio sadrži radove iz različitih lingvističkih disciplina.

FOREWORD

This festschrift is an expression of the deepest respect and gratitude that we have for Professor Snežana Bilbija, as her students and colleagues. With this festschrift, we would also like to celebrate Professor Bilbija's 42 years of academic career and 65 years of life, which for the most part she has spent at the English Department of the Faculty of Philosophy in Sarajevo.

Almost everyone in Bosnia and Herzegovina whose academic interest is English linguistics knows who Professor Bilbija is. The name of Professor Bilbija is a common denominator of numerous linguistic conferences and symposia throughout the region. She is a bridge that connects what we often think cannot be connected. When the idea of publishing such a festschrift was merely in its inception, everyone I talked to about the possibility of participating in this project was delighted without exception. Regrettably, we had to limit the participation in this festschrift somehow, and it was decided to include the members of the English Department in Sarajevo and her doctoral students, which eventually resulted in 19 contributions from different philological disciplines. The most fitting tribute to one's supervisor and colleague in the academia is to publish an article in his or her honour. Many of us are in Professor Bilbija's debt for her professional competence, erudition, enthusiasm, love of linguistics, dedication to the well-being of her Department, and, above all, her humanity. I am proud to have been Professor Bilbija's doctoral student and assistant, and I am happy to have had the opportunity to assemble this festschrift together with my colleagues.

The festschrift for Professor Bilbija consists of contributions by the members of the English Department in Sarajevo as well as contributions by her doctoral students from universities throughout Bosnia and Herzegovina. We have organised the festschrift in two parts: the first part contains articles from the field of literary, historical and cultural studies, while the second part contains articles on various linguistic disciplines.

U prvom dijelu zbornika susrećemo se sa širokom lepezom radova koji se bave različitim aspektima književnosti, historije, kulture i filma. Tako Ifeta Čirić-Fazlija u svome radu razmatra kako pomoćna scenska sredstva mogu funkcionirati kao znak nestabilnog identiteta, a njena analiza zasniva se na Beckettovoj drami *Krappova posljednja vrpca* kao i Egoyanovoj filmskoj adaptaciji te jednočinke. Srebren Dizdar bavi se u svome radu novim književnim (pod)žanrom kojeg naziva „pikcija“ – odnosno spoj svih vrsta piktoralnih iskaza sa fikcijskim narativima i tako otvara vrata jednom novom pristupu književnom djelu, kao i tekstu uopće. U radu Lejle Mulalić susrećemo se s pričom o vezi kralja Henrija VIII i Anne Boleyn, ovaj put preko romana *Bring Up the Bodies* autorice Hilary Mantel, koji „manipuliše iskustvenim i performativnim aspektom kulturne i historijske baštine, dok istovremeno svjesno crpi interpretativne resurse novohistoricističke misli.“ Zvonimir Radeljković piše o prijevodima američke književnosti na bosanski/hrvatski/srpski od 1875 do danas, kao i o njihovom utjecaju na književnost na ovim prostorima. Rad Sanje Šošarić bavi se predstavljanjem Afroamerikanaca u američkom filmu u 20. stoljeću, i to od početka do kasnih 80-ih godina.

U drugom dijelu zbornika nalaze se radovi koji imaju različite predmete proučavanja i rezultat su različitih teorijsko-metodoloških pristupa lingvistici. Kamiah Arnaut-Karović govori o morfosintaksičkim i semantičkim svojstvima *-en/-ed* participa u engleskom jeziku, odnosno o predikativnoj i atributivnoj funkciji ovih participa. Željka Babić nas u svome radu upoznaje s vrednovanjem pomoću kompjutera i razmatra mogućnosti primjene ovakve vrste testiranja u Bosni i Hercegovini kada je u pitanju učenje engleskog kao stranog jezika. Rad Adija Fejzića „bavi se konceptom društvene klase kao značajne sociolingvističke varijable TV komedije“ i ukazuje na značajnu ulogu ove varijable u ustanovljavanju koncepta ovakvih emisija i stvaranju diskursa TV komedije. Ljerka Jeftić analizira odabrane dijelove govora Baracka Obame unutar okvira socio-kognitivnog pristupa u kritičkoj analizi diskursa s ciljem da otkrije načine izražavanja, impliciranja i presuponiranja znanja. U radu Olje Jojić razmatra se upotreba poredbenih struktura u konstruisanim razgovorima humorističkih serija, odnosno „načini interakcije poredbenih konstrukcija sa kontekstom koji rezultiraju agresivnim oblicima humora.“ Nejlja Kalajdzisalihović razmatra zajednička i pojedinačna svojstva u prijetećim pismima koja se odnose na izbor punoznačnih i nepunoznačnih leksema i znakova kojim se izražava prijetnja, kao i pitanja koja se odnose na primaoca prijeteće poruke, a vezano za lokucijske, ilokucijske i perlokucijske aspekte sadržaja prijeteće poruke. Rad Maje Kujundžić bazira se na teoriji da je jezična upotreba u tekstu uvjetovana čitalačkom publikom kojoj je namijenjen, pa se tako polazi od pretpostavke da će frekventnost upotrebe pasiva kao formalnog

In the first part of the festschrift we find a wide variety of contributions that deal with different aspects of literature, history, culture and film. Thus, Ifeta Čirić-Fazlija examines in her paper how theatrical props may function as signs of volatile identity, and her analysis is based on Beckett's play *Krapp's Last Tape*, as well as on Egoyan's film adaptation of this one-act play. Srebrn Dizdar deals in his paper with a new literary (sub)genre, termed 'piction' – i.e. a hybrid of all sorts of pictorial expressions and fictional narratives, and thus opens the door to a new approach to literary work, and text in general. In the article by Lejla Mulalić we find the story of the relationship of King Henry VIII and Anne Boleyn, this time through Hilary Mantel's novel *Bring Up the Bodies*, which "foregrounds the experiential and performative energy of heritage, while consciously drawing on certain strands of New Historicist thought." Zvonimir Radeljković writes about translations of American literature into Bosnian/Croatian/Serbian from 1875 to the present day as well as their influence on the literature of this region. The contribution by Sanja Šoštarić deals with the representation of African-Americans in American film from the beginning of the 20th century to the late 1980s.

The second part of the festschrift comprises contributions which investigate different issues and are results of different theoretical and methodological approaches to linguistics. Kamiah Arnaut-Karović discusses morphosyntactic and semantic properties of *-en/-ed* participles in the English language, i.e. the predicative and attributive functions of these participles. Željka Babić introduces us to computer-based assessment and examines the possibility of applying this type of testing in teaching English as a foreign language in Bosnia and Herzegovina. Adi Fejzić's contribution "deals with the concept of social class as an important sociolinguistic variable of TV comedy" and suggests that this variable has played an important role in establishing the concept of this type of TV shows and the discourse of TV comedy. Ljerka Jeftić analyses prominent fragments from a speech by Barack Obama within the framework of sociocognitive approach to Critical Discourse Analysis in order to identify how knowledge is expressed, implied or presupposed. Olja Jojić's article examines the use of comparative constructions in scripted sitcom conversations, specifically, "the ways comparative constructions interact with context to generate aggressive forms of conversational humor." Nejla Kalajdzisalihović examines some common and specific properties of threat letters involving the choice of functional and non-functional lexemes, and signs used to express threat, as well as some issues regarding the receiver of a threat message in relation to locutionary, illocutionary and perlocutionary aspects of the content of a threat message. Maja Kujundžić's contribution is based on the theory that the language use in a text is conditioned by the audience for which it is intended, and therefore the initial hypothesis is that the frequency of use of

jezičnog stila biti uvjetovana socioekonomskim profilom čitalačke publike analiziranih primjeraka britanske dnevne štampe. Tatjana Marjanović istražuje mogućnost primjene modela tematske strukture, koji se tipično primjenjuje na engleski jezik, na srpskom kao jeziku sa slobodnim redom riječi. Rad Jelene Marković analizira tzv. epistemičku upotrebu progresivnog glagolskog oblika u akademskom engleskom jeziku i zaključuje da je ova upotreba u potpunosti opravdana u kontekstu akademskog metajezika, gdje subjektivno produžava glagolsku situaciju, a samim tim je i naglašava. Melisa Okičić u svome radu analizira modalni glagol *shall* u pravnom registru, čija je upotreba tokom proteklih trideset godina znatno reducirana, što je dovelo do kreiranja tzv. *shall-free* verzije pravnog engleskog. Merima Osmankadić analizira izvještaje Visokog predstavnika u Bosni i Hercegovini s ciljem da pokaže kako inherentno negativne leksičke jedinice mogu da se koriste kao sredstva za postizanje opće strategije predstavljanja sebe u pozitivnom svjetlu i drugog u negativnom svjetlu u političkom diskursu. Rad Amire Sadiković i Selme Đuliman svojom analizom uspješno opovrgava tezu o neprevodivosti poezije Maka Dizdara na primjeru odabranih dijelova prijevoda Francisa R. Jonesa, koji je na engleski preveo Dizdarovog *Kamenog spavača*. Rad Nataše Stojaković bavi se upotrebom glagolskog načina i vremena u hipotetičkom pričanju tokom perioda modernog engleskog, pri čemu se koriste primjeri od prve polovine 16. do početka 21. stoljeća da bi se istražilo šta hipotetičko pričanje može pokazati u pogledu promjena koje su se dogodile u glagolskom sistemu engleskog jezika. Edina Špago-Ćumurija se u svome radu bavi jezikom reklama o finansijama na CNN-u, pri čemu analizira lingvistički zanimljivu pojavu u reklamiranju, a to su znakovi čija se konvencionalna značenja javljaju u novom kontekstu, navodeći primatelje poruke na nove veze u značenju i asocijacijama.

Na kraju ovog predgovora zahvalila bih se članovima Uređivačkog odbora prof. dr. Nedžad Leki, doc. dr. Amiri Sadiković, prof. dr. Sanji Šoštarić i doc. dr. Kseniji Kondali na pomoći pri uređivanju ovog zbornika. Posebnu zahvalnost dugujem kolegici dr. Nataši Stojaković na tehničkom uređenju zbornika. I posljednje, ali najvažnije, zahvaljujem se još jednom profesorici Snežani Bilbiji za njen predani rad.

Merima Osmankadić

the passive as a feature of formal style will be conditioned by the socioeconomic profile of the reading audience of the British daily newspaper issues analysed. Tatjana Marjanović explores the possibility of applying the model of thematic structure, which has been typically applied to English, to Serbian as a language with free word order. The contribution by Jelena Marković analyses the so-called epistemic use of progressive verb forms in academic English and concludes that this use is entirely justified in the context of academic meta-language, where it subjectively extends a verbal situation, which is thus also emphasised. Melisa Okičić examines the modal verb *shall* in the legal register, the use of which has been significantly reduced in the last thirty years, thus leading to the creation of the so-called *shall-free* version of legal English. Merima Osmankadić analyses reports by the High Representative in Bosnia and Herzegovina in order to demonstrate how inherently negative lexical items can be used as means of achieving the overall strategy of positive self-presentation and negative other-presentation in political discourse. The analysis in the article by Amira Sadiković and Selma Đuliman successfully refutes the thesis that the poetry of Mak Dizdar is untranslatable on the example of a selection from a translation by Francis R. Jones, who translated Dizdar's *Stone Sleeper* into English. The contribution by Nataša Stojaković deals with the use of mood and tense in hypothetical narrative in the period of Modern English using examples from the first half of the 16th century to the beginning of the 21st century in order to explore what hypothetical narrative may show in respect to the changes that took place in the verb system of English. Edina Špago-Ćumurija's article deals with the language of financial advertising on CNN and analyses a linguistically interesting phenomenon in advertising, which is signs whose conventional meanings appear in a new context and induce the receiver of the message to new links in meaning and associations.

At the end of this foreword, I would like to thank the members of the Editorial Board, Prof. Nedžad Leko, Dr. Amira Sadiković, Prof. Sanja Šoštarić and Dr. Ksenija Kondali for their help in preparing this festschrift. I particularly wish to thank my colleague Dr. Nataša Stojaković for the technical preparation of the festschrift. And finally, but above all, I wish to thank Professor Snežana Bilbija once more for her dedicated work.

Merima Osmankadić

Prof. dr. Snežana Bilbija – biografija i bibliografija

Prof. dr. Snežana Bilbija rođena je 6.1.1949. u Zemunu. Diplomirala je na Odsjeku za engleski jezik i književnost na Filozofskom fakultetu u Sarajevu 1972. godine. Odbranila je magistarsku tezu pod nazivom *Odstupanje od prelaznosti kod engleskih glagola*, pod mentorstvom prof. dr. Ranka Bugarskog, na Filološkom fakultetu u Beogradu 1977. godine i stekla zvanje magistra filoloških nauka. Doktorsku disertaciju pod nazivom *Pronominalni anaforički proces u savremenom engleskom jeziku*, opet pod mentorstvom prof. dr. Ranka Bugarskog, odbranila je na Filološkom fakultetu u Beogradu 1983. godine.

Na Odsjeku za engleski jezik i književnost Filozofskog fakulteta u Sarajevu počinje da radi kao stručni saradnik 1972. godine, da bi 1973. bila izabrana u zvanje asistenta, a 1977. u zvanje višeg asistenta. U zvanje docenta biva izabrana 1983. godine, 1992. u vanrednog, a 2003. u redovnog profesora.

Profesorica Snežana Bilbija je u stalnom radnom odnosu na Filozofskom fakultetu u Sarajevu bila od 1972. do 1994. godine, i ponovo od 2003. do danas. Na Filozofskom fakultetu u Nikšiću Univerziteta u Podgorici radila je od 1995. do 2000. godine, a na Filozofskom fakultetu Univerziteta u Istočnom Sarajevu od 2000. do 2003. godine. Gostovala je kao predavač na Univerzitetu u Istočnom Sarajevu, Univerzitetu u Banjoj Luci, Univerzitetu „Džemal Bijedić“ u Mostaru i Međunarodnom univerzitetu Burch u Sarajevu.

Profesorica Bilbija je dosad uspješno izvela 12 doktoranada i 19 magistranata na Univerzitetu u Sarajevu, Univerzitetu u Istočnom Sarajevu, Univerzitetu u Banjoj Luci i Univerzitetu „Džemal Bijedić“ u Mostaru.

Profesorica Bilbija bila je član Sarajevskog lingvističkog kružoka (SALK-a) od 1986. do 1989. godine. Član je redakcije *Radovi Filozofskog fakulteta* u Istočnom Sarajevu, kao i Udruženja za primijenjenu lingvistiku u Bosni i Hercegovini. Prof. dr. Snežana Bilbija bavi se semantikom, pragmatikom i sociolingvistikom, i objavljuje radove iz tih oblasti. Učestvovala je s izlaganjima na 18 naučnih konferencija u Bosni i Hercegovini i inostranstvu.

Professor Snežana Bilbija – biography and bibliography

Prof. Snežana Bilbija was born on 6.1.1949 in Zemun. She graduated from the Department of English Language and Literature of the Faculty of Philosophy in Sarajevo in 1972. She defended her master's thesis titled *Odstupanje od prelaznosti kod engleskih glagola*, under the supervision of Prof. Ranko Bugarski, at the Faculty of Philology in Belgrade in 1977 and acquired the degree of Master of humanities in philology. She defended her doctoral thesis titled *Pronominalni anaforički proces u savremenom engleskom jeziku*, again under the supervision of Prof. Ranko Bugarski, at the Faculty of Philology in Belgrade in 1983.

She started working at the Department of English Language and Literature of the Faculty of Philosophy in Sarajevo as an assistant in 1972, and was promoted to a teaching assistant in 1973, and in 1977 to a senior teaching assistant. She became an assistant professor in 1983, an associate professor in 1992 and a full professor in 2003.

Prof. Snežana Bilbija was an employee of the Faculty of Philosophy in Sarajevo from 1972 to 1994, and so she has been from 2003 to the present day.

At the Faculty of Philosophy in Nikšić, University of Podgorica, she was employed from 1995 to 2000, and at the Faculty of Philosophy, University of East Sarajevo, from 2000 to 2003. She was or has been a visiting professor at the University of East Sarajevo, University of Banja Luka, University "Džemal Bijedić" in Mostar and International Burch University in Sarajevo.

Professor Bilbija has successfully supervised 12 doctoral students and 19 MA students at the University of Sarajevo, University of East Sarajevo, University of Banja Luka and University "Džemal Bijedić" in Mostar.

Professor Bilbija was a member of the Sarajevo Linguistic Circle from 1986 to 1989. She is a member of the editorial board of the *Papers of the Faculty of Philosophy* in East Sarajevo, and the Association for Applied Linguistics in Bosnia and Herzegovina. Prof. Snežana Bilbija's academic interests are semantics, pragmatics and sociolinguistics, and she has published papers from these areas. She has presented papers at 18 conferences in Bosnia and Herzegovina and abroad.

Bibliografija/Bibliography

Knjige/Books

Pronominalni anaforički odnos u savremenom engleskom jeziku. Sarajevo: Monografije Filozofskog fakulteta 2, 1990.

Introducing Semantics. Banja Luka: Komunikološki fakultet, 2000.

Radovi/Articles (1998-2013)

Neodređena singularna specifična referencija imeničke sintagme u srpskom jeziku posmatrane kroz njen prevod na engleski. *Riječ* IV/1, 22-31, Nikšić, 1998.

Mogućnost pomjeranja negacije u engleskom i srpskom jeziku. *Kontrastivna jezička istraživanja*, 113-119, Novi Sad, 1999.

Definitizacija kod imenica u srpskom posmatrana kroz engleske prevode. U Slavica Perović (Ur.). *Zbornik radova Vladimiru Sekuliću u čast* (str. 67-79). Podgorica: Institut za strane jezike, Univerzitet Crne Gore, 1999.

Neke sintaksičke i semantičke osobenosti engleskih poslovice. *Radovi Filozofskog fakulteta u Istočnom Sarajevu* 2 (str. 45-53). Istočno Sarajevo, 2000.

Evropski engleski u evropskom protektoratu. *Srpski jezik*, VII/1-2, 463-447, Beograd, 2002.

Izražavanje aproksimacije količine u srpskom jeziku. U Duška Klikovac & Katarina Rasulić (Ur.). *Jezik, duštvo, saznanje, Profesoru Bugarskom od njegovih studenata* (str. 135-149). Beograd: Filološki fakultet Univerziteta u Beogradu, 2003.

Pragmatic Analysis of Some of the Billboard Messages (Communicated to the Citizens of Sarajevo by the International Community in Bosnia-Herzegovina. U P. Cap & P. Stalmaszczyk (Ur.). *Research in Language*, Vol. 2 (str. 163-173). Lodz: Lodz University Press, 2004.

Linguistic and Pragmatic Properties of the Discourse of the High Representative in the Republic of Bosnia and Herzegovina. U L. E. Breivik & O. Øverland (Ur.). *The Power of Language: A Collection of Essays* (str. 53-63). Oslo: Novus Press, 2005.

Pragmatic Interpretations of Socio-Political Discourse in Post-Dayton Bosnia. U Katarina Rasulić & Ivana Trbojević (Ur.). *English Language and Literature*

Studies: Interfaces and Integrations (ELLSII 75 Proceedings), Vol. 1 (str. 413-417). Beograd: Filološki fakultet Univerziteta u Beogradu, 2006.

Politika u jeziku: rečeno i neiskazano. *Jezik, književnost, politika*, 35-43, Niš, 2007.

The Role of Hedges in Political Discourse. U Katarina Rasulić & Ivana Trbojević (Ur.). *English Language and Literature Studies: Structures across Cultures* (ELLSSAC Proceedings), Vol. 1 (499-509). Beograd: Filološki fakultet Univerziteta u Beogradu, 2008.

What Will the OHR Discourse Be Remembered By? U Aleksandra Jovanović & al (Ur.). *Belgrade English Language and Literature Studies* (BELLS), Vol. 1, 97-109, Beograd: Filološki fakultet Univerziteta u Beogradu, 2009.

Getting the Reference Across in English: How Do We Know Who or What is Being Talked About? U *Interdisciplinarnost i jedinstvo savremene nauke* (Zbornik radova sa naučnog skupa) (str. 111-123), Pale, 2010.

Linguistic Crafting of the Current World Economic Crisis. U Milica Spremić & Biljana Đorić-Francuski (Ur.). *English Language and Literature Studies: Image, Identity, Reality* (ELLSIIR Proceedings) (str. 43-51). Beograd: Filološki fakultet Univerziteta u Beogradu, 2011.

The Pragmatic Role of Vague Meanings in the EU Discourse. U Ivana Đurić Paunović & Maja Marković (Ur.). *English Language and Anglophone Literatures Today* (ELALT 1 Proceedings) (str. 18-26). Novi Sad: Filozofski fakultet, 2011.

Odnosi jezika u romanu *Miris kiše na Balkanu* i njegovom engleskom prevodu. *Nauka i identitet* (Zbornik radova sa naučnog skupa) (str. 7-16). Pale, 2011.

Lingvističko tkanje ulaska u Evropsku uniju. *Nauka i politika* (Zbornik radova sa naučnog skupa) (str. 53-65). Pale, 2011.

Contrastive Analysis of Accusing and Defending in English and Bosnian/Croatian/Serbian Public Discourse. *Primenjena lingvistika*, 10, 65-73, Novi Sad, 2012.

Kako artikulirati nerečeno. *Nauka i tradicija* (Zbornik radova sa naučnog skupa) (str. 101-113). Pale, 2013.

Part one

Ifeta Čirić-Fazlija

MEMORY EDITING AND FRAGMENTED IDENTITY IN SAMUEL BECKETT'S *KRAPP'S LAST TAPE*, A SEMIOTIC APPROACH¹

Abstract: This paper intends to demonstrate how the prop of tape-recorder, used as a device to select certain pieces of personal memory and intentionally repress others, functions as a theatrical sign of a volatile identity. The analysis is based on the text of *Krapp's Last Tape* and the film directed by Atom Egoyan, the information on which is provided in the first two sections of the paper. Successive analytical parts look into the character of Krapp and how his appearance, his gestures (non-verbal language which is in opposition to his duologues), and his conduct with the key prop of the one-act play expose the volatility and disintegration the character seeks to conceal.

Key words: dramatic text, dramatic character, film adaptation, props, theatrical sign, fragmentation, memory editing, Theatre of the Absurd

INTRODUCTION

Recalling one's past and/or personal memories have frequently been exploited as topics in 20th century British and American drama, so much that they have led to the creation of a specific form of memory play through which authors such as Tennessee Williams², Harold Pinter³, and Arnold Wesker⁴ have their characters explore daunting personal traumas, attempt to validate the past, or seek to explain wearisome and frustrating present by remembering (false) past incidents. Alternatively, numerous Anglo-American theatres and authors have

¹ A version of this paper was first presented in 2012, at the Third International Conference on Re-Thinking Humanities and Social Sciences: Politics of Memory, held at the University of Zadar, Croatia.

² For example: *The Glass Menagerie*, 1944.

³ His plays *No Man's Land*, 1975, or *Betrayal*, 1978.

⁴ Best known in this form is *Denial*, 1997.

re-examined historical events or the collective past, and even employed real historical and mythical figures from the past to tackle the issue of construction of identities and to rectify stereotypical representations of marginalised groups⁵.

However, it was Samuel Beckett who relentlessly explored the correlation between a lack of distinct and stable identity, and obliteration of personal history/ies through the inability to commit to memory, through selective memory, and intentional suppression of memory (cf. *Waiting for Godot*, 1955; *Endgame*, 1958; *Krapp's Last Tape*, 1958⁶). Language games and non-sequiturs, histrionic narrating, and the utilization of sound-recording technology in performance, along with a minimalist mise-en-scène, are not only constituent elements of Beckett's style, but a means to embody the aforementioned theme.

KRAPP'S LAST TAPE: THE DRAMATIC TEXT

Krapp's Last Tape is one of the later dramatic texts of Beckett that still retain a full human being as their character, even though, as will be expounded on in the article, Krapp is to be clustered with those Beckettian characters who, losing their own particularity and individuality, stopped signalling a single, unique human being and have grown into an abstraction, an allegory for all the humanity in an absurd world (as is the case with other Beckett's characters). The text of *Krapp's Last Tape* was written in English in 1958, and premiered at Royal Court Theatre in London that same year (cf. Beckett, 1966). According to Sarah West, Beckett became personally involved with the production of his text as he developed a vast affection for it (cf. West, 2008: 43-44). He envisaged it as a play for one specific voice, the voice of the actor Patrick Magee who starred at the premiere (Beckett, 1966: 7), and the working title of this one act solo-performance, the first play Beckett wrote in the first person monologue, was "The Magee Monologue" (cf. West, 2008: 48). The drama of this one-person-show is comprised of an old, haggard-looking, unkempt man listening to the memories of his past experience and escapades he himself has been making on a portable tape-recorder for over forty years or longer, and his attempting, yet failing, to record a new one on the occasion of his 69th birthday.

⁵ Such as L. Hughes' *Don't You Want to Be Free?*, 1937 or C. Churchill's *Top Girls*, 1991.

⁶ The years refer to the debut of the plays in English. These three pieces are taken as an illustration for the thematic quest, although almost all of Beckett's oeuvre displays the given paradigm.

The spectators observe as this solitary, decrepit, ungainly figure moves around the cluttered pile of his spools-diary entries, eats bananas, tries to decipher now perplexing descriptions in a ledger, rewinds and fast forwards tapes, indulges his alcohol addiction, makes offensive and mocking remarks at his earlier selves, discards segments of his personal history – being simultaneously auditor⁷ and editor of his memories and his Past. The minimalist mise-en-scène consists of nothing more than a darkened room, with a small desk covered with reels of tapes centre-stage and, most significantly, a tape-recorder with a microphone, the prop which remains in the limelight throughout the performance, thus indicating its own symbolic importance and semiotic function.

Although Beckett committed his whole career to the subject-matter of memory or rather to the inability of humans generally to invoke recollections of past incidents at their own will (as shown in *Waiting for Godot*) along with their wilful and wistful endeavours to curb unwanted chunks of past experience and obliterate personal history/ies (as in *Endgame*, or *Happy Days*) within a wider thematic scope, it is *Krapp's Last Tape* that most overtly examines the subject of memory *per se*, and the correlation between uninterrupted memory and the creation of a stable identity or generation of a unique and functional personality. This could not be possible without the new portable technology that Beckett revelled in having been introduced to, if we are to believe West. The device of tape-recorder and technology of sound-recording that Beckett was fascinated with provided the author a means with which he could pair up voices, memories and reactions of one and the same person from different temporal & spatial zones at one time, in a single place within a seemingly realistic setting, and thus physically and visually embody the theme.

KRAPP'S LAST TAPE: SCREEN ADAPTATION

The film adaptation of *Krapp's Last Tape* is a part of the 2001 *Beckett on Film Project*, in the Production of Blue Angel Films/Tyrone Productions for Radio Telefís Éireann and Channel 4, starring actor John Hurt and directed by Atom Egoyan, who was faced with an extremely challenging task. Egoyan needed to adapt a stage play to the medium of film without making any vast directorial decision and cuts⁸, taking into consideration not only his own perspective and experience but that of John Hurt who had previously impersonated Krapp on a

⁷ Or more precisely “character-cum-auditor” (West, 2008: 11).

⁸ Any director attempting to stage or film a text by Beckett has to apply for the rights to and is bound by the Beckett estate.

three-dimensional theatrical stage. The collaboration proved fruitful and Egoyan succeeded in keeping most of the text intact, making only a few minor editorial cuts (such as Krapp's fumbling with keys at the very beginning of the play and the scene in which Krapp, quite intoxicated, comes back onstage singing about a "day [being] over/ [and] night ... drawing nigh" (Beckett, 1966: 19). Egoyan mostly focused on camera work, thus enabling a more intimate connection of the viewers with the character and creating a more approachable and legible piece without being "intrusively filmic" (Hurt in Beckett on Film Project, web⁹). The film consists of 9 shots altogether without any soft transition in between; the first shot is 15 minutes long, the last one takes 20 minutes. Throughout the film the camera is panning right-centre-left as the tape plays, or slightly zooming in or out in order to re/orient the audience watching it, and to enhance the image of Krapp reminiscing about the past. The close-ups are those of Krapp and/or of the tape recorder, attempting to emphasize Krapp's concentration or "dream-like state" as he turns from a reactive to passive to reactive listener (both terms come from West), as well as the magnitude of the tape-contents & the moments at which tape-recorder metamorphoses from an object/the prop into a person-referent and is treated by Krapp accordingly. As Krapp's listening posture is motionless, at times even excruciatingly still, most of the transformations from passive to reactive listening to the dream-like states are given away by the subtle movements of the head, "gaze [that] controls the body" (Chabert¹⁰ in West, 2008: 54) and hand gestures that close-up shots bring to light, as will be explained shortly.

CHARACTER OF KRAPP

Any analysis examining the issue of identities, and especially this analysis, focusing on memory editing enabled by the use of a prop and comprehended as a sign of an unstable identity, must begin with a question of who Krapp is, what he is like, what his dreams are, his misfortunes and, thus, his drama. The stage directions and Krapp's first stage appearance do not reveal much; as stated before Krapp is a 69-year-old, clumsy man, with a dishevelled exterior whose first action is to sit still for a moment and to "heave a sigh" (Beckett,

⁹ The interview with the actor is given as a complementary piece of information on the website of the Project but not included in the printed addenda of the DVD collection.

¹⁰ The reference is to Pierre Chabert, the actor, director and theoretician who adapted modernist novels and plays to stage. In 1975 Chabert was cast by Beckett for the role of Krapp and consequently discussed this experience (and privilege) of his in an article "Samuel Beckett as director", published in the collection *Theatre Workbook 1, Samuel Beckett's Krapp's Last Tape* (edited by James Knowlson).

1966: 9) before he begins to fumble in his pockets looking for his keys, opening & closing the desk drawers in order to find and eat a banana or two (depending on the version of the text/ its adaptation) and then repeat the given string of actions for about the opening 15 to 20 minutes of the performance/film. Even when Krapp begins his monologue (since he develops dialogue with his earlier selves a bit later in the play) the readers and spectators do not learn much, for he reads from a ledger repeating words such as “spool” (as if taking pleasure from the sheer utterance of the word), “the little rascal”, “the little scoundrel” (all in Beckett, 1966: 10-11), mentioning different numbers, and contents/descriptions of his recordings. He muses over the phrase “memorable equinox”, first unable to read it, and then obviously puzzled by it, and finally reaches the title of the tape the audience will be listening to several times, together with Krapp. Then he puts on the tape and all listen to the 39-year-old Krapp narrating about eating bananas, listening to even older tapes and his even younger self, musing over the memory of his dying mother and her viduity (the word he can read but cannot understand and has to look up in the dictionary), different women he has encountered and their eyes, the episode with a girl in the punt; basically the year(s) that passed. When present-tense Krapp stops the tape and endeavours to record a new commemoration of yet another birthday and another year in his life, then do we realise that Krapp is a lonely man, a creature of habit, who, friendless, keeps to himself and has the tapes and the tape-recorder as his sole company and entertainment. Unable to continue with the recording as he has “[n]othing to say, not a squeak” (Beckett, 1966: 18), Krapp resumes listening to his ‘Farewell to Love’ and ends his actions in the exact same way he began them: sitting “motionless, staring before him” (Beckett, 1966: 20).

To an inattentive observer the bulk of information might be lost, such as the detail that Krapp is a failed writer (cf. Beckett, 1966: 18), hence his relish for a histrionic narrative; the fact that he is a contradictory figure, who although he repeats that “[he] would not want them [the best years] back” (Beckett, 1966: 20) wonders whether he could have been happy with Bianca/girl-in-the-punt (Beckett, 1966: 18) and sits motionless, gazing vacuously while the tape is running in silence, not even detecting it. A keen ear and eye will not fail to notice that Krapp is a conflicted, even tormented man who has the past and the memories at his disposal at a reel’s end, yet cannot recollect them at will though he might want to¹¹ and cannot or will not reconnect to his past, purposefully skimming and scanning through his past lives and his past selves, scorning and rejecting them, not allowing the continuation of remembrances

¹¹ Instances of the so called inaccessible “voluntary memory” (cf. West, 2008: 62-63).

and the accompanying progression of his identity (cf. Hornung¹², 1989; Langbaum¹³, 1977; Levy¹⁴ in Ehlers, 2008; Mayoux¹⁵, 1965). In this play of the late 1950s Beckett generated a character who is not only unstable to begin with (noticeable in the way he behaves with the tape-recorder and in his angry outbursts) but further fragments his inner self and identity by interrupting himself, mocking his earlier selves, discarding past memories, mechanically editing the tapes (and thus the memory) he listens to as he suppresses the unwanted ones and selects to rewind certain others repeatedly (cf. Levy in Ehlers, 2008). As Levy declares: “By editing his past, Krapp divides himself into a succession of individuals” (Levy in Ehlers, 2008: 6).

If one briefly examines Krapp’s behaviour and treatment of the spools/tape-recorder, one will realize that Krapp is far from being an amiable person. He is an ill-tempered man who has developed a very intimate and cordial bond with a sound-recording device, having failed at establishing and maintaining thriving relationships with other human beings. He displays all the mannerisms and the “tendency of a solitary person to enjoy affective relationships with objects” (Beckett in West, 2008: 50). In the opening scene, although afterwards he ridicules himself for doing the very thing, Krapp relishes in uttering the word spool and smiles happily (cf. Beckett, 1966: 10), and even gives his tapes pet names: “the little rascal,... the little scoundrel” (Beckett, 1966: 10-11). On the other hand, when, at the beginning of the play, he accidentally knocks off a box of spools which interrupts his focus and listening, Krapp violently sweeps the other spools and ledger off the table, cursing at them. The reaction reveals Krapp as an aggressive, impulsive and impatient man, prone to angry outbursts. His next explosive incident comes closer to the end of the tape when, growing irritated with his 39-year-old self, Krapp “impatiently winds the tape forward” (Beckett, 1966: 16) hoping to pass over that part in which 69-year-old Krapp is reminded of his younger self’s ambitions and ideals. When he realises the episode is still in full swing Krapp curses at the tape, winds it further forward, switches the tape on, grasps the subject matter is unvaried, curses even more

¹² In his article, Alfred Hornung compares and contrasts the art of Bernhard, Federman, and Samuel Beckett, with particular emphasis given to Beckett’s portrayal of dramatic characters’ disintegration: full human figures who monologise turn into disembodied voices and finally into nothingness.

¹³ Robert Langbaum treats the concept of identity in Beckett’s oeuvre where the characters symbolically represent the lack of identity.

¹⁴ The entry refers to Eric P. Levy’s book *Trapped in Thought: A Study of Beckettian Mentality* which discusses Beckettian mimetic presentation of human existence in two novels and three plays by Beckett (*Molloy*, *Unnamable*, *Waiting for Godot*, *Endgame* and *Krapp’s Last Tape*).

¹⁵ Mayoux talks of Beckett’s minimalist art and characterisation.

loudly and repeats the action until he reaches the point where the disembodied voice is narrating the girl-in-the-punt experience that appeases him. West accurately notices that irate episodes are signs of “contempt for himself as he is now, as well as for his idealistic younger self” (West, 2008: 51). Krapp is perturbed while listening to his 39-year-old voice mocking and laughing at the resolutions of their 29-year-old equivalent¹⁶, and joins him at laughing and mocking the plans, wants and decisions of his earlier selves. Even the attempt to record his 69th birthday diary-entry infuriates Krapp, since he is unable to come up with anything perceptive and rants about his botched novelistic career, the episode with the prostitute Fanny, his speculations regarding whether he could have been happy had he taken a different turn in life and getting annoyed with his powerlessness to curb the desire to relive his past. After a moment of rumination, Krapp abruptly “bends over machine, switches off, wrenches off tape, throws it away” (Beckett, 1966: 19). He is disdainful of himself, the state he is in, the man he has become, or failed to become, over his incapacity to prevent wondering what if, and although he declares “Thank God that’s all done with anyway” (Beckett, 1966: 17), Krapp desires to “relate to his past. He listens to the words of his earlier self, seeking to link somehow to his lost past memories” (Boyd, 2010: 7).

NON-VERBAL LANGUAGE

Krapp’s posture and the treatment of the tape-recorder while listening to “the words of his earlier self” (op.cit.), additionally attest to the volatility of his character and his identity. His listening posture is described by Beckett: “leaning forward, elbows on table, hand cupping ear towards machine, face front” (Beckett, 1966: 11). Any time Krapp is engrossed in the contents of the tape, when he is actively listening, this rigidly static position remains unaltered. At times when he slips into a dream-like state, basically any time Bianca, her eyes, and the girl at the railway station are brought up, Krapp’s position changes with a slight head movement upwards and faint eyes’ reaction: “stares front” (Beckett, 1966: 11). When he is particularly immersed into the unfolding narrative, such as the case of the girl-in-the-punt episode, Krapp’s head steadily descends, arms and hands concurrently creep for the tape-recorder and he even closes his eyes. Krapp appears as if hugging the machine or rather resting on it as if he is trying to bring the memory of the girl closer to his heart and mind.

¹⁶ Resolutions such as eat fewer bananas, drink less; have a “less engrossing sexual life” (Beckett, 1966: 13), the very same decisions 39-year-old Krapp repeats and constantly breaks, as is evident from present 69-year-old Krapp’s actions.

The hugging posture discloses two things, namely that Krapp is capable of tenderness (but only to his tape-recorder, as there is not a living soul around), and the truth about his tragedy:

His gentle gestures belie his words, and perhaps it is this ambivalence which has led him to sadness. The most tragic aspect of Krapp's life may not be so much what he has failed to achieve as what he has pushed away or let go. (West, 2008: 55).

The tragedy of the aged Krapp, painfully foregrounded in the discrepancy between his verbal and non-verbal behaviour, therefore is not merely that he has failed to develop any fulfilling relationship but rather in the fact that he personally drove potential partners and friends away, which is precisely the motivation for this character to endeavour editing the memories and his own past.

PAST MEMORIES EDITED

Unable to either effectively relate to his memories as seen in the voluntary memory episodes (falling short of summoning up the referents to “the black ball”, “the dark nurse” or “memorable equinox”, or not comprehending the word “viduity” used by his earlier self) or else to bury them (as involuntary memory episodes when the dream-like states come upon him unawares expose), Krapp literally “interrupts the tape recorder, instructs it to go back, to go on” (West, 2008: 50) as he switches it off and on, winds it backwards and forwards, swears at it, converses with it, laughs at it, feels and fondles it. He opts for certain memories, and glosses over others; selecting some and rejecting and suppressing others. Examining the contents of the memories Krapp retains we realise that he dwells most on the girl-in-the-punt episode, though there are others that he listens to with care – for example the memory of Bianca that propels him into a brooding mood and of his mother dying which, as Ehlers mentions (Ehlers, 2008: 7), his earlier self fragments, almost as if to make it more bearable, by stating: “Her moments, my moments. (*Pause.*) The dog's moments” (Beckett, 1966: 15). Those pieces of memory that Krapp discards by fast-forwarding the tape are all about failing at life at large, as stated before, not because of the opportunities missed but those not explored to the full.

Both the 39- and the 69-year-old ‘Krapps’ continually edit the memory of the past and the past itself by mocking their earlier selves, passing derisive comments, cutting themselves short, “mechanically dwell[ing] on the memories he relishes and forget[ting] the memories he has come to hate” (Ehlers, 2008:

5). This sorting out of the memory, the compartmentalization¹⁷ of the events, the resuscitation of the seemingly valuable and the getting rid of irritating, and probably painful, memories prevents Krapp from establishing a functional and complete individuality, and once more provides evidence of the volatility of his character.

CONCLUSION

Krapp's Last Tape is not the only Beckett drama or text which explores the subject matter of memory, fragmented and lost identities and eradication of personal histories, but it is the one which most transparently discusses these themes. Although its only character, Krapp, does not do anything profoundly dramatic, not even fulfil the promise from the title¹⁸, he still serves as a theatrical embodiment of a human being living in an absurd universe. His life gone amiss, running in circles, listening to assorted slices of his past and mechanically editing his memories, Krapp reveals the rifts in his identity the very act of making the records, and listening to them, was to conceal. Through the rewinding and fast-forwarding, through the unsuccessful attempt to record a new tape, through Krapp's mannerisms and treatment of the key prop of the play, and by following closely the episodes selected and those rejected, one gets a glimpse of Krapp's unsound character, his promising past and stagnant present life, morsels of his escapades and personal experiences, the dormant desires and the tragic scope of his life. The sound-recording device surpasses the object, metaphorically takes the position of a longed-for companionship and stops being a mere piece of equipment. It is a source of memory, a means to hang on to one's past and alter it, a place to compartmentalize events as it best fits Krapp's current life, yet sadly prevents burial of his past or reconnection to lost memories. Jumping at the potential of the then new portable sound-recording technology, Beckett therefore constructed a play that uses the tape-recorder to vividly portray yet another fractured and dehumanized personality.

¹⁷ The term comes from Ehlers (cf. Ehlers, 2008).

¹⁸ As Krapp does not succeed in recording his 69th anniversary diary entry, that is, his last tape.

REFERENCES

WORKS CITED

1. Beckett, Samuel. *Krapp's Last Tape and Embers*. London: Faber & Faber, 1966.
2. Boyd, Stephen. *Sound and Silence: Samuel Beckett's Audio Plays*. Thesis, State University of New York. Buffalo. ProQuest LLC, 2010. (Publication No. 1474131). <http://gradworks.umi.com/14/74/1474131.html>. Last accessed: May 23, 2012.
3. Egoyan, Atom. Krapp's Last Tape. In Scott Thomas, Kristen *et al*, *Beckett on Film Project*. Blue Angel Films/Tyrone Productions for Radio Telefís Éireann and Channel 4. 2002. <http://www.beckettontfilm.com/plays/krappslasttape/synopsis.html>.
4. Ehlers, Nichole. *The Failed Search for Self-Identity in Krapp's Last Tape*. 2008. <http://www.jmu.edu/mwa/docs/2008/Ehlers.pdf>. Last accessed: May 23, 2012.
5. Hornung, Alfred. Fantasies of the Autobiographical Self: Thomas Bernhard, Raymond Federman, Samuel Beckett. *Journal of Beckett Studies*, 11/12: 91-107, 1989. http://english.fsu.edu/jobs/num1112/091_HORNUNG.PDF. Last accessed: May 23, 2012.
6. West, Sarah. *Say It: The Performative Voice In the Dramatic Works of Samuel Beckett*. Doctoral Dissertation, Uversitat Pompeu Fabra. Barcelona, 2008. <http://www.tesisenred.net/bitstream/handle/10803/7483/tsw.pdf?sequence=1>. Last accessed: May 23, 2012.

WORKS CONSULTED

1. Anderson, Dustin. *Remembering to Forget: The Event of Memory in Joyce and Beckett*. Dissertation, Florida State University. Tallahassee. Electronic Thesis, Treatises and Dissertations, 2010 (Paper 210). <http://diginole.lib.fsu.edu/etd/210>. Last accessed: May 23, 2012.
2. Brater, Enoch. The 'I' in Beckett's Not I. *Twentieth Century Literature*, 20: 189-200, 1974. <http://www.enotes.com./Samuel-beckett-criticism/beckett-samuel-vol-9>. Last accessed: May 23, 2012.
3. Chambers, Ross. Beckett's Brinkmanship. *AUMLA: Journal of the Australasian Language and Literature Association*, 19: 57-75, 1963. <http://www.enotes.com./Samuel-beckett-criticism/beckett-samuel-vol-9>. Last accessed: May 23, 2012.

4. Federman, Raymond. Beckettian Paradox: Who Is Telling the Truth? In *Samuel Beckett Now*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1970. <http://www.enotes.com./Samuel-beckett-criticism/beckett-samuel-vol-9>. Last accessed: May 23, 2012.
5. Gates, David. Scraps from Beckett's Workshop. *Virginia Quarterly Review*, 53/4: 776- 784, 1977. In <http://www.enotes.com./Samuel-beckett-criticism/beckett-samuel-vol-9>. Last accessed: May 23, 2012.
6. Harvey, Lawrence E. A Poet's Initiation. In *Samuel Beckett Now*, Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1970. <http://www.enotes.com./Samuel-beckett-criticism/beckett-samuel-vol-9>. Last accessed: May 23, 2012.
7. Langbaum, Robert. Beckett: Zero Identity. In *The Mysteries of Identity*, New York: Oxford University Press, 1977. <http://www.enotes.com./Samuel-beckett-criticism/beckett-samuel-vol-9>. Last accessed: May 23, 2012.
8. Mayoux, Jean Jaques. Samuel Beckett and Universal Parody. In *Samuel Beckett: A Collection of Critical Essays*. New Jersey: Prentice-Hall, 1965.
9. Pattie, David. Space, Time, and the Self in Beckett's Late Theatre. *Modern Drama*, 43/3: 393-403, 2000. <http://www.samuel-beckett.net/space4a.html>. Last accessed: May 23, 2012.
10. Postlewait, Thomas. Self-Performing Voices: Mind, Memory and Time in Beckett's Drama. *Twentieth Century Literature*, 24/4: 473- 491, 1978.

REDIGIRANJE PAMĆENJA I FRAGMENTACIJA IDENTITETA U DJELU SAMUELA BECKETTA *KRAPP'S LAST TAPE*, SEMIOTIČKI PRISTUP

Sažetak

Članak namjerava prikazati načine kako pomoćno scensko sredstvo (magnetofon), upotrijebljeno kao sredstvo odabira pojedinih instanci ličnog sjećanja i namjernog potiskivanja drugih, funkcionira kao znak nestabilnog

identiteta. Analiza je zasnovana na dramskom tekstu *Krappova posljednja vrpca* i Egoyanovoj filmskoj adaptaciji jedinočinke koje se predstavljaju u prva dva segmenta članka. Potom se analiziraju lik dramskog lika, njegov izgled, geste (odrazi neverbalne komunikacije koji su u kontrapunktalnom odnosu sa njegovim dijalozima), te njegovo tretiranje i odnos sa najvažnijim scenskim pomagalom da bi se razotkrila nestabilnost i dezintegracija ličnosti koju dramski lik pokušava prikriti.

Ključne riječi: dramski tekst, dramski lik, filmska adaptacija, pomoćno scensko sredstvo, teatarski znak, fragmentacija, redigiranje pamćenja, Teatar apsurd

Prof. dr. Srebren Dizdar

CAN PICTION BE CONSIDERED AS A NEW FORM OF LITERARY EXPRESSION?

Abstract: In the ever-changing contemporary world of digital and information technology there is a need to take into consideration hybrid works that combine textual, pictorial, graphic, audio, video and other digital segments in the new cross-bred form of 'piction' – a hybrid constructed of 'picture' and 'fiction'. The paper tries to offer some views on this evolving sub-genre and to present some of its features as a point of reference and further deliberation.

Key words: piction, hybrid form, (sub)-genre, fiction, digital humanities

A NEW LITERARY HYBRID (SUB-)GENRE BETWEEN FICTION AND NON-FICTION?

There seems to be an urgent need to re-think some traditional notions on literary genres, or, even more, their subspecies. The recent decades of both writing creative literary works and their respective critical interpretations, and/or theoretical deliberations what could have been included under such a label; had mostly effaced invisible boundaries between 'high' and 'low' forms of literature. The same can be said of yet another traditional division within the prose works: fictional and non-fictional ones. In the variety of sources that dealt with literary scholarship within the English-written critical books, fiction usually included short stories, fables, fairy tales, novellas and novels if having been composed in prose, or diverse forms of poetry and plays, which had been marked by verse; and, in the case of drama, a dialogue, at least until the more recent times, when these two latter genres opened up for prose as well. The main difference between fiction and non-fiction was seen in the domain or territory they seemed to occupy. According to such a criterion, fictional works were made up, invented or imagined by their authors, since they had not dealt with events, people or any other factual element that could label them as 'real', even when they came dangerously close to the surface level of reality in their precise or accurate renderings, or even mere descriptions of people or events

that had actually existed. On the other hand, non-fiction focused on the people, events, places, and ideas deemed to be real or 'true' to actual facts. However, it was often emphasised that such a version or representation could be either correct or not, or it could give either a true or false account of what it was dealing with within the types of non-fiction, such as autobiographies, biographies, diaries, travelogues, memoirs, journals, histories, almanacs, essays, reports, letters, memos and newspaper articles; as well as, literally, any kind of text that the authors of such accounts had earnestly believed them to be truthful at the time of their composition. Or, to put it more bluntly, fictional works belonged to the area of 'fine arts', whereas the non-fictional ones were confined to the vast category of everyday, non-exciting (if not often rather boring!), somewhat 'plebeian' documents of all kinds.

Things started to become more complex and complicated when renowned public personalities, such as Sir Winston Churchill, had won the Nobel Prize for Literature in 1953 for his six-volume *Memoirs*,¹ or when authors, such as Truman Capote, referred to his 1966 book *In Cold Blood* as the first non-fiction novel. Although many credited Churchill with fine writing skills and style, the citation offered by the Nobel Committee could be equally as puzzling: "for his mastery of historical and biographical description as well as for brilliant oratory in defending exalted human values". Three years earlier, the Nobel Prize for Literature went to philosopher Sir Bertrand Russell, with such a wording: "in recognition of his varied and significant writings in which he champions humanitarian ideals and freedom of thought".² It is, perhaps, surprising that, in the definition stipulated by the Nobel Committee, one can find that "under the term 'literature' shall be comprised, not only belles-lettres, but also other writings which, by virtue of their form and method of presentation possess literary value".³ Clearly, both Russell's and Churchill's books on diverse topics did not belong to 'traditional' fictional works, but Capote's statement indicated that boundaries were beginning to be blurred. Or, they became more flexible, since literature began to include almost anything printed of any kind, as it can found under the heading of 'literature' in *The Oxford English Dictionary*: "Literary productions as a whole; the body of writings produced in a particular country or period", as well as "the body of

¹ In addition to many newspaper articles, Churchill was a prolific writer of books, having written in his career a novel, two biographies, three volumes of memoirs, and several histories.

² The Nobel Prize for Literature in 1950. Accessed on: http://www.nobelprize.org/nobel_prizes/literature/laureates/1950/index.html.

³ Lars Gyllensten. *The Nobel Prize for Literature*, trans. Alan Blair. Stockholm: The Swedish Academy, 1987, p. 15.

books and writings that treat of a particular subject”⁴. In the subsequent decades, Post(-)Modernist fiction did everything to demolish (deconstruct?) the imposed barriers, almost as ancient as the Great Wall of China, and yet as fragile as the Berlin Wall that went down in 1989.

The latter event had often been perceived by contemporary thinkers of all kinds as the true beginning of Globalisation, which was marked, among other things, by explosion of information technologies, most notably the Internet. As an enormous telecommunications system, or the network of networks that consisted of millions of private, public, academic, business, and government networks, ranging from local to global scope; the internet had transformed traditional communications media, including telephone, music, radio, film, and television, but it also influenced printing industry products, such as newspapers, magazines and books. It could be mentioned that, historically, the word *internet* was used, un-capitalized, as early as 1883 as a verb and adjective to refer to interconnected motions. One hundred years later, its initial definition or usage began its unprecedented expansion in order to become the first global mega-system of cyberspace. It soon initiated major changes in human perception of reality, since ‘virtual reality’ created environment that could simulate physical presence in places in the real world or imagined worlds, primarily through visual experiences on computer monitors or similar screens.

GLOBAL CHANGES AFFECTED LITERATURE AND ITS TEXTUAL FORMS

In terms of literature and its primarily textual forms, the spread of Internet caused them to adapt themselves gradually yet persistently to the newly created virtual environment of enormous possibilities to rather intricate features of website technology, or, had them reshaped into blogging and web feeds. It certainly forced them into motion, in the way quite similar to photography towards the end of 19th century, when ‘motion pictures’ or film broke off the limitations of static photos and captured the imagination of the whole planet.

However, photographs survived until our days, albeit much changed from these old sepia prints. So did the books, or newspapers, or the film for that matter, when television threatened quite seriously to throw it in the museum of forgotten inventions. In a way, such a resistance proved that new technologies could not simply replace, or totally discard previous, still functional ones. Such

⁴ “Literature” in *The Oxford English Dictionary*, 2nd edition, vol. 8. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989, p. 1029.

changes did not come out of the blue. Despite the accelerated pace and overall domination of information technology and its diverse products, particularly gadgets that had become indispensable objects in everyday use, similar to what wrist watches used to be in the past; the previous forms proved to be much more resilient. It should be taken into account what happened in similar circumstances in the process of transformation that affected different ‘products’ of a kind: ‘The new technology transforms the old and produces a hybrid. Both continue to exist, but in a new way’.⁵ Instead of reading on paper, one can now use affordable electronic devices that serve as a combination of a huge bookstore, library, news office, channels of communication, or the means of creating new literary forms and styles.

It almost goes without saying that the Internet made the distribution of books, and especially fiction, totally open, and, in most cases, free, in the same sense as as the oldest and highly popular digital library Project Gutenberg, after its appearance in the cyberspace in 1971, made public domain texts more readily available. Many similar projects, usually sponsored by well-stocked University libraries in English-speaking countries, followed and opened up their stacks to millions of computer users, both academic and non-academic ones. Needless to say, other areas of human activities, most notably in arts and humanities, saw this opportunity to create virtual galleries and museums, where their exhibits could be presented even to those who rarely went to such places. One such example was Smith College, Northampton, in the western part of Massachusetts, USA, and its Museum of Arts, which, as a joint effort of seven academic institutions in vicinity, gathered thousands of artefacts, but its online database contained millions of images on diverse topics offered ‘as an educational resource for the public for non-commercial, educational and personal use only, or for fair use as defined by law’.⁶ Each record is equipped with necessary information about the object in question, with a number of possibilities to cross-reference data and have a detailed insight, if desired.

PICTORIAL TURN INVADES TEXTUAL SUPREMACY

It soon turned out that mere fictional or non-fictional texts were just a suitable starting point for interesting experiments in terms of literature. As if the overall course of events somehow led to this situation. At the time when some authors

⁵ “The Impact of the Internet on Literature”, <http://lukethebook.me/post/6797683887/the-impact-of-the-internet-on-literature>. (last time accessed on November 23, 2013).

⁶ As duly mentioned on their webpage: <http://museums.fivecolleges.edu/> (last time accessed on November 27, 2013).

spoke of 'literature of exhaustion' in 1960s, and when there were no signs of any new directions literary production might take in the near future, there were much discussion of 'textuality' in the contemporary critical reflections. Burgeoning theories of linguistics, semiotics, rhetoric and other interrelated disciplines interpreted 'society as a text', which, according to Richard Rorty, meant a new, linguistic turn in the overall history of philosophy. Rorty saw the history of philosophy as periods when certain dominant issues had been in focus, only to be replaced by new ones. For him, the ancient and medieval philosophy had dealt, primarily, in things, whereas from seventeenth to nineteenth century philosophers were mainly concerned with ideas. Contemporary theories centred on words but with considerable plausibility, claiming that "Nature and its scientific representations are 'discourses'".⁷ In response to these ideas, one of the most prominent proponents of visual culture in our age, W.J.T. Mitchell, described yet another shift in the domain of the sphere of public culture and a number of disciplines of the human sciences as 'pictorial turn'.⁸ Mitchell traced various lines of thought in 20th century on this subject, ranging from Charles Peirce's semiotics and Nelson Goodman's 'languages of art', to the works by Wittgenstein, Derrida, Foucault, to mention only those more famous ones he had referred to. Having established a proper academic dialogue and commenting on diverse attitudes on theories on representation, Mitchell underlines that his understanding of 'whatever the pictorial turn is' should not be seen as return to a naive mimesis or a renewed metaphysics of 'pictorial presence', but, rather, as "a postlinguistic, postsemiotic rediscovery of the picture as a complex interplay between visuality, apparatus, institutions, discourse, bodies and figurality".⁹ It is important to see diverse practices of observation, or *spectatorship*, as equally deep problem as various forms of *reading*, which includes decipherment, decoding, interpretation; and "that visual experience, or 'visual literacy' might not be fully explicable as the model of textuality".¹⁰

Without going deeper into theoretical considerations of Mitchell and other writers important to the phenomenon of visual culture¹¹, it seems more

⁷ Rorty wrote on these issues in his books *The Linguistic Turn: Recent Essays on Philosophical Methods*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1967; and *Philosophy and the Mirror of Nature*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1979.

⁸ W.J.T Mitchell. *The Picture Theory*. Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 1994, p. 11 et passim.

⁹ Ibid, p. 16.

¹⁰ Ibid.

¹¹ Such as Griselda Pollock, Stuart Hall, Roland Barthes, Jean-François Lyotard, Rosalind Krauss, Paul Crowther and Slavoj Žižek, or Lisa Cartwright, Margaret Dikovitskaya, and Nicholas Mirzoeff.

appropriate to focus on real impact contemporary fiction, which had already started to become blended with a number of non-fictional texts; received from these new technologies. The similar process took place concurrently in other segments of culture that had become ever so democratic in its nature. Music can serve as appropriate example. In previous times, music could be enjoyed only by the privileged few – either those who could compose it or read its coded symbols (notes), or those who could have the luxury to be present at the time of its actual performance. Phonograph and radio and, later on, tape recorders of all kinds brought music to diverse audiences and also to the most distant places on earth, thus effacing the boundaries between races, nations, classes or generations in the similar manner printed books had helped spreading of literacy and reading habits in general in the past 500 years. The ever-increasing popularity of rock bands from 1960s on, as well as accessibility to music and its recorded forms, boosted people from diverse backgrounds to compose, or even more, to play music on their own. With the new possibilities of digital technologies ‘electronic music’ produced unimaginable number of works that kept on playing virtually around the clock. If one adds to this a continuous presence of music in contemporary human lives, almost equally enormous number of discotheques, or open air concert venues that attract millions of young people across the globe, it is not surprising to observe that multiple hybridized forms of musical expressions saturated the world in early 21st century. Almost anybody could make (or fake?) music!

DIGITAL HYBRIDIZED FORMS OF ‘PICTION’

The similar thing was also happening in literature, hybridized fiction in particular. Since all kinds of media can be easily made digital and uploaded, the creativity of millions of Internet users caused many new forms of fiction to evolve over a rather short span of time. They included traditional films, comic books, and video games, but also developed interactive computer games or computer-generated comics. Dedicated and loyal followers of specific fictional sub-genres gather around fan forums, produce and interchange various derivative stories in order to share them and instigate similar products to populate the cyberspace. In contrast to solitary talented authors of the past, the new technology enabled virtually anyone with enough skills and ideas to start the new creative space on their own called weblog, or simply blog. Blog apportions some virtual space and its creator shares his/her entries or ‘posts’ with a number of other users ready to follow it. Until 2009, blogs were usually the work of a single individual. Sometimes they attracted a small group, and often covered a single subject. They developed a specific type of blog fiction,

where a story is delivered through a blog either as ‘flash fiction’ or ‘serial blog’, but more recently, a collaborative fiction began to emerge in numbers. It is written by different authors, who produce a story in a sequence. As if someone started a thread and others continued to weave the story adding new details and making it more interesting to go on as long as it could. Need one to be reminded at this point that the original meaning of the word ‘*textu*’ (in Latin, it means ‘fabric’, the product of a weaving process) had been proposed by Roman philosopher Quintilian, who, in his *Book on Speeches*, advised authors that “after you have chosen your words, they must be weaved together into a fine and delicate fabric”.¹² The latest trend seems to be a creation of “multi-author blogs” (MABs), where large numbers of authors contribute their posts, but the final version is professionally edited.

Although the basis for such developing virtual forms of fiction remains safely in the narrative; or in the story *per se*, in addition to textual elements or parts, these entries often appear in a variety of multimedia forms. Depending on imagination, technological and other constituent segments, they cannot be simply labelled as ‘books’, since there is a blooming industry of e-books anyway, but a new term should be proposed. Due to their obvious postmodernist hybrid nature and inclusion of both fictional and non-fictional elements, the possible answer is to be found elsewhere. Since these products rely a lot on visual, pictorial backdrops, because a mere text is certainly not good enough to express their versatility, and since they often combine film or video-clips, photos, or comics in quite unusual techniques of collage and pastiche; one can propose yet another mixed or hybrid term – **piction**. The word refers both to a ‘*pictus*’ (painted thing, picture) and a ‘*fictus*’ (made-up, feigned, false, fictitious, ‘non-real’); or, rather, it does aspire to cover such multimedia presentations or accounts that bring forth such kinds of creative works, embedded both in fiction and non-fiction, but also outgrowing them by a diversity of interconnected mosaic-like pieces.

It may sound paradoxical that such an advanced technological age, as a matter of fact, repeats, or, in some peculiar way, goes back to the earliest forms of human artistic expression. Cave paintings that had originated 32,000 years ago could be interpreted as non-fictional, i.e. ‘realistic’, records of what prehistoric human beings managed to catch on their hunting trips; or, they could be understood as their wishful thinking – what they hoped to hunt down in future, thus imagining or inventing the fictitious stories aimed to reconnect their past exploits with their future adventures. In a way, such pictorial narratives can be taken as semi-fiction, or half-fiction, since they can also be imagined as a

¹² Marcus Fabius Quintilianus. *Institutio Oratoria*, trans. H. E. Butler. Vol. 2. Cambridge: Loeb-Harvard UP, 1980.

fictional description, or, rather, **de-piction**, based on a true story. Depiction is defined as a non-verbal representation, where pictures or images are considered to be viable substitutes for things seen, remembered or imagined. When uttered or written down in words, depiction becomes a **description**, which happens to be a very useful tool when dealing with all kinds of literary texts. Without going into more recent theories of pictorial semiotics or iconography, or a number of other equally applicable critical schools of thinking on these issues, ranging from the most ancient to the more recent ones; suffice it to say that 'piction' embraces all these evolving forms of virtual genres and their sub-genres in order to remain as open and flexible as possible.

Of course, other hybrid names came to mind. If one tried to join 'literature' and 'picture', the result might be not so successful – 'pictuliture', or 'literpicture'. Perhaps an analogy to abbreviated terms such as 'Brit Lit' or 'Chick Lit' could be offered as 'Pict Lit', but it did not sound quite right either. On the other hand, one should mention that a variation on name giving had already been used in a guessing word game called 'Pictionary', as way back as 1985. Teams of players try to identify specific words from cards that contain appropriate drawings, which serve as clues to the right answer. And since one could not avoid the most recent developments in the digital technology, let it be known that an application called 'piction' had been circulating for some time with users of smart phones. It has been advertised as a simple camera application that allows user to add text on top of photos and share it with other people and their networks. The combined word here comes as a mixture of a 'picture' and 'caption', which stands for a title or brief explanation accompanying an illustration, cartoon, poster, or a photograph. It primarily serves as an identification of what is seen on the photograph, which is reminiscent of times when such information was duly written on the back of photos as prints. Nowadays it is superimposed on the image making it a kind of a digital postcard or greetings message. The picture remains central, since its appearance that is important, and the text is only adding information in the shape of ornamented letters (fonts), thus keeping both segments visibly separate.

It is not the case with the term proposed here. The emphasis is on a fusion of multiple features, where their combination produces a new unity, or work. As much as one can easily recognise certain segments or parts in the new hybrid, they tend to lose their original characteristics and create, hopefully, something else. In such a process there is no dominant or prevailing segment. Nor does it necessarily favour pictorial over textual elements. Since, due to the nature of technological mastering of all combined elements, the objective is not to strive towards an exquisite, elevated, 'high' piece of art, one may also easily exclude possible theoretical considerations, such as 'literariness' or 'picturerariness' as

modes of identification. It may be safely said that it all depends on any author's initial urge how to deal with its material and imagination. It also seems that a rather totally open eclectic attitude prevails, since the necessary elements for constructing the work of piction can be taken from as many sources one might be able to handle under given circumstances. Besides some common well-known features that had been made readily available from the overall legacy of humankind nowadays understood as pertaining to this yet elusive 'global culture', any regional or distinctly local features are freely mixed in. They add a specific, easily noticeable flavour of both the author's personality, his/her individual and collective background and make the pictional work, in a broadest sense, original, or, at least, different from other similar products. On the other hand, by including those elements that are familiar for most people who share the similar interests, piction can take various protean forms of sub-genres. It comes as no surprise that 'low' forms of 'popular' culture prevail over more sophisticated specimens of books, usually referred to 'high' literature or '*belles lettres*'. In this sense, it is closer to subversive, underworld fictional products, which had existed concurrently through centuries as a specific form of counter-culture, or the culture of the masses. In some parts of the former colonial world, such as in India or Africa, it grew into a lucrative industry of popular titles¹³ based on simple plots, highly didactic in nature, and yet intertwined with elements of romanticised love, violence or sentimental excesses of all kinds. In the countries of 'developed' printing industry, such a demand created a huge market for kitsch, trash or pulp fiction. In the explanation offered by Clive Bloom, who rightfully argues in his book *Cult Fiction*: "Pulp is not only descriptive term for certain of publishing produced on poor quality paper, but it is also indicative of certain attitudes, reading habits and social concerns".¹⁴ It stands for much more, since it does not limit itself only to traditional love stories, detective thrillers, horror or mystery narratives, or science fiction for that matter. It offers a number of possibilities for combing and re-combining almost anything into a new and exciting form. Pictional authors relied on these features when creating this unique hybrid. They mix into their structure many elements of short stories, fables, fairy tales, novels, plays, poetry, but they also use components from comics, feature films, graphics, TV clips or any other video-material, computer programmes such as Power Point presentations or similar templates that integrate text and picture(s), often combined with music scores either borrowed or of their own. Since all these elements have been compressed in appropriate technological

¹³ Onitscha market literature is probably the best known, having originated in cheap presses in western Africa and producing millions of titles and copies of diverse topics.

¹⁴ Clive Boom. *Cult Fiction: Popular Reading and Pulp Theory*. Basingstoke and London: Macmillan Press, 1996, p. 3.

form, they can also be labelled as ‘digital fiction’. It is another area of interest that raised concerns among contemporary theorists and practitioners, who try to seek answers in interconnected disciplines of humanities brought together through the use of computer technologies. One of the pioneers in the field, Roberto A. Busa, summarized his views on the issue:

Humanities computing is precisely the automation of every possible analysis of human expression (therefore, it is exquisitely a “humanistic” activity), in the widest sense of the word, from music to the theater, from design and painting to phonetics, but whose nucleus remains the discourse of written texts.¹⁵

Such an approach has been centred on detailed scientific analysis, whereas piction wants to point out to the hybrid acts of imaginative creation and the possibilities of their critical interpretation in the widest sense, as well as their ‘place’ in contemporary literary production. Whatever the final result, one is faced with a different kind of digital ‘image’. The word itself is ambiguous, since it can refer to traditional physical object, such as a painting or a sculpture, or to the mental, psychological aspect of its use that enters into a highly unsafe territory of dreams, memories or perception. A string of digital images combined or interlaced with larger or smaller segments of texts, then, become a creative backdrop for this new, evolving mosaic of hybrid forms. It may be yet as early to start categorising them, or, even worse, to make presumptuous theories of their true ‘nature’ or directions they could or should take in a foreseeable future. A few things seem to be certain at this point: the digital age has already managed to transgress the imposed boundaries between diverse forms of artistic expression and to ‘pack’ the distinct products of its own into a whole array of, perhaps, not so ‘great’ forms, but, in any case, vibrant and interesting. They continue to grow and to find potentials and possibilities there where the traditional fictional forms had never dared to experiment. Or pictorial forms, for that matter.

IS THERE FUTURE FOR PICTION?

The only ‘normal’ question is: “What is to be done?” There seem to be several potential scenarios, if not the true answers. One of them tends to ignore the technological advancement and to keep to established forms, as a kind of vintage collector who only cares about specific period or type of product. No

¹⁵ Susan Schreibman, Ray Siemens and John Unsworth (Eds.). *A Companion to Digital Humanities*. London: Blackwell Publishing, 2008, p. 10.

doubt there will be enough people who will continue to read books on paper, or, in a slightly modified situation, as e-texts. That will secure for a while new titles of a limited number of professional writers in the usual sense of a word. The majority will succumb to new trends and fashionable hybrid products that will, eventually, become the common thing, as five centuries ago, when printed texts had totally replaced handwritten manuscripts. It should be remembered that these two textual traditions were, at times, nicely illuminated with a limited number of pictures, although the industrial manufacturing of books gradually eliminated the need for colourful illuminations. They had been considered rather costly and were replaced with sketches and black-and-white drawings, not unlike caricatures highly popular in British editions in 18th and 19th century. They survived in comic books, in much the similar manner as coloured pictures found their way into books for children. Although they are still printed in millions of copies and still enjoyed by children of that age, it is unlikely they will be able to endure the competition with technological gadgets, such as tablets, minicomputers, or smart phones. Once the use of electronic devices becomes more prevalent in schools against the traditionally printed textbooks, the battle for traditional modes of literature will be lost.

However, the hope dies last. It cannot be predicted with any certainty if this new sub-genre will eventually come into existence and produce a number of digital forms worthy of analysis and critical deliberation. If by any reason that cannot be seen at the moment, it does not develop and cause enough qualities to be considered as an academic point of interest, it may remain as yet another experiment that has been lost in virtual cyberspace.

SOURCES

1. Gyllensten, Lars. *The Nobel Prize for Literature*, trans. Alan Blair. Stockholm: The Swedish Academy, 1987.
2. *The Oxford English Dictionary*, 2nd edition, vol. 8. Oxford: Clarendon Press, 1989.
3. Rorty, Richard. *The Linguistic Turn: Recent Essays on Philosophical Methods*. Chicago: The University of Chicago Press, 1967.
4. Rorty, Richard. *Philosophy and the Mirror of Nature*. Princeton: Princeton University Press, 1979.
5. Mitchell, W.J.T. *The Picture Theory*. Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 1994.

6. Quintilianus, Marcus Fabius. *Institutio Oratoria*, trans. H. E. Butler. Vol. 2. Cambridge: Loeb-Harvard UP, 1980.
7. Boom, Clive. *Cult Fiction: Popular Reading and Pulp Theory*. Basingstoke and London: Macmillan Press, 1996.
8. Schreibman, Susan, Ray Siemens and John Unsworth (Eds.). *A Companion to Digital Humanities*. London: Blackwell Publishing, 2008.
9. The Nobel Prize for Literature in 1950. Web. http://www.nobelprize.org/nobel_prizes/literature/laureates/1950/index.html.
10. "The Impact of the Internet on Literature". Web. <http://lukethebook.me/post/6797683887/the-impact-of-the-internet-on-literature>.
11. Smith College Museum of Art. Web. <http://museums.fivecolleges.edu/>.

MOŽE LI SE PIKCIJA SMATRATI NOVIM OBLIKOM KNJIŽEVNOG IZRAZA?

Sažetak

U doba gotovo potpune dominacije elektronsko-informatičkih tehnologija počele su se pojavljivati nove hibridne forme koje koriste elemente fikcijskih i nefikcijskih tekstova u kombinaciji sa raznovrsnim slikovnim, grafičkim, video, pa i audio segmentima u nastojanju da, putem Interneta i njegovih korisnika na blogovima, promoviraju svojevrstan iskorak u književnom iskazu. U radu se prati postepeno narastanje ove pojave, koja se određuje kao 'pikcija', odnosno spoj svih vrsta piktoralnih iskaza sa fikcijskim narativima, već dobroano hibridiziranih postmodernističkim zahvatima u tekstove svih vrsta. Digitalne tehnologije su podstakle brojne korisnike širom svijeta da kako u individualnom, a u novije vrijeme, sve više i u kolektivnom naporu ponude brojna djela u pokušaju da se prevaziđu dosadašnja tradicionalna shvatanja o prirodi i vrstama književnih i drugih umjetničkih djela u multimedijalnim oblicima.

Ključne riječi: pikcija, hibridni oblik, (pod)-žanr, fikcija, digitalne humanističke znanosti

Lejla Mulalić

HISTORY, HERITAGE AND LITERARY THEORY IN HILARY MANTEL'S *BRING UP THE BODIES*

Abstract: Due to lack of historical evidence, the story of King Henry VIII and Anne Boleyn has always inhabited the amorphous domain of the historical imaginary rather than geometrically shaped historical factuality. Hilary Mantel, twice winner of the Booker Prize for two novels that are part of a trilogy on Thomas Cromwell's version of Tudor court intrigues, manages to defamiliarize one of England's most controversial stories by avoiding the matrix of romance and cleverly exploiting the subversive tools of heritage. The aim of this paper is to show how her latest novel *Bring Up the Bodies* (2012) foregrounds the experiential and performative energy of heritage, while consciously drawing on certain strands of New Historicist thought. In doing so, the author positions her novel within the spacious, unmapped borderlands between popular and academic *historying*.

Key words: history, heritage, Hilary Mantel, New Historicism, performativity, Thomas Cromwell.

INTRODUCTION

The courtship between King Henry VIII and Anne Boleyn, as well as their marriage, and Anne's execution due to charges of adultery, have always inhabited the amorphous domain of the historical imaginary rather than geometrically shaped historical factuality. Lack of historical evidence has loosened the boundary between fact and fiction, which is why this aspect of the Tudor past has been re-imagined in countless romance novels, film adaptations, miniseries and documentaries. The generic matrix of romance feeds both Hollywood blockbusters and literary re-enactments of Henry's fickle heart and Anne's fall due to ruthless ambition and/or woman's powerlessness in a male dominated world. Desperate pursuit of love and political power, though each is almost indistinguishable in our perception of the Tudor court, perfectly fit the

framework of romance. However, this seemingly unproblematic marriage of story and its generic counterpart is not apolitical as it raises many issues concerning our enduring fascination with romance in the postmodern 21st century, while it also foregrounds the ideological background of the romance genre.

The complexities of genre affiliation are not limited to the domain of Tudor-inspired literature. They ineluctably haunt the realm of history and its unacknowledged other – heritage. In the words of David Lowenthal, distinction between history and heritage is vital since “history explores and explains pasts grown ever more opaque over time; heritage clarifies pasts so as to infuse them with present purposes” (2009: xv). An example of this distinction in relation to the early Tudor period may be found in the historical accounts of Geoffrey Elton and Simon Schama. On the one hand, the scholarly effort of the “old school” historian Geoffrey Elton to assemble a portrait of Thomas Cromwell as a visionary statesman who helped transform the governing bodies of England, thus steering England towards a secular democracy (O’Donnell, 2013: 26), exudes the spirit of Leavis’s “moral seriousness” typical of great English literature and history. On the other hand, Simon Schama, who extends his historical expertise and academic authority to the popular medium of television, creates, in his mega popular documentary *A History of Britain* (2000), brilliant miniatures of Henry and Anne and intersperses them with extracts from old films dealing with the vagaries of Henry’s heart and reign. Furthermore, Schama inscribes in his televised chapter on Henry VIII and the Reformation an idea of the unwilling but inevitable capitulation of all historians, including himself, to the figure of the inscrutable Anne Boleyn who appears to be key to England’s Reformation.

Although Elton’s and Schama’s pursuit of (Tudor) history seems to occupy the space of history and heritage respectively, insisting on contrast will certainly “dim the convergences” by conveniently separating the academic and “popular” approaches to the study of the past. Both historians/approaches aim to show things “as they were”, using their narrative tools in such a way as to construct a particular kind of story, which is why Lowenthal concedes that they “are less dissenting ventures than disparate viewpoints” (2009: 168).

Hilary Mantel, twice winner of the Booker Prize for two novels that are part of a trilogy on Thomas Cromwell’s version of Tudor court intrigues, manages to defamiliarize one of England’s best known stories by avoiding the matrix of romance and cleverly exploiting the subversive tools of heritage. The aim of this paper is to show how her latest novel *Bring Up the Bodies* (2012) foregrounds the experiential and performative energy of heritage, while consciously drawing on certain strands of New Historicist thought. In doing so,

the author positions her novel within the spacious, unmapped borderlands between popular and academic *historiography*.

EMPLOTTING AND STAGING HISTORY

In a stimulating survey of the performative turn in the study of history, within the larger context of cultural studies, Peter Burke invokes Hayden White's notion of historical emplotment as a dramaturgical model for the representation of the past. While this mode of representation entails the imposition of a particular plot onto the raw material of historical events, the agency so given to an historian is that of an emplotter. In the case of Mantel's novel, which is entirely focalised through the character of Thomas Cromwell, the notion of *staging* of history gains a new dimension.

Cromwell was Henry's Master Secretary whose low birth and undivided loyalty towards the disgraced cardinal Wolsey made him highly unpopular at the court, but it was exactly these aspects of his life that made him privy to the most diverse kinds of knowledge. Following in the footsteps of Geoffrey Elton, who tried to redeem Cromwell from the confines of the historical role of villain, Mantel created a striking portrait of a man whose mind gave form and meaning to haphazard events that resulted in England's break from Rome. She used the elements of the historical plot created by other historians in order to examine villainy as a construct of a particular kind. Hence, in an age steeped into religious strife and superstition and deeply averse to all things foreign, Cromwell's knowledge of law and banking, as well his ability to converse in many languages, earned him the label of impostor which later gained Machiavellian stature.

Physical and mental robustness, as well as a puzzling "moral emptiness" (Lethbridge, 2012: 28), give Mantel's Cromwell an ability to transcend existing historical interpretations of the early Tudor period and occupy the position of an emplotter and a stage manager. He is the central consciousness and moving force of the narrative but his power over the narrative is not exhausted in these realist conventions. It is fully unveiled in his ability to *will* history by imagining it and to manage controversial situations by imposing a particular plot line on shapeless events and facts.

In order to illustrate the performative quality of history in the novel and Cromwell's role of emplotter, I will discuss the episode dealing with Henry's alleged death due to a fall from a horse and the turmoil caused by the very idea of his death. The king falls while trying to demonstrate his virility in jousting and stops breathing long enough for everyone to think he is dead. The

commotion in Cromwell's mind, caused by his ability to imagine instantly different versions of the future without Henry, sharpens his perception of the way the courtiers behave. The king's body is laid on a piece of ocean-blue cloth – a seemingly uninjured, perfect body politic that no one dares to touch. Although the body politic is beyond touch, Cromwell registers every gaze, word and thought of the courtiers whose bodies and minds incessantly twitch with the excitement of plotting. More than anyone else, the Duke of Norfolk, Anne Boleyn's uncle, wants to seize the moment and claim the throne now that Anne is pregnant and unfit to rule. Cromwell feels the invisible movement in the space around the king and he seems to

body out ... his girth expands, even his height. So that he occupies more ground (170). ... Norfolk is now buzzing from side to side, a maddened wasp, and as if he were a wasp the onlookers shrink from him, eddying away, than swaying back. The duke buzzes into him; he, Cromwell, bats the duke away (Mantel, 2012: 172).

It is in that moment that he sees a flicker on the king's face and "puts his hand on the king's chest, slapping it down, like a merchant closing a deal. Says calmly, 'The king is breathing'" (Mantel, 2012: 172). An "unholy roar" ensues from the protagonists of this historical moment which Cromwell breaks into meaningful thoughts and words and mercilessly interprets and classifies. He controls the historical tide and reduces it to a single gaze at the Boleyn expressions around him. "They look numb, bemused. Their faces are pinched in the bitter cold. Their great hour has passed, before they realised it has arrived" (Mantel, 2012: 173).

Analogies between society and the theatre have always been made, but now the old dramaturgical model is reinterpreted with the rise of postmodernity. Drawing of analogies is now replaced by removal of boundaries between society and the theatre, which allows for a certain fluidity of their relationship (Burke, 2005: 41). This is nowhere more apparent than in the dynamics of courtly life in 16th century England. Cromwell's performance in the above mentioned episode is exquisite given that there is no definite script for him to follow once he enters the stage, i.e. the tent where the king's body is laid. He dissolves into several people so that he is a performer, a stage director who channels the reactions of other protagonists, and an observer with curious taste. Mantel's narrative, filtered through Cromwell's consciousness, is markedly performative; it does not simply tell us what happened, but it transforms a piece of realist prose into an enactment of ritual where the bodies and language of all protagonists bring history pungently to life. The few moments during which the shadow of death is cast over the king create a vacuum for the courtiers who do not know which role to take now that the source of power, towards which they

all gravitate, is likely to be extinguished. The figurative ritual dance of the courtiers turns into a discordant movement and a cacophony of voices and interpretations before the eyes of Thomas Cromwell, who enters the tent with several improvised scripts in his head and a dagger tucked amongst his garments, should all of his scripts fail.

The theatrical model of representation perfectly fits the experiential aspect of heritage in its immediacy and evocativeness. Lowenthal cites the example of a guide at an Israeli settlement museum who says to tourists, "We are not here to teach history, to do the teachers' work. Let them learn history at school. We are here for the experience" (2009: 167-8). Although it is tempting to discard this approach as simplistic, one cannot deny that we are constantly smothered by similar offers of living the experience of history. History channels advertise their programmes under slogans such as "History made every day"; recent feature films such as *The King's Speech*¹ (2010) and *The Iron Lady* (2011) claim they depict truthful accounts of renowned figures in British history, such as King George VI and Margaret Thatcher, whereas a host of books and documentaries try to redeem Princess Diana from history. We need not look far from home to find similar examples: in April 2012, the London-based tourist agency "Political Tours" announced a ten-day tour of Bosnia and Serbia which would enable "war tourists" to experience "current affairs at first hand". In an ironic summary of this war heritage tour, a Bosnian-born correspondent of *The Guardian* brings up the controversial nature of heritage:

There is lunch to be had in the mountains overlooking Sarajevo, from where the city was shelled to cinders, a picnic en route to Srebrenica and dinners with local genocide survivors, plus bus tours along the old frontlines (Marić, 2012).

This is a fine example of one country constructing the history of another by imposing a particular interpretative framework, in this case a set of Western European notions about Bosnia, in order to commodify a tourist-friendly version of former Yugoslav history. Doing so will enhance Western Europeans' sense of gratitude for their privileged distance from the Balkans'

¹ It is interesting to note that the actor playing the main role in this film about the historical George VI is Colin Firth, who is primarily known as Jane Austen's Mr. Darcy. His performance in the 1995 BBC miniseries, *Pride and Prejudice*, as well as an impersonation of a modern-day Darcy in *Bridget Jones's Diary*, turned him into a genuine cultural icon which, apart from celebrating male sensitivity, promotes a romanticised notion of quintessential Englishness. The cultural and historical heritage embodied in Colin Firth's Mr. Darcy unavoidably becomes an intertext within the film narrative of King George VI which is also centred around the notion of national identity.

troubled past, and a sense of pride in being part of the nation which helped resolve the conflicts. It is easy to identify with a number of historians, both local and foreign, who believe that communicating history to a “broad”, i.e. uninitiated, audience “inevitably simplifies the message” for the “truth is too complex” so that “real” history should rather be left to the professionals (De Groot, 2006: 396). That, however, reduces a multiplicity of interpretations to a monologic vision of academic history whose disciplinary borders are somehow interchangeable with its moral prerogatives and therefore equally limiting.

Even though a comparison between Cromwell’s theatrical narrative, a political tour through Bosnia and Schama’s documentary may seem farfetched, there is one important similarity. The performative nature of Cromwell’s acrobatic wielding of English history, visiting authentic historic sites in Bosnia with acknowledged experts, and surrendering oneself entirely to the filmic and poetic reconstruction of bygone times in Schama’s documentary may be reduced to one common denominator. Namely, these versions of heritage seem to offer the reader/tourist/viewer an individual experience of the past and a sense of freedom from the restraints of academic discipline.

The notion of an individual experience and freedom for consumers of history is, nevertheless, a carefully orchestrated illusion grounded in a clear sense of authority. In other words, Mantel’s Cromwell is an omnipresent enactor and interpreter of the history created at Henry’s court who gives us the illusion of privileged knowledge and experience. His office has no discernible limits so we see him supervising Henry’s guilt-ridden dreams of Anne and disciplining them into a clear cut meaning. The reluctant inkling of Henry’s feelings for Jane Seymour, his next queen, is emplotted into full flowering by Cromwell in the interest of England’s political stability. Likewise, when the king no longer needs Anne, Cromwell conjures real lovers out of fragments of gossip, thus feeding the king’s imagination and providing him with images and formulations of Anne’s adultery. An appearance of reality is willed into existence as Anne’s lovers, “phantom gentleman, flitting by night with adulterous intent” (Mantel, 2012: 350), turn into real shivering human bodies awaiting execution. Cromwell becomes a master of phantoms who makes sure the indictment is staged as a speaking image of lust so that the parliamentarians, the king, and the reader not only read about Anne’s kisses and embraces with her lovers but also imagine and “experience” them, thereby authenticating Cromwell’s version of history.

The pleasure and the comfort that we, as readers, derive from Cromwell’s authoritative voice can be discerned in the carefully planned itinerary of the Bosnian “political tour”, where the aura of authenticity is lent by the presence of “Louis Sell, a former US diplomat who worked on the Dayton peace-accords

and served repeatedly in Yugoslavia” (Political tours). Similarly, Simon Schama instructs the viewers to lose themselves entirely to the poetic power of his televised reconstructions of the past “without any inkling of their return trip to the contemporary” (Schama, cited in De Groot, 2006: 399). In doing so, he objectifies his interpretation of the past, closing it off from the influence of alternative voices in a way similar to the New Critics who turned poetry into artefacts whose meaning could be fathomed only by the Critic. Schama engages the viewer in an emotional and visual experience of history but, in the words of De Groot, “for all Schama’s celebration of the popularising potential of television for history he still wants to be the man in charge of telling us how things were” (2006: 399).

NEW HISTORICIST SCRIPT FOR CROMWELL’S PERFORMANCE

The performativity inherent in Mantel’s representation of history may also be recognized in the New Historicist patterns of interpretation that inform her portraits of Henry VIII and Thomas Wyatt. This is highly pronounced in the peculiar dynamics of courtly life whose protagonists are constantly tossed between the realm of the private and the public in their pursuit of “power, gain, gossip, titles, favours, rewards and entertainment” (Waller, 1993: 14). The dynamics of the relationship between private and public persona, the centrality of the monarch’s physical and political body as a dominant source of power to which all courtiers are irresistibly drawn, as well as the role of poetry as a vehicle of self-fashioning and power struggle are familiar interpretative tools of the New Historicists. Mantel weaves these images and linguistic codes into her theatrical narrative, which results in an evocative double-awareness of her writing.

More so than anyone else, Mantel’s Cromwell instinctively feels and exploits this internal division that defines his role as a performer and a stage manager, a private man and a public presence. This is how he explains it:

You can insist on separation, if you must: go to your cabinet and say, ‘Leave me alone to read.’ But outside the room, you can hear breathing and scuffling, as a seething discontent builds up, a rumble of expectation: he is a public man, he belongs to us, when will he come forth? You cannot blank it out, the shuffle of the feet of the body politic (Mantel, 2012: 281).

Moreover, Cromwell seems to be the mediator between the king's physical body and the king as a body politic, as he is keenly aware of the shifting boundary between these two realities, "The king's body is borderless, fluent, like his realm: it is an island building itself or eroding itself" (Mantel, 2012: 297). The issue of the king and queen's ability to produce a male heir and by so doing provide political stability for England, transforms their bodies into common property and a discursive field where stories and linguistic codes exert political power. Cromwell is acutely aware of the slipperiness of that discursive space as well as the ample opportunity it leaves for manipulation, which is obvious from the following passage:

He is the overlord of the spaces and the silences, the gaps and the erasures, what is missed or misconstrued or simply mistranslated, as the news slips from English to French and perhaps via Latin to Castilian and the Italian tongues ... to India, where they have never heard of Anne Boleyn (Mantel, 2012: 366).

It is, therefore, no surprise that the only courtier for whom he has a particular affinity is Thomas Wyatt, a poet redeemed from historical and literary obscurity by the New Historicists. Wyatt's poem "Whoso List to Hunt" and in particular Stephen Greenblatt's interpretation of it, are powerful intertexts in Mantel's narrative. Cromwell's ability to *read* gaps and silences in Wyatt's poetry disturbs the novel's seemingly mimetic mode and creates ruptures in its tissue.²

The deer in "Whoso List", commonly identified as Anne Boleyn, is an object of the poetic persona's pursuit and desire, a trigger for his severe self-scrutiny and a body not to be touched for it has been claimed by Caesar, i.e. the king. The poem's meaning, however, remains suspended between the historical Anne and the concept of power which is as elusive and omnipresent as Anne. Greenblatt has pointed out "the central place of translation" (1984: 145) in the study of Wyatt's work, for his ambassadorial experience taught him how to slide in and out of a foreign culture, i.e. how to use language to fashion elaborate identities. "Whoso List" is a loose translation of Petrarch's "Una candida cerva", but it is also a superb performance in the art of evasion and subversion, which enables the poet to freely traverse the domain of the individual and the public, thus refusing to tame the meaning of the poem and

² Simon Schama also refers to "Whoso List to Hunt", in the part of his documentary dealing with Anne Boleyn, which may signal the smooth transition of the poem from contemporary theory to heritage. The theorised image of Anne Boleyn, as an incarnation of power struggle, seems immensely adaptable to various interpretations of history.

its historical referent. The poem's confessional tone is deeply misleading because it constantly oscillates between "performance and truth-telling, rhetoric and revelation" (Falconer, 2010: 278).

When the hunt for Anne's phantom lovers begins, it is precisely Wyatt's ability "not to confess his need but to conceal it" (Mantel, 2012: 284) that enables him to slip through the language and reality of the indictment, in spite of his alleged intimate relationship with Anne. This gains a particular resonance in light of the courtiers' insecurity caused by the Treason Act of 1534 when "it became an act of treason to convey, even if only in spoken words, a desire to harm the king, his queen or his heir" (Robinson, 2008: 13). In an attempt to explain the poet's power over language and history, Cromwell at a certain point even enacts an imaginary interrogation of Wyatt:

You point to the page, you tax him: what about this line, is this true?
He says, it is the poet's truth. Besides, he claims, I am not free to
write as I like. It's not the king, but meter that constrains me. And I
would be plainer, he says, if I could: but I must keep to the rhyme
(Mantel, 2012: 348).

Interestingly, the personal pronoun "he", which is a signifier for Cromwell's deep mind throughout the narrative, here becomes indistinguishable from the mind of another supreme performer in the novel – Thomas Wyatt – whose self-fashioning, just like that of Cromwell, is fully enacted in language.

CONCLUSION

Hilary Mantel's *Bring up the Bodies* successfully combines diverse approaches to history. This plurality may be read even from the physical positioning of her text between a dedication to Mary Robertson, which precedes the novel, and an Author's Note at the end. Significantly, Mary Robertson is a dedicated Cromwell scholar who helped Mantel with her research so that her name is an academic reference which validates Mantel's version of history before the reader embarks on a fictional journey to the past. The Author's Note is positioned outside the narrative but this separation is undermined by the novel's final words, "There are no endings. If you think so you are deceived as to their nature. They are all beginnings. Here is one" (Mantel, 2012: 407). The playful ending indicates that the Author's Note might be the beginning of a new narrative, apart from the obvious fact that it anticipates the third sequel of the Cromwell trilogy.

Furthermore, Mantel's words in the Note curiously echo the rhetoric of Cromwell and Wyatt when she says that she does not claim any authority for her version, but is simply making a proposal. Just like her two supreme performers, who write themselves and then disclaim themselves, Mantel cannot resist the allure of emplotting the only piece of text that is ostensibly authentic.

Representation of the past in this novel draws on the theatrical and experiential aspect of heritage in order to invoke the dynamics of courtly life in 16th-century England. The realist mode of writing, as well as the tools and strategies of heritage, imply the presence of a (narrative) authority which ensures coherence, continuity and a sense of teleological vision. However, a liberal humanist precept of the novel's/author's moral vision is seriously undermined by Cromwell's "moral emptiness", which nonetheless does not invalidate the power of his historical vision. The dominant ideological thread in the novel is defamiliarized by the intertextual presence of new historicist notions of power, sexuality and language and their relevance for understanding courtly culture. The influence of contemporary literary theory on Mantel's narrative sometimes results in haunting textual presences, such as that of Thomas Wyatt who evolves into a pastiche-like figure who feeds upon critical interpretations of his poetry.

The dynamic blend of academic history, heritage and literary theory has won Mantel both popular and critical acclaim and, just like her main protagonist, she carefully guards the boundaries of her texts, especially when it comes to their translation into other media. That is probably why she refused the advances of Hollywood film makers and chose instead to have her novels adapted into a six-part series for the BBC and a stage play (Davies, 2012). It appears that Cromwell's incarnation of Englishness and his consummate theatrical skills will ensure the novel's cultural afterlife.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. *A History of Britain*. Written and presented by Simon Schama. The Complete Series. BBC, 2006. DVD
2. Burke, Peter. Performing History: The Importance of Occasions. *Rethinking History*. Vol. 9, No. 1: 35-52, March 2005.
3. Davies, Catriona. Hilary Mantel becomes first woman to win literary prize twice. *CNN*, October 17, 2012, <http://edition.cnn.com/2012/10/17/showbiz/hilary-mantel-double-booker-prize-winner/index.html>.

4. De Groot, Jerome. Empathy and Enfranchisement: Popular Histories. *Rethinking History*. Vol. 10, No. 3: 391-413. September 2006.
5. Falconer, Rachel. Wyatt's 'Who so list to hunt'. In Michael Hattaway (ed.) *A New Companion to English Renaissance Literature and Culture*. Volume One. Oxford: Wiley Blackwell, 2010.
6. Greenblatt, Stephen. *Renaissance Self-Fashioning: From More to Shakespeare*. Chicago and London: The University of Chicago Press, 1984.
7. Lethbridge, Lucy. Decent, Respectable & Empty. *Commonweal*. Vol. 139, Issue 20: 27-28., 11/23/2012, www.ebscohost.com.
8. Lowenthal, David. *The Heritage Crusade and the Spoils of History*. Cambridge: CUP. 2009.
9. Mantel, Hilary. *Bring Up the Bodies*, London: Fourth Estate, 2012.
10. Marić, Vesna. Bosnia-Herzegovina wears its history like a pair of cement shoes. *The Guardian*. 5 April 2012. <http://www.theguardian.com/commentisfree/2012/apr/05/bosnia-herzegovina-history-war>
11. O'Donnell, Angela Alaimo. A Tale of Two Thomases. *America*. Vol. 208, Issue 13: 24-27. 4/22/2013, www.ebscohost.com.
12. Robinson, Jon. *Court Politics, Culture and Literature in Scotland and England: 1500-1540*. Aldershot: Ashgate, 2008.
13. Waller, Gary. *English Poetry of the 16th Century*, New York: Longman, 1993.

HISTORIJA, BAŠTINA I KNJIŽEVNA TEORIJA U ROMANU HILARY MANTEL *BRING UP THE BODIES*

Sažetak

Priča o engleskom kralju Henryju VIII i Anne Boleyn jedno je od najkontraverznijih poglavlja u engleskoj historiji. Zbog nedostatka historijskih

dokaza, ova priča oduvijek je pripadala prostorima historijske imaginacije i neumoljivo izmicala imperativima činjenične koherentnosti i zaokruženosti.

Britanska autorica Hilary Mantel, dvostruka dobitnica književne nagrade Booker za dva romana koja su dio iste trilogije, ispisuje ovo poglavlje historije iz ugla Thomasa Cromwella, kraljevog sataniziranog ministra. Mantel uspijeva očuditi svijet dvorskih intriga tako što se udaljava od matrice romanse i vješto koristi subverzivne koncepte kulturne i historijske baštine.

Cilj ovog rada je da pokaže kako njen posljednji roman, *Bring Up the Bodies* (2012.), manipuliše iskustvenim i performativnim aspektom kulturne i historijske baštine, dok istovremeno svjesno crpi interpretativne resurse novohistoricističke misli. Na taj način, Mantel pozicionira svoj roman unutar neobilježenog, neprohodnog prostranstva koje dijeli popularnu i akademsku historiju.

Ključne riječi: historija, Hilary Mantel, novi historicizam, performativnost, Thomas Cromwell.

Zvonimir Radeljković

CULTURAL ENCOUNTERS: BOSNIAN/CROATIAN/SERBIAN WRITERS AND AMERICA ¹

Abstract: This paper will discuss the appearance of translations from American literature in Croatian, Serbian and Bosnian, from 1875 till the present, and their impact on the creative writing in these territories. It will discuss the probable reasons for the appearance of translations of specific works and non-appearance of others, the quality (or lack of quality) of translations, and the importance of translators. It will explore forms in which American influences appear in the fiction and poetry of Bosnia, Croatia and Serbia, as well as certain Balkan echoes in American literature.

Key words: translation, influence, American literature, Bosnian/Croatian/Serbian literatures.

I want to discuss the appearance, and impact of translations from American literature on literary works in South Slavic languages such as Bosnian, Croatian, and Serbian (BCS). In other words, what happens when two or more civilizations, very unlike each other, meet on an artistic ground and start communicating. On the other hand this issue of differences is rather complicated. One could conceivably assume that there are certain similarities between the Balkan countries and the US, at least in the multi-cultural texture on which they are based. One could also argue that one of the large differences between America and the Balkans lies in the fact that the Anglo-Saxon

¹ The majority of data for this study was obtained from a bibliographical study, *Bibliografija rasprava, članaka i književnih radova*, Jugoslavenski leksikografski zavod, Zagreb, 1956–, especially from vol. III, *Historija stranih književnosti (History of Foreign Literatures)*.

(WASP) writers were until recently absolutely dominant in the culture of the US, whereas in the Balkans it is not easy to make any such generalizations, to find any nationally dominant group of writers. So, in spite of these relative similarities and differences, as well as the absolute distance, geographic and cultural, there have been points of contact, some faint but some quite strong, connecting the writing in the Balkans and the US. Throughout the twentieth century, long before the arrival of NATO troops and the UN administration in the region, literature, together with other arts, was the strongest tie between the United States of America and the Balkan countries.

It is a notorious fact, however, that the English language had no firm foothold in these parts in the 19th century and earlier, unlike German, Hungarian, Italian, Turkish, even French and Russian. Nevertheless the first major American author translated into the common language (BCS) appeared relatively early, and the translator's choice did not quite conform to the public tastes of either, the country of origin or the recipient country. While Longfellow was at the summit of his popularity and recognition, while James Russell Lowell was still highly respected in the US, the Croatian translator, possibly under the influence of French symbolists, especially Baudelaire, selected for the first translation from the American English Edgar Allan Poe's poem "The Raven". It was published in 1875 in the Zagreb literary magazine, *Vienac (The Wreath)* which was at the time edited by August Šenoa, a major Croatian historical novelist, whose father was Czech and mother Slovak. It is quite possible that Šenoa himself translated Poe, since it is known that it was him who afterwards translated two poems by Longfellow: "The Slave's Dream" and "Old Clock on the Stairs", of which the latter, at least in its tone, reminds of "The Raven". But more significantly Šenoa's own poem "At the Carnival" ("Na poklade") about the death of a child resembles not only Goethe's "Erlkönig", but in its macabre tone Poe's poems as well.

The third American poet to be translated gives an indication of a Balkan instinct to recognize literary values, even when they were shockingly non-conformist. Articles on Walt Whitman, namely, started to appear in BCS periodicals as early as 1897, only five years after the poet's death, and the first translations were soon to follow in 1900. These early Whitman translations illustrate some of the difficulties their translators were having in the uncharted sea of American language and culture: for instance in a place the author is referred to as Uolt Vajtman. Yet one of the first Whitman's translators was Ivo Andriæ, the first and only writer in BCS to be awarded the Nobel Prize for literature in 1961. His translations of Whitman's poems appeared in 1912 in three Sarajevo magazines, *Bosanska vila*, *Glasnik*, and *Omladina*, while he was still in high school, and a few months later as he became a freshman at Zagreb

university, studying science². Further more, in 1921, to mark the centenary of Whitman's birth, Andrić published a very well informed and perceptive essay on Whitman which holds its own even today. Another Whitman's translator, in the nineteen forties was a very well-known Croatian poet, one of its best modernists, Tin Ujević.

The subsequent appearances of translations of Twain's *The Prince and the Pauper* in 1908, Upton Sinclair's *The Jungle*, translated as *Močvara* (meaning "swamp") in 1911, and Bryant's poem "Thanatopsis" in 1913 are quite logical, and present a rather conventional choice. One rather wonders about what was left out. Not only was there no translation of Hawthorne till the 1950s; he wasn't even mentioned anywhere, and in this sense fares worse than Melville who has one honorable mention in a magazine article. There is surprisingly little of Emerson: his essay on Shakespeare appeared in 1924, and then nothing until after 1945. An article about Thoreau got published in 1899, but this interest did not develop, and *Walden* appeared in BCS only in 1982.

The period of 1920s brought very little news in the BCS acquisition of American literature. The first novel by James Fenimore Cooper, *The Last of the Mohicans*, got translated in 1927, once again by an important Croatian writer, Vladimir Nazor, very much interested in nature as well as heroes from the past. But the Thirties displayed a burst of interest in a special section of American literature. While all the translations and critical comments in magazine articles on American literature before that sprang primarily from a literary interest, a curiosity for transatlantic literary developments, there were obvious political overtones in the Thirties in the selection of writers and books to be translated.

Three most popular writers in the Thirties, Jack London, Upton Sinclair and Sinclair Lewis, reflect the search for values different from the mentality that prevailed in the Kingdom of Yugoslavia. Jack London was the most translated American writer in Yugoslavia then; thirteen of his books appeared between 1927 and 1935. Upton Sinclair and Sinclair Lewis followed closely with nine books each between 1927 and 1939. Other American writers well known and widely read were John Dos Passos whose *Manhattan Transfer* appeared in 1933, and *42 Parallel* in 1939.

The translators of this large segment of social fiction had different degrees of knowledge of English. Some admitted they were translating from German translations, and others did it clandestinely, claiming some knowledge of English, but relying for their text mostly on the cheap and readily available German paperback editions of American authors, the Tauchnitz editions. The

² See Miroslav Karaulac, *Rani Andrić*, Prosveta, Beograd, Svjetlost, Sarajevo, 1980, p. 106-107.

quality of most translations was consequently appalling: at the time there were no reliable dictionaries of the English/BCS languages, and so the translators lacked tools as well as language skills. But in spite of a number of not-quite-adequate translations, in spite of numerous title changes in a typically German manner – London's *John Barleycorn*, for instance, was renamed *Kralj alkohol* (*King Alcohol*) – it is a fact that American literature was read and discussed by many Croats, Muslims and Serbs between the two world wars. It is also important to mention that these books were sometimes translated by leading Serbian and Croatian writers. There was even newspaper polemics about the quality of translation of American fiction³, and the ideas and techniques of American social novelists must have contributed up to a considerable degree to experiments and solutions of Yugoslav writers.

Still, from a purely literary or esthetic point of view, readers in BCS were largely uninformed about major modernist developments in American literature during the 20s and the 30s. A novel by Ernest Hemingway, *A Farewell to Arms*, appeared in 1938, badly translated from German, and probably therefore remained almost unnoticed. F. Scott Fitzgerald was never even mentioned in print, and William Faulkner, although mentioned once, was likewise untranslated, as were T. S. Eliot, Ezra Pound, Robinson Jeffers, Robert Frost, or Sherwood Anderson. These were just unknown names. The main criterion for selection of books to be translated was ideology, but also the probability of commercial success: this is probably the reason why Henry James was unknown, while Anita Loos' *Gentlemen Prefer Blondes* appeared in translation as early as 1927, only two years after its American publication.

The Second World War and the period of several years after it brought a halt to most kinds of publishing except the political one. Between 1945 and 1950, when Russian and politically correct Communist books dominated, there were only two works of American fiction translated, both reflecting the inherent polarity between realism and romanticism, especially from the point of view of people of former Yugoslavia who mostly did not have enough to eat. These two were Margaret Mitchell's *Gone with the Wind* which appeared in 1946, and Steinbeck's *Of Mice and Men* in the next year.

During the following decade, in the 1950s, after the break with the USSR, English language was for the first time introduced into elementary and secondary schools as a language of choice. But the most impressive feature of the period was an unprecedented burst of translation energy, making available

³ See Omer Hadžiselimović, *Poruke i odjeci: Američki socijalni roman u kritici na srpskogrvatskom jezičkom području od 1918. do 1941. godine*, Svjetlost, Sarajevo, 1980, p. 47-50.

to former Yugoslav readers books from all over the world. It seems obvious that the period of waiting under the domination of “social realism” caused the intensity of the consequent liberation of BCS culture. This was the time when the leading English and American modernists became available in BCS, such as Eliot and Pound whose poems we first read as teenagers in inspired, if not always accurate, translations of Antun Šoljan and Ivan Slamnig. It was in this period that most gaps in the knowledge of American literature were closed: in that decade more than 30 books by major American authors came to be translated. And yet, all these writers, the classics and the contemporaries, appearing in BCS for the first time, were far from being the most read segment of American literature. From the point of view of the “general reading public” Luis Bromfield, Pearl Buck and, surprisingly enough, Theodore Dreiser, were among the most popular American writers, and their works were sold in great sets which must still adorn with their ornamented bindings many homes in what used to be Yugoslavia. But the most popular writer, hands down, was still Jack London, whose works appeared in 48 separate editions during the Fifties in BCS, probably reflecting the nostalgia for literary tastes of the past. The second most popular author of the Fifties was Zane Gray whose Western novels appeared in 10 editions, mirroring the reappearance of American movies, in particular westerns, on Yugoslav screens.

It was in the Fifties as well that first signs of American influence on popular culture began to appear. Blue jeans, together with American music became the landmark of the age. The younger generation listened almost exclusively to American music, first in the form of jazz, enormously popular in the dance-halls and on the radio in the middle and late Fifties, and later on in the form of rock’n’roll. All this, of course, influenced and helped the reception of American literature. It was in the early Sixties that a kind of official recognition of American literature took place: several American books were introduced into the literary curricula of elementary and high schools as obligatory reading, including *Leaves of Grass*, *Light in August*, and *The Old Man and the Sea*.

Towards the end of the millennium, the periods between the original dates of publication of American books and the appearance of the translation tended to become shorter, especially during the Seventies and Eighties, and it became a matter of course to expect books successful in America to be translated. Apart from the popular culture in which science fiction, detective stories, comics and such movie version originals like *The Love Story* and *Godfather* dominated, most of major American writers from the period became available, in some cases almost complete, as with Saul Bellow, whose *More Die of Heartbreak* appeared in Sarajevo in 1990. One expects nowadays to see bestsellers, even strange ones as Frank Mc Court’s *Angela’s Ashes* or John Gray’s *Men Are from Mars, Women Are from Venus* to appear in translation soon after its original

publication. But is there any literary impact in this interaction? What are the literary results of numerous translations?

Not counting the recent transplants, such as Aleksander Homen, Semezdin Mehmedinović, or Josip Novakovich, who haven't quite become American yet in spite of their success there, there is at least one prominent echo from the Balkans materialized in the contemporary American poet Charles Simic, born in Beograd, Serbia in 1938, but raised and educated in America, who is emeritus professor in the English Department of University of New Hampshire, and is widely anthologized. He was also the fifteenth U. S. Poet Laureate and received the fellowships of Guggenheim and MacArthur Foundations. His poems sometimes show a successful blend of both elements of his past – his Balkan history and his American experience – illustrating thus the merits of multiculturalism as well as the essential cosmopolitanism of modern culture. This is one of his poems:

The Lesson

It occurs to me now
that all these years
I have been
the idiot pupil
of a practical joker.
Diligently
and with foolish reverence
I wrote down
what I took to be
his wise pronouncements
concerning
my life on earth.
Like a parrot
I rattled off the dates
of wars and revolutions.
I rejoiced
at the death of my tormentors
I even become convinced
that their number
was diminishing.
It seemed to me
that gradually
my teacher was revealing to me
a pattern,
that what I was being told
was an intricate plot
of a picaresque novel

in installments,
the last pages of which
would be given over
entirely
to lyrical evocations
of nature.
Unfortunately,
with time,
I began to detect in myself
an inability
to forget even
the most trivial detail.
I lingered more and more
over the beginnings:
The haircut of a soldier
who was urinating
against our fence;
shadows of trees on the ceiling,
the day
my mother and I
had nothing to eat....
Somehow,
I couldn't get past
that prison train
that kept waking me up
every night.
I couldn't get that whistle
that rumble
out of my head....
In this classroom
austerely furnished
by my insomnia,
at the desk consisting
of my two knees,
for the first time
in this long and terrifying
apprenticeship,
I burst out laughing.
Forgive me, all of you!
At the memory of my uncle
charging a barricade
with a homemade bomb,
I burst out laughing.⁴

⁴ <http://articles.latimes.com/1998/jul/26/books/bk-7120> Accessed Sept. 26, 2013.

The obviously Partisan uncle from this poem, a mythical hero illustrating absurdities of history, is somehow vitally connected to ghosts of Stephen Crane and Robinson Jeffers, to the American poetic heritage, and the two worlds blend into a new whole.

If one searches for echoes of American literature in the works of writers in BCS, one shall discover that there are at least two types of influence. The first one is of broad cultural impact: it often reached the Balkans through other foreign literatures and is therefore rather difficult to pinpoint, or to show in a specific instance. One such example is the Whitmanesque free verse which since 1920s permeated a great deal of poetry in BCS, with its unrhymed lines of irregular length, catalogues of images and internal rhythms. Yet it seems that it was chiefly introduced through the direct influence of French symbolists like Rimbaud or Laforgue, who probably drew on Whitman.

The other type of influence can be discovered in the presence of certain thematic or stylistic parallels in the works of BCS and American writers. Such cases might sometimes be just coincidences, but sometimes the textual evidence seems to be so strong to indicate more than that. Let me start with a novel whose very title, translated into English, clearly shows its model: it runs *The Strange Story of the Great Whale, Also Known as Big Mac*. This satiric novel, by Erih Koš, Serbian-Jewish writer, appeared in BCS in 1956. Its translation into English was published in 1962⁵. The post-modern ironic reference to Big Mac of MacDonald prominence is accidental, since the book appeared in the Balkans more than a decade before the brand-name arose in America (1968). The plot of the novel has almost nothing to do with Melville's *Moby Dick or the Whale* except for the overwhelming presence of a whale in the story, a dead one this time. The story line goes like this: a whale had been caught in the Adriatic, and it was shown all over the country. People were very excited about it, all except the unnamed narrator, who refuses to see it or even discuss it, thinking the topic trite and tasteless. As a result his friends leave, his girlfriend deserts him, but all that makes him only more fanatical in his refusal to have anything to do with the whale. In the end, however, he does give in, and he goes to see the whale, but only after all people have stopped caring about it, since they have found some other more up-to-date attraction, and the stinking carcass is left to sanitation engineers to dispose of. The parallel between *Moby Dick* and *Big Mac* consists mainly of giving symbolic importance to the whale, endowing it with a universal meaning, and there is of course a similarity between the narrator and Melville's Bartleby. Instead of quoting from ancient and modern literary and scientific texts about the whales

⁵ Erih Koš, *The Strange Story of the Great Whale, Also Known as Big Mac*, New York, Harcourt, Brace, 1962.

as Melville did, Koš quotes extensively from daily newspapers, achieving basically the same effect, with a touch of modern vulgarity thus stressing the situational irony.

Another example of an influence more tonal than thematic is the impact of T. S. Eliot's poetry on a number of modern poets in BCS. I hope to illustrate the extent and scope of Eliot's presence, by giving an example from the poetry of Croatian poet Daniel Dragojević: This is the last stanza of Dragojević's poem "On the Deck" in the translation of Jovan Hristić and Bernard Johnson:

Hands on the rail and a firm horizon.
Needed hand, voice of another dawn
Which knows our weakness and our own misfortune,
We might have pitied that we were so young
With strength but not humility. We know.
But we still didn't push away the cup, the bitter wall.
Please don't allow this blindness, arrogance.
Thy Will be done.⁶

Further on it is necessary to mention the stylistic influence of Hemingway's fiction on writers in BCS. Here is a section from a story by the well-known Serbian writer Antonije Isaković, which seems to me to strongly resemble Hemingway's method. It should be added that Isaković, like Hemingway, writes mostly on war. This is from a short story called "April's Fool Day" ("U znaku aprila", *Paprat i vatra*, 1962) translated by Bernard Johnson:

The train had only five carriages. The officers were in the first two, behind the engine, and they all had the same insignia on their shoulders – violet epaulettes. There were boats on the carriages' tin roofs and the oars had been fastened down with their ends stuck out of the windows like short sticks. There was a continual hum from the crowd which had assembled in the small area between the station and the iron barrier, and the people were all the time craning forward to look inside the forbidden military train.

The Engineer Corps, where are they going? Up to the front or to the rear?

Will there be another train, will there be one for us?

How the hell do I know?

You're polite, aren't you? ...

Shut up, old man, what are you doing here with your withered legs. Your throat's much too wrinkled and your tie's choking you. Just take a look at that nose of yours, go on, don't be shy.

⁶ Daniel Dragojević, "On the Deck", *New Writing in Yugoslavia*, ed. by Bernard Johnson, Penguin Books, Middlesex, England, 1970, p. 79

There's not enough room, you'll crush that woman.
What a way to speak to an old man... Times are really hard.⁷

I cannot continue listing examples of such influences within this short article. Let me just list a few random ones: one of the best Serbian novelists and worst politicians, Dobrica Ćosić in one of his war novels entitled *Divisions (Deobe)* published in 1961, polyphonically structured with long sections of interior monologue in the stream of consciousness technique, introduces an American colonel from the South whose name happens to be Sartoris. A major Bosnian writer, Meša Selimović, once told me that he was trying to recreate the Faulknerian perspective in his books on Bosnia.

There's also special case of literary symbiosis, made possible by the Fulbright program and other forms of scholarly exchange between America and the Balkans appearing in a novel by a Serbian contemporary writer Milan Oklopdžić, published in 1981, with the title in English, *Ca. Blues*. This is in essence an American novel, written in BCS. Oklopdžić tells not only the story of his own life, but in a *deja vu* sense his story repeats and mirrors the biography of Jack Kerouac as already told in the autobiographical *On the Road* (1957). It portrays California in the Seventies, and American-Balkan dreams concern drugs, fast cars, unlimited sex, travel with plenty of Jack Daniels, in other words not very much different from ambience of Kerouac's novels. But this was only foreshadowing of what was going to happen in the mid and late Nineties.

It would be an oversimplification to conclude that writers in BCS who show American influence, even in the case of Oklopdžić, were only trying to imitate their American models. The elements they took from American literary works, whether stylistic or thematic, almost in all cases acquired new meanings in their new venues, due to a complete change of the spiritual and physical context, sometimes quite different from the meaning of the original. They suffered a sea-change and become allotropic forms rather than substances they originally were. And they are precious as such. The very fact that such literary exchanges can and do exist reveals two basic facts: the ever-increasing global importance of American literature, as well as an increasing openness of writers in BCS to stimuli from great writers of the world. So a lot of rich material appeared in a kind of cultural symbiosis which will hopefully and teleologically lead to the kind of *Weltliteratur* Goethe dreamed about.

⁷ Antonije Isaković, "April Fool's Day", Bernard Johnson (ed.), *New Writing in Yugoslavia*, p. 23.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. Dragojević, Daniel. "On the Deck", Bernard Johnson (ed.), *New Writing in Yugoslavia*. Middlesex, England: Penguin Books, 1970.
2. Hadžiselimović, Omer. *Poruke i odjeci: američki socijalni roman u kritici na srpskogrvatskom jezičkom području od 1918. do 1941. godine*, Sarajevo: Svjetlost, 1980.
3. Isaković, Antonije. "April Fool's Day", Bernard Johnson (ed.), *New Writing in Yugoslavia*, Middlesex, England: Penguin Books, 1970.
4. Karaulac, Miroslav. *Rani Andrić*. Beograd: Prosveta, Sarajevo: Svjetlost, 1980.
5. Koš, Erih. *The Strange Story of the Great Whale, Also Known as Big Mac*. New York: Harcourt, Brace, 1962.
6. Oklopčić, Milan, CA. *Blues*, Bograd, BIGZ, 1981.

KULTURNI SUSRETI: BOSANKI/HRVATSKI/SRPSKI PISCI I AMERIKA

Sažetak

Ovaj članak govori o pojavljivanju prevoda iz američke književnosti na bosanskom/hrvatskom/srpskom jeziku od 1875. do danas, kao i o njihovom uticaju na književnost na ovim prostorima. Tu se raspravlja o vjerojatnim razlozima pojave određenih djela, dok se druga nisu pojavljivala, o kvaliteti ili slabosti prevoda, i o značaju prevodilaca. Također se ispituju oblici američkih uticaja na prozu i poeziju Bosne, Hrvatske i Srbije, kao i izvjesni balkanski odjeci u američkoj književnosti.

Ključne riječi: prevodi, uticaj, američka književnost bosanska/hrvatska/srpska književnost

Sanja Šoštarić

REPRESENTATIONS OF AFRICAN-AMERICANS IN AMERICAN CINEMA

Abstract: The paper explores the development and modification of film stereotypes about African-Americans through the history of American cinematography. It focuses on three American movies that have either perpetuated and reflected the prevalent racial stereotypes already existing in pre-cinematic entertainment forms (D.W. Griffith's *The Birth of A Nation* from 1915), or introduced the new ones, no less problematic (S. Kramer's, *Guess Who's Coming to Dinner* from 1967) or achieved a more differentiated depiction in the black independent cinema of the late 20th century (S. Lee's *Do the Right Thing* from 1989).

Key words: film industry, race, African-Americans, history, stereotypes, silent movie, interracial marriage, independent black cinema

INTRODUCTION

From the very beginnings of the American film industry in the early 20th century, immense popularity of the film as a new artistic form has launched a debate about ethical concerns. Then as now, in the USA and elsewhere, moral, political or cultural implications of the cinematic works have engendered highly sensitive reactions of the public. On the one hand, the attention has been repeatedly drawn (particularly by the more conservative voices) to the manipulative power of the film language, images or messages, that is, to the danger of easy youth or mass indoctrination by harmful ideologies, dubious worldviews or socially unacceptable values. On the other hand, filmmakers and more progressive social groups have always defended themselves by insisting on artistic 'freedom and autonomy' as well as on the inseparability of text and context, i.e. on the mutual interplay of art and its wider social context, arguing that the interdependence of film and society is a two-way process where movies simultaneously shape and mirror social perception, particularly in the

sense that they reflect and confirm both the officially accepted norms and values and the unwritten social rules, thus separating the normative from the non-normative practices. With regard to movies as socio-cultural documents, there is a discernible tendency in the movies of the late 20th century towards stronger and more frequent questioning of the widespread norms and conventions, for example by problematizing the position of the marginalized or less influential social groups or individuals. At the same time, such pronounced critical attitude has been accompanied with a similar response in the field of cultural studies, including film studies, to the effect that early artistic forms and contents have undergone re-examination and revision from the perspective of the affirmation of the Other (referred to as the 'identity politics' in the Anglo-American cultural theory), whether the Other be identified as women, particular marginalized ethnic, religious or racial groups, gay/lesbian population, or any other groups excluded from the mainstream for any given reason.

In the specific context of the American cinema, this approach significantly intercedes with the question of the position of African-Americans in the American society, that is, their celluloid representations, in the sense that early movies are being read as the documents of cultural stereotypization. It has become a commonplace in the film studies to point out the undisputed and indispensable role the American cinema played in the defining of the American dream by creating and perpetuating the Americans' myths about themselves and about America as a place from which nightmares, worries and troubles are banished, in which justice and human bonds always prevail, and in which a peculiar blend of robust individualism and unreserved communal spirit guarantees the range of freedom and economic prosperity hitherto unseen in the world history.

Daniel Leab, a well-known culturologist whose research includes stereotypical representations of African-Americans in the American cinema has indicated that from its beginnings 'the American film industry left the black out of that [American] dream, either by ignoring him or by presenting him as an object incapable of enjoying it because of a nature that was not quite human' (Leab, 1976: 2).

THE BIRTH OF A NATION

What connects all stereotypes about African-Americans used in the early American cinema was the intention to dehumanize black population by reducing them to the half-human or sub-human species, in other words by the

attempts to present their humanity as incomplete, lacking, always under the question mark, which has historically been proved an efficient method in discrediting the undesired social groups. American film that in the period 1890-1915 became the most popular entertainment form has thus from the outset serviced the creation and perpetuation of racial stereotypes. The early American film took over many stereotypes about blacks from the earlier theatrical-musical forms such as the minstrel shows and vaudeville. The minstrel show was a popular antebellum genre that showed life of blacks in the American south through a mixture of the burlesque, humorous sketches, singing and dancing. Typical protagonists were illiterate, lazy, good-natured, dumb, infantile and irresponsible blacks who wasted their time away in a predictable way, namely either dancing their wild 'African' dances or stealing chicken or watermelons, gin drinking and disfiguring English language. Later theatrical forms of the late 19th century, alongside with the figure of a silly, unreliable servant from the minstrel show, sometimes introduced a 'positive' stereotype of the 'faithful retainer', a selfless figure born to serve, diligent and doglike in his fidelity to his white master's family, at all times bent on contributing only to the master's welfare and hostile to any idea of racial equality.

Two further theatrical stereotypes introduced in the period were the figures of the 'brute' and the 'tragic mulatto', both extremely negative in their perception of the black man as a menace to the established white hegemony, a projection of the whites' fears of the black retribution, reflecting to a certain extent a paranoid social context created by the white man's insistence on racial segregation and discrimination. Black brute is thus characterized by the inborn desire to abuse, humiliate or harm whites, including physical violence, murder or, frequently, the rape of the white woman. The mulatto is inevitably shown a tragic figure, a victim of the race mixing, where his whiteness accounted for all good qualities that were tragically neutralized or wiped out by the evil black blood. The goal of this stereotype in showing the mulatto as an abnormal creature was to discourage miscegenation.

The first feature films from the early 20th century took over and perfected all the above-mentioned stereotypes, so that the depiction of African-Americans on the screen was as uniform and predictable as in the pre-cinematic production, leaving no room for modifications or for venturing outside the standard and widely accepted social and cultural framework that rested on the axiom of the inborn white supremacy, hence on the belief in the necessity of keeping racial relations within the boundaries of a rigid, unchanging hierarchy. David Wark Griffith's movie *The Birth of A Nation* (1915) is a fitting illustration of the above-mentioned. This three-hour movie has not only reconfirmed and unified all the existing stereotypes about African-Americans

(it can be read as an encyclopedia of racial stereotypes), but it reconfirmed, justified and rationalized a systemic racism in the American society. The movie enraged the African-American population, both individuals and organizations such as the National Association for the Advancement of Colored People – NAACP), but also the white liberal society, it sharpened racial tensions, and caused serious riots and protests in many American cities. For the African-Americans this movie signaled that at the beginning of the 20th century they were still excluded from the American dream, that is, that the American myth in the year 1915 was still exclusively white. Griffith's skillful use of new cinematic techniques (e.g. quick change of scenes to achieve a dramatic 'cross-cutting' effect, the use of close ups and fadeouts, the shooting of long, slowed-down scenes such a seven-minute scene of chase ending with a suicide, etc.) made this movie a technologically and artistically highly accomplished work of art for its time (and therefore still regarded a landmark in the development of world cinematography), but as such it was also quickly recognized as a powerful weapon in the popularization of racist theories and used by the Ku Klux Klan for the recruitment of new members. The movie is basically Griffith's film version of the story about the causes, progress and consequences of the American civil war 1861-1865 from the white-racist viewpoint through a story about the intertwined destinies of a southern and a northern family. This silent movie begins with an intertitle which unequivocally identifies the main cause of the civil war: 'the bringing of the African to America planted the first seeds of disunion!', whereby the entire movie may then be perceived as a skillfully construed elaboration of that thesis. African-Americans, perceived as an un-American, savage, anticivilizational element, are represented as the chief hindrance to the unification of the American nation and a threat to the Union. The movie's first part shows friendship between the sons of the northern Stoneman and the southern Cameron family, as well as a double love story between the sons and daughters of two families. The idyll is broken by the civil war in which one Stoneman and two Cameron boys die. Austin Stoneman, the father of the northern family, is an important political figure in Washington and an abolitionist and desegregationist whom the ever closer victory of the North in the civil war enables to aggressively promote his political views. The first part ends with Lincoln's assassination, while the second part communicates the essence of Griffith's racist message. This part shows the reconstruction in the South based on Stoneman's principles of egalitarianism and racial equality, issuing a warning about what might happen if whites were to become that politically irresponsible as to hand over the political decision-making power and the voting right to black people. Scenes of black anarchy in Piedmont, South Carolina, the home of the Camerons during the civil war, abound in the second part: the arrival of black militia to Piedmont and their bursting into the

Cameron house, the assault on the father Cameron, the plundering and vandalism of blacks, the hiding of the white women in the cellar, the killings of whites on the streets of Piedmont and alike, stopped only by the arrival of white rescuers – the Confederate forces. The scenes of black terror after the civil war include discrimination against whites, after black people, thanks to Austin Stoneman's policy, gain equality. In Griffith's version, liberation of the blacks brings nothing but black terror, abuse and humiliation of whites (e.g. in a scene blacks are seen pushing whites off the sidewalk, insulting and threatening them) and the punishing of blacks loyal to whites and the old system.

Griffith certainly does not miss the opportunity to chastise political shortsightedness of abolitionists and white liberals, represented in the movie by Austin Stoneman. The inadequateness of the white liberal policy toward blacks that enabled them to become sheriffs, judges, or parliamentary representatives, is shown in the scene of parliamentary session in South Carolina, in which black men are shown as savages utterly incapable of civilized or politically responsible behavior. Black men are shown with their bare feet on the table, gobbling down whiskey and meat, and discussing the legalization of interracial marriages, simultaneously throwing lascivious, ominous glances towards the white people in the gallery with unmistakable message that the desire for racial equality is motivated by the black man's lust for the white woman. This implication was intended to frighten the white audiences into believing that the fight for racial equality primarily stemmed from the desire for sexual domination over the white woman. Interracial marriage was here used as a euphemism for sexual control of the black man over the white woman, and through it for the black man's humiliation of the white man, which for Griffith was unnatural and abominable. Beside the scenes showing black anarchy and savagery, Griffith included the earlier theatrical stereotype of the tragic mulatto through the figure of Silas Lynch. Lynch is the abolitionist Stoneman's protégé, insofar as Stoneman's inappropriate promotion of black rights forwards Lynch's political career to the effect that Lynch becomes the main instigator of black anarchy in Piedmont after the war. Silas Lynch is shown as a shrewd rogue who abuses Stoneman's naivety and goodness, wanting both political domination over whites and Stoneman's daughter Elsie. Griffith once again focuses on the lusting for the white woman, alongside with the will for political power, as the main motivation of the black evil-doers, thus using this particularly touchy issue to stimulate hatred and mistrust of the white audiences toward the black race. He also condemns the foolishness of the white abolitionists like Stoneman whose fight for racial equality directly endangers the white women's honor, or, as in Stoneman's particular case, his own daughter's honor, practically handed over into the claws of the evil mulatto.

Lynch ends up proposing to Elsie Stoneman, announcing his wish to make her the queen of his Black Empire, locking her up in the house after being rejected and issuing orders for the forced marriage preparations. Lynch's female duplicate is a cunning, morally doubtful mulatto Lydia Brown, Stoneman's house keeper and perhaps a lover, which might explain his unnatural advocacy of the rights of black people.

Griffith likewise takes over the negative stereotype of the brute through the figure of Gus, a former Camerons' slave, a product of the 'dark doctrines', as the accompanying intertitle reads, who vents his lowest instincts by chasing the youngest Camerons' daughter through the woods in the above-mentioned seven-minute scene and forcing her to save herself from rape by throwing herself off the cliff. The lust for the white woman is shown here in its most direct and most shocking form. That the white man's war against racial equality is basically the war for the honor of the white woman, i.e. that the law and order protecting the white woman are possible only in the society resting on necessary racial segregation and inequality is shown in one of the closing scenes, where the father Cameron holds a gun against his other daughter's head, prepared to kill her should the black chasers burst into the cabin where the Camerons have escaped.

Beside the evil, menacing figures, the movie incorporates lighter but just as diminishing stereotypes from the early minstrel shows and theater. For example, a scene in the first part shows a group of slaves on the Cameron plantation who are overjoyed to entertain the Camerons and their northern guests with their dancing during a two-hour dinner break after a day's hard work in the fields (from six to six, as the intertitle suggests).

Another stereotype used is that of the faithful retainer, here an obese, elderly black woman, a servant of the Camerons, who remains loyal to her beloved masters during the wild looting of the black militia in Piedmont. In one of the scenes she helps Mr. And Mrs. Cameron escape from Piedmont and physically assaults a black soldier to protect the Camerons.

In Griffith's cinematic depiction of the American civil war, the order is reinstated only after the founding of the Ku Klux Klan, glorified as a modern white man's knightly order resolute in defense of peace and freedom. They represent the main force that reestablishes the 'natural' order of white supremacy, thus defending the white women's honor. Griffith refers to the Ku Klux Klan as 'the organization that saved South from the anarchy of black rule', imposing the conclusion that the 'birth of a nation' could come about only after the northern and southern whites agreed to keep blacks under control. Thus, with the Klan's aid North and South overcome their earlier political hostilities, 'united again in common defense of their Aryan birthright'.

It is noteworthy to point out that Griffith achieved in this movie a somewhat more complex depiction of the black people than was ordinary in his time (as well as many decades later). Paradoxically, in emphasizing negative stereotypes of the evildoer and the brute motivated by savage instincts, Griffith has, beside demonizing, invested his black figures with a certain dimension of humanity, no matter how twisted, which in itself represents an exception in a long history of film stereotypization of African-Americans in the American cinema. However, it is by no means a recommendation for his movie, but serves as an illustration of the scope of discrimination in society and on the screen of the age. Anyway, Griffith's movie, described by the African-American author Oliver Killens as 'Hollywood's first powerful weapon in war against the black American' (Leab, 1976: 22) has unfortunately established standards of cinematic representation of African-Americans based on a range of one-dimensional stereotypes who prevailed for decades up to the 1960s.

GUESS WHO'S COMING TO DINNER

The above-mentioned negative film stereotypes about the African-American served to underline his animalistic nature, while the lighter stereotypes about dumb bimbos or good-natured but limited faithful servants entirely robbed black characters of any traces of integrity or dignity. The only mentionable exception in the early 20th century was the opus of the first African-American director Oscar Micheaux. However, it was only in the 1960s that new social movements and theories, such as the Civil Rights movement, feminism, initiatives for black emancipation ranging from a peaceful diplomacy of Martin Luther King to the more radical doctrine of Malcolm X and his Nation of Islam, then the anti-Vietnam war activism, gay movement, hippy subculture and rock'n'roll, liberalized and redefined traditional values. At the root of all these initiatives was the awareness about the necessity of social change that implied a reassessment of traditional hierarchical relations within the family, at the work place, in education, politics, art etc. Along with the demands for gender equality, freedom of sexual orientation, the rights of ethnic groups etc., the time has finally come to openly discuss the racial issue in the US, as a particularly touchy subject in the American society. The achievements such as desegregation, voting right and alike, which were being repeatedly challenged by the conservative racist groups and lobbies, still did not mean that genuine racial equality was attained. Racial issues in the US of the 1960s included countless contradictions, while the increased legal equality was not automatically leading to full-blown social equality or to the changed awareness of individuals. An important question remains whether that process has ever

been completed in the USA, or whether the contemporary American society is truly 'post-racial' as some theorists would have it. Film industry has certainly documented these social changes along with the accompanying contradictions, so that the cinematography in the 1960s saw a break away from earlier stereotypical representations of African-Americans. At the same time it created the new ones.

An ample illustration of the new one-dimensional stereotype of the 1960s was the protagonist in Stanley Kramer's *Guess Who's Coming to Dinner* (1967), a movie that focused on a controversial subject of interracial marriage between a white woman and a black man. However, the very fact that the director decided to tackle this sensitive issue indicated a changed social climate. The turbulent socio-historical background of the movie involved the passing of the Civil Rights Act in 1964 which outlawed racial segregation in public places, as well as the 1965 protest marches in Alabama leading to the passing of the Voting Rights Act. In the same period a series of upsetting political assassinations followed all of which were to a greater or lesser extent linked to the racial issue: J. F. Kennedy's in the Republican Dallas in 1963, and then Martin Luther King's and Malcolm X's. In the year of the movie's release (1967) interracial marriage was still banned in sixteen American states, while the *Loving vs. Virginia* case made the headlines, ending with the historic ruling of the Supreme Court on the lawfulness of interracial marriages that allowed a white American Loving and his black bride move back to their native Virginia which they had had to leave to avoid imprisonment due to the Virginia restrictive anti-miscegenation laws. In view of the political climate and tensions surrounding racial issues, Kramer's movie represented an unusual move in Hollywood that secured the director support of liberal viewers and critics. The movie was praised as groundbreaking in the history of the American cinematography, as the first Hollywood's movie with a progressive antiracist message. Yet, Donald Bogle, in his study of the film stereotypization of African-Americans, points out that the reformist spirit of the 1960s made many movies released in the decade culturally significant per definition, in that they inevitably reflected the challenges in the American society caught up in the cultural transition. Many of these movies, including *Guess Who's Coming to Dinner*, simply were a blend of the old and the new, provoking an equally mixed response, so that the ones praised the movie for its courageous venturing into the new territory, while the others claimed it was not essentially progressive since it merely presented the old values in new disguise. In particular, the movie provoked enraged response of the African-American community and, partially, of the white liberals for its watered-down, unrealistic treatment of the important subject. The actor Sidney Poitier who played the main role, Hollywood's first African-American black megastar, soon became a

favorite target of the African-American fury. Poitier's Hollywood success (e.g. he became the first black Oscar-winning actor in the main role in 1963) made him unpopular in parts of the African-American community that accused him of coopting with the dominant white culture and the Hollywood system and of betraying his race and the idea of racial emancipation by accepting lucrative roles that had little or nothing to do with the reality of racial relations in the country. Some labeled him 'the white man's nigger', alluding to the historical film stereotype of the faithful retainer, some saw him as 'too white', pointing at the roles he played in the period 1963-1967 that in their opinion were impersonations of black men shaped by the white people's perception of black men. His character of Dr. John Prentice in Kramer's movie is unrealistically ideal, more caricatural than genuinely affirmative, or, as Boogle emphasizes, his role represented a version of ideal black man that, from the African-American perspective at least, seriously undermined his position of an undisputed star.

The movie begins with a white girl returning from vacation to her San Francisco home and her liberal, affluent parents with a black boyfriend she announces she plans to marry. Despite initial resistance, especially from the fathers of the two families, the movie has a happy-ending, while the girl's father Matt Drayton, played by Spencer Tracy, realizes he must give his consent to the marriage, if he is to confirm in practice his theoretical support of the racial equality. Ironically, just like the abolitionist Austin Stoneman from *The Birth of A Nation* (but with a different outcome), Drayton has an opportunity to test his political convictions on the most sensitive issue of his own daughter's future. The future son-in-law Prentice played by Poitier is perfect, with impeccable biography, tidy, sensible, educated, intelligent, a Nobel Prize candidate, a dedicated altruist engaged in aid projects for Africa, handsome, well-behaved, eloquent, leaving the father Drayton no option but to admit that the only reason for refusing him would be his own racial prejudices. Sarcastic comments by the film's detractors and critics saw in this the implicit belittling of the blacks, claiming that the only way a black character could be worthy of a white bride was if he was unrealistically perfect as a fairy-tale prince.

Finally, the character of Tillie, the Draytons' black housemaid, embodies the old stereotype of the faithful retainer. Tillie is mistrustful toward Prentice and makes it clear to him that she sees him as a plain double-dealer, and warns him she watches him, so he will not be able to deceive her as he did the Draytons. Tillie, in her loyalty to the Draytons and readiness to confront people of her own race for their benefit, is basically a modern modification of the old stock character. In line with the stereotypization, Tillie is disinterested in her own emancipation, and rejects the Civil Rights activism as silly fashion and

temporary modern craziness, condemning Prentice as a Negro who elevated himself above his race. Tillie's character, as well as Prentice's, has been created primarily for the average white movie-theater goers, with the intention to make it less difficult for them to accept a shocking subject of interracial marriage, since Tillie wants to maintain the status quo, while Prentice advocates desegregation in an unrealistically polite manner, except when arguing with his own black father. Besides, Prentice's brilliant university education crowned with a PhD in medicine and a splendid career have had little foundation in the American reality of the 1960s, which may have proved particularly irritant for the African-American audience. Furthermore, the fact that the final word in the movie is given to the white man, the future Prentice's father-in-law Drayton, suggests that elderly white males are more capable of abandoning their prejudices than the black men from the same generation (such as Prentice's father), which seems to demonstrate superiority of whites, as they are shown as the ones who adapt faster to changes and faster overcome their prejudices.

DO THE RIGHT THING

After a series of unconvincing, halfway committed Hollywood movies of the 1960s such as *Guess Who's Coming to Dinner*, discredited by the black and white progressive audiences and critics as naively escapist (e.g. a *New York Times* article 'Why Does White America Love Sidney Poitier So?'), representations of African-Americans on the screen in the early 1970s shifted in new directions, but they still did not bring about an essential change. While, on the one hand, reality finally started seeping into American cinema, namely the reality of race riots, militant black movement, widespread discrimination, growing crime rates, urban prostitution and drug addiction particularly tied to the black neighborhoods in the American cities such as New York and Los Angeles etc., a more recent image of the African-American, on the other hand, remained quite one-dimensional in a new way, inasmuch as race became hip and sold the movies, while the growing interest in the black experience went hand in hand with attempts of the young whites to imitate the black street and ghetto slang. However, this interest in black (sub)culture remained rather superficial as did the true understanding of the position of black people. This time, the dumb servant or the evil mulatto or even the Poitieresque handsome and exemplary black man were replaced by the less polished and cooler black superspade: muscular, attractive, supersexi seducer. In the 1970s, the new stereotype was applied to a wide range of male characters, so that the typical black character of the early 1970s was an intelligent, cynical, invincible

detectiv Shaft from the popular samenamed police thriller. More problematic and more negative variation of the black superspade dominated the 'blaxploitation' film wave of the early 1970s, popular among black audiences, which showed the main protagonist as a cool anti-hero who lives outside the law, a womanizer and irresistible macho lover, a cunning warrior of the black ghetto abiding in the world of gamblers, drug addicts and drug dealers, drunkards, and thieves, in the manner of Sweetback from *Sweet Sweetback's Badass Song*. Unfortunately, a new stereotype deprived the African-American of humanity by creating another caricature instead of offering an image of a genuinely multilayered personality. Still, despite the shortcomings of the blaxploitation movies with their oversimplified characters and glorification of life determined by the ghetto rules, violence and sex, which associated all African-Americans with vice and lawlessness, these movies for the first time brought the black ghetto to the American screen, i.e. the Hollywood film camera for the first time, no matter how superficially and temporarily, looked into the world on the social margin that has been excluded from the American myth of middle class (largely white) welfare. Yet the interest in the blaxploitation movies rapidly ceased, partly due to the improved financial situation in the film industry, no longer dependent on the blaxploitation movies for attracting large numbers of profit-securing black viewers. On the other hand, many African-Americans objected to undifferentiated (mis)representation of black people through the use of blaxploitation clichés (similar stereotypes are nowadays used in the hip-hop music video clips).

At about the same time, the first serious attempts at a more distinct and complex articulation of the black/African-American film aesthetics were accompanied with the founding of organizations directed against the stereotypization of African-Americans in the American cinema. This included Jesse Jackson's People United to Save Humanity – PUSH, or the Coalition Against Blaxploitation – CAB, or the Blacks Against Narcotics and Genocide – BANG aimed against the 'mental genocide', that is, the glorification of crime and drug culture typical of the blaxploitation movies.

Finally, the 1980s saw a new generation of African-American filmmakers who formulated a new African-American film aesthetics, launched an independent African-American film production, hired African-American actors and actresses and, for the first time in the history of American film, showed authentic black characters in authentic situations, accentuating racial issues but always placing them in a wider social context, while the destinies of the featured protagonists, although African-American, were also universally human. Spike Lee belongs to filmmakers from this generation who successfully combined commercial interests and artistic concerns. His movie *Do the Right*

Thing (1989) appropriately illustrates some major points of the new black film aesthetics.

Building up on the blaxploitation tradition in which movies were set in urban black ghettos, Spike Lee situates his film stories in the New York neighborhood of Brooklyn and focuses on its black inhabitants. In this manner he creates a new genre of the so called 'hood movie', a movie set in an urban area inhabited prevalently by black people. As such, Lee's movies resemble hip-hop video clips and musicals of the 1980s focusing on the microworlds of Bronx and Brooklyn, including the graffiti art, rap and hip-hop music and a popular street dance 'breakdance'. In many ways Brooklyn is the main protagonist of Lee's movies or major Lee's black urbanscape.

The simple storyline of Lee's movie shows different ways in which young Brooklyn African-Americans, *Mookie*, *Radio Raheem* and *Buggin' Out*, cope with existence on the social and economic margin as well as with the white discrimination embodied in the New York police and some neighborhood whites or with the tensions and challenges of multiculturalism.

Lee foregrounds differentiated, multilayered, complex African-American characters from Brooklyn's urban routine of the late 1980s. He is interested in the destinies of ordinary individuals in Brooklyn and in their everyday problems and temptations, while the movie's action is limited to twenty-four hours in Brooklyn on the hottest day in the year. Wider socio-political and economic background, including questions about the possible causes of Brooklyn's social and economic deterioration or of the economic and cultural downtown decay, that is, pointing at the connection of this phenomenon with the beginning of deindustrialization in the late 1970s, when factories were first moved out of American downtowns and cities and then outside the US, is not shown directly or explicitly, but the theme is handled in an indirect manner through the individual stories and interaction of Brooklyn inhabitants. Lee creates characters with a lot of empathy and understanding but refrains from sentimental romanticizing. At the core of Lee's movie is the analysis of racism and its possible causes and consequences as well as of possible ways of overcoming racism in the urban, late-20th-century America.

As an established chronicler of the marginalization of African-American urban population, Spike Lee quickly attained fame and popularity among the African-American audiences, hungry for the authentic film representations of African-American experience, but he also drew attention of a part of white audiences and critics, which proved crucial for his success. Thus, Spike Lee became a true media star of the 1980s and 1990s and probably the most popular and the most influential Afro-American film director in the history of American film. His movies have launched a heated debate in the US concerning the painful

racial issue and sharpened the white people's awareness for the difficult position of African-American urban subclass, whom the deindustrialization excluded from the capitalist job market and thus deprived of work that might secure a decent living. Divided response from within the African-American community saw Lee either as an authentic voice of the marginalized and underprivileged urban African-Americans (a view shared by most white critics), or as a director who has failed to offer a sufficiently clear picture of the causes of severe social problems in black urban neighborhoods (e.g. Rhines Jesse Algeron) thus partly confirming the white middle class stereotypes about African-Americans in showing that black people's failure was partly self-inflicted due to their notorious irresponsibility, lack of discipline and work ethics and alike.

Still, it is undisputable that Spike Lee showed with a lot of empathy all complexity of living as the young Brooklyn African-American and undermined one-sided stereotypes which nourished fears and suspicion of the whites toward this social group. He showed that Brooklyn is not merely the world of violence, drugs and hopelessness, but that its inhabitants are human beings capable of compassion, tenderness and tolerance. Lee's characterization reflects urban black culture and the worldview of the young, urban, prevalently unemployed African-Americans without standard education and clear existential perspective, left to the street, who are both the victims and the carriers of the consumer mentality, and as such define themselves through the graffiti, hip-hop, music and clothing.

Lee implicitly shows that many of them are steeped in idleness and leisure, but regardless of the lack of steady income (except Mookie) they wear trendy T-shirts and sneakers, indirectly hinting that the money comes from drug dealing or alike. Therefore, clothes and music, in line with the protagonists' life style, represent the main method of characterization: the local radio station speaker Radio Raheem is wearing a T-shirt with the inscription 'Bed Stuy', the name of the neighborhood he comes from and in which the movie is set, which identifies him as a person belonging in the community. Mookie is wearing a T-shirt with Jackie Robinson's name, which even before the action begins points at his ambivalent position between the African-American and the Italian neighborhood communities, because Jackie Robinson was the first black American League baseball player, i.e. a person who entered the history of American baseball as the first who crossed the racial barrier. Likewise, Buggin' Out's radical afro-nationalism is signaled by his T-shirt and shorts with African patterns and his African-inspired hair style.

At the same time, *Do the Right Thing* reverberates with the Public Enemy song 'Fight the Power' which represents an authentic African-American voice and

attitude of the Brooklyn inhabitants with regard to their position – wanting change and feeling powerless or incapable of (depending on the personal viewpoint) real change. In this way, Lee promotes hip-hop as a legitimate expression of the African-American self-awareness and the urban youth (sub)culture, that during the late 1980s and the early 1990s started to overcome racial barriers, gaining popularity among both black and white young people. Radio Raheem is additionally defined precisely by being associated with this song and hip-hop subculture, with his ghettoblaster becoming a powerful weapon of the urban music guerilla and the defiant anti-racist stance. For the unemployed Raheem deprived of perspective making noise becomes the only possible act of resistance, indicating African-American presence and non-acceptance of social invisibility.

In the neighborhood, music wars are essentially cultural-political as well as territory wars. This is obvious in the scene where Raheem with the help of his ghettoblaster (his powerful music) competes with a group of Puertoricans. A quarrel over music tastes between Raheem and Sal, the Italo-American pizzeria owner for whom Mookie' works as a pizza delivery guy, illustrates that the dispute is a cultural warfare over the right to one's own physical and mental space that music symbolizes.

Do the Right Thing shows how real frustration of the Brooklyn inhabitants (of all races) over their life on the margins, combined with the hellish heat of the New York summer, leads to the escalation of violence and hatred. The first serious sparks fly during the apparently harmless and for Brooklyn ordinary quarrel between Sal and gloomy, dissatisfied Buggin' Out over Sal's 'wall of fame'. Buggin' Out criticizes Sal for refusing to include on his wall the pictures of famous African-Americans along with the pictures of Italo-Americans: Robert de Niro, John Travolta, Joe di Maggio, Frank Sinatra etc. Buggin' Out states that Sal should accept that since blacks have become a majority group in Brooklyn and Sal's most numerous, if not the only, customers, they deserve more respect. On that occasion, Mookie is as usual in an embarrassing position of the mediator between the opposed sides, because he must be loyal to Sal as his employer and throw Buggin' Out out of the pizzeria for instigating unrest, on the other hand he sympathizes with his friend who warns him that he should 'stay black', i.e. not betray his race. This indicates the complexity of the position of black people who are condemned as traitors by their own people whenever they try to find their place in the white man's world in accordance with the rules imposed by whites.

Racial and ethnic tensions in the neighborhood dangerously escalate, because the radical Buggin' Out does not accept Sal's right to hang on the wall of his pizzeria the pictures he wants to, calling on every occasion for the boycott of

Sal's pizzeria, which generally does not elicit any serious approval by other blacks. However, in a scene which represents the beginning of violence escalation, *Buggin' Out* finds understanding in the silent but frustrated Raheem, who already had a quarrel over music with Sal that same day.

Soon thereafter an open hostility between the two and Sal breaks out in the pizzeria. Sal smashes Raheem's ghetto blaster and Raheem attacks Sal, which leads to the ensuing chaos in the neighborhood. With the arrival of police events get out of control after a white policeman virtually strangles Radio Raheem while on duty. Raheem's murder is Lee's direct comment on the brutality of the system and widespread racism, that is, on countless real cases when African-Americans lost their lives under dubious circumstances in contacts with the police, such as the Brooklyn inhabitants Eleanor Bumpers and Michael Stewart.

Finally, violence culminates with the burning down and demolishing of Sal's pizzeria. Mookie finds himself in the center of these events, being the only African-American in the neighborhood who, working as a pizza delivery guy for Sal, daily crosses, as Paula Massood states, 'the variety of visible and invisible borders with which people stake their claims on the neighborhood' (Massood, 2003: 137). Like the baseball player Jackie Robinson who crossed the racial barrier and whose name Mookie is wearing on his T-shirt, Mookie feels on his skin, figuratively and literally speaking, both the privileges and the pressures derived from his role of the mediator. Although Mookie basically does not support radical afro-nationalism advocated by *Buggin' Out*, after Raheem's murder he decides to side with his community by throwing the first garbage bin through the shop window of Sal's pizzeria and thus open the last act in the all-day spiral of violence.

Mookie's dilemma lies in him having to do the right thing (as the movie title suggests), that is, make a right decision, while the movie's main message seems to be that, due to the complex intertwinement of racial, ethnic, political and class factors, it is extremely hard to know what is right and what is not right. Did Mookie do the right thing in directing the rage and the frustration of the black mass to the pizzeria, that is, was Sal right in seeing this act as treason, or was Mookie right in so doing after all because this way he certainly saved Sal's and his sons' lives, redirecting the accumulated rage of blacks toward the physical object. Was that kind of retribution for Raheem's murder appropriate? Is everything to be blamed on *Buggin' Out*'s radicalism and the fact that *Buggin' Out* talked Raheem into the confrontation with Sal? Does Sal deserve the punishment for his intolerance toward blacks? Is Sal a racist and is Mookie to a large extent a betrayer of African-American interests who makes a right choice only when he decides to side with his people? Is there any quality

solution for Mookie who loosely respects the Anglo-American work ethics and guards his permanent job for the minimal wage? At last, an important question is emphasized at the movie's beginning and ending through the contrasting of the pacifist and the radically-nationalistic response to racism embodied in the strategies of Martin Luther King and Malcolm X, whereby Lee reminds that in the late 20th-century-America the racial issue is far from easy solutions, perhaps suggesting that the new solutions might be sought somewhere between or entirely outside these two positions.

Particular merit of the movie is in Lee's reluctance to define racial issues in a superficial way by referring to simplistic formulas, but instead insists on showing a wide range of reactions to the complex reality inside both the African-American and Italo-American communities. These reactions range from Buggin' Out's radical afro-nationalism and black racism, or radical white racism (the policeman and Sal's older son Pino), over more moderate views which despite mistrust allow for a possibility of relative understanding, shown in the unusual relationship between Sal and Mookie or in the friendship between Mookie and Sal's younger son Vito), to passivity and resignation of the elderly generation of the Brooklyn African-Americans (Mother Sister and Da Mayor) which may be interpreted as a historical outcome of the experience of slavery and segregation. Anyway, Spike Lee showed there are neither simple solution nor absolutely reliable explanations of the causes or consequences. To those who criticized him for the lack of interest in the profound socio-economic analysis he replied he was not a sociologist or economist but an artist, and to those who criticized him for embarrassing the white middle class he replied it was high time whites came to terms with the representations of the American society from the African-American viewpoint and accepted reality, displaying on such occasions a distinct political stance and historical-racial consciousness.

The complexity and authenticity of Lee's movie has been confirmed in its ending, insofar as he avoids a cheap happy-ending or superficial optimism, taking into consideration the givens of American postmodern, postindustrial reality, socially devastated urbanescapes, racial and class tensions and leaves open the question about the future race and other relations in the US. He identifies the absence of vision and nihilism as the main hindrance and burden for the future, yet through the relationship between Mookie and Sal in the movie's closing scene, taking place in the morning after the riots, he points at a fragile hope in the future of a difficult but precious friendship. After the mutual blame game (Sal accuses Mookie of treason and Mookie in turn accuses Sal of insensitivity, because Sal will be refunded by the insurance, while Raheem lost his life) two of them continue together and start rebuilding a bitter-sweet professional-private relationship.

With the movies like this Spike Lee became an unavoidable reference in every serious survey of the development of the African-American cinematography and independent film industry but also of a more differentiated and more realistic depiction of the African-Americans and racial relations in the American cinema. That such depiction is pessimistic only reveals the uncompromising attitude of the author who rejects beautified versions of the American racial reality, for which reason his movies may seem extreme only to the less informed European viewers. Spike Lee stated once that *Do the Right Thing* cannot possibly have a happy-ending, because there is no happy-ending in the reality and that it could be only in the Hollywood version that Sal and Mookie might end up kissing each other, holding hands and singing 'We are the World': 'that's what gets me mad about this whole American myth, that it doesn't matter what color you are, creed or nationality, and as long as you're American, you'll be treated the same and viewed the same. That's a lie. It's the biggest lie ever perpetrated on the people in the history of mankind. None of my work is going to reflect that' (Rhines, 1996: 111).

For everything stated so far it seems appropriate to end this essay by referring to another Spike Lee's movie, namely *Bamboozled* (2000), that straightforwardly speaks of the ubiquitous racism inside the American television industry of the late 20th century, where the old minstrel show stereotypes are being revamped and the market philosophy and economic profitability instigate not only racism but also lack of knowledge about one's own roots as well as the cooptation of African-American artists and their capitulation before new forms of economic, racial and cultural discrimination. Lee suggests that despite hundred years of the development of the American film, the old stereotypical image of the African-American survives with appalling tenacity in the media space at the millennium's beginning. On the other hand, Spike Lee's movies represent a new exciting chapter in a race saga, proving it is possible to achieve a differentiated depiction of the African-Americans and the complex racial issues in the US.

BIBLIOGRAPHY

1. Bogle, Donald. *Toms, Coons, Mulattoes, Mammies, and Bucks: An Interpretive History of Blacks in American Films*. New York: Continuum, 1996.
2. Leab, Daniel J. *From Sambo to Superspade*. Boston: Houghton Mifflin Company, 1976.

3. Massood, Paula. *Black City Cinema: African-American Urban Experiences in Film*. Philadelphia: Temple University Press, 2003.
4. Rhines, Jesse Algeron. *Black Film/White Money*. New Brunswick, NJ: Rutgers University Press, 1996.

PREDSTAVLJANJE AFROAMERIKANACA U AMERIČKOM FILMU

Sažetak

Od samih početaka razvoja filmske industrije u SAD početkom 20. stoljeća ogromnu popularnost filma pratila je debata o moralnoj odgovornosti tog novog umjetničkog žanra, te je javnost, onda kao i danas, s izuzetnom osjetljivošću reagirala na moralne, političke ili kulturološke implikacije određenih filmskih sadržaja. S jedne strane se oduvijek ukazivalo na manipulativnu moć filmskog jezika, filmskih slika i poruka, s druge na međusobno prožimanje umjetnosti i šireg društvenog okvira pri čemu se odnos između filma i društva promatra kao dvosmjernan proces u kojem filmovi istovremeno oblikuju svijest jednog društva ali su i njegovo ogledalo u smislu da odražavaju uvriježene vrijednosti ili nepisana pravila. Ovakve debate se, između ostaloga, prelamaju preko pitanja položaja Afroamerikanaca u američkom društvu, odnosno njihovog predstavljanja na filmskom platnu.

Rana filmska ostvarenja se u tom kontekstu čitaju kao dokumenti stereotipizacije. Film D. W. Griffitha *Rođenje nacije* (*The Birth of A Nation*) iz 1915. godine najbolje pokazuje da su prvi dugometražni filmovi s početka 20. stoljeća preuzeli i nadogradili sve stereotipe koji su bili već prisutni u pred-kinematografskim oblicima zabave, poput 'minstrel show-a', vodvilja, mjuzikla i pučkog teatra: lik neodgovorne lude, lik vjernog sluga, lik nasilnika i lik tragičnog mulata/mješanca. *Rođenje nacije* se tako danas čita kao enciklopedija rasnih stereotipa tj. kao film koji je potvrdio, opravdao i racionalizirao sistemski rasizam u američkom društvu, te je, nažalost, ustanovio standarde prikazivanja Afroamerikanaca na filmu zasnovane na jednodimenzionalnim stereotipima koji su prevladavali decenijama, sve do 1960-ih.

Na valu liberalizacije američkog društva 1960-ih kada dolazi do ozbiljnijeg propitivanja i redefiniranja tradicionalnih vrijednosti pod utjecajem brojnih novih pokreta i doktrina kao što su pokret za građanska prava, feminizam, pokreti za emancipaciju Crnaca, antiratni aktivizam, hipi subkultura itd. U osnovi svih ovih inicijativa bila je svijest o potrebi društvene obnove koja je pretpostavljala dokidanje tradicionalnih hijerarhijskih odnosa u porodici, na radnom mjestu, u obrazovanju, politici, umjetnosti, vojsci itd., dakle u društvu općenito. Tako je najzad došlo vrijeme da se neuvijeno progovori i o rasnom pitanju u SAD kao izuzetno bolnoj tački američkog društva. Film je bilježio ove društvene promjene ali i protivvrječnosti, pa je tako došlo do razbijanja griffithovskih stereotipnih prikaza Afroamerikanaca, ali su istovremeno stvoreni novi, moderniji, stereotipi. Dobra ilustracija jednodimenzionalnosti novog pozitivnog stereotipa 1960-ih je glavni muški lik u filmu S. Kramera *Pogodi ko dolazi na večeru* (*Guess Who's Coming to Dinner*) iz 1967. Glavna tema filma je međurasni brak Crnca i bjelkinje, a sama činjenica da se režiser odlučio tematizirati to osjetljivo pitanje u godini u kojoj je međurasni brak još uvijek bio protuzakonit u šesnaest američkih država govori ponešto i o promjenjenom društvenom ozračju u SAD-u 1960-ih. Međutim, iako je dio liberalne javnosti podržao film kao prelomni trenutak u historiji američkog filma, kod dobrog djela afroameričke, ali i bjelačke, populacije, gledalaca i kritičara ovaj film je izazvao negativne reakcije zbog svog, po njihovom mišljenju, nerealističnog i razvodnjenog pristupa ovoj važnoj temi. Nakon serije blijedunjavih poluangažiranih holivudskih filmova iz 1960-ih koje je, poput višepomenutog, crnačka i bjelačka progresivna kritika diskreditirala kao naivno eskapističke, te nakon novog vala tzv. 'blaxploation' filmova 1970-ih koji su stvorili novi stereotip crnog antiheroja na ivici zakona tj. novu karikaturu lišenu višedimenzionalnosti, 1980-ih godina se javlja nova generacija afroameričkih režisera koja formulira novu afroameričku filmsku estetiku, pokreće neovisnu afroameričku produkciju, angažira afroameričke glumce i prikazuje autentične afroameričke likove.

Najznačajniji režiser iz te generacije, Spike Lee, je uspješno objedinio komercijalni interes i umjetničku dimenziju, te je njegov film *Učini pravu stvar* (*Do the Right Thing*) iz 1989. godine pogodna ilustracija nekih glavnih tačaka nove estetike neovisne afroameričke filmske produkcije. U prvom planu su diferencirani, višeslojni afroamerički i drugi likovi iz urbane svakodnevice Brooklyna kasnih 1980-ih godina. Leeja zanimaju sudbine običnih pojedinaca u Brooklynu i njihovi svakodnevni problemi i iskušenja, dok je šira socio-politička i ekonomska pozadina, uključujući pitanje propadanja gradske jezgre i deindustrijalizacije dotaknuta indirektno, preko individualnih priča i rasne i klasne interakcije različitih stanovnika ove newyorške četvrti. U osnovi filma je analiza rasizma, njegovih mogućih uzroka i posljedica, te pitanje mogućnosti

ili nemogućnosti njegovog prevazilaženja u urbanoj Americi kasnog 20. stoljeća. Posebna vrijednost ovog filma leži u tome što Lee odbija rasnu (i drugu) problematiku definirati površno uz pomoć jednostavnih formula, već prikazuje lepezu reakcija na složenu realnost unutar afroameričke i italoameričke zajednice. Filmovima poput ovog S. Lee je postao nezaobilazna referenca u svakom ozbiljnom prikazu razvoja kako neovisne afroameričke kinematografije tako i diferenciranog prikazivanja Afroamerikanaca i rasnih odnosa u američkom filmu. Da su ti prikazi prilično pesimistični ili nedogmatski govori o beskompromisnosti autora koji odbacuje zašćecerene verzije američke rasne stvarnosti i umjesto jeftinog sretnog završetka uzima u obzir datosti američke postmoderne, postindustrijske realnosti, socijalno devastiranih urbanih krajolika, rasnih i klasnih napetosti, te ostavlja otvorenim pitanje budućih rasnih odnosa u SAD-u.

Ključne riječi: filmska industrija, rasa, Afroamerikanci, historija, stereotipi, nijemi film, međurasni brak, neovisna crnačka kinematografija

Part two

Kamiah Arnaut-Karović

A BRIEF SURVEY ON THE GRAMMATICAL CATEGORY OF *-EN/-ED* PARTICIPLES

Abstract: This brief survey on the morphosyntactic and semantic properties of *-en/-ed* participles aims at a more detailed insight and better understanding of the *-en/-ed* participial forms occurring in the attributive and predicative function. The paper analyses whether there is any correlation between *-en/-ed* participles in both above-mentioned distributions, since such a correlation is present in the case of the majority of central adjectives. Since *-en/-ed* participles are the deverbal lexical units, the analysis is mostly focused on the extent to which these participial forms preserve the argument structure of the verb base. It has been noted that, while the predicatively used *-en/-ed* participles must be the result of morphosyntactic operations of inflection in which the *-en/-ed* suffix is attached to the verb base as the grammatical marker for aspect or voice (which depends on the type of diathesis in which they occur), and this process most probably takes place in syntax, their counterparts used in the modifying, i.e. attributive, function, although partially preserving the argument structure of the verb base showing the semantic orientation to one of the arguments, cannot always be related to the predicatively used ones. The *-en/-ed* suffix attached to the verb base, in order to be used as the attributive modifier, seems to be the derivational suffix and the morphological operation presumably takes place in the lexicon, not in syntax. A good indicator for this may be the fact that the correlation between the participles in the attributive and the predicative function does not always exist, and therefore, the participial attributes should be observed and analysed at the level of the lexeme and not as the equivalents of their predicatively used counterparts, which clearly belong to the category of verbs, with the exception of their predicative function in subject-complement constructions, in which it is almost impossible to identify whether the *-en/-ed* participle is an adjective or a verb.

Key words: *-en/-ed* participles, attributive function, predicative function, diathesis, derivation, inflection

1. INTRODUCTION

The *-en/-ed* participle, traditionally called “*past participle*” is usually defined as a word derived from a verb but used as an adjective (see Crystal, 1985 and Lyons, 1968: 250). Although the traditional term “*past participle*” seems inadequate since it involves the grammatical category of tense in spite of the fact that the *-en/-ed* morpheme is, in fact, the grammatical marker for the perfective aspect and not for tense, it is still widely used in linguistic literature studying the grammatical and semantic features of the *-en/-ed* participles in all their distributions.

As stated in the above definition, these participles share the syntactic distributions with both, verbs and adjectives. In their predicative use *-en/-ed* participles participate in the formation of perfective tenses, passive constructions as well as subject-complement constructions. In addition, many of the *-en/-ed* participles also occur in their modifying function, i.e. as attributes/adjuncts within the noun phrase. If they have not already achieved their full adjectival status and adjectival interpretation (denoting a property of...), such as: *tired, excited, disappointed* and the like, which can easily be tested by a number of linguistic tests such as: the intensifier *very*; prefix *un-*, modification by the expression *however* and the like (see Quirk et al., 1985; Siegel, 1973; Bresnan, 1978, respectively etc.), when they are used in their attributive function, the semantic interpretation of *-en/-ed* participles, most often called adjectivals, is frequently related not to adjectives proper but to verbs. Whatever interpretation they might have, either active or passive, when occurring as the attributes within the NP, they are very often related to their verbal counterparts used in relative clauses:

- (1) lost property = property that has been lost
- (2) the escaped prisoner = the prisoner who has escaped¹

For these reasons, *-en/-ed* participial forms are often ambiguous between being adjectives and verbs.

However, we claim that such a correlation between the *-en/-ed* participles, attributively used, and the ones in the predicative function does not always exist and that the attributively used *-en/-ed* participles should be observed as the lexical units formed by the morphological operations of derivation², which

¹ The above examples are taken from Quirk et al. (1985: 413).

² That the *-en/-ed* suffix is a productive derivational and not necessarily inflectional morpheme can be supported by a number of denominal adjectives which do not produce interpretational ambiguities like the deverbal *-en/-ed* forms: a *wooden table*; a

implies the processes in the lexicon, whereas the predicatively used ones are nothing but verbs marked for either perfective aspect or passive voice by the morphological operations of inflection at the syntactic level. This claim will be illustrated by examples that can show that some *-en/-ed* adjectival participles are possible while the corresponding diathesis is not, and vice versa, not all types of diatheses have the corresponding adjectival participle that can be used as an attribute at the NP level. This paper aims to show this asymmetry between the diathetic paradigm and the lexical category of *-en/-ed* participles.

2. THEORETICAL BACKGROUND

The above-stated definition that *-en/-ed* participles (just like *-ing* participles) are the words derived from a verb and used as adjectives implies that participles may be categorially neutral between two lexical categories: verbs and adjectives.³ However, in the most recent linguistic researches in the fields of morphology and syntax there are different standpoints with respect to the formation of *-en/-ed* participles. Those used as attributes are now believed to be a product of different processes such as conversion (Bresnan, 1978) or the morphological operation of null-affixation (Lieber, 1980; Levin and Rappaport, 1986; Kratzer, 1994 etc.), or syntactic operations in which the *-en/-ed* suffix is attached to the VP for verbal or V₀ for adjectival participles (Jackendoff, 1977; Abney, 1987) or V₀ is dominated by AspP for “verbal” as opposed to “adjectival” participles that have no projection on the top (Embick, 2004).

There is yet another problem closely related to *-en/-ed* participles. That is the term used to refer to this fuzzy lexical category. The traditional term, still widespread, not only in conventional grammars but also in linguistic papers, is “past participle” and it covers almost all types and subclasses of *-en/-ed* participles in all their distributions.

However, since *-en/-ed* participles share almost identical distribution with both, verbs and adjectives, different terms can be found for their different distributions. While they are traditionally called “past participles” in their verbal distribution and predicative function, the confusion about their

bearded man; a *green-eyed* boy, a *talented* writer, a *handicapped* child etc. When the denominal *-en/-ed* forms are used either attributively or predicatively they unambiguously refer to the state/property ascribed to the subject. In subject-complement constructions, just like in their attributive distribution in the NP, they are clearly adjectives denoting a property of a noun.

³ Progressive *-ing* participial forms also show the categorial and interpretational ambiguity between being nouns and verbs.

categorial identity arises, to a much greater extent, when they occur in the attributive function within the noun phrase. In this distribution they are called: participial adjectives (Quirk et al., 1985: 413); adjectival passives (Huddleston and Pullum, 2002: 1436), past participles (Langacker, 1991, Parsons, 1990, Levin and Rappaport, 1986, Ackerman and Goldberg, 1996) etc.

Semantic discussions about *-en/-ed* participles, particularly in their attributive position, are mostly concerned with their semantic orientation and semantic explanations aimed at making the distinction between *-en/-ed* participles with “verbal” and those with “adjectival” interpretation. When they participate in the formation of different types of diatheses, we can find terms such as “passive participles”, “perfect participles” and the like. The newly introduced term for *-en/-ed* participles used as attributes or predicates in the subject-complement constructions is the term “resultatives”.⁴ They are defined as “those verb forms that express a state implying a previous event” (Nedjaljkov and Jaxontov, 1988: 6).

A resultative participle is also explained as the one that “characterises its head by expressing a state that results from a previous event” (Haspelmath, 1994: 159).

However, the attempts to explain the very nature and grammatical behaviour of *-en/-ed* participles and the disputes as to whether they are verbs or adjectives continue. Therefore, precise identification and, consequently, their proper categorization either as verbs or adjectives or as a distinct and specific lexical category is not in sight yet. The aim of this paper is to show that there is not always a correlation between the same *-en/-ed* forms derived from the same verb base when they are used in their attributive or predicative function. In other words the *-en/-ed* participles which are used as attributes should not be observed and grammatically analysed in the same way as their verbal counterparts in the relative clause as shown in the examples (1) and (2), although Quirk et al. (1985: 413) claim that “when there is a corresponding verb, attributively used -ed forms usually have passive meaning.”

⁴ Haspelmath (1994: 159-161) defines the resultative participle (referring to the ones used as attributes or in the subject-complement construction) as the expression which characterizes its head “by expressing a state that results from a previous event”, as stated above. In other words, if used as an attribute in the NP, *-en/-ed* participle characterizes a participant by “affectedness”, i.e. by means of a resulting state only if the previous event affected or changed it somehow (e.g. *the abused child; the wilted dandelion*).

3. SOME REMARKS ON THE TERMS USED FOR THE CATEGORY OF PARTICIPLES

The traditional, still widely used, term for the participial forms in English is “present participle” for those formed by the suffix *-ing* and “past participle” for those ending in the *-en/-ed* suffix. The above terms involve the reference to the grammatical category of tense in spite of the fact that the suffixes *-ing* and *-en/-ed* are the grammatical markers for aspect (progressive and perfective, respectively) and not for the category of tense. That this claim is true can be easily supported by a number of examples showing that the *-ing* suffix refers to simultaneousness whatever the time frame of the action in the main clause is:

(3) She lay in bed thinking about what to do. (past time reference)

(4) She is lying in bed thinking about what to do. (present time reference)

Since *-en/-ed* suffix is the marker for the perfective aspect, then *-en/-ed* participial forms usually refer to “previousness” or the state resulting from some previous event, whatever the time frame of the action in the main clause is:

(5) Covered with mud, we walked down the street.

(6) Covered with mud, we are walking down the street.⁵

These are the reasons for which the most recent linguistic sources use various terms for *-en/-ed* participles. In their predicative use they are called perfect participles, passive participles or resultative participles depending on the type of diathesis in which they occur (active, passive or subject-complement). When used as attributes i.e. modifiers of nouns at the NP level, they are treated as adjectivals (hybrid category) and the terms used when they occur in this function are: participial adjectives, adjectival passives, past participles or resultatives as already stated in the previous section.

⁵ Contrary to *-ing* participles that refer to simultaneousness, whatever the time reference in the main clause might be, the above examples of the *-en/-ed* participial form “covered” may be ambiguous as to the time reference. The participle “covered” may be understood as dynamic – the reference to the previous event/action – (*after we had been covered with mud*) or as stative (the state resulting from the previous event) in which case the interpretation of the time reference is the same as expressed in the main clause.

4. SYNTACTIC DISTRIBUTIONS AND FUNCTIONS OF -EN/-ED PARTICIPLES

Since *-en/-ed* participles are considered to be the deverbal forms used as adjectives, they are expected to share the grammatical properties of adjectives. This is true to a certain extent because the majority of *-en/-ed* participles indeed share almost all the same distributions and grammatical properties with adjectives.

Their distributional similarities may be seen in the adjectival functions. Namely they are almost clearly adjectives in:

1. attributive function: *the embarrassed woman/cf. the content woman, a tired old man/cf. a strange old man, excited children/cf. obedient children* etc.
2. predicative function in subject-complement constructions:
 - (7) The woman was embarrassed. Cf. The woman was happy.
 - (8) The old man was tired. Cf. The old man was sick.
 - (9) The children are excited. Cf. The children are obedient.
3. object complement function (or predicative elements in the small clauses):
 - (10) She found the front door locked. Cf. She felt her mouth dry.
4. substitutes for the noun phrase (in the functions of the subject or direct object) just like any other adjective used pronominally (with a generic reference):⁶
 - (11) The injured were transported to the hospital.
vs. They transported the injured to the hospital.
cf. The old do not understand the young.

Distributional similarities with verbs can be seen in their predicative uses where they occur in:

- (12) The convict has escaped. (active diathesis)
- (13) The boy was/got killed (by the burglars) (passive diathesis)

⁶ Huddleston and Pullum (2002) call these phrases “fused heads” since the noun is deleted but implied.

The well-known ambiguity arises from the identical surface structure of passive and subject-complement construction. It is almost impossible to disambiguate constructions such as:

(14) The window was broken. Cf. The window was clean.

(15) The boy was killed. Cf. The boy was sad.

Where the *-en/-ed* participle shows distributional parallelism with adjectives but can have both, passive as well as resultative (stative) interpretation.

However, despite the above-stated distributional similarities with both categories, adjectives and verbs, there are some distributions in which they fail to overlap with adjectives:

1. Causative constructions formed by the verbs *have* and *get*:

(16) He had/got his car repaired. Cf. *He had/got his car new.

2. Passive constructions with the expanded predicate containing the subject complement:

(17) Tom was elected chairman. Cf. *Tom was happy chairman.

Though in the majority of the above-stated distributions *-en/-ed* participles overlap with adjectives and verbs, there are many examples showing that some *-en/-ed* participial forms that are possible in the predicative function (whether interpreted as verbs or adjectives) are not possible in the attributive function (when they function as adjectives but may have both adjectival and verbal semantic interpretation) and vice versa. Therefore, there is not a consistent correlation between the diathetic paradigm and the *-en/-ed* participial form that may still retain its verbal (dynamic) interpretation. For this reason *-en/-ed* participial forms in the attributive function, where they modify a noun within the NP, should be observed and analysed as the lexical units originating from the lexicon and merged with the noun directly, and not as the correlatives of the verbs occurring in the relative clause as illustrated in the examples (1) and (2).

5. *-EN/-ED* PARTICIPLES AND VALENCY RETENTION⁷

Since the base for the derivation of the participial forms is a verb which is, semantically, always the unsaturated expression, it is completely natural that the verb base retains its valency and argument structure even when the participial form is used in the modifying function, i.e. as the attribute in the NP. With the progressive participles used as attributes the argument structure is much better seen:

(18) a wine-producing region

(19) a rugby-playing surgeon⁸

The argument structure of the verbs *produce* and *play* in the above examples used for the derivation of the above participial forms in the attributive function is clearly preserved though they function as the modifiers within the NP. The problem with participial attributes is the fact that verbs may not function as the modifiers at all:

NP → (det.) A + N

*NP → (det.) V + N

The problems with the *-en/-ed* participles used attributively is their frequent passive interpretation, which means that the agent-argument is suppressed by the passive morpheme *-en/-ed*⁹. For this reason, majority of *-en/-ed* participles derived from transitive verbs are patient-oriented and therefore called “passive participles”. However, this is not necessarily the rule since *-en/-ed* participles, when used as attributes, may have a different semantic orientation since they are not restricted only to transitive verbs. Namely, *-en/-ed* participles, when occurring in the attributive function within the NP, may be derived from different types of verbs and may have different semantic orientation showing that they partially retain the valency of the verb base. The following examples are taken from different sources including: Quirk et al., 1985: 413; Bresnan, 1978: 8 and 2001, 34-35; Kibort, 2005, and some are selected from Collins Harper Corpus “Collins WordbanksOnline”:

⁷ The semantic orientation of resultative participles has been the subject of many linguistic studies dealing with the world languages. The above section is just a brief survey. For details see Haspelmath, 1994; Nedjaljkov and Jaxontov, 1988; Bresnan, 2001; Kibort, 2005, Ackerman & Goldberg, 1996 etc).

⁸ The examples are taken from the corpus “Collins Wordbanks Online”.

⁹ For details about passive morphology see Chomsky (1981: 121) and Cook & Newson, (2003: 196)

1. Attributive *-en/-ed* participles derived from the intransitive verb the only argument of which is an agent (and sometimes an experiencer):

- (20) The escaped prisoner
- (21) The departed guests
- (22) The surrendered militants
- (23) a failed writer
- (24) a grown man

The above examples show that the *-en/-ed* participles derived from such verbs may be either agent-oriented or experiencer-oriented.

2. Attributive *-en/-ed* participles derived from the intransitive unaccusative verbs the only argument of which is a patient or a theme:

- (25) elapsed time
- (26) a collapsed lung
- (27) a frozen river
- (28) the faded curtains
- (29) a vanished civilisation

These examples show that the *-en/-ed* participles derived from such intransitive verbs may be either patient-oriented or theme-oriented.

3. Attributive *-en/-ed* participles derived from transitive verbs are most often patient-oriented and to a much lesser extent they can also be oriented to the agent:

- (30) the confessed murderer
- (31) the confessed crime cf. The murderer has confessed the crime.

We may conclude that it is possible to derive the participial forms that can function as the modifiers of the noun from all types of verbs, but they may have different semantic orientation. The only exception are the middle verbs (in the terminology of Quirk et al., 1985: 735). Although these verbs are transitive, they may not be passivized, nor can they be used as a base for the derivation of *-en/-ed* participial forms:

- (32) *the resembled mother
cf. She resembles her mother. vs. *Her mother is resembled by her.
- (33) *the had room
cf. He has a nice room. vs. *A nice room is had by him.

It is obvious that the resultative participles partially retain the valency of the verb and preserve its argument structure, expressing the semantic orientation to one of the participants in the event. However, in spite of this strong verbal force that *-en/-ed* participles may retain from the verb base, they may still be used as the attributes in the NP in spite of the fact that verbs may not function as modifiers. Depending on the semantic orientation of these participles they may have either active or passive interpretation and are therefore frequently related to their predicatively used counterparts. That the attributively used *-en/-ed* participial forms do not always have a correlation with the type of diathesis in which their verbal counterparts occur and that they are the product of the processes in the lexicon, will be shown in the following sections.

6. TYPES OF DIATHESES

A diathesis conceptualizes the way in which actual syntactic dependencies relate to predicate's argument structure, and encompasses arguments and diathetic grammatical relation.
(Avgustinova, 2000: 85)

According to the above definition the different types of diatheses involve different ways in which the arguments of the predicating verb are mapped into the structure of the clause. The diatheses which preserve the argument structure of the predicating verb but they do it in two different ways are active and passive diathesis. In the former construction there is no alternation in the position of the arguments in relation to the predicating verb, and the latter is realized by rearrangement of the arguments¹⁰, which results in the change of the syntactic functions of the NP arguments while preserving the argument structure:

- (34) The burglars killed the boy. (active)

¹⁰ The rearrangement of the arguments in the process of derivation of passive constructions involve syntactic processes of promotion and demotion of the NP arguments – for details see Tallerman (1998).

(35) The boy was killed by the burglars. (passive)

Another type is the reduced diathesis involving reduction of the number of arguments and it is usually achieved by reflexivisation, impersonalisation, medio-passive constructions and the like.¹¹

The third type of diathesis is the extended diathesis in which the new argument is introduced and embedded into the sentence. These are causative constructions.

The problem in English arises between the *-en/-ed* participles and either their verbal or their adjectival interpretation when used as the predicating expressions in the reduced passive diathesis (in which the agent phrase is not expressed) or in the subject-complement construction in which the prototypical, and the most frequent predicating element, is an adjective.

7. TYPES OF DIATHESES VS *-EN/-ED* PARTICIPIAL ATTRIBUTES

In all the above-stated types of diatheses *-en/-ed* participle may occur as the predicating verb. In active diathesis the *-en/-ed* participle is the predicating verb participating in formation of all perfective tenses. In the process of derivation of the passive diathesis *-en/-ed* participle participates in the formation of the passive predicate. In other words it may occur in active and passive constructions as well as in subject-complement constructions.

The section explaining the semantic orientation of *-en/-ed* participles has shown that a large number of *-en/-ed* participles used as attributes are patient-oriented, while the number of agent-oriented ones is much more restricted. In

¹¹ For more details about the diathetic paradigm see Avgustinova (2000). What she calls reflexivisation is present in Bosnian/Croatian/Serbian when the expression “se” (prototypical reflexive) is used in some constructions such as: *Cipele se prave od kože.* (*Shoes reflex. make of leather*). However, this particle is in fact the “passive particle” – for details see Riđanović (2003). Riđanović also discusses impersonal particle “se” occurring with some verbs in certain contexts: *Ovdje se samo sjedi i priča o prošlosti* (*Here reflex. only sit and speak about past*). Medio-passive or the reduced type of diathesis in English can also include the clauses realized as active diathesis in their surface representation and the predicating verb is the intransitive unaccusative verb with a single argument – a patient or a theme.

other words the majority of *-en/-ed* participles have passive interpretation, and therefore, they are frequently referred to as “passive participles”. The aim of this paper is to analyse whether there is a correlation between the *-en/-ed* participles used in both distributions: predicative and attributive. Such a correlation exists for the category of central adjectives. Namely, the majority of adjectives can be used in both functions: attributive and predicative. If the *-en/-ed* participles are treated as adjectives when used in the attributive function then there should be an equivalence in their interpretation in both distributions and they should be classified in a single syntactic category – the category of adjectives. However, it is quite clear that they sometimes act as verbs and sometimes as adjectives. For this reason, *-en/-ed* participles should be thoroughly studied to be properly identified. That this approach can be helpful to a certain extent will be demonstrated by the text below, which will show that the correlation between the *-en/-ed* participles within the NP and the type of diathesis in which they may function as the predicates does not always exist in spite of the fact that they are very often interpreted by the corresponding relative clause as illustrated by the examples (1) and (2).

1. *-en/-ed* passive participles in the attributive function are possible but the passive diathesis is not with the unaccusative verbs, which are always intransitive and have only one argument – a patient:
 - (36) the wilted lettuce (Haspelmath, 1994; Bresnan, 2001)
cf. The lettuce has wilted. vs. *The lettuce has been wilted
2. *-en/-ed* passive participles in the attributive function are not possible but the derivation of the passive diathesis is, with the:
 - a) Promotion of the indirect object (argument: beneficiary):
 - (37) The captured bird was shown the way out.
cf. I have shown the captured bird the way out. (active counterpart)
vs. * the shown bird
 - b) Promotion of the adverbial of place (argument: location):
 - (38) This bed was slept in last night.
cf. Somebody has slept in this bed. (active counterpart)
vs. * the slept-in bed
3. Passive diathesis is always possible with the prepositional verbs, but passive attributes are very rarely derived from such verbs:

- (39) The boy was laughed at by everybody.
cf. Everybody laughed at the boy. (active counterpart)
vs. * the laughed-at boy
4. However, both, passive attribute and passive diathesis are possible with phrasal verbs:
- (40) The installations have been built in. Cf. The built-in installations
5. Neither is possible with “middle verbs” (see Quirk et al., 1985: 735)
- (41) *Her mother is resembled by her. Cf. * the resembled mother
vs. She resembles her mother.

8. SOME RESTRICTIONS AFFECTING SOME OF THE *-EN/-ED* PASSIVE PARTICIPLES

A certain number of passive *-en/-ed* participles are not acceptable in the attributive position unless preceded by the appropriate adverbial modification:

- (42) a recently built apartment block
- (43) a much-admired writer
- (44) brutally killed people

These *-en/-ed* passive attributes are obviously equivalent to their relative clause counterparts:

- (45) the apartment block (that has been) built recently
- (46) the writer (who is) very much admired
- (47) the people (who were) killed brutally

Such adverbially premodified passive *-en/-ed* participial attributes are sometimes treated as compounds (see Biber, 1999; Adams, 1973; 2001; Plag, 2003). Ackerman and Goldberg (1996) and Bresnan (2001) explain this phenomenon by pragmatic condition of informativeness. To be sufficiently informative, such expressions require modification. Besides, we might conclude that this phenomenon fits into the principle of economy and full interpretation, since such adverbially premodified *-en/-ed* passive participles have the same quantity of informativeness as the relative clause. In this way, at

the structural level, instead of the embedded relative clause there is the NP constituent without postmodification. This syntactic strategy enables full interpretation and, at the same time, the rest of the clause is open to some other pieces of information, which, consequently, increases the degree of informativeness of the entire utterance.

However, some of these *-en/-ed* passive participles that have verbal interpretation even though they function as attributes, can be gradable, and some cannot. For some useful tests that can help distinguish those with verbal and those with adjectival reading see Arnaut-Karović (2008).

9. CONCLUSION

It is clear that both, the type of the diathesis and the *-en/-ed* participial form which is used in the attributive function partially preserve the argument structure of the verb. However, it is also obvious that the *-en/-ed* participles used as the modifiers of the nouns, i.e. attributes in the NP are subject to a greater degree of semantic restriction. They are restricted mostly to the most prominent arguments (agent/experiencer and patient/theme) which, at the clause level, function either as subjects or direct objects. However, the patient-oriented participial attributes are much more frequent than the agent-oriented ones. The resultative *-en/-ed* attributes are almost never oriented to the less prominent arguments such as recipient or location. At the same time, these arguments can function as the subjects of the passive diathesis by a process of passive transformation. Therefore, there is not a consistent correlation between the modifying *-en/-ed* participles and those used in the predicative function. For the above reasons, *-en/-ed* participles in these two distributions – attributive and predicative – should not be treated and analysed as equivalents. This is the additional evidence proving that the *-en/-ed* suffix is indeed a derivational morpheme attached to the verb base in the lexicon when the *-en/-ed* participles function as the modifiers, in which case they directly merge with the noun in the process of forming larger structures, i.e. NPs. At the same time, the same morpheme attached to the verb in different types of diatheses fails to change the syntactic category. In this case the *-en/-ed* morpheme is a syntactically relevant inflectional morpheme when attached to the verb in the formation of the diathesis of the respective type. This process presumably takes place in syntax, not in the lexicon. Whether the derivational processes in the lexicon are the result of the morphological operations of conversion, as claimed by Bresnan, 1978 or null-affixation (Lieber, 1980; Levin and Rappaport, 1986; Kratzer, 1994 etc), or syntactic operations in which *-en/-ed* suffix is attached to the VP for verbal or V₀ for adjectival participles (Jackendoff, 1977; Abney,

1987) or V_0 is dominated by AspP for “verbal” as opposed to “adjectival” participles that have no projection on the top (Embick, 2004) is still the subject of theoretical discussions. This brief survey of the morphosyntactic and semantic properties of *-en/-ed* participles aims at a more detailed insight and better understanding of this fuzzy category of words in their major distributions and functions.

REFERENCES

1. Abney, S.P. *The English Noun Phrase in Its Sentential Aspect*, (Ph. D. Thesis) B.A. Indiana University. 1987.
2. Ackerman, F. And Goldberg, A.E. Constraints on Adjectival Past Participles. In Goldberg, A. E. (ed.) *Conceptual Structure, Discourse and Language*, Stanford, CA: CSLI Publications, (pp. 17-29). 1996.
3. Adams, V. *An Introduction to Modern English Word-formation*, London: Longman. 1973.
4. Adams, V. *Complex Words in English*. London: Pearson Education. 2001.
5. Arnaut-Karović, K. The subclasses of the open class degree adverbs in English, *Pismo, Časopis za jezik i književnost VI/1*, Sarajevo, Bosansko filološko društvo. 2008.
6. Avgustinova, T. Arguments, Grammatical Relations and Diathetic Paradigm, paper presented at 7th international conference of HPSG, published in *Berkley Gormal Grammar 2000*, Berkley, California (pp. 85-89). 2000.
7. Biber, D. Et al., *A Grammar of Spoken and Written English*, Longman. 1999.
8. Bresnan, J. A realistic transformational grammar. In Halle, M., Bresnan, J. and Miller, G. A. (eds.), *Linguistic Theory and Psychological Reality*. Cambridge, MA: The MIT Press. 1–59. 1978.
9. Bresnan, J. *Lexical-Functional Syntax*, Oxford, Blackwell Publishing. 2001.
10. Chomsky, N., *Lectures on Government and Binding*, Dordrecht: Foris. 1981.
11. Cook, V.J. and Newson, M. *Chomsky's Universal Grammar – An Introduction*, Oxford. Blackwell Publishers. 2003.

12. Crystal, D. *A Dictionary of Linguistics and Phonetics*, Basil Blackwell Ltd. Oxford. 1985.
13. Embick, D. On the structure of resultative participles in English, *Linguistic Inquiry*. Mit Press. 2004.
14. Haspelmath, M. Passive Participles Across Languages. In Fox, B. and Hopper, P. (eds.) *Voice: Form and Function*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins, pp. 151-177. 1994.
15. Huddleston, R. and Pullum, G. *The Cambridge Grammar of the English Language*, Cambridge. Cambridge University Press. 2002.
16. Jackendoff, R. *X-Bar Syntax: A Study of Phrase Structure*. Linguistic Inquiry Monographs, 2. Cambridge, MA, MIT Press. 1977.
17. Kibort, A. The Inns and Outs of the Participle – Adjective Conversion Rule, paper presented at the LFG05 Conference, CSLI Publications, Stanford. 2005.
18. Kratzer, Angelika. *The Event Argument and the Semantics of Voice, Chapter 2: Adjectival Passives*, Ms, University of Massachusetts. (1994)
19. Langacker, R. *Foundations of Cognitive Grammar*, Stanford. Stanford University Press. 1991.
20. Levin, B. and Rappaport, M. The Formation of Adjectival Passives, *Linguistic Inquiry* 17 (4). pp. 623-661. 1986.
21. Lieber, R. *On Organisation of the Lexicon*, PhD. Thesis, distributed by Indiana University Linguistic Club, Bloomington. 1980.
22. Lyons, J. *Introduction to Theoretical Linguistics*, Cambridge. Cambridge University Press. 1968.
23. Nedjaljkov, V.P. and Jaxontov, S.J. The Typology of Resultative Constructions. In Nedjaljkov, V.P. (ed.) *Typology of Resultative Constructions*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins, 4-62. 1988.
24. Parsons, T. *Events in the Semantics of English: A Study in Subatomic Semantics*, Cambridge, Mass. MIT Press. 1990.
25. Plag, Ingo. *Word-formation in English. Cambridge Textbooks in Linguistics*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press. 2003.
26. Quirk, R. et al., *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language*, London. Longman Group Limited. 1985.
27. Ridanović, M. *Totalni promašaj, Šahinpašić*, Sarajevo. 2003.

28. Siegel, D. Nonsources of unpassives, in Kimball, J. (ed.) *Syntax and Semantics 2*. New York: Academic Press. 1973.
29. Tallerman, M. *Understanding Syntax*, Arnold, London. 1998.

KRATAK PREGLED GRAMATIČKE KATEGORIJE *-EN/-ED* PARTICIPA

Rezime

Budući da *-en/-ed* participi u engleskom jeziku vrše višestruke funkcije učestvujući i u tvorbi aktivne i pasivne dijateze, kopulativnih konstrukcija, modificirajući imenice na nivou imeničke sintagme itd. literatura obiluje različitim nazivima za ovu hibridnu kategoriju riječi (participni pridjevi, adjektivni pasivi, prošli participi, rezultativni participi i slično). Oni su predmetom opsežnih lingvističkih istraživanja usmjerenih na njihovu pravilnu identifikaciju i kategorizaciju. Kao i pridjevi, ovi participi se javljaju u dvjema glavnim distribucijama i funkcijama – atributivnoj i predikativnoj. Budući da, kao deverbativna kategorija riječi, čak i u atributivnoj funkciji, djelimično čuvaju argumentsku strukturu glagola iz kojeg su izvedeni, često se njihova atributivna funkcija dovodi u vezu sa predikativnom kada su upotrijebljeni u odnosnoj rečenici. Tema analize je postojanje korelacije između *-en/-ed* participnih parova upotrijebljenih u ove dvije funkcije. Uočeno je da atributivno upotrijebljeni *-en/-ed* particip, za razliku od svog predikativno upotrijebljenog para, podliježe većem stepenu semantičkog ograničenja. Dok njegov predikativno upotrijebljen par može vršiti funkciju predikacije čak i kada je subjekat pasivne rečenice manje prominentan argument (kao što je npr. primalac ili lokacija koji se, na nivou analize funkcija u aktivnoj dijatezi, realizuju kao indirektni objekat ili adverbijal) dotle je atributivno upotrijebljeni *-en/-ed* particip ograničen isključivo na modifikaciju imenica koje imaju prominentne semantičke uloge (agens ili pacijens/tema) i koje se na nivou rečenice realizuju u funkcijama subjekta odnosno direktnog objekta. Dakle, u atributivnoj funkciji se najčešće javljaju *-en/-ed* participi sa semantičkom orijentacijom na pacijensa/temu, i do manje mjere na agensa. Njihovi predikativni parovi, bez obzira na vrstu dijateze (aktivnu ili pasivnu), nisu ograničeni semantičkom ulogom subjekta. Zbog postojanja ove asimetrije i

nekonzistentne korelacije između atributivnih i predikativnih *-en/-ed* participa, što nije slučaj sa većinom centralnih pridjeva, postoji potreba da se atributivno upotrijebljeni *-en/-ed* participi posmatraju neovisno od svojih predikativno upotrijebljenih parova. Odsustvo pomenute korelacije je dobar pokazatelj da atributivni participi, vrlo vjerovatno, jesu produkt morfoloških operacija derivacije koje se odvijaju u leksikonu. Njihovi predikativno upotrijebljeni parovi imaju jasniju glagolsku interpretaciju pri čemu je *-en/-ed* sufiks sintaksički relevantan morfem kojim se obilježavaju gramatički relevantna obilježja kao što su pasivno glagolsko stanje ili svršeni glagolski vid, u zavisnosti od tipa dijateze u kojoj se takav participni oblik javlja. Problem pravilne interpretacije i identifikacije u predikativnoj funkciji i dalje je otvoren u reduciranoj pasivnoj dijatezi koja je gotovo identična kopulativnoj sintaksičkoj konstrukciji u kojoj je prototipični predikativni izraz pridjev. Kada su u pitanju atributivno upotrijebljeni *-en/-ed* participi, pitanje načina njihovog nastanka, odnosno da li je riječ o konverziji, nultoj afiksaciji ili nekoj drugoj vrsti morfološke operacije i dalje je predmetom opširnih teorijskih rasprava i analiza. Ovaj kratak pregled morfosintaksičkih i semantičkih osobina *-en/-ed* participa ima za cilj da pruži detaljniji uvid i omogući bolje razumijevanje ove hibridne i dosta nejasne kategorije riječi u njenim glavnim distribucijama i funkcijama.

Ključne riječi: *-en/-ed* participi, atributivna funkcija, predikativna funkcija, dijateza, derivacija, infleksija

Željka Babić

COMPUTER-BASED ASSESSMENT – A PERSONAL VIEW

Abstract: When dealing with issues on computer-based assessment in Bosnia and Herzegovina, one is prone to thinking of accessibility. Even though research tells us that computers are widely used by the academic population, when testing and assessment of foreign language are concerned, the results are quite the opposite. Computer-adaptive tests are seldomly used in FLT practice in Bosnia and Herzegovina, usually with students doing high-stakes proficiency tests. This paper tries to compare one of the tests used in practice with data of previously researched tests and it summarizes the findings in order to try to pave the path for some future, in-depth research of the matter. It also attempts to emphasize need for introduction of this type of testing into everyday teaching practice in our country.

Key words: testing, validity, reliability, washback

INTRODUCTION

Assessment puts in front of us the dilemma whether to use standardized, pre-fabricated tests or teacher-made ones. Diving into the incessant pros and cons of each of these would mean entangling oneself into a labyrinth, knowing that there is a very little chance of finding the way out. The market itself puts in front of us a range of ready-made tests, available at hand every time we need them. Furthermore, we, as assessors, can rely on the results of the test, for there is very little doubt present in our minds as far as the main characteristics which every test should possess are concerned. We take it for granted that teams of people who prepare and administer tests go through all the procedures necessary in order to comply with the needs of assessment. The main aim of this paper is to take one of the CBT tests used in the region and compare it with other similar tests in order to describe benefits and potential problems with this sort of assessment.

ISSUES DISCUSSED

Even though, at first, it seems quite unusual to try to research on something that a CBT should have as a default, the idea to compare tests has emerged because there has been need felt to establish whether all the issues which are usually taken into consideration when designing a test have really been used to their maximum.

CAT (computer-assisted testing), according to Winke and Fei Fei (2008: 354), presents “technologically advanced assessment measures ... which use sophisticated algorithms to move examinees from one item to the next based on the examinee’s performance on the last item”.

When discussing alternative assessment, its proponents emphasize that it is not enough to evaluate tests according to their validity, reliability and objectivity, but also in the light of their trustworthiness, credibility and audibility (Huerta-Macías 2002: 340). Still, after participation in a CBT test, the necessity has been felt to investigate it on the basis of its general qualities.

Bachman and Palmer (1996: 18) refer to these as the qualities of test usefulness and even give an equation for it: usefulness = reliability + construct validity + authenticity + interactiveness + impact + practicality.

They refer to validity as to whether a test measures what it is supposed to measure, and therefore, several particular types of validity can be differentiated. Content validity is focused on establishing whether all aspects which the test claims to be measuring are covered. Construct validity is focused on determining whether all the items are directed at measuring the same thing or, as Brown (1996: 295) claims, “the degree to which a test measures what it claims, or purports, to be measuring”. Unlike content validity, with which it is often mistakenly equated, face validity tries to establish whether the test items, on the surface or subjectively, look like realistic uses of what is being measured. Concurrent validity institutes whether scores on other measures of a construct are similar to those they are achieving in the test taken, the main point here being that both measures are done at the same time.

Bachman and Palmer (1996: 19-20) define reliability “as consistency of measurement” and claim that “reliability can be considered to be a function of the consistency of scores from one set of tests and test tasks to another”. There are several types of reliability, out of which we will mention the following ones: test/retest reliability or repeatability, which tries to establish the possibility of non-existence of variation in data when, for example, students take the same test during a short time frame with no instruction or feedback between testing; internal consistency, where the measurement is aimed at

establishing the correlations between different items of the same test, i.e. the test is split in two and the scores for each half of the test are compared with one another for the presence of consistency, which would mean that the items are likely measuring the same thing; inter-rater reliability, where two raters evaluating language use independently should agree with each other.

Washback, positive or negative, also known as backwash, curriculum alignment, test feedback, test impact and measurement-driven instruction, is, according to Brown and Hudson (1998: 667) “the effect of testing and assessment of the language-teaching curriculum that is related to it”. Cohen (1994: 41) broadens its domain by adding to the notion of “how assessment instruments affect educational practices and beliefs”. Bachman and Palmer (1996: 31) note that impact is made both on students and teachers. As they claim, “test takers can be affected by three aspects of the testing procedure: 1. the experience of taking and, in some cases, of preparing for the test, 2. the feedback they receive about their performance on the test, and 3. the decisions that may be made about them on the basis of their test scores”. As far as teachers are concerned, it is extremely important for them to feel and experience that what they teach is relevant to testing, thus lowering the possibility of occurrence of negative impact on instruction.

Bachman and Palmer (1996: 37) define practicality as “a matter of the extent to which the demands of the particular test specifications can be met within the limits of existing resources”. The types of resources they mention are human, material (space, equipment, materials) and time (development time, time for specific tasks).

TEST DESCRIPTION

Some years ago I was a speaking instructor at an internationally funded English-language teaching project. The idea of the project was to teach the local army officers English as a part of future cooperation in Partnership for Peace. The officers had eight classes a day for twelve weeks, and every week they took a CAT (computer adaptive test), which was there not only to monitor their progress, but also to give the final mark.

The teachers also took the test, once at the beginning and once at the end of the course. No one registered the scores that the teachers gained. It was just important to note down that they took the test, and that they took it twice. There were no explanations given as to why it was done and whether the results would be used for any further analysis, which resulted in teachers' extremely relaxed (and sometimes nonchalant) attitude towards both the test itself and the

results scored. Still, all of the teachers (there were four of them) stated that they passed the test with flying colours.

The examinees were all between 25 and 30 years old and all of them finished university. They have never learned English before, but they were all fairly proficient in French, German or Russian. They were all males and there were 40 examinees in total, separated in five groups of eight.

The test consisted of 50 multiple-choice tasks, mainly grammar, but there was also a part in it which dealt with reading-comprehension. Like all computer-adaptive tests, this one also adapted itself according to the answers given. The students were pre-trained to work on computers by using accompanying CDs for the course they took (REWARD) and some chosen Internet web pages. The scores were collected after each test and were used as guidelines for future work and as a starting point for choosing the participants for future (more advanced) courses.

The multiple-choice tasks consisted of:

- a) 20 sentences that needed to be filled in with only one of the offered grammatical forms (A, B, C, D), which ranged from tenses to some basic word-formation skills (recognition of adjectives as opposed to adverbs, nouns as opposed to verbs, etc.),
- b) 10 tasks consisting of 2-3 conversations; the examinees had to choose between sentences A, B, C, which all were the presupposed topic of the conversation (weather, traffic, etc.),
- c) 20 sentences dealing with grammatical/vocabulary issues (A, B, C, D).

The test was always taken on a laptop computer, the students were not given chance to retake it, and it was timed. All the students had to take the test precisely at the time arranged by the instructors, no excuses whatsoever were allowed. The students who did not take the test were instantaneously failed regardless of the reason(s) which prevented them from sitting the exam.

The instructors did not have access to the computer, there was an outer administrator of the test, who was the only person who knew the password for entering it, and there was no pre-conception of the exact layout of the test itself.

The decision of using such kind of assessment and scoring was made solely by financiers, even though the teachers and instructors suggested that the results should not be parts of the final score. The reason for that was obvious from their point of view, for the students were all at beginner / pre-intermediate level, and it was quite difficult for them to follow some of the instructions (which were all in English). Also, some of the questions the computer asked

covered aspects of grammar they had not dealt with, and in that case, students had to guess the answers.

DATA DISCUSSION

Unlike the COPI speaking test (Norris 2001), where at the beginning of the test one chooses the level which he/she is to take (beginner, pre-intermediate, etc.), it was up to the administrator (with the help of the teacher of the group) to select the level and administer the test appropriately. At this point one should stop and raise the question of concurrent validity and retest reliability. Actually it was raised at the time by asking the administrator to let some people (20 of them of different language ability) take the test twice in a span of couple of hours. All of them scored differently in both tests, so it is obvious that factors concerning personalities of the examinees need to be taken into consideration. Still, test reliability, when administering a test in such a manner, should entail that the questions asked in these two separate takes were not exactly the same, even though, due to programming of algorithms, they were probably of the same difficulty. At least, this is what the theory would like us to think. In order to make sure that items are really at the same level, one conducts pilot testing involving a very large number of people, sometimes even thousands. Still, one cannot avoid the feeling that with some makers of computer adaptive tests these requirements are not met as precisely as they should be, and even more, many of them do not publish the test data. Also, the level of motivation in the second test was quite high, for two-thirds of examinees scored higher on the second test, which can be explained as a positive washback of the first test in a way that they felt the will and the urge to perform better, i.e. the motivation for getting better grades was quite high.

As far as concurrent validity is concerned, scoring differently on progress tests as opposed to CAT can also mean that students are still not prepared to take a bit more complex tasks, so what the instructors should have done was to widen the syllabus with some additional exercises, not only those from the textbook.

The construct measured in such a way should be, according to my opinion, dealt with utmost caution. By answering questions one by one and pressing DONE button after each question, there is no time left for revision. From a personal experience in taking both kinds of assessment (paper and pencil and CBT) I have to say that quite a number of times I have changed my answers at the very last minute of the test (mostly successfully), because I realized that something was wrong with them. One somehow feels that the tests, which are timed and still let you reconsider your answers, prove more beneficiary on

examinees, for when you know that the next question is going to be selected by the computer according to your previous answers, you do definitely feel under pressure and negative feelings and attitudes towards that test and the things you are being tested start to emerge.

When reading Bannerji (2003) one notices that the creators of CBT TOEFL have taken into consideration the fact that it would be quite useful to have a tutorial or demonstration at the beginning of the test. That certainly creates a positive washback; firstly, it provides more time for the examinee to surpass the nervousness and anxiety, and, secondly, seeing what the actual tasks look like will definitely raise confidence. CAT, on the other side, begins with a window in which people write their names and surnames, after which time starts to elapse and the first question pops up. Nevertheless, I would like to emphasize that my personal opinion is that the problem is not with the test, but those who administer it. This test presupposes that whoever takes it knows all about it and is familiar with the layout and ways of doing it. It was probably the inexperience of the administrator which made him decide that the test should be administered without any previous explanations made. Still, it is quite dangerous to indulge oneself in such experiments, for we are working with human beings and, at the end of the day, it is in our interest that they start appreciating and liking what we have been teaching them. The dangers of negative washback, always lurking from the corner, must never be kept out of mind for all testing.

As I have previously mentioned, the reasons given for such an approach (the examinees are trained on progress tests on CDs) are not plausible, for these are only progress tests which refer to issues dealt with in the textbook. Having this in mind, we can definitely say that in this case face validity is extremely questionable, i.e. the test does not serve to test what has been taught. Namely, this kind of assessment is difficult to grasp when dealing with it (especially for the first time and with lower levels). The range and scope of understanding of L2 and limited grammar and vocabulary do not present a solid base for weaker students (even with higher levels). Even the good ones have to deal with negative washback, for the results in the first couple of tests are usually below their expectations and do not correspond to those of progress tests. This problem can be solved easily by letting the students get familiar with the test layout (maybe even letting them take one without the pressure of it being taken as a part of their overall performance).

Having in mind the fact that all the students examined were computer literate, the anxiety or computer-related problems are not emphasized as sole problems for most of the poor results. Still, one has to take into consideration the fact that

possible anxiety does not have to be connected with familiarity / non-familiarity with the use of computers (Bannerji 2003).

One more thing should be added: all the students showed extremely negative attitude towards this kind of testing, which is understandable, for they felt they were learning English for the sake of results which would be given to them by a machine, and not because they would need it in their future work. This negative washback was enhanced by the fact that they all had military ranks, they were accustomed to giving orders, and now, their “destinies” somehow depended on this machine. The “human” factor in testing plays a big role in the society I live in, and the absence of it (in a way there is no one they can ask for clarification, support) is still not accepted positively.

Even though this particular test raised quite a lot of concerns, its practicality is obvious. The test can be administered whenever the administrators or the students want to; the question of space and time is settled, for all they need is a table and a chair. The taking of the test is very personalized, which is quite beneficiary for overcoming inhibition. Students cannot be complaining that the person who made the test put some difficult questions on purpose. It also gives the students a feeling of privacy and enables them focus on the work itself, which is sometimes difficult to do when doing a test in a group. At the same time, the teacher can work with the rest of the class on something different, while some students do the test. The adaptability concerning when to take the test and the adaptability of the test itself according to the student’s answers should be emphasized as the most beneficiary thing this particular test offered to those who took it.

Having said all this, I have a feeling that in this particular case, the main problem was actually administering, not the test itself. If special attention is paid on preparing the students for it, if they are accustomed and properly informed about the tasks they are to perform, I think that the test will have quite the different impact and it will be accepted quite warmly.

CONCLUSION

The comprehensive conclusion would require the establishment of the purpose of assessment which has been described above. Somehow one has the feeling that this particular CBT has all three purposes (formative, summative and diagnostic) interwoven, without any clear borders defined and established. According to Fisher and Frey (2007: 4), formative assessments are ongoing reviews and observations in a classroom used to improve instructional methods and provide student feedback, and summative are used to evaluate the

effectiveness of instructional programs and services at the end of a pre-determined time. Diagnostic assessment is used to identify areas and difficulty and strength that particular students demonstrate, even though these issues are rather questionable, for its diagnostic purpose can only be understood in the realm of self-assessment, a type of personal-response alternative assessment (Brown and Hudson 1998: 665). If we turn to other classifications of tests based on their purposes, for example Hughes' (1989), in which he differentiates between proficiency, achievement, diagnostic and placement tests, we again somehow feel as if being put in the cul-de-sac. The CAT test has obviously been designed as a progress test, but somehow the course designers extended its use into an overall, multipurpose one, whose effectiveness is questionable, not because of its design but merely because of the way it has been used in practice. One is prone to thinking that the decision has been made instinctively, without considering the purpose, which resulted in some amount of dissatisfaction present with the examinees.

In their contrastive research between paper-based and computer-based language tests, Choi et al. (2003: 299) set the conclusion that limitations of the paper-based tests as far as audio-visual information is concerned are vividly contrasted in favour of the computer-based test, which enables usage of range of multimedia aids. They claim "this strength helps simulate reality in a language-testing context, thus maximizing authenticity and, presumably, enhancing validity as well". The feedback given after this test is a bit different. Even though students, at first, have been quite satisfied with the assessment process, they have later protested because of the amount of tests taken and their inability to perform at their best. All of them, quite unanimously, have given only one reason for that: the test has been done on computers. Not being able to go back and check the answers, realizing that they have written down the wrong answer just seconds after they have pressed the enter button, not being able to focus afterwards, the "coldness" of such an approach somehow brought back on surface the positive feelings towards paper-based tests. Having in mind the fact that the reasons for the answers may be cultural and personal in their basis, the need for emphasizing them has still been felt.

I will finish this small discussion by quoting advice given to me when I started working as a teaching assistant. After meticulously circling and underlining all the possible mistakes and errors in essays, I have taken the test to my professor for proofreading and validation. She never bothered looking at my work, utterly stunned by the redness of the paper. She politely asked me to sit down and told me that if I intended to look for things my students did not know instead of those they did, it was high time for me to look for another profession. I still cherish that advice every time I do any type of assessment, oral or written. Applying advice to this small scale research, there is one thing

which goes onto the surface: computer-adaptive tests are highly-valuable and useful type of assessment, but, as it is the case with all types of high-stakes assessment, they should be used with caution and prudence. If students are not completely prepared for understanding and appreciating the results of the testing process itself, the only expected outcome will be negative washback.

REFERENCES

1. Bachman, Lyle F. and Adrian S. Palmer. *Language Testing in Practice*. Hong Kong: Oxford University Press, 1996.
2. Brown, James Dean. *Testing in Language Programs*. Upper Saddle River, NJ: Prentice Hall Regents, 1996.
3. Brown, James Dean and Thom Hudson. Alternatives in assessment. *TESOL Quarterly* 32 (4), 1998, pp. 653-675.
4. Bannerji, Jayanti. A review of the TOEFL CBT (Computer Based Test). *Language Testing* 20 (1), 2003, pp. 113-124.
5. Choi, Inn-Chull, Sung Kim and Jaeyod Boo. Comparability of a paper-based language test and a computer-based language test. *Language Testing* 20, 2003, pp. 295-320.
6. Cohen, Andrew D. *Assessing Language Ability in the Classroom*. Boston: Heinle and Heinle, 1994.
7. Fisher, Douglas and Nancy Frey. *Checking for Understanding. Formative Assessment Techniques for Your Classroom*. Alexandria, VA: Association for Supervision and Curriculum Development, 2007.
8. Huerta-Macías, Ana. Alternative Assessment: Responses to Commonly Asked Questions. In Jack C. Richards and Willy A. Renandya. *Methodology in Language Teaching: An Anthology of Current Practices*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002, pp. 338-343.
9. Huges, Arthur. *Testing for Language Teachers*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1989.
10. Norris, John M. Concerns with computerized adaptive oral proficiency assessment. *Language Learning and Technologies* 5 (2), 2001, pp. 99-105.
11. Winke, Paula and Fei Fei. Computer-Assisted Language Assessment. In Nancy H. Hornberger (Eds.). *Encyclopedia of Language and Education. Volume 4: Second and Foreign Language Education*. New York: Springer Science + Business Media LLC, 2008, pp. 353-364.

KOMPJUTERSKI POTPOMOGNUTO VREDNOVANJE – LIČNI STAV

Rezime

Pri istraživanju karakteristika vrednovanja uz pomoć kompjutera u Bosni i Hercegovini obično se razmišlja o mogućnosti izvođenja takvog vrednovanja. Iako istraživanja pokazuju da akademski građani koriste računare, kada se u razmatranje uzmu testiranje i vrednovanje stranih jezika, rezultati su sasvim drugačiji. Kompjuterski samoprilagodljivi testovi rijetko se koriste u praksi nastave stranih jezika u Bosni i Hercegovini, i to uglavnom pri polaganju testova postignuća. Ovaj rad poredi jedan od testova koji se koristi u praksi sa rezultatima ranijih istraživanja i sažima rezultate s ciljem da se u budućnosti otpočne sa detaljnijim istraživanjem ove vrste testiranja. On predstavlja i pokušaj da se naglasi potreba da se u nastavni proces u našoj zemlji uvede i ovaj način testiranja.

Ključne riječi: testiranje, validnost, pouzdanost, povratna informacija

Adi Fejzić

PRAGMATIC INTERPRETATION OF SOCIAL CLASS AS A SOCIOLINGUISTIC VARIABLE OF TV COMEDY

Abstract: This paper deals with the concept of social class as an important sociolinguistic variable of TV comedy. We are trying to prove this variable played a key role in establishing an entire concept of TV show, as well contributed tremendously to making of the whole discourse of TV comedy.

Key words: TV comedy, discourse, sociolinguistic variable, pragmatic interpretation

INTRODUCTION

The social context of modern American TV comedy (MATVC) is defined through the following variables:

1. Social class
2. Gender
3. Ethnicity
4. Race

These variables often interchange in order to define the social context of the MATVC in ways that make it so special. The basic question that defines the need for the social context treats peculiarities of speech patterns of individuals and groups they belong to. On the other hand, what is it that connects the meaning of whatever is uttered in a joke and the element which foresees that the joke would work?

It is impossible to assess which of the aforementioned variables is the most dominant in terms of covering the most used spoken space in the show, but we can safely assume that the social class is the safest category for wide use since it does not contain almost any threat for general public, unlike gender for

example. In order for the audience to understand or/and follow the context they must accumulate a certain amount of information prior to watching a certain program, which will eventually be crucial so that a needed reference is understood, accessed and approved as funny. Practically, this is impossible to assume or measure, but what we can assume is that some information can be more accessible or represented because of their general cultural value and topicality. For example, it is difficult to assume that there is a single TV viewer regardless to social, ethnic or any other background that is not familiar with the basics of the religion or ideology he/she belongs to, regardless to the level of education and formal schooling or foundations of the American society, culture or establishment. Also, those elements of modern comedy that producers and script writers most count on belong to the sphere of general human knowledge, conveyed via various social mechanism, on the level of the nuclear family as well as the community. It includes clichés, stereotypes, knowledge of pop-culture, audio-visual information that are served to viewers with or without their approval and final the general body of work of information used by every human being. That body includes interest in certain topic or area that is proportional to the percentage of the topic or area. If we bear that in mind then we can assume that a properly determined niche can be expanded contingent to larger interest. We can call that factor “current knowledge” which is also considered to be the primary interest of an individual or group, better known as “trend” or “in” or “hot”.

On the other side, there is accumulated knowledge on the level of humankind which is impervious to any alteration, negation or updating. That knowledge is compiled of information conveyed through upbringing and education, which makes it more stabile. We can call that knowledge “fundamental” and unlike current knowledge, it is not imperative for individuals because it is not conveyed via same social mechanisms.

So, the percentage of these forms of knowledge in the primary memory can be considered as valid as to why certain information is understood or not, and to illustrate we will use an example from a show that perhaps deals with these problems the most. In one of the most popular US sitcoms, “The Big Bang Theory”, the key characters are four brilliant physicians whose life problems are not astro-physics or quantum mechanics, but understanding women. Every one of them has accumulated immense theoretical knowledge about things that are barely taught in schools, but know so little of things their peers usually talk about.

Howard’s mother: Should I ask Leonard to bring over your homework?

Howard: I don't have homework. I'm a grown man with Master's degree in Engineering!

Howard's mother: Excuse me, Mr. Fancy-Pants. Want me to get u a popsicle?

Howard: Cherry, please!

Howard's mother: I ate the cherry. All that's left is green.

Howard: You make me wanna kill myself.¹

One of them, whose family identity is directly and interculturally emphasized as Jewish, has constant issues when communicating with his mother, with whom he stays. This twist is common and very frequent in sitcoms and as such cannot be used as an example. But, there are two possible explanations: the first, the aforementioned, and the second, which explanation requires additional knowledge about American Jewish Mother. In the latter case, the context is additionally defined by the stereotype of a permanently displeased, over protective mother. Since the setting is in California, which is inhabited by a large Jewish community, one can assume that the context is easily understood. But the context is differently spun in case of characters from continental US who know a little or practically nothing about Jews or Judaism. So, when a Nebraska native Christy sleeps with Howard, she shows what a typical US Middle Eastern knows about Jews:

Howard: So, what do you say? Wanna repair to Casa Wolowitz?

Christy: What is that, like a Mexican deli?

Howard: I am sorry, I should have mentioned this earlier. My last name is Wolowitz.

Christy: Oh, ho-ho. That's so cool. My first Jew.²

As the second category that, probably, even more directly portrays why this "background knowledge" is essential, we are going to use an example from another type of comedy, live show, where comedian take turns doing their routines. Since that program cannot be edited and there is always room for improvisation, any reaction of the audience and other comedians cannot be taken as a valid indicator whether the material and joke are understood and successful. So in "Comedy Central Roast of Charlie Sheen"³ comedian Anthony Jeselnik speaks to a roaster⁴, the boxer Mike Tyson and says:

¹ <http://bazingabigbangtheory.blogspot.com/2011/05/quotes-for-howards-mother-mrs-walowitz.html>

² http://www.big-bang-forum.de/infusions/pro_download_panel/download.php?catid=2&rowstart=0. Accessed on November 23rd, 2013.

³ An event in honor of the actor Charlie Sheen. (author's comment)

⁴ A roaster is a member of the "jury" of comedians or "dias". (author's comment)

Anthony Jeselnik: Besides, what can you say about Mike Tyson that hasn't already been a title of a Richard Pryor album?⁵

The audience, and Tyson himself, gave a mild response, apart from another black comedian roaster Patrice O'Neal, who started applauding after a short curse. The reason behind such a reaction of the rest of the dais is that knowledge of Richard Pryor discography is more frequent with African-American audience and some of the most famous albums are: *That nigger's crazy*; *Bicentennial nigger*; *Insane* and *Supernigger*, which, if we take into consideration Tyson's behavior and prison sentence, constitutes a joke by itself.

SOCIAL CLASS

The manner of representation of differences between social classes in sitcoms depends of several factors:

1. Purpose of the show
2. Symbols
3. Intertext

Using these factors we can define any show, that is, their presence and absence can show how much social class is crucial for defining this type of context. We analyzed original shows from 5 key channels: NBC, ABC, FOX, HBO and Comedy Central, but we could not use sketch comedy because by definition they do not represent a particular social-political idea in comedy, because the sketches are not related to each other. The only thing we can analyze in sketch comedy is so called "recurring character sketches" where a character appears in many separate, chronologically lined up episodes and then based on its profile we can determine the social class it belongs to.

The following shows are selected because they are aired and re-aired on US channels.

⁵ <http://www.tumblr.com/tagged/anthony-jeselnik?before=1316813301>. Accessed on November 24th, 2013.

Table 1⁶

No	Name of the show	Channel	Genre	Description
1.	Chappelle's Show	CC	H.sketch	Humor of African-Americans, stereotypical satire, usually deals with blue collar workers
2.	Chocolate news	CC	H.sketch	Humor of African-Americans, stereotypical satire, usually deals with blue collar workers
3.	Comedians of comedy	CC	Stand up	Upper middle class
4.	Comedy central presents	CC	Stand up	Middle class
5.	Dog bites man	CC	H.sitcom	Middle class
6.	Dr.Katz	CC	Anim	Upper middle class
7.	Drawn together	CC	Anim	Blue collar workers
8.	Freak show	CC	Anim	Middle class
9.	Futurama	CC	Anim	Upper middle class
10.	Halfway home	CC	Sitcom	Middle class
11.	Hollow man	CC	Sketch	Upper middle class
12.	Insomiac with Dave Attel	CC	H.standup	Middle class
13.	Important things with Demetri Martin	CC	H.sketch	Upper middle class
14.	Last laugh	CC	Stand up	Middle class
15.	Live at Gotham	CC	Stand up	Middle class
16.	Mind of Mencia	CC	H.sketch	Middle class
17.	Naked trucker & T-Bones show	CC	Sketch	Middle class
18.	Premium blend	CC	Stand up	Upper middle class
19.	Primetime glick	CC	H.sitcom	Upper middle class
20.	Reno 911	CC	H.sitcom	Blue collar workers
21.	Lewis Black's Root of all evil	CC	H.standup	Upper middle class
22.	The Sarah Silverman Show	CC	H.sitcom	Middle class
22.	South park	CC	Anim	Blue collar workers
23.	Stella	CC	H.sketch	Upper middle class
24.	Strangers with candy	CC	Sitcom	Upper middle class
25.	That's my Bush	CC	Sitcom	Middle class

⁶ Data retrieved from a table compiled from a sitcom and sketch comedy list from http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/List_of_Sitcoms. Accessed on November 22nd, 2013.

26.	TV funhouse	CC	H.sketch-anim	Upper middle class
27.	Upright citizens brigade	CC	H.sketch	Middle class
28.	Wanda does it	CC	H.sitcom-sketch	Middle class
29	Da Ali G show	HBO	H.standup-mock	Blue collar workers
30.	Def comedy jam	HBO	Standup	Middle class
31.	Curb your enthusiasm	HBO	H.sitcom-mock	Upper middle class
32.	The life & times of Tim	HBO	Anim	Middle class
33.	Little Britain USA	HBO	H.sitcom	Middle class
34.	Eastbound and down	HBO	Sitcom	Blue collar workers
35.	Flight of the Conchords	HBO	H.sitcom	Middle class
36.	30 Rock	NBC	Sitcom	Upper middle class
37.	Kath & Kim	NBC	Sitcom	Blue collar workers
38.	Saturday night live	NBC	Sketch	Middle class
39.	My name is Earl	NBC	Sitcom	Blue collar workers
40.	The office	NBC	H.sitcom-mock	Middle class
41.	Scrubs	ABC	Sitcom	Upper middle class
42.	Samantha Who	ABC	Sitcom	Middle class
43.	According to Jim	ABC	Sitcom	Middle class
44.	Better off Ted	ABC	Sitcom	Upper middle class
45.	American dad	Fox	Anim	Middle class
46.	Family guy	Fox	Anim	Middle class, with an exception of a character who speaks as an English aristocrat
47.	King of the hill	Fox	Anim	Blue collar workers
48.	Madtv	Fox	Sketch	Middle class
49.	The Simpsons	Fox	Anim	Blue collar workers
50.	Til' death	Fox	Sitcom	Middle class
51.	The big bang theory	CBS	Sitcom	Middle class – academic language
52.	How I met your mother	CBS	Sitcom	Middle class
53.	Gary unmarried	CBS	Sitcom	Middle class

LEGEND:

- H.sitcom-mock – a hybrid of a sitcom and mockumentary
- H.sitcom – a hybrid of a sitcom and some other TV genre
- H.sitcom-sketch – a hybrid of a sitcom a sketch comedy
- H.sitcom-anim – a hybrid of a sitcom and animated

The table says that, of the 50 programs mentioned, 11 use the language of blue-collar workers, 24 describe the middle class and 15 describe the upper middle class. This tells us that MATVC is a genre of an ordinary person, where such its discourse is adjusted to such a person. Of course, assessing the used percentage of the language is based on the social class of the character from the show, noting that the language may vary from one episode to another. For example, “My Name is Earl” is a show of a man from a lower social class, a profile of an American family that lives on social welfare from generation to generation, usually referred to as other social groups as “trailer trash”. The language of such a social group is presented through frequent abbreviating of standard language forms (presented in a form of an apostrophe, author's comment), through over-exaggeration of ignorance about general terms and cultural aspects in the USA, through using irregular grammatical forms or any combination of the aforementioned:

Joy: I don't care if she's Chinese, Vietnamese, or Chuck E. Cheese. She don't need to be learnin' no English!⁷

MATVC is designed as general population entertainment tool, as clumsily as it may sound in an American context, and that is why every show is an overview of an aspect of American life. Usually it is the title of the show that describes everything that takes place in the show, but not necessarily. The show may bear the name of the leading character – “My name is Earl”, “Samantha Who”; it may be the description of the topic – “Scrubs”, “Testees”; it may be named after the place of the action – “South Park”; “Normal, Ohio”, etc, and by that division the audience can choose whatever they like.

When we talk about intertext and the way it is used in comedy shows, the basic rule we use to stress it is parody. In the history of US sitcoms, parody has been the technique that launched the chain reaction and has been responsible for the whole line of subgroups and new comedy categories. Lately, the category that is particularly popular with unproductive screenwriters is “spinoff”. It is a technique of taking a popular character from an ended show and making a new show based on that character. Spinoff is, actually, the best indicator how much general audience follows a show and how much a certain character is popular. In the show “Cheers”, the character of a psychiatrist by the name of Frasier Crane reached such popularity that he got his own sitcom, which, success and glory-wise match the original show. However, spinoff is not an authentic parody, since the character does not undergo any major changes, if we speak about the profile. Parody, in this case, is about the living environment, because the character in the original show had limited maneuver space, and

⁷ http://en.wikiquote.org/wiki/My_Name_Is_Earl. Accessed on November 27th, 2013.

subsequently, limited to him, positive potentials. The character of Joey from “Friends”, on the other hand, was meant to be a parody of 1980s macho men who also cry. Since the character had reached a sufficient popularity as a likeable simpleton, after the end of “Friends” Joey got his spinoff “Joey”, which absolutely exploited any possible flaws the original character had had. Finally, the fake news parody programs “The Daily Show” and “Colbert Report” are designed to point out all the absurdities of serious political shows such as “Hardball” or “Larry King Show” which are meant to be a public commentary.

What is indicative for all parodies is that they always relate to a specific social group or class, but never to a common man, which explains why Dr. Frasier as an intellectual would be an object of parody, as well as Joey as a Latin lover. Parody in MATVC is a tool used to eliminate exclusivity or eccentricity, which evens relations among humans. Finally, the social class is eliminated by these tools, if we consider that all the aforementioned shows are comedy shows and are designed for ordinary people. Unlike parodies which aim to eliminate class, satire as a different comedy tool aims completely in the opposite direction, that is, to stress the class or group, in this case, people who are not ignorant, intolerant, or, on the other side, conservative and uptight. Parody and satire in 1970s sitcoms aimed at those that America raised as its “best sons and daughters”, that is, obedient, virtuous and neat, while the biggest enemy, that omnipresent dark force was “The Man”, that is the establishment. It was the time when sitcoms regularly contained a rebel, a non-conformist and somebody usually referred to as “a cool guy”. In the 1970s it was Arthur Fonzarelli – The Fonz⁸, a sympathetic figure somewhat resembling James Dean. That show, “Happy Days”, portrayed 1950s, even though the show was on-air in the period of 1974-1984, which was a sitcom practice at the time. The character of Fonz could not have been portrayed in a 1950s show, but it was important to wait for some 20 years to use him. The same practice was obvious in “M.A.S.H 4077” that spoke about adventures of a mobile hospital during the Korean War, and it was on-air during the war in Vietnam. That is why the characters that did not fit the subtext of the plot could not have been portrayed, that is, their dialogues not established or accepted. 20th century wars are characterized in American history by movies, and more importantly for us, comedy shows, which aimed to alleviate the effect of war horrors. It particularly goes for cartooning war movies, because through satirical and comical approach this type of sitcom is set as a therapy for American public. Sitcoms such as “M.A.S.H 4077” and “Hogan Heroes” somewhat make fun of the war and enemy, so doctors in

⁸ <http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Fonz>. Accessed on November 25th, 2013.

“M.A.S.H 4077” play golf a few kilometers from the front line, and American prisoners in the camp organize a fashion show in front of inept German guards.

In the 1980s, during Reagan’s administration, there was a need for nuclear family⁹ in the USA, but in a different way than it was portrayed in the 1970s. Namely, the 1970s shows stressed blood families with at least one parent present, who kept the family together and under control. Also, because wars that kept the country under paranoia and in a substantial economic crisis, the family was considered something important because of the survival of the American idea of freedom, and in such concept there was a need for a proof of democracy – a loveable rebel. In the 1980s, after the country somewhat recovered, the rebel did not have to be a norm-breaker, but somebody who is more advanced than others. Such character is shown in Steve Urkel from “Family matters”¹⁰, who, at first glance, is not meant to be a rebel. There is a character in the show, Eddie Winslow, who is supposed to be a regular Fonz-like rebel, but in time it proved to be that Urkel is “the one”. What makes Fonz and Urkel different is clothes, which, in Fonz’s case, was street thug clothes with the jacket collar up, which was a sign of rebellion in the 1950s, whereas Urkel’s clothes is clothes of a person who should be a spitting image of somebody that Fonz is rebelling against.

In both decades, such characters gave us insight into a need that TV comedy both shows and proves that sitcom is avant-garde enough unlike other TV genres that follow trends, and that in the 1970s and 1980s they could be considered a mirror image of the American society. It was as late as the 1990s that the concept of an individual could be discarded, because it was the time when there was no more need for analyzing groups but individuals within the group.

REFERENCES

1. Couldry, Nick et al., *Media consumption and public engagement*, Palgrave, 2007.
2. Fiske, John and Hartley, John, *Reading Television*, Routledge, 2004.
3. Kellner, Douglas, *Media culture: cultural studies, identity and politics between the modern and postmodern*, Routledge, 1995.
4. Perse, Elizabeth, *Media effects and society*, Lawrence Erlbaum, 2001.

⁹ http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Nuclear_family. Accessed on November 22nd, 2013.

¹⁰ http://en.wikipedia.org/wiki/Family_Matters. Accessed on November 26th, 2013.

5. Tueth, Michael, *Laughter in the living room: Television comedy and the American home audience*, Peter Long Publishing, 2004.
6. Zijervald, Anton C, *Trend report: The sociology of humour and laughter*, 1993.

PRAGMATIČKO TUMAČENJE DRUŠTVENE KLASE KAO SOCIOLINGVISTIČKE VARIJABLE TV KOMEDIJE

Sažetak

Ovaj rad bavi se konceptom društvene klase kao značajne sociolingvističke varijable TV komedije. Pokušava dokazati da je ova varijabla igrala značajnu ulogu u ustanovljavanju cijelog koncepta emisija, te u velikoj mjeri doprinijela stvaranju cijelog diskursa TV komedije.

Ključne riječi: TV komedija, diskurs, sociolingvistička varijabla, pragmatičko tumačenje

Ljerka Jeftić

MANAGEMENT OF KNOWLEDGE IN OBAMA'S SPEECH ON SYRIA

Abstract: The paper is concerned with semantic properties of the discourse-knowledge interface, that is, with the ways knowledge is related to the structures of discourse in the example of Barack Obama's speech when making the case for a military strike against the Syrian government. Prominent fragments of his speech are analyzed within the framework of sociocognitive approach to Critical Discourse Analysis in order to detect the ways knowledge is expressed, implied or presupposed. The analysis reveals that Obama strategically presupposes and recalls socially shared knowledge on America's greatness, might and righteousness at the same time deploying the strategies of persuasion and coercion to define beliefs as knowledge of facts.

Key words: discourse, knowledge, assertion, legitimization, presupposition

INTRODUCTION

What was initially widely perceived and welcomed by the Western countries as pro-democratic rebellions across the Middle East and, consequently, labeled as "Arab spring" led to serious disputes among the superpowers (US and Western Europe on the one side and, Russia and China on the other) following the alleged use of chemical weapons in Syria on the 21st August 2013 when, reportedly, over a thousand people were killed. The dispute arose both over which side in the Syrian conflict had used chemical weapons and over the US led initiative to launch "a targeted military strike" against "the Assad regime."

At the moment of writing of this paper, the major credible international organization, the United Nations, has not reported its findings about the nature of the attack. Therefore, underlying the dispute were the issues of legitimacy and credibility of the parties involved – "Whose discourses are legitimate or not? Whose discourses are more or less credible?" (van Dijk, 2008: 9). To put it differently, as knowledge about anything is not a natural product, but is being produced and used, taught and learned, and in all these interactions social roles,

groups and organizations are involved, the important questions are the ones of dominance, power and legitimacy.

This paper is concerned with how the US President, Barack Obama, formulates his knowledge on what happened in Syria in his speech, i.e. “remarks” delivered on the occasion of “making the case for a military strike against the Syrian government.” (*The Washington Post*, 11.9.2013) The reason to use this example is because “language has consequences” (Silberstein, 2002: 1) especially the language used by the President of one of the superpowers when legitimating his intentions. The aim is to examine the ways Obama manages the knowledge he claims to possess to manufacture consent for “a targeted military strike” against “the Assad regime.”

THEORETICAL FRAMEWORK

The sociocognitive approach within Critical Discourse Analysis (CDA) is a suitable theoretical-methodological framework within which to analyze political speeches as a form of discourse as well as the ways “knowledge is presupposed, implied, expressed or signaled” (van Dijk, 2012: 592) in a specific example.

Which actions are to be perceived as “political”, for Chilton & Schaffner (1997) it is a matter of interpretation yet they define “as potentially ‘political’ those actions (linguistic or other) which involve power, or its inverse, resistance” (Chilton & Schaffner, 1997: 21). They link political situations and processes to discourse types by way of an intermediate level, that is, “strategic functions” the notion of which “enables analysts of text and talk to focus on details that contribute to the phenomena which people intuitively understand as ‘political’, rather than on other functions such as the informational” (Chilton and Schaffner, 1997: 212). Two of four strategic functions are closely linked and prominent in political speeches: “coercion” and “legitimization”. Whereas the former is deployed by political actors through discourse by means of speech acts (commands, assertions, etc.) by setting agendas, selecting topics, making assumptions about realities that hearers are obliged to accept, the latter establishes the right to be obeyed the reasons for which have to be communicated linguistically (Chilton & Schaffner, 1997).

In the light of CDA’s concern with power and “discursive power abuse” (van Dijk, 2005) as manifested in language (van Dijk, 2005; Fairclough, 1995; Wodak, 2001), power is seen as being about relations of inequality and difference in society and the effects of these in social structures. In other words, “[f]or CDA, language is not powerful on its own – it gains power by the

use powerful people make of it” (Wodak, 2001:10). Such social power relations are based on the privileged or preferential access to, even control over social resources by the dominant groups. As these resources are not only material, but also symbolic, “knowledge as well as access to public discourse are among the major symbolic power resources of contemporary society” (van Dijk, 2003:87). Therefore, if we were to study power and its abuse, it is of crucial importance to understand how powerful groups and institutions (e.g. politicians, media, universities, etc) express and manage their knowledge in public discourse. Also, “one of the major challenges of CDA is to make explicit the relations between discourse and knowledge” (van Dijk, 2003: 85). Here lies the suitability of sociocognitive approach within CDA.

Van Dijk (2008) claims that “[w]e acquire most of our knowledge by discourse, and without knowledge we can neither produce nor understand discourse” and that “discourse processing is not just language processing but also knowledge processing.” He views knowledge not as just a discursive, cultural or social phenomenon, but as “both cognitive and as such associated with the neurological structures of the brain, as well as social, and thus locally associated with interaction between social actors and globally with societal structures.” (van Dijk, 2003: 89) The cognitive properties of the relation between knowledge and discourse are explained in terms of “social cognitions”:

‘Social cognition’ I shall define as the system of mental structures and operations that are acquired, used or changed in social contexts by social actors and shared by members of social groups, organizations and cultures. This system consists of several subsystems, such as knowledge, attitudes, ideologies, norms and values, and the ways these are affected and brought to bear in discourse *and* other social practices. (van Dijk, 2003: 89)

These “mental structures” van Dijk refers to as “mental models” and defines them as “subjective representations of *events* or *situations* in which a person participates at a certain *moment of time*, at a certain *place*, with other participants (with variable *identities* and social *roles*), engaged in a specific *action* and with specific *goals*” (van Dijk, 2012: 588). Mental models are essential in the production and understanding of discourse and provide for “the crucial interface between discourse and knowledge on the one hand, communication and interaction in general on the other: human beings are able to ‘read the mind’ of others through plausible and often reliable reconstructions of the mental models of others” (van Dijk, 2012: 589). Knowledge is part of context and one of the crucial functions of mental, context models is the management of knowledge in interaction (van Dijk 2012) in the sense that, for

instance, speakers generally need not assert what they know to be well known by the recipients and hence they may presuppose that information or knowledge in discourse. This is where room is provided for discursive power abuse.

DATA ANALYSIS

The data consist of prominent fragments of “President Obama’s Sept. 10 speech on Syria”¹. The analysis benefits from considering the following questions:

- How do language users know what knowledge must or may be expressed in discourse?
- Which knowledge is already known to the recipients and hence may be presupposed?
- What knowledge may have been forgotten by the recipients and hence may need to be recalled?
- Which new knowledge is important and hence be emphasized?
- Which new knowledge is less important and hence may be marginalized in discourse? (van Dijk, 2008: 7)

As noted above, discourse processing is controlled at all discourse levels by context models that manage the expression of knowledge in discourse. Consider the opening lines of President Obama’s speech:

- (1) My fellow Americans, *tonight I want to talk to you about Syria – why it matters, and where we go from here.*²

Contextually shared knowledge in this sentence is expressed by the personal pronoun *I* referring to the current speaker, by the pronoun *you* referring to the audience and, more generally, the American people, by the present tense of the stative verb *want*, by deictic adverb *tonight* referring to the temporal dimension of the setting in Obama’s context model. In terms of information distribution at sentence level (topic – comment), new knowledge is expressed as the comment (*Syria*) with more emphasis placed on the postpositional summarizing clauses: *why it matters, and where we go from here*. Part of this new knowledge is the knowledge implied by means of deictic adverb *here* referring not to the spatial

¹ The entire speech can be retrieved from: www.washingtonpost.com/politics/.

² Italics in the examples from Obama’s speech are author’s.

dimension of Obama's context model but to the context model he, that is, the US administration has formed with regards to the situation in Syria, in particular in the aftermath of the 21 August 2013 use of chemical weapons in that country. In other words, the first sentence is almost entirely an expression of Obama's context model at the moment of delivering his speech.

Obama's argumentation, i.e. management of knowledge in elaboration of the announced topics – *Syria, why it matters, where we go from here* – is the object of the analysis in the paper.

SYRIA

The following is the first paragraph of Obama's speech:

- (2) Over the past two years, *what began as a series of peaceful protests against the repressive regime of Bashar al-Assad* has turned into a brutal civil war. Over 100,000 people have been killed. Millions have fled the country. In that time, America has worked with allies to provide humanitarian support, to help the moderate opposition, and to shape a political settlement. But *I have resisted calls for military action, because we cannot resolve someone else's civil war through force, particularly after the decade of war in Iraq and Afghanistan.*

This part of speech serves the purpose of recalling general knowledge on Syria shared, at least, by the American "knowledge community" (van Dijk, 2012) and it is imbued with asserted and presupposed knowledge. Namely, the nominal relative clause occurring as the subject (*what began as a series of peaceful protests against the repressive regime of Bashar al-Assad*) asserts the peaceful nature of the protests at the same time presupposing the nature of the regime in power in Syria expressed by a definite structure (*the repressive regime of Bashar al-Assad*). The results of the protests are expressed by the assertions on the nature of the consequences (*a brutal civil war*) and on the number of people that have been killed (*over 100,000*) and the number of those who have fled the country (*millions*). The last sentence in the paragraph contains a factive presupposition (Yule, 1996: 27) in the information following the verb *resisted* (*I have resisted calls for military action*), i.e. the presupposed information that there had been calls for military action is treated as a fact. Presupposed knowledge expressed by a definite structure (*the decade of war in Iraq and Afghanistan*) functions as a trigger to activate the context model of the wars in Iraq and Afghanistan only to reaffirm American righteousness and decency upheld in international relations (*we cannot resolve someone else's civil war through force*).

Knowledge on how *the situation profoundly changed* in Syria is new and needs to be emphasized:

- (3) The situation profoundly changed, though, on August 21, *when Assad's government gassed to death over a thousand people, including hundreds of children. The images from this massacre are sickening: Men, women, children lying in rows, killed by poison gas. Others foaming at the mouth, gasping for breath. A father clutching his dead children, imploring them to get up and walk.*

The emphasis is achieved by means of “granularity” (van Dijk, 2012: 598) which is an element of semantic property of a discourse controlled by underlying knowledge related to the ways discourse “describes” the world. That is, “all situations and events (and their components objects, people, etc.) may be described more finely or more coarsely, with more or less detail” (van Dijk, 2012: 598). Having in mind the context of Obama’s speech as specified in the slug line – “making the case for a military strike against the Syrian government” – evident is the need to opt for granularity (marked with italics in the quote above) in description of the event *when Assad’s government gassed to death over a thousand people, including hundreds of children*. The information on the agency is presupposed within the quoted temporal clause.

As regards “evidentiality” (van Dijk, 2012: 600) to account for credibility and the source of his knowledge about *Assad’s government having gassed to death over a thousand people, including hundreds of children*, Obama states no explicit sources thus blurring the line between his beliefs and knowledge. Instead, his argumentation relies on the assumption that President’s speeches are based on reliable information of state agencies so the pieces of evidence are provided by means of presuppositions following factive verbs:

- (4) No one *disputes* that chemical weapons were used in Syria;
- (5) ...the world *saw* in gruesome detail the terrible nature of chemical weapons...;
- (6) The world *saw* thousands of videos, cell phone pictures, and social media accounts from the attack...;
- (7) ...we *know* that Assad regime was responsible...;
- (8) ...we *know* that Assad’s chemical weapons personnel prepared for an attack...;

- (9) We know senior figures in Assad's military machine reviewed the results of the attack, and the regime increased their shelling of the same neighborhoods in the days that followed.
- (10) We've also studied *samples of blood and hair* from people at the site that tested positive for sarin.

Failure to state which credible institution studied *samples of blood and hair* (10) makes this piece of knowledge controversial.

To strengthen his case and, at the same time, to legitimize the US planned *targeted strike*, Obama resorts to recalling general knowledge on the use of chemical weapons in the past (*In World War I, American GIs were among the many thousands killed by deadly gas in the trenches of Europe.; In World War II, the Nazis used gas to inflict the horror of the Holocaust.*) which led to the international agreement prohibiting the use of chemical weapons that *in 1997, the United States Senate overwhelmingly approved* and which is *now joined by 189 governments that represent 98 percent of humanity*. This is an effort that *the civilized world has spent a century working to ban them* just to see the violation of these rules (*these basic rules were violated, along with our sense of common humanity*) on August 21. The inferences expected to be made here are that Assad's government is not part of the civilized world, and the use of chemical weapons is not only America's concern.

This leads us the elaboration of the topic of *why [Syria] matters*.

WHY SYRIA MATTERS

Argumentation in this part of Obama's speech starts with implication about the nature of Assad's regime followed by assertions on the state of affairs:

- (11) *When dictators commit atrocities, they depend upon the world to look the other way until those horrifying pictures fade from memory. But these things happened. The facts cannot be denied.* The questions now is what the United States of America, and the international community, is prepared to do about it. Because *what happened to those people – to those children – is not only a violation of international law, it's also a danger to our security.*

Having asserted the *danger to our security*, Obama concentrates on explaining the reasons (*Let me explain why.*) by means of clauses of real condition (12i and 13i). The coherence of the piece of discourse in (12) is achieved by means of assertion stated as the result of the real condition (12i), within the

proportional clause (12ii), by the adverbial sentence connector (12iii) and the logical connector (12iv):

- (12) (i) *If we fail to act, the Assad regime will see no reason to stop using chemical weapon.* (ii) *As the ban against these weapons erodes,* other tyrants will have no reason to think twice about acquiring poison gas, and using them. (iii) *Over time,* our troops would again face the prospect of chemical warfare on the battlefield. (iv) *And* it could be easier for *terrorist organizations* to obtain these weapons, and to use them to attack civilians.
- (13) (i) *If fighting spills beyond Syria's borders, these weapons could threaten allies like Turkey, Jordan and Israel.* (ii) And a failure to stand against the use of chemical weapons would weaken prohibitions against other weapons of mass destruction, and embolden Assad's ally *Iran* – which must decide whether to ignore international law by building a nuclear weapon, or to take a more peaceful path.

Lexicalization of the agency presenting the *danger to our security (terrorist organizations, Iran)* helps reinstating the well-known enemies the knowledge of whom is important, hence re-emphasized.

The above line of argumentation is summed up with the following assertions answering the *why* in the rhetorical question *why it matters*:

- (14) This is not a world we should accept. That is what's at stake.

WHERE WE GO FROM HERE

The aura of authority and responsibility is displayed in Obama's *judgment as Commander-in-Chief*:

- (15) ... after careful deliberation, I determined that it is in the national security interests of the United States to respond to the Assad regime's use of chemical weapons through *a targeted military strike*. The purpose of this strike would be to deter Assad from using chemical weapons, *to degrade his regime's ability* to use them, and to make clear to the world that we will not tolerate their use.

The meaning of *a targeted military strike* is yet to be explained in the rest of Obama's speech, but the meaning of the infinitive *to degrade*³ (*his regime's ability*) remains unexplained, thus suggesting deliberate marginalization of this particular piece of new knowledge that is being communicated.

The example of the tenet that context models control the pragmatic aspect of discourse, i.e. that the speakers adjust their mental models to the particular situation, at the particular moment, is the following:

- (16) But I'm also the President of *the world's oldest constitutional democracy*. So even though I possess the authority to order military strikes, I believed it was right, in the absence of direct or imminent threat to our security, to take this debate to Congress.

In other words, the moment has come in his speech to attend to the issue of the ongoing public debate as well as opposing voices coming from some members of the Congress as regards the planned *targeted military strike*. Obama leaves that knowledge implicit while emphasizing his responsibility as the President of the presupposed *world's oldest constitutional democracy*. Along similar lines are his remarks on his predecessor's decision to wage the wars in Iraq and Afghanistan:

- (17) This is especially true after a decade that put more and more war-making power in the hands of the President, and more and more burdens on the shoulders of our troops, while sidelining the people's representatives from critical decisions about when we use force.

When Obama makes the knowledge of opposing voices explicit, he does so in the form of questions-answers exercise by quoting some of the *hard questions* he has *heard from members of Congress, and that I've read in letters that you've sent to me*:

- (18) ...many of you have asked...
(19) One man wrote to me...
(20) A veteran put it more bluntly...

³ Three meanings of the verb "degrade" are found in Cambridge Advanced Learner's Dictionary: 1/ "make worthless"; 2/"spoil"; 3/ "change structure" (CALDE, 2005: 326). The only logical meaning in Obama's particular use could be the first one ("to cause people to feel that they or other people are worthless...") for the second one implies an object of "beauty" whereas the third meaning is specialized referring to changing structure "of a substance".

- (21) Others have asked...
- (22) Many of you have asked...

The function of these introductory clauses is to reaffirm his credibility of the caring President who has not lost the common touch and who welcomes criticism. At the same time, the questions provide room for the answers emphasizing his intentions and sending messages to whom they may concern:

- (23) My answer is simple: I will not put American boots on the ground in Syria. I will not pursue an open-ended action like Iraq or Afghanistan. I will not pursue a prolonged air campaign like Libya and Kosovo.
- (24) Let me make something clear: The United States military doesn't do pinpricks. Even a limited strike will send a message to Assad that no other nation can deliver.
- (25) We don't dismiss any threats, but the Assad regime does not have the ability to seriously threaten our military.
- (26) America is not the world's policeman.

The conspicuous part of Obama's speech as regards management of knowledge is concerned with the way he communicates to the audience the diplomatic solution initiated by Russia by which the government of Syria agreed to put its chemical weapons under international control:

- (27) However, over the last few days, we've seen *some encouraging signs*. (i) In part because of the credible threat of U.S. military action, as well as constructive talks I had with President Putin, (ii) the Russian government *has indicated a willingness to join with the international community in pushing Assad to give up his chemical weapons*. The Assad regime has now admitted that it has these weapons, and even said they'd join the Chemical Weapons Convention, which prohibits their use. It's too early to tell whether this offer will succeed, and any agreement must verify that the Assad regime keeps its commitments. But this initiative has the potential to remove the threat of chemical weapons without the use of force, (iii) *particularly because Russia is one of Assad's strongest allies*.

In the light of the question pertaining to which new knowledge is less important and hence may be marginalized in discourse (cf. p. 4), the share of information on *some encouraging signs* within Obama's speech is rather insignificant. Moreover, the role of the initiator of a diplomatic solution

(Russia) is downplayed by means of thematic fronting of subordinate clauses of reason (27i), thus implying and emphasizing the role of the US and its President; by lexical means (*has indicated a willingness*,27ii) to imply “earlier unwillingness” on the part of Russia to *join* the presupposed, thus asserted, ongoing efforts of *the international community in pushing Assad to give up his chemical weapons*. This is corroborated with the emphasis put on the clause of reason (27iii) by means of the clause emphasize *particularly*. The rest of the speech on this topic is dedicated to imparting new knowledge on the relevant actions undertaken by the President in relation to *the initiative*, whereby his authority is asserted by means of clearly expressed agency *I* and *we* while presupposing shared knowledge on the role of the actors involved:

(28) I have, therefore, asked *the leaders of Congress* to

(29) I'm sending *Secretary of State* ... to meet *the Russian counterpart*...

(30) I've spoken to *the leaders of two of our closest allies*...

(31) We'll also give *U.N. inspectors* the opportunity to report their findings about what happened on August 21st.

Interestingly enough, although the UN is the major international organization that could legitimate Obama's calls for military intervention, the knowledge about the organization's inspectors not having reported their findings at the time of his speech is deliberately marginalized.

In the final part of his speech, Obama reiterates the military might and legitimacy of the USA to act on global scale when deemed necessary, as could be the case in Syria *if diplomacy fails*. He asserts shared knowledge on the military power of the US and implicitly recalls its active role in both *forging* and *enforcing international agreements*:

(32) ... for nearly seven decades, the United States has been the anchor of global security. This has meant doing more than *forging international agreements* – it has meant *enforcing them*. The burdens of leadership are often heavy, but the world is a better place because we have borne them.

Still advocating military action in Syria, Obama appeals to the audience, as well as to his friends *on the right* and to his friends *on the left* (thus indicating his contextual knowledge about the venue of his speech and implying shared knowledge of the distribution of seats among the members of the House occupied by the Democrats and Republicans respectively) to

- (33) ... view those videos of the attacks, and then ask: What kind of world will we live in if the United States of America sees a dictator brazenly violate international law with poison gas, and we chose to look the other way?

The appeal above does not refer to knowledge or evidence but to emotions and beliefs. In other words, Obama is making assumptions about realities that hearers are obliged to accept.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion we can say that in making his case for a military strike against the Syrian government Obama strategically presupposes and recalls socially shared knowledge on America's greatness, might and righteousness. Likewise, as "in the real life of international politics knowledge may be relative" (van Dijk, 2008: 21) he deploys the strategies of persuasion and coercion to define beliefs as knowledge of facts within his efforts to legitimize a military action.

REFERENCES

1. Chilton, P. & Schaffner, C. Discourse and Politics. In Teun A. Van Dijk (Ed.). *Discourse as Social Interaction* (pp. 206-231). London: SAGE, 1997.
2. Fairclough, Norman. *Critical Discourse Analysis: The Critical Study of Language*. Edinburgh: Longman, 1995.
3. Silberstein, Sandra. *War of Words: Language, Politics and 9/11*. London and New York: Routledge, 2002.
4. van Dijk, Teun A. The Discourse-Knowledge Interface. In Gilbert Weiss & Ruth Wodak (Eds.). *Critical Discourse Analysis. Theory and Interdisciplinarity*. Houndsmills, UK: Palgrave-Mac Millan, 2003.
5. van Dijk, Teun A. Politics, Ideology and Discourse. In Ruth Wodak (Ed.). *Encyclopedia of Language and Linguistics. Volume on Politics and Language* (pp. 728-740), 2005.
6. van Dijk, Teun A. Discourse, Knowledge, Power and Politics. Towards Critical Epistemic Discourse Analysis. <http://www.discourses.org/projects/knowledge2008>.

7. van Dijk, Teun A. Discourse and Knowledge. In James Paul Gee & Michael Handford (Eds.). *Handbook of Discourse Analysis* (pp. 587-603). London: Routledge, 2012.
8. Wodak, Ruth & Meyer, Michael. *Methods of Critical Discourse Analysis*. London/Thousand Oaks/New Delhi: SAGE, 2001.
9. Yule, George. *Pragmatics*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1996.

UPRAVLJANJE ZNANJEM U OBAMINOM GOVORU O SIRIJI

Rezime

Rad se bavi semantičkim obilježjima interfejsa između diskursa i znanja, odnosno, uspostavljenim načinima odnosa između diskursa i znanja. Odabrani dijelovi govora Baraka Obame, kojim zagovara vojni udar na sirijske vlasti, analizirani su unutar okvira socio-kognitivnog pristupa u kritičkoj analizi diskursa sa ciljem otkrivanja načina izražavanja, impliciranja i presuponiranja znanja. Analizom je ustanovljeno da Obama koristi strategije presuponiranja znanja koje dijele pripadnici američkog društva o velični, moći i pravednosti Amerike, kao i strategije prinude i ubjeđivanja pri definisanju uvjerenja kao znanja zasnovanog na činjenicama.

Ključne riječi: diskurs, znanje, tvrdnja, legitimizacija, presupozicija

Olja Jojić

COMPARATIVE CONSTRUCTIONS AS A RESOURCE FOR AGGRESSIVE HUMOR

Abstract: This paper explores the use of comparative constructions to generate humor in scripted (sitcom) conversations. More specifically, we discuss some of the ways comparative constructions interact with context to generate aggressive forms of conversational humor. Aggressive humor characteristically builds on the potential asymmetry between individuals to produce laughter. Comparative constructions are typically concerned with the degree to which objects share a certain property, but they need not, however, always involve grading, since identity and likeness can also invite comparison. In that regard, the paper discusses some of the typical examples of how scalar and non-scalar comparisons are used to produce laughter in the recipient.

Key words: comparative constructions, aggressive humor, scalar comparisons, non-scalar comparisons

1. INTRODUCTION

Beyond certain restricted classes of language-dependent humor, such as puns, it might not always be immediately obvious what role linguistic form plays in the production of humor. As Bergen and Binsted note, there is no such thing as “funny grammar”, that is, “there are no dedicated syntactic structures or configurations that by themselves always trigger humor” (Bergen and Binsted, forthcoming). This makes humor all the more challenging topic for linguistic research.

The object of investigation in this paper is conversational humor (*cf.* Coates 2007; Dynel 2011).¹ The term is used to refer to humorous utterances embedded in otherwise non-humorous stretches of discourse. Specifically, we focus on the aggressive types of humorous verbalizations extracted from the

¹ Jokes and similar (non-)interactive types of humor conveyed through language will not be discussed in this paper (*cf.* Dynel 2009).

corpus made out of thirty sitcom episodes (see *References*). Such types of humor are best explained by social theories of humor, which are typically concerned with the modalities of production and reception of humorous phenomena (Attardo 1994: 2, and *passim*). For instance, disparagement theories² see humor through the prism of asymmetry between two or more individuals, and propose that “it is the perception of this asymmetry that causes enjoyment in those that consider themselves to be superior” (Ermida 2008: 15). In that regard, it appears that obvious correlation can be established between the comparative form/meaning on the one hand (*cf.* Carter and McCarthy 2006; Quirk *et al.* 1985; Huddleston and Pullum 2002; Biber *et al.* 1999) and the asymmetry germane to aggressive humor, on the other, in the sense that both seem to draw on the concepts of in/equality to achieve their communicative goals.

Some research on jokes exploiting the concept of scale has already been done from the cognitive linguistic perspective (*cf.* Bergen and Binsted 2003). However, further analyses need to be done in order to be able to determine the ways comparative form and meaning are amalgamated with contextual factors to generate humor in conversations.

2. AGGRESSION AND HUMOR IN (NON-)LINGUISTIC LITERATURE

The term *aggression* is frequently invoked in literature on humor (to mention some authors, albeit far from exhaustively, Graham *et al.* 1992; Attardo 1994; Norrick 2003; Tannen 2005; Billig 2005; Holmes 2006; Partington 2006; Martin 2007; Norrick and Spitz 2008; Schnurr 2009; Dynel 2009, 2010a). Terminology varies, but some of the descriptive terms used to refer to the phenomenon in question are: *disaffiliative humor* (Dynel 2010a), *subversive*, *repressive*, *contestive humor* (Holmes 2000, 2006), *adversarial humor* (Veale *et al.* 2006), *the dark side of humor* (Schnurr 2009). The absence of a terminological consensus is even more noticeable in papers addressing various manifestations of aggressive humor. In the recent literature on humor some of the following terms can be encountered: *irony/sarcasm* (Partington 2006; Martin 2007; Norrick and Spitz 2008; Schnurr 2009; Dynel 2010a), *teasing* (Boxer and Cortes-Conde 1996; Lampert and Ervin-Tripp 2006; Geyer 2008; 2010; Norrick and Spitz 2008), *putdowns* (Tannen 2005; Dynel 2010a; Norrick

² Also called hostility/aggression/superiority/triumph/derision theories (*cf.* Attardo 1994).

and Spitz 2008), *ridicule* (Billig 2005), *mocking* (Norrick and Spitz 2008).³ Theoretical treatment of these subcategories differs from one author to another, overlaps are frequent, and differences between individual categories are impossible to establish. Furthermore, some authors take the criterion of *the butt* to distinguish between various forms of aggressive humor. In such studies, various forms of racial or ethnic humor, satire, or various types of stereotype humor, are treated as aggressive. Some other authors, still, find elements of aggression in relation to discourse structure. For instance, Norrick and Spitz mention that humorous remarks that are topically unrelated in a goal-directed talk can be perceived as aggressive in that they constitute an intrusion (2008: 1663). Similarly, Holmes finds that subversive humor is used to “challenge, disagree with, or undermine the propositions or arguments put forward in earlier contributions” (Holmes 2006: 33).

Taking into account all of the above mentioned, in this paper aggressive humor is used as an umbrella term embracing humorous utterances which are “liable to hurt others, thus disaffiliating the speaker from hearer” (Dynel 2010a: 184). The recipients of such humor, that is, the addressee, and other types of hearers (*cf.* Dynel 2010b), can experience the perlocutionary effects of either offense or mirth. Namely, whereas the butt (target) of the aggressive humorous utterance will not find any humor in such utterances, other interlocutors, apart from the speaker and the target, can potentially derive humor from them, provided that they are not emotionally attached to the target (Dynel 2010a: 185).

3. DISCUSSION

Given that units of conversational humor can range from lexemes to suprasentential units, it is important to note that in the sections below the attention will be limited to the sentence. However, taking into account that the semantic concept of comparison is relevant to the whole system of grade, and mindful of space limitations in this article, in the sections below we turn our attention to the sentences which contain what traditional grammar books refer to as the *comparative clauses* (Quirk *et al.* 1985: 1127-1146) or *clauses of similarity and comparison* (*ibid.*: 1110-1111), typically introduced by *than*, *as* or *like*. Following Huddleston and Pullum (2002), in 3.1. and 3.2. these are grouped in scalar and non-scalar varieties. The significant difference between

³ As Dynel points out, units of conversational humor “may capitalise on semantic categories and rhetorical figures regarded as **distinct humorous forms in their own right**” (Dynel 2011: 5, our emphasis).

them is that in the former the standard of comparison is measurable in terms of degree, whereas the latter are based on identity and similarity.

All the examples are numbered, and the relevant contextual information is supplied in square brackets. The shorthand given in round brackets refers to the sitcom and the episode from which the example was taken (the complete list is supplied in *References*).

3.1. SCALAR COMPARISONS

3.1.1. MORE/LESS/-ER ... (THAN)

Humorous effect can draw on the semantics and pragmatics of scalar comparative structures. Semantically, the presence of correlative sequences (*more/less/-er*) in sentences typically indicates lack of equivalence on some scale (cf. Quirk *et al.* 1985: 1128). Pragmatically, a number of (non-logical) inferences can be drawn on the basis of the relationship between the matrix and the comparative clauses, and typically one of the inferences can potentially draw laughter from the recipient.

In the example of mocking humor below, which extends above the sentence level, world leaders' unattractiveness is taken as the standard of their comparison. In the given co(n)text, the comparative construction in George's utterance triggers the presupposition⁴ that both Johnson and de Gaulle share the quality of being ugly. Since it is highly unlikely that the recipients (TV viewers) will sympathize with the two referents, it is expected that laughter will ensue due to the recipients feeling superior to Johnson and de Gaulle in terms of the level of attractiveness:

- (1) [Monk's Café. Elaine, Jerry and George are sitting at the table.]
Elaine: Hey, who do you think is the most unattractive world leader?
Jerry: Living or all time?
Elaine: All time.
Jerry: Well, if it's all time, then there's no contest. It begins and ends with Brezhnev.
Elaine: I dunno. You ever get a good look at de Gaulle?
George: Lyndon Johnson was uglier than de Gaulle. (STO)

Other examples of the use of comparative constructions to generate humor may not be as straightforward. In the example below, the standard of comparison

⁴ A presupposition is understood as "a proposition whose truth is taken for granted by the producer of an utterance and which must be known and taken account of for the utterance to make sense to an interpreter" (Cruse 2006: 138).

between Kelly and Mrs. Rhoades (Marcy) is size. Unlike previous example, where the claim that Johnson was uglier than de Gaulle implied that both of them were ugly, the comparative construction in (2) does not, however, trigger the presupposition that Marcy has a big bra size. In fact, humorous effect exploits the fact that, unlike logical inferences such as entailment, presuppositions can be canceled (the so-called *defeasibility*; see Saeed 2003: 107). Namely, Bud is using Kelly's disadvantageous position on the scale of bra size (and implicitly breast size), on which Marcy does not occupy a significant position either, to provoke ridicule of the both of them:

- (2) [Marcy and Steve Rhoades and Kelly are in the living room. Bud comes running down the stairs, holding a bra.]
 Bud: Hey Kelly, look! Even Mrs. Rhoades has a bigger bra size than you! (MWCMWC)

In other instances, the role of the comparative form can be contributory to the pragmatic function of the humorous utterance. In the example below, the exclamation *wow* followed by the comparative item *better*, which is modified by the intensifier *even*, are ostensibly used to express a speech act of compliment. However, the fact that a dog is taken as the basis of comparison turns unfavorable for Jake, who is evaluated in terms of having a better appeal to potential dates than a dog. This generates the element of surprise (incongruity), which, according to some authors, is the ingredient without which there is no humor:

- (3) [Charlie and his eight-year-old nephew Jake are at the supermarket. They just stopped singing the song Charlie wrote.]
 Woman: You two are really good together.
 Charlie: Thank you.
 Woman: So, does your wife sing too?
 Charlie: No, I'm not married.
 Woman: Oh, what a shame. [the woman leaves]
 Charlie [to Jake]: Wow, you're even better than a dog! (THMP)

Due to the fact that the dimensions of equality and inequality intersect with the dimensions of scalarity and non-scalarity, scalar comparisons do not necessarily always imply inequality. In (4) below, the adverb *no* is used to modify the comparative element *better*. The comparative structure, which can be equated with the proposition that Steve is the same as Al (*cf.* Quirk *et al.* 1985: 1136), triggers the presupposition that Al "is no god". Whereas Marcy's dismayed utterance is not humorous in the "first run", Peggy's utterance reframes it as humorously aggressive, by implying that this "equality" is insulting for Steve. Indirectly, Peggy is hurling her jibe at Al:

- (4) [Marcy and Steve are sitting on the couch. Peggy and Al are in the kitchen.]
Marcy: And after we have our little boy and little girl, Steve's going to have a vasectomy. Right, Steve?
[Steve looks up in fright.]
Steve: Steve is going to have what, dear?
Al: You know, Steve, like Buck – you've live longer, you'll be calmer...
Steve: Shut up, Al. [to Marcy] Uh, dear, we never talked about doing anything to, uh, "Mr. Mike".
Marcy: Sure we did, Steve, we said that once we'd had our two children we'd stop.
Steve: Well, I guess I read "stop" a little differently than you did.
Marcy: Just how did you read it, Steve? You're no better than Al.
Peggy: Now, now, there is no need for insults. (MWCBDI)

Sarcastic irony (*cf.* Jorgensen 1996; Toplak and Katz 2000) is often mentioned in literature on humor. It carries both aggressive potential (present in sarcasm) and indirectness (typical of irony). In the example below, the utterance of the underlined sentence triggers the false presupposition that (going to) Vietnam is fun,⁵ which due to irony should be taken to mean exactly the opposite. Successful calculation of the intended meaning – that having dinner with in-laws at *Le Bernadoux* will be even less fun than going to Vietnam brings humorous delight to the recipient:

- (5) [Ray and Debra's living room.]
Lois: Everything okay?
Ray: Oh, yea, couldn't be better. We were, Debra and I were just saying it's a shame we don't spend more time together.
Lois: We were just thinking the same thing. So, why don't we all have dinner together tomorrow night?
Ray: Huh?
Warren: We have a reservation at Le Bernardoux. We'll just expand it. We'll all go.
Debra: That's a four star restaurant.
Marie: No, no, no, thank you. We don't go to those kinds of places because – well, it's just too much.
Frank: I don't like to get dressed.
Lois: Oh, don't be silly. In fact, Ray, bring your brother.
Ray: Oh boy.
Lois: Doesn't this sound like fun? Oh come on, you guys, our treat. It would mean so much to us.

⁵ In the same scene which could not be fully reproduced due to its extensiveness, Frank makes fun of Lois and Warren's plan to go to Vietnam for their next vacation.

Marie: But we're just so very busy.

Debra: Ray?

Ray: Well, we're not too busy for our in-laws. Yes, yes. Le Bernardoux, the whole family. Together.

Warren: Great.

Marie: Oh, it's gonna be so thrilling.

Frank: It'll be more fun than Vietnam. (ELRIL)

In example (6), scalar comparison of nonequivalence is used to practice a particularly reckless witticism, which produces the humorous effect on the basis of pragmatically implied meaning – specifically a particularized conversational implicature.⁶ The proposition that funeral is cheaper than a wedding conveys to Kelly that her father does not care whether she lives or dies. In fact, he would rather she died, because it would cost less:

- (6) [Kelly is arguing with Al. Al follows Kelly across the room and they stop behind the couch. Peggy is idly sitting on the couch.]
Kelly: Daddy, I love Lonnie, and I'll die if I can't have him.
Al: Suit yourself, a funeral's cheaper than a wedding. (MWCHMM)

3.1.2. AS... AS

The corpus used in this paper contains a small number of examples of comparison of equivalence facilitated by the correlatives *as ... as* (cf. Quirk *et al.* 1985: 1137). In both of the examples below, aggressiveness is contained in the proposition triggered by the comparative construction. In the first example, it is presupposed that the world sees Al as cheap labor, whereas in the second, the presupposition is that Homer looks and sounds stupid:

- (7) [Al is back from moving Brenda's couch.]
Al: Well, after I moved Brenda's couch, she said I was cute. Oh, Peg, I think she likes me!
Peggy: Aww, honey, how could she? Oh, believe me, Al, and I'm telling you this as your wife and as your friend. No one likes you. Face it, sweetie. I know you better than anyone. And believe me, she sees you as the world sees you — as cheap labor. Now how about a beer? (MWCDS)
- (8) [Burns is trying to persuade Homer to take his job offer.]

⁶ One of central pragmatic notions, typically divided into conventional and conversational implicatures. Particularized implicatures depend on specific contexts and they are not default message components (Cruse 2006: 71).

Burns: You mean you're willing to give up a good job and a raise just for your principles?

Homer: Mhm. When you put it that way, it does sound a little farfetched... but that's the lug you're looking at! And I vow to continue spending every free minute I have crusading for safety. Of course, I'd have a lot less of those free minutes if you gave me the job.

Burns: Mmm. You're not as stupid as you look or sound... or our best testing indicates. You've got the job. Now get to work! (TSHO)

3.2. NON-SCALAR COMPARISONS

3.2.1. POSITIVE RESEMBLANCE: "LIKE"

In sitcom discourse, comparative constructions as complements to the preposition *like* are frequently found in putdowns and other types of aggressive humor. In the example (9) below, the underlined comparative construction is instrumental in producing a disparaging type of humor, the butt of which is a generic referent (all girls). The elliptical comparative clause following the preposition *like* triggers the unbecoming proposition that all girls are things (and derivatively neutered dogs):

- (9) [Steve is trying to persuade Al to have Buck neutered. Al is reluctant.]
Al: I bought a male dog because I wanted a male dog.
Steve: He'll still be a male dog.
Al: No he won't be a male dog, he'll be a... a thing. Like a, like a girl.
(MWCBDI)

Figurative comparisons (similes) with *like* can also be used to actualize aggressive forms of humor. In (10), two fundamentally disparate situations are juxtaposed to the disadvantage of the two referents (Marie and Frank). Namely, Marie's and Frank's conduct during dinner at an expensive restaurant with their in-laws is compared to the hypothetical situation of wearing shoes for the first time. Humorous effect depends on the how successful the recipient is in calculating the implicature:

- (10) [Debra, Ray, Robert, Marie and Frank have just arrived at Le Bernadoux.]
Debra: Uh, we're with the Walen party.
Maitre'd: Yes, your hosts have arrived already. I'll be glad to take you to your table.
Frank: Am I gonna have to tip this guy?

Marie: No. We'll... we'll seat ourselves, thank you. Come on, let's go.

Debra: [to Ray] What's with your parents? It's like the first time they've ever worn shoes. (ELRIL)

Sitcom discourse is replete with examples of unintentional humor, one type of which are unintentional insults. In his clumsy attempt to deny his attraction to Angelina, Ray tries to ingratiate himself with Debra by paying her a compliment. The elliptical sentence with the comparative construction functioning as subject complement (*Nothing like you...*) can be interpreted in two ways. In the intended interpretation, the underlined sentence has a gap in the place of the subject and the operator (*She is nothing...*). In this non-humorous interpretation, Angelina cannot compare to Debra. Humorous interpretation is that some men may find Angelina attractive, but they would never find Debra attractive (unintentional insult):

- (11) [Debra is asking Ray to describe Angelina, the new waitress at Nemo's Restaurant.]

Debra: Oh come on, can't you be honest? Look, if you saw someone pretty today Ray, you can tell me.

Ray: I saw nothing.

Debra: Oh, wow, she must be beautiful.

Ray: She... look, she's Nemo's niece, how beautiful can she be, huh? You've seen Nemo. Alright look, some men may find her attractive. Nothing like you though. [Off Debra's look] Which means that you are the more attractive one. I... I have the right to an attorney. (ELRLDT)

3.2.2. NEGATIVE RESEMBLANCE: "UNLIKE"

Preposition *unlike* conveys the meaning of negative resemblance (Quirk *et al.* 1985: 698-699). In the example below, by employing the underlined clause of comparison in his utterance, the speaker distances himself from the collective addressee, who is referred to by the noun *nut*, which acquires derogatory connotations when used metaphorically to refer to human beings (*cf. Oxford Advanced Learner's Dictionary* 1994: 846). On a more pragmatic note, the subordinate clause triggers the presupposition is that the collective addressee are nuts:

- (12) [Homer is standing on top of his car with a fellow speaker.]

Speaker: I give you the man whose very name is synonymous with safety. Homer Simpson!

Crowd: Homer! Homer!

Homer: Thank you. Unlike most of you, I am not a nut. Just a good, honest American who opposes wrongdoing ... (TSHO)

In (13) below, humorous effect depends on recipient's successful interpretation of Peggy's sarcasm, deeply veiled in her utterance. Peggy likens the situations of showering and fixing a doorbell, in the sense that both require the act of raising an arm. In Al's case, resemblance is negative, which means that Al does not raise his arm when showering, which implies that Al is a slob:

- (13) [Al sits on the couch, puts his feet up on the table and puts his hand down his pants. A little while later, Peggy enters. She puts down her things and sits next to Al. She keeps looking at him, expectantly. Al starts to look anxiously at Peggy. He starts shaking.]
Al: WHAT!?
Peggy: Hi, honey. Are you enjoying your day off?
Al: Peg, you know I am. And how are you gonna ruin it for me? Sex, chores, what?
[Peggy leans in to sniff Al, and recoils.]
Peggy: Ooh. Well, I think we'll just stick to chores for today. But I'll give you a choice: shower or fix the doorbell.
Al: How much work is it to fix the doorbell?
Peggy: Well, unlike taking a shower you might have to raise an arm. (MWCDS)

3.2.3. UNGRAMMATICAL COMPARISON

An interesting example of the exploitation of the formal properties of comparative constructions to produce humor is illustrated below. In order to perform the (face-threatening) speech act of correction, Ray employs an ungrammatical comparison which breaks the prescriptive rule that when *than* is followed by a personal pronoun acting as the head of a noun phrase, the object forms are to be used (*cf.* Carter and McCarthy 2006: 764):

- (14) [Debra and Ray are in bed. He is sitting up, she is trying to sleep.]
Debra: You know what? [gets out of bed] I have been holding this in all day. There is no way that you are smarter than me.
Ray: Smarter than I. (ELRSD)

4. CONCLUSION

In this paper we have explored the ways comparative constructions are used to produce aggressive forms of humor. Comparative constructions were first classified into scalar and non-scalar varieties, and then discussed in terms of how their semantic-pragmatic behavior contributes to the production of humor. It appears that in scalar comparisons humorous effect mainly depends on the recipients' successful identification of presuppositions, whereas in non-scalar comparisons, on their successfulness in inferring implicatures. However, as we already pointed out, the present article turns attention only to comparative clauses, and clauses of comparison and similarity. English language, however, offers other lexical and grammatical means to convey comparative meaning. These need to be examined further, in order to get the full picture on how comparative meaning and context are enmeshed for the purpose of generating humor.

REFERENCES

1. Attardo, S. *Linguistic Theories of Humor*. Berlin/New York: Mouton de Gruyter, 1994.
2. Bergen, B. and Binsted, K. Embodied grammars and linguistic humor. In G. Brone, T. Veale, and K. Feyaerts (Eds.). *Cognitive Linguistics and Humor Research*. Berlin/New York: Mouton de Gruyter (forthcoming).
3. Bergen, B. and Binsted, K. The Cognitive Linguistics of Scalar Humor. In M. Achard, and S. Kemmer, (Eds.). *Language, Culture, and Mind* (pp. 79-93). Stanford: CLSI Publications, 2003.
4. Biber, D. *et al. Longman Grammar of Spoken and Written English*. Harlow: Longman, 1999.
5. Billig, M. *Laughter and Ridicule. Towards a Social Critique of Humour*. London/Thousand Oaks/New Delhi: Sage, 2005.
6. Boxer, D. and Cortes-Conde, F. From bonding to biting: Conversational joking and identity display. *Journal of Pragmatics* 27: 275-294, 1997.
7. Carter, R. and McCarthy, M. *Cambridge Grammar of English*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006.
8. Coates, J. Talk in a play frame: More on laughter and intimacy. *Journal of Pragmatics* 39(1): 29-49, 2007.

9. Cruse, A. *A Glossary of Semantics and Pragmatics*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2006.
10. Dynel, M. Beyond a Joke: Types of Conversational Humor. *Language and Linguistics Compass* 3/5: 1284-1299, 2009.
11. Dynel, M. Friend or foe? Chandler's humour from the metarecipient's perspective. In Iwona Witzczak-Plisiecka (Ed.), *Pragmatic Perspectives on Language and Linguistics Vol. II: Pragmatics of Semantically Restricted Domains* (pp. 175-205). Newcastle: Cambridge Scholars Publishing, 2010a.
12. Dynel, Marta. Not hearing things – Hearer/listener categories in polylogues. *mediAzioni* 9. <http://mediazioni.sitlec.unibo.it>, ISSN 1974-4382, 2010b.
13. Dynel, M. Pragmatics and linguistic research into humour. In M. Dynel (Ed.) *The Pragmatics of Humour Across Discourse Domains* (pp. 1-15). Amsterdam/Philadelphia: John Benjamins Publishing, 2011.
14. Ermida, I. *The Language of Comic Narratives: Humor Construction in Short Stories*. Berlin/New York: Mouton de Gruyter, 2008.
15. Geyer, N. *Discourse and Politeness. Ambivalent face in Japanese*. London/New York: Continuum, 2008.
16. Graham, E. *et al.* Functions of humor in conversation: Conceptualization and measurement. *Western Journal of Communication* 56: 161-183, 1992.
17. Holmes, J. Politeness, Power and Provocation: How Humour Functions in the Workplace. *Discourse Studies* 2 (2): 159-185, 2000.
18. Holmes, J. Sharing a laugh, Pragmatic aspects of humor and gender in the workplace. *Journal of Pragmatics* 38(1): 26-50, 2006.
19. Huddleston, R. and Pullum, G.K. *A Student's Introduction to English Grammar*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
20. Jorgensen, J. Functions of sarcastic irony in speech. *Journal of Pragmatics* 26: 613-634, 1996.
21. Lampert, M. D. and Ervin-Tripp, S. M. Risky Laughter: Teasing and self-directed joking among male and female friends. *Journal of Pragmatics* 38: 51-72, 2006.
22. Martin, R. *The psychology of humor. An integrative approach*. Burlington, MA: Elsevier, 2007.

23. Norrick, N. R. and Spitz, A. Humor as a resource for mitigating conflict in interaction. *Journal of Pragmatics* 40: 1661-1686. 2008.
24. Norrick, N. Issues in conversational joking. *Journal of Pragmatics* 35: 1333-1359, 2003.
25. Partington, A. *The Linguistics of Laughter. A corpus-assisted study of laughter-talk*. London: Routledge, 2006.
26. Quirk, Randolph, *et al.* 1985: *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language*. London/New York: Longman, 1985.
27. Saeed, J. *Semantics* (2nd ed.). Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 2003.
28. Schnurr, S. Leadership discourse at work. Interactions of Humour, Gender and Workplace Culture. London: Palgrave Macmillan, 2009.
29. Tannen, D. *Conversational Style: Analyzing Talk among Friends* (2nd ed.). Oxford: OUP, 2005.
30. Toplak, M. E. and Katz, A.N. On the uses of sarcastic irony. *Journal of Pragmatics* 32, 1467-1488, 2000.
31. Veale, T. *et al.* The cognitive mechanisms of adversarial humor. *Humor. International Journal of Humor Research* 19(3). 305-338, 2006.

Websites used for data collection

1. <http://www.twiztv.com>
2. <http://www.albundy.net>
3. <http://www.seinfeldscripts.com>
4. <http://www.simpsoncrazy.com/scripts>

List of sitcoms and episodes used as corpus

1. Married With Children: Married without Children (MWC MWC); Bud Hits the Books (MWC BHB); Buck Can Do It (MWC BDI); Do Ya Think I'm Sexy? (MWC DTS); How to Marry a Moron (MWC HMM)
2. Two and a Half Men: Did you Check with the Captain of the Flying Monkeys? (THM CFM); An Old Flame With a New Wick (THM OFNW); I Can't Afford Hyenas (THM CAH); No Sniffing, No Wowing (THM NSNW); Pilot (THM P)

3. Frasier: The Proposal (FP); Caught in the Act (FCIA); I'm Listening (FIL); Boo! (FB); Freudian Sleep (FFS)
4. Everybody Loves Raymond: In-laws (ELRIL); Standard Deviation (ELRSD); Win, Lose or Draw (ELRWLD); Turkey or Fish (ELRTF); Look, Don't Touch (ELSLDT)
5. Seinfeld: The Hot Tub (SHT); Serenity Now (SSN); The Frogger (STF); The Betrayal (STB); The Outing (STO)
6. The Simpsons: Homer's Odyssey (TSHO); There's no Disgrace like Hom (TSNDLH); Bart, the Mother (TSBM); Two Cars in Every Garage and Three Eyes on Every Fish (TSTCGTEF); Homer and Apu (TSHAA)

POREDBENE KONSTRUKCIJE KAO IZVORI HUMORA

Rezime

U radu se bliže razmatra upotreba poredbenih struktura u konstruisanim razgovorima humorističkih serija. Tačnije, analiziraju se načini interakcije poredbenih konstrukcija sa kontekstom koji rezultiraju agresivnim oblicima humora. Kod agresivnog humora potencijalna asimetrija između pojedinaca služi kao osnov za generisanje smijeha kod recipijenta. S druge strane, poredbenim konstrukcijama tipično se stepenuje razlika u izraženosti neke osobine kod dva (ili više) objekata. One, međutim, ne moraju uvijek uključivati gradaciju, budući da se poređenje može vršiti i prema jednakosti ili sličnosti. U tom smislu, u radu se razmatraju neki od tipičnih načina proizvođenja smijeha kod recipijenta upotrebom skalarnih i neskarnih oblika poređenja.

Ključne riječi: poredbene konstrukcije, agresivni humor, skalarno poređenje, neskarno poređenje

Nejla Kalajđisalihović

THREATENING LANGUAGE IN THREAT LETTERS

Abstract: When distinguishing between prominent and contrastive features of threat letters, one may tentatively conclude that threat letters, anonymous or not, are face-threatening communicative events containing a promise of violence. However, a question arises whether threat is intended, meant or properly understood. In this paper, I present some of the most commonly encountered lexico-grammatical contrastive features in threat letters in an attempt to identify whether their locutionary, illocutionary and perlocutionary points overlap. I also discuss how the receiver may or may not wish to take part in fulfilling the felicity conditions. As threat letters fall into the category of forensic texts, I partially present levels of analysis to be considered in the data-mining process.

Key words: threat letters, felicity conditions, prominent features, contrastive features

INTRODUCTION

As shorter pieces of written discourse, threat letters, along with other types of forensic texts are analysed in the domains of sociolinguistics, psycholinguistics, discourse analysis, critical discourse analysis and forensic linguistics. Since they contain features also found in the spoken discourse, threat letters could be observed as individual speech acts containing locutionary, illocutionary and perlocutionary points that could, in some cases, be interpreted differently by different recipients depending on whether they are playing an active role in the interactional intention of the text pertaining to its illocutionary points. In other words, threatening language in threat letters may not always result in co-operation and contribution 'such as required, at the stage at which it occurs, by the accepted purpose or direction of the talk exchange' (Grice, 1975: 45).

By definition, in threat letters, *the threatener* is threatening *the threatened* with a certain form of punishment or (property) destruction if he/she/they does/do not act according to conditions provided (Gales, 2010: 1). For this reason, threat letters are abundant in conditional sentences and passive forms. Also, threat letters can be regarded as counterparts of *promises* (Olsson, 2004: 155).

Depending on the sociolinguistic context (e.g. the author profile, the year the letter was written in, the sum of money required (e.g. ransom note), the delivery method etc.), letters containing threat may be compared and contrasted against their various prominent and contrastive features. For instance, ransom notes are direct, short, and usually provide information about the time and place where the parties are to meet. They are usually unambiguous and clearly state what should be done. However, individual ransom notes for instance, anonymous or not, may contain numerous contrastive features that need to be analysed using various approaches to single-text studies.

Stylistically, threat letters contain instances of both formal and informal language. Formal language in threat letters is expressed by means of full grammatical forms, but also by choices of non-functional (content) words. However, informal or non-standard language usually prevails as threat letters reflect spoken language. On the other hand, threat *letters* are not transcribed and are, for that reason, different from tape-recorded ‘spoken texts’ (Brown, 1983: 9). Particular contrastive features of threat letters are usually recognized on the semiotic level of analysis (e.g. punctuation, capital letters, exclamation marks, misspellings, emoticons etc.).

Further on, I give illustrations for several threat letters written in English. In these letters, I analyse the most frequent functional and non-functional words in an attempt to identify the most salient features important for the analysis of their locutionary, illocutionary and perlocutionary points as these are important for assessing the threatener’s stance and the victim’s comprehension of the content.

PARTS OF SPEECH BY FREQUENCY

The corpus analysed for the purpose of determining word frequency consisted of three threat letters and one extortion note, i.e. 35 sentences, 656 words, and 2,738 characters.

The most frequent non-functional words relevant for the analysis of threat letters were personal pronouns. The second-person personal pronoun (both singular and plural), *you*, occurs six times in the corpus (0.9%). The reason for

this is found in the fact that the threatener addresses any potential or known receiver of the letter. Other most frequent personal pronouns are first-person singular and plural personal pronouns (*I*/0.45% and *we*/0.3%). The frequency and choice of personal pronouns reveals that threat letters are very concise, focusing on agents and patients of top-priority, i.e. agents and recipients of shared microcosms.

As for content words, the most frequent head nouns found in the corpus are: *day* (4/0.61%), *person* (4/0.61%), *radio* (4/0.61%), *hostage* (3/0.45%), and *message* (3/0.45%)/*messages* (2/0.3%). Adjectival participles are rarely used (e.g. *unauthorised* approach, *recorded* message, *published* notice), whereas possessive adjectives are used more frequently. For instance, *your* occurs seven times (1.067%) in the corpus and is the most frequent possessive adjective. Here are several examples of its usage:

Your employee has been kidnapped and will be released for a ransom¹ of £175, 000.

Your watch must be synchronized with the 5pm pips on Radio2.

I have *your* Lin Phun.

The table below shows the most frequent personal pronouns and possessive adjectives found in the corpus:

Table 1. Personal pronouns and possessive adjectives in four letters containing threat.

Personal pronouns by frequency	Possessive adjectives by frequency
I (3X) 0.45%	Your (7x) 1.06 %
We (2x) 0.30%	You (6x) 0.91 %

Full verbs in threat letters actively participate in building illocutionary points as *commissives*, *directives* and *declaratives*. They also occur as:

¹ The misspellings in the examples given are present in the original documents or messages.

- elements building a future tense: *will be released, will be granted, will be pre-recorded, will be given*
- elements building a present tense: *are not informed, has been kidnapped, has been released, have been warned*
- linguistic material following modal verbs (*must, can, will*): *must be synchronized, must be carried, (must be) made up, (must be) packed, can be made.*

Auxiliary verbs partake in the linguistic content mostly through *will*, the most frequent verb in the corpus, which occurs eleven times and is used to express commands and reinforce superiority of the threatener. The most frequent *adverbs* function as adverbials of time (*today* occurs twice, and *tomorrow* is used only once) or ‘adverbials of certainty’ (e.g. *never, really, always*) (Gales, 2010: 127). In threat letters, it is also very common to find names of days and months (e.g. *Friday, Wednesday, September*), which serve as reference points or deadlines.

Numbers, another visible category in threat letters, are usually used to refer to phone numbers, years, hours and currencies. When used to indicate time, numbers are usually followed either by ‘A.M.’ or ‘P.M.’, and when used as ordinals, they are usually followed by ‘-st, -nd, -rd, -th’.² In the corpus, numbers referring to the amount of money to be delivered are preceded by abbreviations for currencies (e.g. \$, £), or separated by ‘/’ (e.g. 21/XII/75), when referring to dates and years. They are usually positioned at the top or bottom of the page, and are sometimes used together with the signature of the threatener.

All the categories mentioned above vary in various letters and can be further analysed for contrastive features in authorship attribution bearing in mind that word frequency is different for letters written in different languages.

LOCUTIONARY POINTS IN THREAT LETTERS

Apart from prominent and contrastive features of threat letters, it is important to analyse the stance of the threatener. In further text, I present some of the most prominent contrastive features found in the corpus.

² For all these categories, spelling varies and can be further observed when analysing contrastive features of individual letters.

The lexico-grammatical choices in letters containing threat are usually expressed by *Present Continuous Tense* or *Present Perfect Tense* (e.g. *are holding hostage, has been kidnapped*), obligation modal verbs reinforcing the necessity to fulfil the condition(s) (e.g. *must, will*), and other lexical choices asserting urgency (*starting two hours from now, any delay will endanger the life of our hostages*). Most threat letters contain Type I conditional sentences, following an *if+you+do/do not+do+X [,] we+ will/will not+do+X* pattern, e.g.:

If you go to the Police or refuse to pay we will release 2000 prints of the photos which are captioned with your full name and address.³

Another prominent contrastive feature in some single-text studies is the possibility to recognize an absence of personal pronouns. For instance, the ransom demand written by Michael Sams (see: Appendix) is not signed and does not contain personal pronouns for first person singular or plural (*I/we*). The most frequent personal pronoun in this letter is the third-person personal pronoun, *he* (2.19%), followed by the second-person personal pronoun, *you* (1.09%). The third-person personal pronoun *he* is the most frequent pronoun in the letter as the kidnapped person is a male. However, if one takes into consideration the fact that Sams referred to himself in the third person in the handwritten claim presented to the court,⁴ it is without doubt that word frequency is not always a viable marker for analysis.⁵

As for *modal verbs*, the most frequent modal verb in the corpus is *will* (3.65%). *Must* is usually followed by a passive infinitive of the main verb where the *by*-phrase is omitted. What is interesting to observe in Sams' letter is the prepositional phrase '*with a little luck*' in: '*With a little luck he should be still O.K. and unharmed*'. This condition may be understood by the receiver in two ways, the first being that the victim may not have such luck (whereas threat is more openly expressed by: 'YOU HAVE BEEN WARNED. HIS LIFE IS IN YOUR HANDS'). However, in the light of Gales' analyses, the threat in '*with a little luck he should still be O.K. and unharmed*' may not be even present. Gales discusses markers that allow the threatener, though usually anonymous, to save face:

³ Public domain. 'The Extortion Letter'. In: *The Daily Telegraph*. Retrieved from: <<http://www.dailytelegraph.com.au/the-extortion-letter/story-e6freuy91226192119890>>. Date of access: 06.09.2013.

⁴ 'Murderer Michael Sams tells judge he is 'low risk''. BBC News. March 2012. Retrieved from: <<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-nottinghamshire-17225915>>. Date of access: 17.10.2013.

⁵ See Olsson (2004: 155-159).

I uncover an unexpected set of interpersonal functions associated with these markers – functions that mitigate or *weaken* the threatener’s stance. Pragmatically, these markers allow the threatener to save face and adhere to societal norms of politeness, despite the fact that, in a majority of cases, the threatener is anonymous. This finding is contradictory to the surveyed impressions about threatening language as a whole, which focus, rather, on forms that function to *strengthen* the threatener’s stance, thus violating social norms. (Gales, 2010: 300)

The choice of capital letters and the position of the two sentences at the end of the letter reveal that linguistic patterns may vary within single texts. This further complicates the analysis of stance, which is directly related to cultural patterns as well.

ILLOCUTIONARY AND PERLOCUTIONARY POINTS IN THREAT LETTERS

Interpretation of threat letters depends on the receiver’s understanding of the sincerity of the message, i.e. whether the threatener had the intention to threaten and whether the felicity conditions have been met or violated. According to Jones (2012: 106), unlike in promises, apologies, or warnings, in threat letters:

1. What is threatened is harmful rather than beneficial to the addressee;
2. The action requested is for the benefit of the speaker rather than the addressee;
3. The speaker takes his or her own perspective, not the hearer’s, and he or she controls the outcome rather than the hearer.

The felicity conditions, or conditions under which interpretation differs, play a relevant role in online threats as well, as the contribution of emoticons to the linguistic patterns used may be as important as that of functional or content words. What is more, there were several court cases on whether a smiley emoticon reduces threat in the following messages: ‘*I’m going to kill you LOL*’ or ‘*You’re so dead ☺*’.⁶ For this reason, no threat letter should be analysed outside of the sociolinguistic, deictic or cultural context(s).

⁶ See ‘Girls Invoke Emoticon Defense in Cyberbullying Case’. 31 Oct. 2012. Retrieved from: <<http://www.inquisitr.com/226632/girls-invoke-emoticon-defense-in-cyberbullying-case/>>. Date of access: 05.09.2013.

Another illustration is that of mock threat letters written by anonymous authors in various 'humorous' contexts. In these letters, the intention of the author is not to threaten, but embarrass the perpetrator.

When contrasted against ransom demands or extortion notes, 'the threatener' is the party to which some harm has been done, e.g.:

Don't be surprised if you get sick. I'm sure the visit to the doctor will cost more than you would have paid if you bought your lunch as opposed to stealing someone else's.⁷

Another example of what may be referred to as mock threat/extortion letters are those written by children, e.g.:

Nobody over the age of eight! If you disobey, you'll be SORRY!
AND I mean it ~~Ne-it~~

Dear Tootfairy, I want two dollars for my tooth because It's my first fang. Annisa. P.S. If you don't give me what I want I will find another toothfairy⁸

The first example given above is not devoid of threat unless observed in the context, i.e. that this note was placed by a child onto his/her room door. The threat in the second example also contains a *cause-effect/if*-clause (without punctuation), but is addressed to a recipient understood by adults to be fictional.

These illustrations once more demonstrate that the recipient of a threat letter decides how to participate in the perlocutionary domain of the message, i.e. in fulfilling the felicity conditions. Prominent features of letters similar to the ones presented above are found in various degrees of creativity their authors resort to. Their contrastive features are more numerous and are beyond the scope of this paper.

CONCLUSION

When referring to different types of forensic texts, the focus of analysis is usually on authorship attribution. At the same time, in threat letters, apart from wishing to know who wrote the actual letter, the threatened party, initially a

⁷ Public domain. 'Funny Threat Messages'. Retrieved from: <<http://crazylifemeetsdee.blogspot.com/2012/01/funny-threat-messages.html>>. Date of access: 18.10.2013.

⁸ '13 Threatening Letters from Kids'. Retrieved from: <<http://www.jest.com/article/175087/13-threatening-letters-from-kids>>. Date of access: 10.09. 2013.

passive recipient of the message, may wish to know whether the threatener had the intention to act as promised. The threatened party, subconsciously or not, upon receiving a threat letter becomes an active participant in the communicative event as he/she/they decides on his/her/their role in fulfilling the felicity conditions. Bearing in mind that prominent features of threat letters are the benchmark of analysis, one can further explore individual differences among various types of threat letters (ransom notes, hate mail, business letters containing threat etc.). However, for all the reasons given above, contrastive features of individual threat letters are more complex and more difficult to extract as there exist both inter and intravariations of linguistic patterns found in threat letters written by even a single author.

Apart from terrorist threat letters, another subcategory of threat letters that needs more attention is threat mail exchanged between online buyers and/or sellers as there have recently been many complaints by numerous online buyers and/or sellers about this issue, particularly when it comes to threats to misuse personal customer information. In the future, the analysis of both prominent and contrastive features of threat letters, signed or not, will be even more challenging due to various channels of communication and complex cultural, linguistic and other identities of all those participating in all communicative events in both the virtual and non-virtual interaction.

APPENDIX

Michael Sams' ransom demand⁹

Your employee has been kidnapped and will be released for a ransome of £175,000. With a little luck he should be still O.K. and unharmed, to prove this fact to you [, you]¹⁰ will in in the next day or so receive a recorded message from him. He will be released on Friday 31 January 1992, provided:

On Wednesday 29 January a ransome of £175,000 is paid, and no extension to this date will be granted.

The police are not informed in any way until he has been released. On Wednesday 29th at 4pm (on line 021 358 2281) you will receive a short recorded message from the hostage. To prove he is still alive and O.K. he will repeat the first news item that was on the 10am,

⁹ Public domain. See Olsson (2004: 249).

¹⁰ This pronoun ([,you]) is not present in the original text and has been added (together with the comma) for easier understanding of the sentence and the analysis provided.

Radio 2 news. He will then give further instructions. A second and more detailed message will be given at 5.05 pm the same day. Your watch must be synchronized with the 5pm pips on Radio 2. The location of the second call will be given at 4pm, so transport with a radio must be available.

The money must be carried in a holdall and made up as follows, precisely;

£75,000 in used £50. £75,000 in used £20. £25,000 in used £10 packed in 31 bundles, 250 notes in each.

Kevin Watts (if not the hostage) must be the person to receive all messages and carry the money to the appointed place.

However, please note that all messages will be pre-recorded, so no communication or negotiations can be made.

YOU HAVE BEEN WARNED. HIS LIFE IS IN YOUR HANDS.

REFERENCES

1. Brown, G. & G. Yule. *Discourse Analysis*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1983.
2. Funny Threat Messages. Retrieved from: <<http://crazylifemeetsdee.blogspot.com/2012/01/funny-threat-messages.html>>. Date of access: 18.10.2013.
3. Gales, T. *Ideologies of Violence: A Corpus and Discourse Analytic Approach to Stance in Threatening Communications*, 2010. Retrieved from: <<http://linguistics.ucdavis.edu/pics-and-pdfs/Gales%20Dissertation.pdf>>. Date of access: 20.10.2013.
4. Grice, P. H. Logic and Conversation. In *Syntax and Semantics*, Vol. 3, *Speech Acts*, Peter Cole and Jerry L. Morgan (Eds.). New York: Academic Press, 1975, 41–58. Retrieved from: <<http://www.sfu.ca/~jeffpell/Cogs300/GriceLogicConvers75.pdf>>. Date of access: 19.10.2013.
5. Girls Invoke Emoticon Defense In Cyberbullying Case. 31 Oct. 2012. Retrieved from: <<http://www.inquisitr.com/226632/girls-invoke-emoticon-defense-in-cyberbullying-case/>>. Date of access: 05.09.2013.
6. Jones, R. H. *Discourse Analysis. A Resource Book for Students*. London: Routledge, 2012.

7. Murderer Michael Sams tells judge he is 'low risk'. BBC News. March 2012. Retrieved from: <<http://www.bbc.co.uk/news/uk-england-nottinghamshire-17225915>>. Date of access: 17.10.2013.
8. Olsson, J. *Forensic Linguistics – An Introduction to Language, Crime and the Law*. London: Continuum, 2004.
9. The Extortion Letter. In: *The Daily Telegraph*. Retrieved from: <<http://www.dailytelegraph.com.au/the-extortion-letter/story-e6freuy9-1226192119890>>. Date of access: 06.09.2013.
10. 13 Threatening Letters from Kids. Retrieved from: <<http://www.jest.com/article/175087/13-threatening-letters-from-kids>>. Date of access: 10.09.2013.

JEZIK PRIJETNJE U PRIJETEĆIM PISMIMA

Sažetak

U ovom radu se razmatraju zajedničke i pojedinačne razlike u prijetećim pismima koje se odnose na izbor punoznačnih i nepunoznačnih leksema i znakova kojim se izražava prijetnja. Međutim, autorica se više bavi pitanjima koja se odnose na primaoca prijeteće poruke, bez obzira na to da li je njen autor poznat ili ne, a u odnosu na lokucijske, ilokucijske i perlokucijske aspekte sadržaja prijeteće poruke.

Ključne riječi: prijeteća pisma, uslovi prikladnosti, značajne odlike, kontrastivne odlike

Maja Kujundžić

THE USE OF NON-FINITE PASSIVES IN THE BRITISH DAILY PRESS: SOCIOLINGUISTIC AND PRAGMATIC APPROACH

Abstract: This paper is inspired by the theory of “audience design” (Bell 1977) and therefore it is based on the hypothesis that the use of the passive, which tends to be “more frequent in formal than in informal styles” (Trudgill 2002: 162), will be conditioned by the socio-economic status of the readers of the British daily newspapers that are analysed in this paper. This hypothesis was largely confirmed in some of the author’s previous researches. However, all of those researches had in their focus finite passives which were classified in a very detailed way and on the basis of various criteria such as: the possibility of transformation into their active counterparts, the complexity of their verb phrases, auxiliary verb that appears with the past participle, etc., while non-finite passives, on the other hand, were observed in a rather generalized manner. Naimly, their analysis did not include such varied and detailed classification which could be taken as a fully valid confirmation of the obtained results. With regard to this, the main aim of this paper will be to perform a more detailed analysis of the use of non-finite passives in the language of the British daily press through classifying them more thoroughly and on the basis of various criteria and to try, in this way, to show and confirm the results of the previous researches according to which the pattern of the use of non-finite passive is very similar to that of finite passives.

Key words: non-finite passives, frequency of use, daily newspapers, socio-economic profile, pragmatic use

Like the author’s previous articles that dealt with the frequency of passive use in the language of the British press (Kujundžić 2011; Kujundžić 2012) this article is also inspired by Allen Bell’s theory of “audience design”. According to Bell’s theory, language use is not influenced by the socio-economic profile of the speaker, but by the socioeconomic status of the audience i.e. of those

who are at the receiving end of the linguistic message. In relation to this theory, this article is based on the hypothesis that the use of the passive construction will also be closely related to the socio-economic status of the readers of the analysed British daily newspapers. Therefore, the British daily newspapers were, for this purpose, classified on the basis of the socio-economic status of their readers into the up-market newspapers (*The Guardian*), the mid-market (*Daily Mail*) and the down-market newspapers (*The Sun*). Namely, influenced by Trudgil's claim according to which the passive is "more frequent in formal than in informal styles" (Trudgil 2002: 162), it is hypothesised that it will be used more frequently in those newspapers whose readers belong to the higher socio-economic class since they are at the same time the most educated members of the society. Given their education, they have been, to a great extent, exposed to standard and formal varieties of the language, which has, in turn, largely influenced their own linguistic preferences and use. In accordance with this, it has been presumed that such readers will reach out for those newspapers which are characterized by the use of more standard and formal language. This was confirmed by the articles mentioned above which showed that the passive construction was most frequently used in the up-market newspaper (*The Guardian*), less frequently in the mid-market newspaper (*Daily Mail*), and least frequently in the down-market newspaper (*The Sun*).

However, it is important to mention that the articles mentioned above had in the focus of their attention finite passives, which were analysed and classified in a detailed way and on the basis of various criteria such as: the ability to be transformed into their active counterparts, the complexity of their verbal phrase, the auxiliary verb that is combined with the past participle, etc. As opposed to finite passives, non-finite passives were observed in a rather general way, without being further classified and scrutinized which could have been used to confirm and validate such general observations and results. In relation to this, the aim of this article is to analyse the use of non-finite passives in the British daily press in the same way as it was done with regard to finite passives in order to confirm rather general results which were obtained earlier and to try and prove that the pattern of their use is similar to that of finite passives.

Before the working definition of non-finite passives and the criteria on the basis of which they will be classified are presented, it would be important to mention that this article has been to a great extent inspired by the fact that non-finite passives have been generally neglected in grammar sections that deal with the passive construction and therefore the need to devote to them the equal amount of attention as to finite passives. Namely, it has been noticed that majority of contemporary grammarians focus on finite passives while, as to non-finite passives, they content themselves with merely recognizing their existence and mostly in the grammar sections that are not devoted to the

passive itself but to the non-finite forms of verbs, such as infinitives and gerunds. This is not surprising if we are aware of the fact that non-finite passives were almost completely neglected by the most prominent traditional grammarians whose books served as the bases for the vast majority of modern grammars. For example, Jespersen (1949) is primarily concerned with finite passives in the sections on the passives while non-finite passives are given more space in the sections devoted to the non-finite forms of the verbs themselves such as in the sections on the infinitive and the gerund.

Kruisinga mentions non-finite passives in a section entitled “non-predicative passive”, in the chapter dealing with the passive. He recognizes the existence of the passive with *being* and *be* as auxiliaries, but he also points out that “it has seemed convenient to treat the group with *being* in the chapter of the verbal *-ing*” (Kruisinga 1931: 324).

Zandvoort merely recognizes the existence of non-finite passives in his chapter on the passive, briefly discussing them elsewhere in his handbook, in the role of adjuncts to nouns, pronouns, etc. “The non-finite forms of the passive (*to be seen, being seen*, etc.) have been illustrated in the preceding chapters. It has not yet been pointed out that the passive infinitive varies with the active infinitive and an adjunct to nouns and pronouns, where Dutch always uses the active infinitive.” (Zandvoort 1948: 66)

Similarly, Poutsma touches on non-finite passives in the section on the formation of the passive: “Also the infinitive, gerund and present participle of a verb can, in like manner, be made to express a passive meaning by connection its past participle with respectively the infinitive, the gerund or the present participle of the verb to be; e.g.: to be killed, being killed.” (Poutsma 1926: 93). The fact that the paragraph containing this statement is printed in a smaller font shows that Poutsma does not regard non-finite passives as particularly relevant for the topic in question. In his *English Grammar* (1964) Curme discusses the passive in the section devoted to the inflection of verbs. Here, in his account of voice he deals only with finite forms of the passive. Like Jespersen he mentions non-finite passives in connection with the infinitive and gerund. We thus see that traditional grammarians take little or no interest in non-finite passives and, as it has been already mentioned, this could be taken as the reason such constructions are also excluded from more recent treatments of the passive.

In this article the non-finite passive will be seen as a construction whose verbal element consists of a non-finite form of the auxiliary verb *to be* or *to get* (*-ing* and *to* infinitive forms) and a past participle of the main verb. The passive constructions that consist of a past participle only will be accepted as examples of the non-finite passive, too. Examples (1), (2) and (3) illustrate the examples on the non-finite passives that are mentioned above:

- (1) Peck dislikes his business *being described* as up-market pawn broking saying that is an oversimplification. (*The Guardian*, p. 3)
- (2) He did manage *to get booked*, unfairly, it *has to be said*, when Cordoba was the more reckless. (*Daily Mail*, p. 78)
- (3) Bruno, now 47, late had to battle his own mental health problems, *fuelled by* cocaine abuse. (*The Sun*, p. 7)

Such formally defined examples of the non-finite passive are further classified on the basis of their function. Given that they always occur in subordinate clauses, they are classified according to the function of the subordinate clause they are part of. Accordingly, they are divided into nominal, adverbial and adjectival non-finite passives, as in (4), (5), (6) respectively.

- (4) Many analysts had expected Thomson Reuters *to be battered by the global recession*, as banks cut their subscriptions to its real-time data services. (*The Times*, p. 47)
- (5) Since *being gifted* a set of keys to Charles Dance's North London home last October, model-turned-sculptress Eleanor Boorman, 36, has taken to calling herself the actor's significant other. (*Daily Mail*, p. 37)
- (6) Scientists took seven years to create the Orbiting Carbon Observatory, a satellite *built* for NASA to study greenhouse gas pollutants. (*The Sun*, p. 23)

According to whether or not they contain an expressed *by-agent* phrase non-finite passives are further divided into long and short non-finite passives, as in (7) and (8) respectively.

- (7) In a move away from the approach *adopted* by a previous minister, Ruth Kelly, who sought to bypass extremist groups, Blair will declare that the government will engage with all organisations to bar those that advocate violence. (*The Guardian*, p. 16)
- (8) The men and women, who all had defibrillators *implanted* in their chests to monitor their heartbeat and shock it back into rhythm when necessary, *were than tracked* for three years. (*Daily Mail*, p. 22)

Long non-finite passives are then classified, according to the type of the agent, into non-finite passives with animate and non-finite passives with inanimate agents as in the examples (9) and (10) respectively.

- (9) The Independent Police Complaints Commission probed 36 complaints *made by Terry*. (*The Sun*, p. 21)
- (10) I do not want the Met *distracted* by a debate about institutional racism – the label no longer drives or motivates change as perhaps it once so clearly and dramatically did. (*The Times*, p. 7)

Finally, non-finite passives are classified according to whether their verb phrase contains the auxiliary *be* or *get* auxiliaries, as in (11) and (12).

- (11) The Home Office says the database will generate “travel” histories for all passengers and have a particular emphasis on biometrics, including fingerprints, DNA, iris patterns and face recognition, which have already started *to be contained* in passports. (*The Guardian*, p. 15)
- (12) He did manage *to get booked*, unfairly, it *has to be said*, when Cordoba was the more reckless. (*Daily Mail*, p. 78)

The forms with no corresponding verb will not be excluded from the investigation, as in (15) and (16), while examples with *given* or *given that* used as prepositions and conjunctions respectively, will be excluded from the investigation, as in (17):

- (13) A new record for the Champions League of 20 consecutive games *undefeated* will have scant relevance for them. (*The Guardian, Sport*, p. 1)
- (14) They had entered the tie on a run of 13 matches *unbeaten*, yet with dark mutterings from the stands and Wanger complaining about the negative approach of teams arriving at the Emirates. (*The Guardian, Sport*, p. 5)
- (15) Adult stem cells exist in a wide range of tissues, but *given* particular chemical signals they *can be transformed* into anything from a heart cell to a nerve cell. (*Daily Mail*, p. 23)

The tables that follow will show the frequency of use of different types of non-finite passives in one up-market newspaper (*The Guardian*), one mid-market (*Daily Mail*) and one down-market newspapers (*The Sun*). This classification of newspapers is taken from Jucker’s (1992) research on the complexity of the noun phrase in the language of newspapers. Jucker, on the other hand, took it from Henry (1983), who was the first one to classify newspapers into up-market, mid-market, and up-market newspapers on the basis of the socio-economic profile of their readers. All three newspapers were published on the

same day, February 29, 2009. The chosen newspapers are assigned to the above mentioned newspaper categories on the basis of the results of the surveys that are periodically published by *Joint Industry Committee for National Readership Surveys – JINCARS*.

In order for the results to be comparable, the same number of words (33,066) from each newspaper was investigated, the corpus thus totalling 99,198 words.

Table 1: Non-finite passives – function

Non-finite passives										
	Nominal			Adverbial			Adjectival			Sum
	Freq.	1 000	%	Freq.	1 000	%	Freq.	1 000	%	Freq.
<i>The Guardian</i>	12	0.5	36.4	32	1.2	42.1	92	3.5	43.8	137
<i>Daily Mail</i>	11	0.4	33.3	23	0.9	30.3	68	2.6	32.4	101
<i>The Sun</i>	10	0.4	30.3	21	0.8	27.6	50	1.9	23.8	82
Total	33	0.4	100	76	0.9	100	210	2.6	100	320

Table 1 shows that nominal non-finite passives are most frequent in *The Guardian* with 12 occurrences (36.4%), *Daily Mail* follows with 11 occurrences (33.3%), while *The Sun* occupies the last position with 10 occurrences (30.3%). Adverbial passives are, again, most frequent in *The Guardian* with 32 occurrences (42.1%), *Daily Mail* follows with 23 occurrences (30.3%), and *The Sun* with 21 occurrences (27.6%) again occupies the last position with the least frequent passive use. The adjectival non-finite passives follow the same pattern of frequency as nominal and adjectival non-finites, they are most frequent in *The Guardian* with 92 occurrences, (43.8%), *Daily Mail* again occupies the mid position with 68 occurrences (32.4%), while *The Sun* has got the lowest frequency of use with 50 (23.8%).

As appears from Table 1, adjectival non-finite passives have got the highest frequency of use, i.e. they make two-thirds in the total number of non-finites, whereas only one-third belong to nominal and adverbial non-finites together. The high frequency of adjectival non-finite passives could be partly explained by Jucker's (1992) findings concerning syntactic variation within the noun phrase across different styles of newspaper English. Jucker (1992: 104) states that postmodifiers are more explicit than premodifiers. Therefore it is not surprising that adjectival non-finite passives as noun postmodifiers are

frequently used in all the three investigated newspapers since newspapers in general aim at using explicit language.

The fact that noun postmodifications in the form of non-finite adjectival passives are most frequent in *The Guardian*, less frequent in *Daily Mail*, and, finally, least frequent in *The Sun* is probably an indication that, of the three analysed newspapers, the language of *The Guardian* is most explicit and specific, the language of *Daily Mail* is less so, while the language of *The Sun* possesses such qualities in the least measure.

Table 2: Non-finite passives – agent expression

Non-finite passives							
	Long passives			Short passives			Sum
	Freq.	1 000	%	Freq.	1 000	%	Freq.
<i>The Guardian</i>	30	1.2	27.3	107	3.5	51	137
<i>Daily Mail</i>	36	1.4	32.7	65	2.5	31	101
<i>The Sun</i>	44	1.7	40	38	2.1	18.1	82
Total	110	1.4	100	210	2.7	100	320

The results in Table 2 agree with the results of the research by Biber et al. (1999), which shows that short passives are generally less frequent than long passives in all the registers. Also, according to Jim Miller (2001) 95% of the passive clauses in the English language appear without an expressed agent. Our results also agree with the results by Quirk et al. according to which “approximately four out of five English passive sentences have no expressed agent” (1985: 165). Namely, Table 2 shows that, in the total number of non-finite passives, short non-finite passive are twice as frequent as long non-finite passives. Out of the total number of non-non-finite passives (320 occurrences), two-thirds belong to short non-finites (210 occurrences, 65.6%), while only one third belongs to long non-finite passives (108, 34.4%).

Long non-finite passives are most frequent in *The Sun*, with 44 occurrences (40%), *Daily Mail* occupies the middle position while 36 occurrences (32.7%), and in *The Guardian* they’re least frequent with 30 (27.3%). The number of the occurrences of short non-finite passives in *The Guardian* is 107 (51%); *Daily Mail* follows with 65 occurrences (31%), while *The Sun* again occupies the last position with 38 occurrences of short non-finite passives (18.1%). As it is obvious, the frequency of long non-finite passives follows a different tendency than that of short non-finite passives.

The highest frequency of short non-finite passives in *The Guardian* can be explained by the fact that, since it represents the category of up-market newspapers, its authors will more often employ the topics of the biggest importance than it would be the case in *Daily Mail* which is of a slightly more entertaining character and therefore its authors will deal with such topics to a, somewhat, lower degree. Consequently, the authors in *The Sun*, which is largely of tabloid character, will mostly avoid serious socio-political topics. Therefore it is not surprising, that in the focus of *The Guardian's* news, we mostly come across the most powerful and influential persons from the most important walks of life, who are, consequently, responsible for the acts and decisions of the biggest socio-political importance. Such acts and decisions are not always approved by the general public, therefore the author of texts in such newspapers will try not to mention their identity. In this way, according to 'politeness theory' (Brown and Levinson, 1987) the author avoids assigning responsibility for the acts and decisions that are not generally approved of and protects the "face" of the person in question.

As it was mentioned, *Daily Mail*, in comparison with *The Guardian*, deals with the topics of the biggest socio-political importance to a somewhat lesser degree, therefore very important and influential persons appear less frequently in the focus of its news. In relation to this, authors in *Daily Mail* will not try as much as the ones in *The Guardian* to protect their reputation and identity by avoiding their mentioning in relation to certain sensitive issues, which could explain the lower frequency of short non-finite passives in this newspaper. Given that majority of the articles in *The Sun* deal with the topics of the entertaining and sensational character, it is not surprising that in the focus of their articles we come across the popular persons, mostly from the world of show business and sports. Unlike the authors of the articles in *The Guardian* and, to a lesser degree, unlike those from *Daily Mail*, the authors in *The Sun* will not try as much to protect their identity, since it is exactly their mentioning, even if it is in a negative context, that gives them the attention and rises their popularity by attracting the readers' attention through scandalous contents. Therefore, it is logical that the number of short non-finite passives is least frequent in *The Sun*.

Having in mind all that has been mentioned regarding the frequency of short non-finite passives, it is not surprising that long non-finite passives are most frequent in *The Sun*, less frequent in *Daily Mail* and least frequent in *The Guardian*. As it was concluded, the more important the person is the more protected is his/her identity, therefore long non-finite passives are least frequently used in *The Guardian*, more frequently in *Daily Mail*, and most frequently in *The Sun*.

Table 3: Non-finite passives – type of agents

Non-finite passives							
	Animate agent			Inanimate agent			Sum
	Freq.	1 000	%	Freq.	1 000	%	Freq.
<i>The Guardian</i>	9	0.4	14.1	21	1.3	45.7	30
<i>Daily Mail</i>	20	0.5	31.4	16	0.8	34.8	36
<i>The Sun</i>	35	0.6	54.5	9	0.3	19.7	44
Total	64	0.5	100	46	0.8	100	110

Table 3 shows that, in the total number of non-finite passives, those with inanimate agents are considerably more frequent than those with animate agents.

Non-finite passives with animate agents are most frequent in *The Sun* with 35 occurrences (54.5%), *Daily Mail* follows with 20 occurrences (31.4%), while *The Guardian* occupies the last position with only 9 occurrences (14.1%). On the other hand, non-finite passives with inanimate agents are most frequent *The Guardian* with 21 occurrences (47.7%), *Daily Mail* again occupies the middle position with 16 occurrences (34.8%), and *The Sun* occupies the last position with 9 occurrences (19.7%)

Such frequency of animate and inanimate agents can be explained by the fact that, unlike animate agents, inanimate agents do not possess complex psychophysical characteristics, therefore they will not be, on that level, very much affected by the negative consequences that their mentioning could imply. In relation to this, their mentioning will not be as much avoided as in the case of animate agents, whose mentioning, especially in a negative context, can inflict great harm and suffering. It would be interesting to notice that, in the case of long non-finite passives, no animate agents were found, which could serve as a further proof of the sensitivity of their mentioning.

The results in this table are very much related to the results in the previous table, since animate agents are, for the reasons mentioned above, more sensitive to their mentioning than inanimate agents and their frequency is proportionate to the degree of their importance in the most important and influential walks of life. Having in mind the explanations given for the Table 2, it is not surprising that non-finite passives with animate agents are least frequent in *The Guardian*, more frequent in *Daily Mail* and least frequent in *The Sun*. In other words, in relation to the degree of importance of persons that

are in the focus of their news, the authors of articles in the analysed newspapers will try, to higher or lesser degree, to protect their “face”.

Being not as sensitive to their mentioning as animate agents, non-finite passives with inanimate agents follow the same pattern of frequency as majority of other passive types. Therefore, their frequency is proportionate to the degree of the linguistic formality of the analysed newspapers i.e. they are most frequent in *The Guardian*, less frequent in *Daily Mail* and least frequent in *The Sun*.

Table 4: Non-finite passives – type of auxiliary

Non-finite passives							
	<i>Be</i>			<i>Get</i>			Sum
	Freq.	1 000	%	Freq.	1 000	%	Freq.
<i>The Guardian</i>	137	1.4	42.9	0	0	0	137
<i>Daily Mail</i>	100	0.8	31.3	1	0	100	101
<i>The Sun</i>	82	0.9	25.7	0	0	0	82
Total	319	1.1	100	1	0	100	320

Table 4 shows that, in the total number of non-finite passives (320 occurrences), only one example of non-finite *get*-passive was found.

- (16) He did manage *to get booked*, unfairly, it has to be said, when Cordoba was the more reckless. (*Daily Mail*, p. 78)

Be-passives are most frequent in *The Guardian* with 137 occurrences (42.9%), *Daily Mail* follows with 100 occurrences (31.3%), while *The Sun* again occupies the last position with 82 occurrences of *be*-passives (25.7%).

Such small, almost non-existent appearance of non-finite *get*-passives, could be explained by the fact that *get*-passives are generally seen as a feature of spoken, colloquial style and therefore rarely appear in formal style, which is, to a higher or lesser degree, characteristic for the newspaper language. The results of our research agree with the results of the research done by Biber et al. on the basis of which they conclude that *get*-passives are very rare and confined to spoken language. Miller also points out to the fact that *get*-passives are frequently used in conversational style and that this type of passive is dominant in the spontaneous spoken language. Miler supports this claim by the results of his corpus based research in which one sample of conversation recorded in

Edinburgh has got eight occurrences of *be*-passives and 11 occurrences of *be*-passive, while the other recorded sample has got as many as 57 occurrences of *get*-passive and only three occurrence of *be*-passive.

Stein also investigates the use of *get*-passives and after the analysis of the similar researches done by other linguists and own analysis she concludes “*get* is colloquial” (Stein 1979: 48).

Huddleston and Pullum also claim “*get*-passives tend to be avoided in formal style” (2002: 1442). Similarly, Quirk et al. claim that “*get*-passive is avoided in formal style, and even in informal English it is far less frequent than *be*-passive” (1981: 161).

Having on mind all that has been said above regarding the use of *get*-passives, it is more than clear why they appear in our corpus in a very small number. Namely, the language of newspapers is directed at the general public and therefore it tends to use more standard and formal language variety, although, as we could see it from the analysis of the data in the tables above, the degree of its formality is closely interrelated with the socio-economic category to which majority of it’s readers belong to.

In view of the above it could be concluded that the frequency of use of non-finite passives in the language of the British daily newspapers follow the same pattern of use as that of finite passives, as it has been shown in the author’s previous articles. Namely, non-finite passives are most frequently used in *The Guardian*, the up-market newspaper whose majority of readers belong to the highest socio-economic classes. They are less frequently used in mid-market newspaper *Daily Mail* whose majority of readers belong to somewhat lower socioeconomic classes, while their use is least frequent in down-market newspaper *The Sun*, whose readers belong mostly to the lowest socioeconomic classes. Therefore, the frequency of use of non-finite passives in the language of the British daily press confirms the main hypothesis of this and the previous articles that investigated the use of the passive in the language of newspapers. Namely, it shows that the use of the passive is nor random but systematic and closely related with the socio-economic status of the majority of the readers i.e. with their importance in the political life of the country, their economic power and the level of their education.

The frequency of the use of long and short non-finite passives also turned out to be following the same pattern of the use as that of long and short finite passives. In relation to this, the results of this article confirm the hypothesis according to which the use of the passive with or without the expressed agent will be dictated and highly influenced by the pragmatic factors such as the need of the author to leave out the identity of the agent and, in that way, to protect

his identity and save his face. Therefore, in relation to the importance of the subject matter and the person who is its main actor, long non-finite passives showed to be most frequent in *The Guardian*, less frequent in *Daily Mail* and least frequent in *The Sun*.

On the basis of the findings mentioned above, it would be legitimate to conclude that they confirmed both the sociolinguistic and the pragmatic hypothesis concerning the use of non-finite passives in the British daily press and that, at the same time, they showed that the frequency of the use of non-finite passives follows the same pattern as that of finite passives.

LITERATURE

1. Biber et al., *Longman Grammar of Spoken and Written English*. London: Longman, 1999.
2. Bell, A. Language style as audience design. In *Language in Society, Vol. 13* (pp. 145-204). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1984.
3. Brown, P. and S. Levinson. *Politeness: Some Universals in Language Usage*, Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987.
4. Huddleston R. and G.K. Pullum. *The Cambridge Grammar of the English Language*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
5. Curme, O.G. *English Grammar*. New York: Barnes and Noble, INC., 1964.
6. Henry, H. (Ed.) *Readership Research: Montreal 1983 Proceedings of the Second International Symposium*, Amsterdam: Elsevier Science Publishers, 1983.
7. Jespersen, O. *A Modern English Grammar on Historical Principles. Parts 1-7*. Copenhagen: Munksgaard, 1909-1949.
8. Jucker, A. *Social Stylistics. Syntactic Variation in British Newspapers*. Berlin/New York: Mouton de Gruyter, 1992.
9. Krusinga, E. *A Handbook of Present-Day English. Part 2, 5th ed.* Groningen: P.Noordhof, 1927-31.
10. Kujundžić, M. Pragmatička upotreba pasiva u jeziku britanske štampe. *Radovi Filozofskog fakulteta Pale* 13: 268-277, 2011.
11. Kujundžić, M. The Use of the Passive in the British Daily Press: A Sociolinguistic Approach. *Philologia* 10: 13-21, 2012.

12. Querk et al. *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language*. London: Longman, 1985.
13. Miller, J. *An Introduction to English Syntax*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2001.
14. Stein, G. *Studies in the Function of the Passive*. Tübingen: Gunter Naar Verlag, 1979.
15. Trudgill, P. *Sociolinguistics, Variation and Change*. Edinburgh: Edinburgh University Press, 2002.
16. Zandvoort, R.W. *A Handbook of English Grammar*. Groningen: J.B. Wolters' Uitgeverij N.V., 1948.

UPOTREBA NEFINITNIH PASIVA U JEZIKU BRITANSKE ŠTAMPE IZ UGLA SOCIOLINGVISTIKE I PRAGMATIKE

Rezime

Ovaj rad je inspirisan Belovom teorijom publikom uslovljene jezičke upotrebe (Bel, 1984) u skladu sa kojom je pretpostavljeno da će i frekventnost upotrebe pasiva kao odlike formalnog jezičkog stila biti uslovljena socijeekonomskim profilom čitalačke publike analiziranih primjeraka britanske dnevne štampe. Ovu hipotezu su u ogromnoj mjeri potvrdila naša prethodna istraživanja, međutim ono što je karakteristično za navedene radove je to da se u centru njihovog interesovanja nalaze finitni pasivi, koji su detaljno klasifikovani na osnovu različitih kriterija kao što su: mogućnost transformacije u odgovarajuće ekvivalente u aktivu, složenost glagolske fraze, pomoćni glagol koji se pojavljuje u kombinaciji sa participom prošlim. U odnosu na finitne pasive, nefinitni pasivi su posmatrani na prilično uopšten način. Naime, njihovo posmatranje je svedeno na posmatranje nefinitnih pasiva uopšte, bez dodatnog i detaljnijeg klasifikovanja koje bi potvrdilo istinost i vjerodostojnost dobijenih rezultata. U skladu sa ovim, cilj ovog rada je da izvrši detaljniju analizu frekventnosti upotrebe nefinitnih pasiva u dnevnoj britanskoj štampi, ta da ih, poput finitnih pasiva, klasifikuje na osnovu različitih i raznovrsnih kriterija,

kako bi na taj način opravdali i potvrdili rezultate prethodnih istraživanja i dokazali da je obrazac frekventnosti upotrebe nefinitnih pasiva isti kao kod finitnih pasiva.

Ključne riječi: nefinitni pasivi, frekventnost upotrebe, dnevna štampa, socioekonomski profil, pragmatička upotreba

Tatjana Marjanović

THEMATIC STRUCTURE, ONE STORY AND TWO VERY DIFFERENT LANGUAGES

Abstract: An exploratory study was carried out aiming to probe the possibility of applying an English-oriented theory of thematic structure to a free-word-order language such as Serbian. Based on a micro-corpus involving a short story in Serbian and its English translation, the research suggests that it is indeed possible to retain a reasonable degree of consistency between thematic structures in these languages. Much as the existing grammatical restrictions affect the level of thematic correspondence between the original text and its English counterpart, there are significant points of convergence which go beyond the realities of two very different grammatical systems. However, these claims remain tentative until supported by empirical evidence originating in less permissive research design than the one used in this exploratory study.

Keywords: theme, rheme, systemic-functional, word order, markedness

INTRODUCTION

The project I would like to report on has been on my mind for quite some time, but it has taken me a while to pluck up enough academic courage to face all the challenges that come along with it.

A huge fan of the functionalist approach (e.g. Halliday 1985; Halliday & Matthiessen 2004), I have grown accustomed to English-specific terminology and analytical tools and procedures residing in precisely the kind of theory and practice in which a linguistic reality is shaped by the English language (e.g. Marjanović 2009).

There would be no awful shame in this were I not interested in exploring an area that received a remarkably elegant and vastly appealing interpretation in the English strand of systemic-functional linguistics, and applying it to another language alongside English.

The theoretical background of the study is for the most part associated with an English-oriented account of thematic structure, and the language other than English that I wish to explore applying the said theory is Serbian.

Let us just briefly mention in these preliminaries that thematic structure is concerned with the textual function of language, i.e. how clauses are organized as messages in which whatever element comes first suggests what they are about, and how this distribution of content affects the text as a whole.

Serbian happens to be my first language, which explains my curiosity in how it would respond to a theory moulded to the needs of a distinctly different system: English is a language that does not revel in extravagant morphology, which has left it rather vulnerable to changes in word order. Unlike English, with its significant word-order constraints, Serbian is found at the other end of the spectrum in the company of other inflectional languages exercising plenty of flexibility in word order.

Ironically enough, thematic structure as a theoretical concept was first developed by scholars working in the tradition of free-word-order languages (e.g. notably the Prague school linguists, old and contemporary, such as Mathesius, Firbas, Daneš, Sgall), but was then given a new twist by the acclaimed English linguist M. A. K. Halliday, who succeeded in making the theory more manageable in practice and more readily applicable to systems with relatively stable linear arrangements (Baker 1992: 140).

This is not to say that there is no common ground at all in the treatment of thematic structure by Halliday's followers as opposed to the Prague linguists, but each have made different aspects of the theory their respective priorities: the former identify as thematic 'that element which comes in first position in a clause' (Halliday 1985: 38); the latter do not necessarily restrict theme to initial position but allocate thematic status to all contextually dependent elements (Firbas 1974: 18-24).

Before we engage in more technicalities surrounding thematic structure, this may be as good a time as any to bring the actual research back into the spotlight. The idea was to take a text in Serbian and analyze it in Hallidayan terms, consistent in both theory and apparatus, just as if it were an English text. The idea seemed daunting at first because I expected the differences to be so overwhelming that they would hinder my work on the corpus to the point of turning it into mission impossible. Additionally, since having a text in Serbian alone would prove little by way of trying to bridge the gap between these two dramatically different systems, an important link was felt to be missing. I could see no other way to proceed than find a parallel text, and that was how an English translation of the original text in Serbian came to the rescue.

Now is the time to break all these preliminaries down into appropriate sections and give each a more thorough account.

THEMATIC STRUCTURE: FINDING COMMON GROUND

Halliday (1985: 38) defines theme as ‘the point of departure of the message.’ The message is a clause in which a theme is followed by a rheme, the remainder of the message in which the theme is developed. Theme has been given special prominence¹ in that it provides a sense of orientation for the listener/reader by signalling what the clause is concerned with.

One of the practical implications of thematic structure as such is that a different distribution of the same set of lexical items in two clauses seems to indicate different communicative priorities on the part of the speaker, as the following examples suggest:

- (a) Mark is married to Martha.
- (b) Martha is married to Mark.

Assuming that there is no contrastive stress in either of these, (a) is simply a statement about Mark, just as (b) is a statement about Martha.

In the declarative English clause, theme is most often conflated with subject: being the most typical thematic element in this domain, it is regarded as the unmarked theme². Adjuncts, on the other hand, are the most common forms of marked theme: such a low degree of markedness is supported by their high mobility in the structure of English. Higher degrees of markedness are accordingly assigned to objects, complements and predicates, the last of which arguably represents the most marked thematic choice in English (Baker 1992: 135).

There are some elements that are inherently or characteristically thematic in English, such as conjunctions, which, if present, have to occur initially, or comment adjuncts, which are frequently placed in initial positions. Although such themes clearly have distinctive structural and communicative tasks to perform, their obligatory or characteristic initial position leaves room for at least one more thematic choice that will be both deliberate and meaningful. Furthermore, because these elements owe their thematic status to either structural requirements or frequency and because they do not qualify as

¹ The entire structure is dubbed thematic rather than rhematic.

² For more details on the classification of themes see Halliday and Matthiessen (2004: 71-87).

immediate constituents, they alone cannot make thematic structure complete. This makes it possible for any one theme to be composed of more than one element, thus forming a thematic complex or multiple theme. A multiple theme, as opposed to simple, contains an obligatory topical theme (realized by subject, adjunct, object, complement or predicate) and one or more textual and/or interpersonal themes.

Textual themes provide links between the ongoing clause and the surrounding text: most work in this category is performed by conjunctions (e.g. *and, but, or*, etc.) and conjunctive adjuncts (e.g. *likewise, anyway, in this respect, also, to sum up, on the other hand*, etc.). Occasionally, textual themes will take the form of interjections and discourse markers (e.g. *oh, well, no*, etc.), which fall within the subcategory of continuative themes.

Alongside finite auxiliaries in *yes/no* questions, which the speaker uses to interact with the listener when asking for information, and vocatives, which reinforce the immediacy of exchange between speaker and listener, the level of interpersonal theme brings out modal (or comment) adjuncts, expressing the speaker's attitude to the content of the message (e.g. *certainly, presumably, fortunately, in my opinion, really*, etc.).

To sum up, a theme is simple if it contains only the topical element, and if the topical element is preceded by one or more textual and/or interpersonal themes, the result is a multiple theme.

At discourse level, topical themes of individual clauses interact with each other and with rhematic elements of the message, forming chains of thematic progression (Daneš 1974: 114-122). Although restrictions of space do not permit us to address the issue at this point, it will suffice to say that thematic choices in individual clauses are often greatly influenced by the surrounding discourse.

The following sketchy account of Serbian will foreground those features that usually raise doubts about its capacity for undergoing a Hallidayan model of analysis.

In languages such as Serbian that often thematize verbs inflected for person, number and gender (e.g. *work-they, listen-she, see-you*, etc.), no overt subject is normally required as long as the identity of the referent is safely maintained across a given stretch of discourse. Generally speaking, independent subject pronouns are normally used for reasons of emphasis or disambiguation, and full noun phrases typically perform the task of introducing new referents, in which case it is also typical for them to occur in postverbal position.

Actually, the unmarked word order in Serbian conforms to a theme-rheme sequence (Halupka-Rešetar 2011: 124), indicating a strong preference for clause-final information focus (i.e. rheme) building on contextually dependent or recoverable information expressed earlier in the clause (i.e. theme). Although a rheme-theme pattern still remains a viable option in the Serbian language, and although the notions of theme and rheme therein do not necessarily coincide with those in English, there is still a certain amount of overlap that should not be disregarded in either theoretical or applied contexts (e.g. translation studies, teaching, etc.).

Baker's position that '[t]he impact of a series of *I*'s in theme position is not the same as the impact of a series of verbs inflected for first person' (1992: 127) may ultimately be a matter of whether one sees the glass as half-full or half-empty: this time it is about making the most of the similarities rather than holding on to the differences.

RESEARCH QUESTIONS AND METHODS

The micro-corpus used in this exploratory study involved a short story in Serbian written by the Nobel Prize winner Ivo Andrić along with its English translation by Svetozar Koljević.

The original, "Most na Žepi", was thought the most appropriate choice on three grounds: it was written by a world-renowned storyteller; it was a short story of reasonable length for an exploratory study (approximately a dozen pages); and it was a canonical literary text. The last of these was an especially important factor in that it precluded implications of a technical, scientific or dramatic text, each of which is felt to be very idiosyncratic in its expression (e.g. Swales 1990; Snell-Hornby 2007). In other words, not only was the story taken to be a valued piece of prose, but it was also considered representative of general language rather than its strictly generic manifestations.

"The bridge on the Žepa", its English translation, appeared in a selection of Andrić's nine short stories and a novella together entitled *The damned yard and other stories*. The book was edited by Celia Hawkesworth, Senior Lecturer in Serbo-Croat, School of Slavonic and East European Studies, University of London. The affiliation of the editor provides in itself enough reassurance that the project was handled knowingly and professionally.

It is also worth mentioning that all but one of the stories in the book were translated by native speakers of English, and precisely that one was selected as a parallel text in the study. The translation was the work of Academician

Svetozar Koljević, whose brilliance I still clearly remember as one of the students sitting in several English literature classes the professor taught back in those days.

My choice was, however, governed by more than mere nostalgia for bygone college days: I was genuinely intrigued, even encouraged, by some of the more recent challenges posed to the long-standing traditional axiom in translation studies that native speakers of a target language inevitably and without questioning produce better translations into that language than do native speakers of a source language (Pokorn 2005).

It is all these factors taken together – the high credibility of the editor, the native speakership of the majority of the translators, the academic excellence of the remaining one coupled with the newly-emerging belief that native speakers of a source language are capable of producing translations into a target language that cannot be readily identified as non-native – that led me to fully embrace the quality of the English text and treat it on a par with the original. Finally, while the translation of the Serbian text was a crucial instrument in the study, it was nevertheless but a means to an end.

One of the aims was to test whether Halliday's systemic-functional apparatus, which clearly takes English as its standard, could be purposefully utilized to address phenomena occurring in a free-word-order language like Serbian. An ancillary to this test brought forth the second hypothesis: if so, would it suggest, albeit tentatively, that the two languages are not entirely incomparable in their respective expressions of thematic structure?

As the study was designed to do no more than offer tentative preliminary insights into the possibility of thematic correspondence between two language samples, the quantification performed should by no means lead to any far-reaching conclusions suggestive of the overall thematic patterning in the two languages. Alongside the percentages obtained, an interpretative commentary was provided to describe both the similarities and differences in thematic organization of the texts analyzed.

Of particular interest was monitoring the extent to which specific syntactic strategies were employed in the English text to do the work of word order in the original (Halupka-Rešetar 2011). The strategies referred to (e.g. passivization, clefting, etc.) were only commented on when they played a role in preserving the original thematic pattern in the English text. The fact that these are commonly described in English literature as syntactic strategies in assigning focus (Downing & Locke 2002: 247) did not interfere with our perspective since the two systems, thematic and information structure (and

focus) respectively, are treated in Hallidayan systemic-functional accounts as complementary (Halliday 1985: 316).

RESULTS AND DISCUSSION

Before the results of the study are presented, an important caveat should be acknowledged: the parameters applied in analyzing the texts were characterized by considerable flexibility in what was interpreted as thematic equivalence. In other words, a rather broad interpretative framework was established to embrace any, however small, degree of thematic correspondence between the original and its English translation. For example, two non-equivalent topical themes did not prevent two matching textual themes in the same complex from bearing comparison. This decision made it possible to document all thematic convergences in the texts rather than focus on the topical theme alone. Given the exploratory nature of the study, assigning all the subclasses of theme (i.e. topical, textual or interpersonal) the same status was not considered a major deviation from the course.

Instead of the prototypical clause, the main unit of analysis was the sentence; if a sentence was opened by a clause, it was either the whole thematic clause or any of its potential individual themes that were taken into account when seeking thematic consistency in the texts. Clauses separated by a semicolon, dash or any other punctuation mark that seemed to carry more weight than the comma were analyzed in the same way as orthographic units ending in a full stop. Even sentential fragments were treated as regular sentences if their punctuation permitted such a possibility (even though, strictly speaking, such fragments had no thematic structure, they too opened in potentially matching ways).

Much as theme was regarded as a formal category, thematic correspondence was also established on the grounds of meaning: if roughly the same topical content was expressed in different structures in the two texts, or if a topical theme in one text was partially equivalent in content to its counterpart, such themes were taken to be thematically consistent.

Finally, a thematized verb inflected for person without the following overt (pronominal or other) subject in the Serbian text was considered to be equivalent to a thematized pronominal subject in the translation: the decision was based on an understanding that such themes expressed partly matching contents.

It is beyond any doubt that parameters so generously conceived must have contributed to the total number of thematic matches in the texts, but the overwhelming prevalence of corresponding or consistent themes, as they were dubbed in Table 1 below, was still somewhat of a surprise.

Table 1. Distribution of equivalent vs. non-equivalent themes in the texts

theme	
consistent 152 (86%)	replaced 25 (14%)

The text in Serbian was abundant in clause-initial adjuncts, and such themes proved relatively easy to reproduce in the translation (provided there were no grammatical restrictions on their initial position in English).

- (1) **četvrte godine svoga vezirovanja** posrnu veliki vezir Jusuf³
(in the fourth year of his viziership tottered Grand Vizier Jusuf)
in the fourth year of his viziership Grand Vizier Jusuf tottered

It was generally true that if a subject in the original text was fully expounded, it was regularly seated in postverbal position; however, if such arrangements were made following a thematized adjunct, they had no effect on the status of theme itself.

If an adjunct in clause-initial position allowed subject-predicate inversion in English, the result was a translation that closely adhered to the original.

- (2) **ispod toga** bio je vezirov pečat u ovalu
(under that was the Vizier's oval seal)
underneath was the Vizier's oval seal

Alternatively, if the verb was too weak to support subject-predicate inversion following a thematized adjunct, the entire structure was reinforced with an existential *there* keeping the default position of the verb intact.

³ For reasons of space the examples were not presented as full orthographic units, and all themes were written in boldface. Each example came in a set of three: the original text, a bracketed gloss of the original displaying the actual word order, and the authorized translation.

- (3) **na priloženoj tvrdoj hartiji** bio je fino ispisan hronogram
(on the enclosed sheet of stout paper was a finely copied chronogram)
on the enclosed sheet of stout paper there was a finely copied chronogram

Of course, there were cases when a thematized adjunct in the original had to be integrated into the rhematic structure of the corresponding English clause if such ordering of constituents was thought to improve the readability of the target text.

- (4) **povazdan** je nešto tesao
(all day long something hewed-he)
he spent most of his time hewing

Partially matching themes occurred when their contents were not expressed in matching forms, e.g. although a thematized adjunct in the original became rhematic in the translation, the new theme still conveyed the same referential information.

- (5) **iza sebe** nije ostavio ni duga ni gotovine
(behind him did not leave-he either debt or cash)
he had left behind him no debts and no cash

As similar restructuring of content was observed in themes other than adjuncts, it emerged as a useful strategy helping to maintain thematic correspondence when word order constraints, frequency issues or context prevented direct mappings at this level of analysis.

- (6) **a mesa**, kažu, nije nikad kupovao
(and meat, say-they, never bought-he)
as to meat, people said he never bought any

The original opted for a direct object as theme, which would lead not only to a highly marked but also contextually inappropriate structure in English; so the tension was resolved by turning a nominal theme into a prepositional structure.

Along with rephrasing, passive was another viable strategy for ‘minimizing linear dislocation’ (Baker 1992: 167) between the original and its translation. In this study, regulating word order constraints by voice change was taken into account as a successful strategy only if it resulted in maintaining a consistent point of departure, i.e. thematic equivalence.

- (7) **njega** najmi vezirov haznadar
(him hired the Vizier’s treasurer)
he was engaged by the Vizier’s treasurer

No other syntactic strategy described in theory and available to translators (e.g. Downing & Locke 2002; Baker 1992), apart from a single case of clefting, was identified in the target text. Instead, matching themes were much more often the work of linguistic resources which are relatively common in both languages, such as adjunct fronting.

When thematic equivalence could not be achieved, the main reason was, as one would expect, word order. For example, a predicate preceding a fully expounded subject is thematized in the original text in (8), and (9) points to a thematized direct object.

(8) **otpoče** rad
(started work)
work started

(9) **sve** poče da prima sa prikrivenim ali dubokim nepoverenjem
(everything began-he to regard with secret but deep mistrust)
he began to regard everything with secret but deep mistrust

Other cases of non-correspondence, however, could be explained on purely thematic grounds; for instance, the common feature of the source language to thematize predicates whether or not they ensure co-referentiality has no apparent equivalent in English.

(10) **vredali su** ga izvesni predmeti koje pre nije ni primećivao
(irritated him certain things which before did not even notice-he)
he was irritated by things which he had not even noticed before

The passive was contextually the most appropriate choice in the target text as it maintained topical continuity (i.e. 'he' remained the topical theme in four successive sentences). By way of comparison, the source text formed a chain of four verbal themes, but they did not necessarily share the same subject (e.g. *irritated-they* vs. *became-he*).

Finally, one has to acknowledge the fact that different languages may conceptualize experience in different ways. Or how else are the following wordings to be accounted for?

(11) **u snu** poče da mu se javlja tamnica
(in dreams began to appear to him the prison)
the prison began to obsess his dreams

CLOSING REMARKS

As Berry (1995: 64) puts it, ‘for the purposes of this article, I have erred on the side of generosity,’ which is why the results are to be treated as somewhat tentative.

If anything, this study suggests that it is indeed possible to take a theoretical framework primarily intended for describing thematic structure in fixed-word-order languages and relate it to a free-word-order language⁴.

Fears that “Most na Žepi” and “The bridge on the Žepa” would yield practically incomparable thematic structures also proved unfounded. Admittedly, the number of consistent themes in the study would be significantly reduced if textual, interpersonal and topical themes were each analyzed on its own terms, or if only topical themes were held responsible for thematic equivalence (or lack thereof).

Therefore, more research is needed to counterbalance the findings of this exploratory study by those originating in less permissive research design. Many applied contexts, e.g. translation studies, can only benefit from such endeavours.

REFERENCES

1. Andrić, I. Most na Žepi. In *Žeđ* (pp. 191-199). Sarajevo: Svjetlost, 1984.
2. Andrić, I. The bridge on the Žepa (S. Koljević, Trans.). In C. Hawkesworth (Ed.). *The damned yard and other stories* (pp. 81-91). Beograd: Dereta, 2007.
3. Baker, M. *In other words: A coursebook on translation*. London: Routledge, 1992.
4. Berry, M. Thematic options and success in writing. In M. Ghadessy (Ed.). *Thematic development in English texts* (pp. 55-84). London: Pinter, 1995.
5. Daneš, F. Functional sentence perspective and the organization of the text. In F. Daneš (Ed.). *Papers on functional sentence perspective* (pp. 106-128). Prague: Academia, 1974.
6. Downing, A., & Locke, P. *A university course in English grammar*. London: Routledge, 2002.

⁴ Also see Ventola (1995) on some important issues of thematic progression in German/English translations of scientific texts.

7. Firbas, J. Some aspects of the Czechoslovak approach to problems of functional sentence perspective. In F. Daneš (Ed.). *Papers on functional sentence perspective* (pp. 11-37). Prague: Academia, 1974.
8. Halliday, M. *An introduction to functional grammar*. London: Edward Arnold, 1985.
9. Halliday, M. A. K., & Matthiessen, C. *An introduction to functional grammar*. London: Hodder Arnold, 2004.
10. Halupka-Rešetar, S. *Rečenični fokus u engleskom i srpskom jeziku*. Novi Sad: Filozofski fakultet, 2011.
11. Marjanović, T. *Tema, rema i diskurs: Kako je čitati i slušati vijesti na engleskom jeziku*. Banja Luka: Filozofski fakultet, 2009.
12. Pokorn, N. K. *Challenging the traditional axioms: Translation into a non-mother tongue*. Amsterdam: John Benjamins Publishing Company, 2005.
13. Snell-Hornby, M. Theatre and opera translation. In P. Kuhiwczak & K. Littau (Eds.). *A companion to translation studies* (pp. 106-119). Clevedon: Multilingual Matters Ltd, 2007.
14. Swales, J. M. *Genre analysis: English in academic and research settings*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990.
15. Ventola, E. Thematic development and translation. In M. Ghadessy (Ed.). *Thematic development in English texts* (pp. 85-104). London: Pinter, 1995.

TEMATSKA STRUKTURA, JEDNA PRIČA I DVA VEOMA RAZLIČITA JEZIKA

Sažetak

U radu se istražuje mogućnost primjene engleski orijentisanog modela tematske strukture na srpskom kao jeziku sa slobodnim redom riječi. S obzirom na eksploratornu prirodu istraživanja, mikrokorpusnu bazu činila je jedna pripovijetka na srpskom jeziku i njen engleski prevod. Uprkos neospornim gramatičkim restrikcijama koje nesumnjivo utiču na konstantnost tematske strukture u poređenim jezicima, dobijeni rezultati ukazuju na postojanje

nezanemarljive dosljednosti u tematskim izborima u dva proučavana teksta. Svakako, pomenuta ograničenja u obimu i modelu istraživanja zahtijevaju značajniju empirijsku potvrdu ovih preliminarnih rezultata, koji tek predočavaju moguće pravce budućih istraživanja.

Ključne riječi: tema, rema, sistemsko-funkcionalno, red riječi, markiranost

Jelena Marković

ON THE INTERPRETIVE PROGRESSIVE IN ACADEMIC ENGLISH

Abstract: The progressive form in contemporary English is considered to have been changing for decades in basically two ways: its overall frequency has increased in the contemporary language, and it has firmly established few specific uses. Among them, we find the so-called interpretive progressive to be especially interesting.

In this article we focus on the interpretive progressive in academic English, or more precisely, in university coursebooks. Therefore, the corpus used in the article is *A Student's Introduction to English Grammar*, by Huddleston and Pullum (2005), which is usually referred to as a standard undergraduate coursebook in English grammar.

The paper shows that the interpretive progressive, only sporadically found in the 19th century academic discourse, has considerably increased in frequency. Among the examples found in the corpus the interpretive progressive appears mostly in the three structures already identified in literature. The interpretive progressive is primarily used as a means of clarification, or more precisely, as an expression of the speaker's epistemic stance in the context. Thus it is found to be suitable in academic English and in the corpus used in the article. Therefore, we consider the interpretive progressive to be gaining ground in its usage in academic English.

Key words: progressive, the interpretive progressive, academic English, academic language, syntactic structures, grammaticalisation

1. INTRODUCTION: THE CHANGES IN THE VERB PHRASE

Nowadays, at the beginning of the 21st century, contemporary English is considered to be essentially the same language which has been spoken for about two centuries. The language system has not suffered radical or considerable changes, although some changes in the verb and the noun phrases

can be noticed. The list based on Barber (Barber, 1964: 130-144 in Mair and Leech, 2006: 320) contains the following changes in the verb phrase:

- (1) a tendency to use ‘regular’ verb morphology,
- (2) revival of the so-called mandative subjunctive,
- (3) elimination of *shall* as a future marker (*I/we*),
- (4) new, auxiliary-uses of certain lexical verbs (e.g. *get, want*),
- (5) extension of the progressive to new constructions
- (6) increase in the number and types of multi-word verbs (phrasal verbs, *have/take/give a ride*, etc.)
- (7) placement of frequency adverbs before auxiliary verbs, and
- (8) *do*-support for *have*.

Similar lists are found in other sources (e.g. Leech et al., 2009).

1.1 The changing progressive in linguistic literature

Among the features mentioned above there are few which have recently been receiving a lot of attention, including the changes under e), in the progressive construction. Thus numerous research papers and studies have primarily discussed the changes in its use, alongside with the changes in its frequency (e.g. Denison, 1998; Smitterberg et al., 2000; Aarts et al., 2010, Marković, 2013).

Smitterberg et al. (2000) focused on the two genres (political and academic language) and the two corpora (the 19th and 20th centuries). They concluded that the progressive “has become increasingly frequent during the 19th and 20th centuries” (2000: 113). They also found out that attitudinal uses of the progressive “are not very frequent in either corpus, but still a number of examples where the progressive has a politer or interpretative effect could be found both for the 19th and 20th centuries” (ibid). Aarts et al. (2010) focused on the changes in the use of the progressive in contemporary spoken English. They concluded that the corpus being used (*the Diachronic Corpus of Present-day Spoken English*) “shows an increased use of the construction in recent times, possibly due to a wider range of uses” (2010: 163).

Apart from the quantitative change, the progressive obviously changes in the ‘qualitative’ dimension, firmly establishing itself as the form expressing a number of specific functional roles, e.g. the interpretive progressive, the quasi-stative progressive, the ‘always’ progressive (see Marković, 2013: 76-77). We

find the changes in the functional load of the progressive to be both interesting and important, and subsequently we have decided to focus on the specific functional value of the progressive, called the interpretive progressive (see Huddleston and Pullum, 2002: 165). The specific genre of interest in the paper is academic English.

2 THE INTERPRETIVE PROGRESSIVE

The only typical aspectual opposition which is formally marked in contemporary English is the progressive/non-progressive binary opposition. Namely, the progressive typically and clearly immerses the speaker into the verb situation itself, subsequently being considered a typical aspectual form.¹

2.1 The description

The essence of the progressive semantics is expressing the ongoing verb situation, or the quality of progressiveness. A very insightful and detailed description of its features and implicatures is found in Huddleston and Pullum (2002: 163). They state that the progressive is best seen as consisting of the following features:

- i the situation is presented as in progress, ongoing, at or throughout T_r .
- ii the situation is viewed imperfectively.
- iii T_r is a mid-interval within T_{sit} . [implicature]
- iv The situation is presented as durative.
- v The situation is presented as dynamic.
- vi The situation is presented as having limited duration. [implicature]²

Apart from the four obligatory parts of the meaning of the progressive, Huddleston and Pullum mention the two implicatures, which are not

¹ On the other hand, the opposition perfect/non-perfect may be called aspectual, but it has to be seen as rather different from other aspect(s), because obviously “it tells us nothing directly about the situation in itself, but rather relates some state to a preceding situation” (Comrie, 1976: 52). Different views, either primarily temporal or primarily aspectual, are still held by influential scholars on the perfect/non-perfect opposition, unlike the progressive.

² The symbols T_r and T_{sit} stand for *time referred to* and *time of situation* (2002: 126), respectively. In Reichenbach’s terms (1947), these are *reference time* (R) and *event time* (E).

necessarily present in the meaning though they typically hold. The first, that T_r is a mid-interval within T_{sit} , is especially important for our discussion.

By the term *mid-interval*, the authors denote that the time referred to by the verb is shorter than the time of the situation, since the time referred to typically excludes the beginning and/or the end of the verb situation. Therefore we may say that the time referred to in the progressive is a mid-interval within the broader time interval – the time of the situation:

- (1) *When we arrived, she was phoning the police.* (Huddleston and Pullum, 2002: 163).

On the other side, in the following examples the time of the beginning or the end (or sometimes both) may be specified:

- (2) *From the moment I arrived he was trying to provoke me.*
(3) *He was watching TV until the power went off.* (Huddleston and Pullum, 2002: 165).

If it is so, it means that in the examples (2) and (3) the mid-interval implicature is clearly cancelled, the time referred to by the progressive covers the interval within the time of the situation including either the beginning or the end, or sometimes both.

Among the specific cases when the mid-interval implicature is cancelled, Huddleston and Pullum emphasise the so-called interpretive/explanatory progressive:

- (4) *When I said 'the boss' I was referring to you.* (ibid 165)

In the preceding example, the time referred to in the progressive *was referring* is actually the complete time covered by the verb situation which is equated with its 'appositive' verb situation of saying:

Here the saying and referring are strictly simultaneous, coextensive, so that the T_r for *was referring* is the whole T_{sit} . (Huddleston and Pullum, 2002: 165).

In the first verb situation, the choice is the simple form, whereas in the second verb phrase, the choice is different: the progressive. The reason is achieving the effect of the explanatory function of the clause. Thus the situation, whose T_{sit} is now typically rather short, is seen from within, in that way being subjectively extended and subsequently emphasised. Therefore this use of the progressive

... interprets the speaker's attitude and perspective of the situation, and, in so doing, conveys her epistemic stance at a particular moment in the context of utterance. (Wright, 1995: 157 in Aarts et al., 2010: 161).

The primarily epistemic meaning is the reason why some scholars use the term 'modal' progressive for this use.

2.2 The frequency and the patterns

Smitterberg offers the data about the frequency of the interpretive progressive over genres in the 19th and the 20th centuries (Smitterberg, 2005: 222 in Aarts et al. 2010: 162), in which we see that absolute frequencies have been steadily increasing over the period in all the genres included (Press, General prose, Learned, Fiction). His analysis was done using a number of corpora.

In an earlier study, Smitterberg et al. (2000) noted that in his corpus which consisted of one million words of 19th century British English (CONCE) he found examples of the interpretive progressive, although it is generally claimed that this use is a rather recent phenomenon. The example he provides in academic language is the following:

- (5) In propounding the fact, ... we are stating the final result rather than the process by which this position is reached – the ultimate limit, rather than the gradual development. (*Science*, 1850-1870, 62-63, in Smitterberg et al., 2000: 111).

The syntactic patterns in which the interpretive progressive appears are rather limited. Namely, it cannot appear on its own, since it is a reflection on some other verb situation in the context, which it should emphasise and clarify. Therefore König identified the three structural patterns in which it appears: the category 'coordination, parataxis', the category '*in* + participle + main clause', and the category 'Conditionals' (König, 1980: 275f in Smitterberg et al., 2000: 112). The first category, coordination, parataxis, includes the cases in which the interpretive progressive appears mostly in an independent sentence which clarifies the preceding sentence, being also independent. The second and the third categories are found in complex sentences, containing a non-finite adverbial clause and a conditional adverbial clause respectively.

Apart from the structural limitations, there are also lexical ones. Namely, the pragmatic inference of emphasising and clarifying requires the choice among verbs of communication, e.g. *say, tell, refer, lie, state* etc.

2.3 The explanations

The interpretive progressive obviously expresses “a higher degree of pragmatic meaning and/or subjectivity on the part of the speaker than regular uses of the progressive” (Smith, 2005: 166 in Aarts et al. 2010: 161). In actual fact, it is used as identical with the other verb situation, which is, at least in the conditional pattern, expressed by the simple form.

Trying to explain few specific uses of the progressive, including the interpretive progressive, Ranta (2006: 112) suggests that “the ‘attractiveness’ of the progressive resides in the grammatical form itself”:

What I mean by this is that adding the ending *-ing* and the auxiliary BE to a verb (any verb for that matter) gives the verb more prominence and salience in the speaker’s utterance. It makes the verb stand out, so to speak, and draws the interlocutor’s attention to a ‘heavier’ periphrastic structure. (Ranta, 2006: 112)

The changes of this type are seen as examples of grammaticalisation.³ Haspelmath (1999: 1044) says that grammaticalisation “shifts a linguistic expression further toward the functional pole of the lexical-functional continuum”. The reasons for grammaticalisation are primarily pragmatic, or as Hopper and Traugott say (2003: 67),

... they can be summarized as maximization of efficiency via minimal differentiation on the one hand, and maximization of informativeness on the other.

Since the stylistic conventions in academic discourse, or at least in academic English, have been showing some tendency to change over a number of features, the interpretive progressive seems to be among the features slowly but steadily entering and influencing academic English.

2.4 The area of interest: academic English

The empirical part of the research done for the article is the structural and functional analysis of the instances of the interpretive progressive which appear

³ Grammaticalisation theories distinguish between instances of primary and secondary grammaticalisation. Primary grammaticalisation includes the cases of lexical categories and constructions developing into members of functional categories, whereas secondary grammaticalisation includes the changes in the grammatical status of the already existing functional categories, e.g. the change from a less grammatical to a more grammatical category (see Traugott, 2002: 19-27).

in a standard English undergraduate grammar book, *A Student's Introduction to English Grammar*, by Huddleston and Pullum (2005). Namely, focusing on the interpretive progressive required a specific genre in which its use may be pragmatically justified: academic English. Furthermore, academic English is also interesting in terms of its own changes – primarily changes in stylistic expectations, as noted by Leech et al. (2009: 4).

The term ‘genre’ is defined as comprising “a class of communicative events, the members of which share some set of communicative purposes” (Swales, 1990: 58), so that “genres are best conceptualized as goal-directed or purposive” (Askehave and Swales, 2001). The key purpose of academic English (or academic genre in general) is negotiating and presenting scientific endeavours to other scholars in the field. However, it is not the case that genres impose uniformity over their users – on the contrary, variation is the factor on the basis of which genre samples are ordered from core genre samples towards more marginal ones (see Hyland, 2005: 88).

Since the term ‘academic language’, or ‘academic English’, is rather wide, Hyland (2005: 101) divides it into research articles, popular science articles and introductory (undergraduate) textbooks. This article is based on the corpus being representative for the undergraduate textbook, or ‘the major pedagogic genre of the academy’ (ibid).

The reasons why we decided to take *A Student's Introduction to English Grammar*, by Huddleston and Pullum (2005), as our corpus are multifold. Firstly, it is considered to be a standard undergraduate grammar book, thus being a typical contemporary sample for the undergraduate textbook. The grammar book, according to its contents, in accordance with *The Cambridge Grammar of the English Language* (2002), is itself undoubtedly a groundbreaking undergraduate textbook, its metalanguage also being intentionally slightly untypical.⁴

3 THE DATABASE

In the corpus, which will consecutively be marked by the abbreviation SG, we have found the total of 36 sentences containing 42 examples of the interpretive

⁴ This was the major conclusion of our paper called “Is academic English necessarily formal?”, presented at the scientific conference “Going against the Grain” in Banja Luka in June 2013.

progressive altogether.⁵ This figure, when the total number of pages (about 300) is taken into account, is rather huge, producing the average of three examples in twenty pages. However the distribution over the text is rather uneven. Thus most examples appear in the chapters devoted to verb phrases and clause types.

Among the 36 sentences identified, we marked 17 (or approximately a half) as the type called ‘parataxis’:

- (6) ... (perhaps **I’m proposing** a change to current arrangement where she’s arriving at some other time) ... (SG, 47)⁶
- (7) In [1] we contrast two non-standard expressions ... In [1], though, we’re specifically **talking** about the sentences of a non-standard dialect. (SG, 2)
- (8) I don’t know that she’s ill, but I also don’t know that she isn’t, and **am countenancing** it as a possibility. (SG, 54)
- (9) In [iia] it could be that you already know I did it, and **I’m** here **telling** you why. (SG, 80)
- (10) **I’m not instructing** you to sleep well, have a great weekend, recover: **I’m expressing** a hope. (SG, 171)
- (11) In [iii] **I’m saying** what I want you to do, and in a context where I have some relevant kind of authority or control over you I **am** indirectly or implicitly **telling** you to do it. (SG, 172)

We also found 3 examples of the second type: prepositions initiating sentences in which the interpretive progressive appears. However, in all the three examples, the preposition used was ‘by’:

- (12) By saying [ib] I don’t claim it was a success, by asking [iib] or [iiib] **I’m not asking** questions about its success ... (SG, 161)
- (13) But by putting in a qualification like ‘primary’ or ‘characteristic’ we’re **acknowledging** that we can’t determine whether some arbitrary verb in English is a past tense form simply by asking whether it (SG, 7)

⁵ We have also identified several borderline sentences, which were not included into the database.

⁶ In all the examples from the corpus, the interpretive progressive is in bold letters.

The number of conditional examples is 11, which means it is slightly under a third of the total number of examples:⁷

- (14) But it is not being used to ask a question: if I say [iib], I'm **not asking** for an answer, I'm **asking** for the salt. (SG, 8)
- (15) When we ask whether the two declarative clauses have the same core meaning, we **are asking** whether they have the same truth conditions ... (SG, 217)
- (16) When I say [ib] I'm **not directing** you to sleep well, I'm just **wishing** you a peaceful night. (SG, 8)

Within the same type, we included the example which contains the concessive *may*:

- (17) In [ia], I may not know that he overslept, but I'm **inferring** that he did. (SG, 54)

The number of examples in the three types identified by König (König 1980 in Smitterberg et al. 2000: 112) is 31 out of 36, or 86%.

In the remaining 5 examples, we identified other structures, the first of which is the noun clause structure:⁸

- (18) The distinction between the two kinds of sentence is drawn in terms of clauses (one versus more than one), which means we're **taking** the idea of the clause to be descriptively more basic than the idea of a sentence. (SG, 12)
- (19) What we're **saying** is that when there is a conflict between a proposed rule of grammar and the stable usage of millions of experienced speakers who say what they mean and mean what they say ... (SG, 5)
- (20) What they **are claiming** is (putting it in our terms) that the missing subject of a non-finite clause in adjunct function **MUST** be under

⁷ Within the same pattern, called conditional examples, we included complex sentences containing temporal clauses as well.

⁸ The clauses containing the interpretive progressives in (18), (19) and (20) are called *noun clauses* in traditional grammar. Huddleston and Pullum (2002, 2005) distinguish between the clauses in the examples above: they use the term *content clause* for (18) and the term *fused relative* for (19) and (20). In examples (19) and (20) an additional emphatic effect is achieved by using the pseudo-cleft construction.

obligatory syntactic determination by the subject of the matrix clause.
(SG, 209)

There also appeared an example which is the only nonfinite interpretive progressive in the corpus:

- (21) In [iib] ... the second sentence is supposed **to be saying** that Marisa was trying on her dress. (SG, 208).

In this example, the additional attitudinal effect is achieved by the semi-auxiliary *be supposed to*.

Interpretive quality of this progressive is also supported by a number of adverbs or prepositional phrases serving as adverbs (e.g. *maybe, specifically, indirectly, implicitly, in effect*). The verbs being used are mostly *tell, say, inform, consider, claim, take for granted, etc.*⁹

4 CONCLUSION

The interpretive progressive, being a specific extension of the typical progressive semantics, is primarily used as an expression of the speaker's epistemic stance in the context given, which is probably best seen in the example (15):

- (15) When we ask whether the two declarative clauses have the same core meaning, we **are asking** whether they have the same truth conditions ... (SG, 217)

Thus though it is (mostly explicitly) simultaneous with the other (simple) verb situation, the progressive is chosen because it subjectively prolongs the time of the situation.

The interpretive progressive was rarely found in the 19th century English, but its frequency has recently been increasingly prominent. Since it is used as a means of clarification, it proves to be especially useful in academic language.

⁹ The interpretive progressive is an alternative to the emphatic present simple with the operator *do*. Both the forms appear in the same sentence in the corpus in the following:

In [52i], for example, I'm **saying** in [a] that it is necessary the case that he overslept, and in [b] that it is necessary for him to apologise: in neither **do I countenance** any other possibility. (SG, 55)

Therefore our research was aimed at academic English, or more precisely, the undergraduate textbook sample. The analysis of the results has shown that the interpretive progressive appears considerably frequently in the textbook. The patterns in which it appears are mostly the three patterns already identified by scholars, with minor extensions.

What we may conclude in the end is that the interpretive progressive has been gaining ground rather steadily in the contemporary language. It is very attractive in situations in which the speaker wants to present his epistemic perspective of the situation. Thus it is sometimes a very desirable choice in academic English, itself undergoing certain stylistic changes.

REFERENCES

1. Aarts, B. et al. Recent Changes in the Use of the Progressive Construction in English. In Capelle, B. and N. Wada (Eds.). *Distinctions in English Grammar*. Tokyo: Kaitakusha, 148-168, 2010.
2. Askehave, I. and J. M. Swales. Genre Identification and Communicative Purpose: A Problem and a Possible Solution. *Applied Linguistics*, 22/2, 195-212, 2001.
3. Barber, C. *Linguistic change in present-day English*. London and Edinburgh: Oliver and Boyd, 1964.
4. Comrie, B. *Aspect*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1976.
5. Denison, D. Syntax. In Romaine, S. (Ed.). *The Cambridge History of the English Language IV: 1776-1997*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 92-329, 1998.
6. Haspelmath, M. Why is Grammaticalization Irreversible? In *Linguistics*, 37, 1043-1068, 1999.
7. Hopper, P. J. and E. C. Traugott. *Grammaticalization (2nd ed.)*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2003.
8. Huddleston, R. and G. Pullum. *A Student's Introduction to English Grammar*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2005.
9. Huddleston, R. and G. Pullum. *The Cambridge Grammar of the English Language*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
10. Hyland, K. *Metadiscourse: Exploring Interaction in Writing*. London: Continuum, 2005.

11. König, E. On the context-dependence of the progressive in English. In Rohrer, C. (Ed.). *Time, tense, and quantifiers: Proceedings of the Stuttgart conference on the logic of tense and quantification*. Tübingen: Max Niemeyer Verlag, 269-291, 1980.
12. Leech, G. et al. *Change in Contemporary English: A Grammatical Study*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2009.
13. Mair, C. and G. Leech. Current Changes in English Syntax. In Aarts, B. and A. McMahon (Eds.). *The Handbook of English Linguistics*. Oxford: Blackwell Publishing, 318-340, 2006.
14. Marković, J. On the Progressive Construction in Contemporary English. In *On the English Verb*. Pale: Faculty of Philosophy, 59-79, 2013.
15. Ranta, E. The 'Attractive' Progressive – Why Use the *-ing* Form in English as a Lingua Franca? *Nordic Journal of English Studies*, vol. 5, no. 2, 95-116, 2006.
16. Reichenbach, H. The Tenses of Verbs. In *Elements of Symbolic Logic*. New York: Free Press, 287-298, 1947.
17. Smith, N. *A Corpus-based Investigation of Recent Change in the Use of the Progressive in British English (doctoral dissertation)*. Lancaster University, 2005.
18. Smitterberg, E. et al. The present progressive in political and academic language in the 19th and 20th centuries: A corpus-based investigation. *ICAME Journal*, vol. 24, 99-118, 2000.
19. Smitterberg, E. *The Progressive in 19th-Century English: A Process of Integration*. Amsterdam: Rodopi, 2005
20. Swales, J. *Genre Analysis*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1990.
21. Traugott, E. C. From etymology to historical pragmatics. In Minkova, D. and R. Stockwell (eds.). *Studying the History of the English Language: Millennial perspectives*. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter, 19-51, 2002.
22. Wright, S. Subjectivity and Experiential Syntax. In Stein, D. and S. Wright (eds.). *Subjectivity and Subjectivisation: Linguistic Perspectives*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 151-172, 1995.

O EPISTEMIČKOM PROGRESIVNOM OBLIKU U AKADEMSKOM ENGLESKOM

Rezime

Tema ovog rada jeste predstavljanje i analiziranje tzv. epistemičke upotrebe progresivnog glagolskog oblika u akademskom engleskom jeziku. U prethodnih nekoliko decenija progresivni oblik u engleskom jeziku razvijao se i kvantitativno i kvalitativno. Osim učestalosti koja je sve primetnija u raznim korpusima i rezultatima istraživanja, progresivni oblik preuzeo je i nove funkcionalne uloge. Kao objašnjenje za novine u upotrebi progresivnog oblika, autori navode proces gramatikalizacije. U datom slučaju ovaj proces podrazumeva upotrebu već postojećeg progresivnog oblika u novim ulogama, medju kojima nalazimo i tzv. epistemičku upotrebu.

Osnov korišćenja progresivnog oblika kao epistemičkog jeste izbor govornika koji želi da naglasi istinitost tvrdnje koju iznosi tako što će subjektivno produžiti inače kratko vreme trajanja glagolske situacije. Iako se epistemička upotreba progresivnog oblika sve učestalije beleži u više žanrova u jeziku, u ovom radu odabrali smo akademski engleski jezik. Preciznije, kao korpus koristili smo standardni univerzitetski udžbenik gramatike savremenog engleskog jezika: *A Student's Introduction to English Grammar* (2005), čiji su autori Hadlston i Pulam.

Analizirajući metajezik pomenutog udžbenika, zaključili smo da se u proseku na dvadeset strana teksta epistemički progresivni oblik upotrebi tri puta, što ne možemo smatrati zanemarljivim za jednu novu funkcionalnu ulogu. Osim toga, značajno je pomenuti da su rečenične strukture u kojima se javlja uglavnom tri koje su već identifikovane u literaturi, uz još par drugih struktura.

Na osnovu uvida u literaturu i empirijskog dela rada možemo zaključiti da se epistemička upotreba izvesno sve više javlja u akademskom jeziku. Drugim rečima, epistemička upotreba je u potpunosti opravdana u kontekstu akademskog metajezika, gde uspešno služi subjektivnom produžavanju glagolske situacije, a samim tim, i njenom naglašavanju.

Ključne reči: progresivni oblik, epistemički progresivni oblik, akademski engleski, akademski jezik, sintaksičke strukture, gramatikalizacija

Melisa Okičić

ON REFORM OF *SHALL* IN LEGAL ENGLISH

Abstract: As is well known, *shall* has been the hallmark of legal English for centuries. However, over the past 30 years this modal auxiliary has been rapidly decreasing in use, thereby creating the so-called *shall-free* version of legal English. This paper gives a brief overview of *shall*-reform process, focusing on the description of *shall-free* recommendations which are nowadays acknowledged standardized rules used in British legal drafting practice.

Key words: *shall*, legal English, *shall-free*, reform, recommendation

INTRODUCTION

“Non-future” or “legal” *shall* is known to have been in use in legal English for more than 600 years (Williams 2009: 199). Denoting *obligation* and giving a highly formal *flavour* to the legal discourse, this modal auxiliary, from the 1980s, has become a burning issue, the subject of much discussion seeking urgent reforms as to its use in future legal drafting practice. In other words, a frequent use of this modal auxiliary was no longer considered a standardized use, but an *overuse* requiring urgent revision. Accordingly, over the years, the use of *shall* has been gradually decreasing in all English-speaking jurisdictions, resulting in the creation of the so-called *shall-free* version of legal English (Williams 2011: 143). Therefore, this paper gives a brief overview of the key changes that have taken place in terms of the development of *shall-free* standard of legal English nowadays, being considered a set of standardized rules in legal drafting practice in the UK (as well as in all English-speaking jurisdictions)¹. The paper is organised as follows: after *Introduction*, the first section gives a brief overview of arguments for *shall*-reform in English-speaking jurisdictions, outlining also the impact of the reform in some other countries apart from the UK. The following section briefly describes the beginning of the reform process in the UK, summarizing a set of adopted recommendations which nowadays define the *shall-free* standard in British

¹ Excluding the European Union legislation.

legal drafting practice. This section also gives an illustration of the implementation of *shall*-reform recommendations in recently enacted British acts (2013). All the acts were taken from <http://www.legislation.gov.uk/2013>. In the end, we give some final remarks and conclusions.

THE BIRTH OF *SHALL*-REFORM

The idea of *shall*-reform was born as a response to calls for an overall reform of legal language which was initiated by the proponents of the Plain English Movement. The Plain English Movement started to emerge in the early 1980s in all English-speaking jurisdictions, whose main goal was “to modernize legal language, especially prescriptive texts such as laws and contracts.”² From its establishment up to date, the Plain English Movement has developed rapidly and become widespread all over the globe. Its proponents have been constantly campaigning against the incomprehensible nature of legal language³, arguing that citizens “have a right to understand legal documents that affect their rights and obligations” (Tiersma 1999: 220). Taken as a whole, the activities of the Plain English movement are aimed at the simplification of legal language by implementing the Plain English recommendations, which can be summarized as follows: reduce sentence length, eliminate archaic and Latin words, reduce the use of passive sentences, reduce the use of nominalization, avoid repetition of frequent words, use gender-neutral text, reduce the use of *shall*⁴.

As touched on previously, *shall*-reform was originally initiated by the Australian and American Plain English proponents in the early 1990s. Michèle Asprey (1992: 79), by analysing legal documents written in Australian English, concludes that “the word is hardly ever used outside the legal communication ... and lawyers misuse it. They confuse imperative *shall* with the future tense and fail to distinguish between various senses of *shall* in their documents.”⁵ Joseph Kimble, a representative of the American Plain English Movement, goes a step further by claiming that *shall* should not only be reduced, but completely ousted from a legal context because “that would at least end the

² Williams, Christopher. Legal English and Plain Language: An Update. *ESP Across Culture* 8: 139, 2011.

³ Plain English Campaign. About Us. 2013. <http://www.plainenglish.co.uk/about-us.html> (accessed 23 September 2013)

⁴ Williams, Christopher. Legal English and Plain Language. *ESP Across Cultures* 1: 111-124, 2004.

⁵ Michèle M. Asprey. Shall Must Go. *The Scribes Journal of Legal Writing* 3: 79-85, 1992.

misuses. And it would take us another step closer to the plain language”⁶. Focusing on the problem of “*shall*-misuse” Kimble (1992: 63) proposes the following set of *shall*-reform recommendations, as follows:

“There *shall be* no right of appeal.” (Change *shall be* to *is*. You are not imposing a duty; you are declaring a legal fact or policy.)

“Days *shall be* defined as calendar days, unless otherwise specified.” (Change *shall be defined as* to *means*. Same reason as in the first example.)

“No professor or employee *shall* individually *resolve* or attempt to resolve a suspected violation.” (Change *shall* to *may*. You are not negating a duty; you are negating permission.)

“Appropriate sanctions *shall include* any one or more of the following” (Omit *shall*. Better yet, identify the agent. If you are imposing a duty, make it *The hearing panel must impose one or more of the following sanctions*. If you are granting permission, make it *The hearing panel may impose one or more of the following sanctions*.)

In subsequent years, Kimble’s proposal was strongly supported by many other Plain English proponents all around the globe who added their voice to the growing demands for the reform of *shall* (Garner 1995, 2001; Cutts 1998, 1999, 2000; Butt and Castle 2001; Hunt 2002; Sullivan 2001; Asprey 2003). However, at the same time, such a newly-defined approach provoked very strong reactions from legal drafters, who openly demonstrated their resistance to change by claiming that *shall* has been the hallmark of legal writing tradition for centuries and that plain reform of any kind is not acceptable because “plain language advocates want baby talk or drab.”⁷

Although it was crystal clear that “traditional language will be a long time dying” (Butt and Castle 2001: 3), Plain English reformists were determined to succeed. However, in the 1990s Plain English reform entered the phase of “convincing” the government bodies that there was a justified need for reforming an overall legal language, which turned out to be a very long

⁶ Kimble, Joseph. The Many Misuses of *Shall*. *The Scribes Journal of Legal Writing* 3: 61-79, 1992.

⁷ Kimble, Joseph. Answering the Critics of Plain Language. *The Scribes Journal of Legal Writing* 5: 51-85, 1994-1995.

process, since the first signs of the reform started to be “visible” from 2000 onwards. After a series of internal discussions between Plain English proponents and parliamentary drafters, the reform first took place in Australia and New Zealand. In Australia the reform process officially started in 1993 and ended in 2003 when the Australian Office of Parliamentary Counsel produced *Plain English Manual*, thereby prescribing a new Plain English-oriented drafting style, also proclaiming an entire elimination of *shall* from legal drafting practice:

Say “must” or “must not” when imposing an obligation, not “shall” or “shall not”. If you feel the need to use a gentler form, say “is to” or “is not to”, but these are less direct and use more words. The traditional style sometimes uses “shall” in declaratory provisions. Example: “This Act shall cease to have effect...”; “An authority shall be established...”; “The Authority shall consist of 10 members...”. These are neither imperatives nor statements about the future, they are declarations of the law. Example: “This Act ceases to have effect...”; “An authority is established...”; “The Authority consists of 10 members...”. Even if the event is yet to happen, the law speaks in the present because an Act is “always speaking”.⁸

In New Zealand⁹ the reform formally ended in 2009 in the same way. After an intensive period of internal discussions, The Parliamentary Counsel Office finally produced *Drafting Manual*, thus officially acknowledging the Plain English recommendations, and also confirming the use of *shall*-alternatives as follows:

“May” should be used where a power, permission, benefit, or privilege given to some person may, but need not, be exercised, i.e., exercise is discretionary.

“Must” should be used where a duty is imposed that must be performed.

⁸ Plain English Manual. Australian Government: Office of Parliamentary Counsel, 1993: 6. At https://www.opc.gov.au/about/docs/Plain_English.pdf (accessed 16 September 2013).

⁹ “In early 1997, the New Zealand Parliamentary Counsel Office ... made a number of modest changes in its drafting style (and that) they included ... use of “must” instead of “shall”.” Tanner, Garner. Imperatives in drafting legislation: a brief New Zealand perspective. *Clarity* 52: 7-11, 2004.

“Must” should be used in preference to “shall” because it is clear and definite, and commonly understood.¹⁰

In the end, although the first set of *shall*-reform recommendations was originally produced by an American representative of the Plain English Movement, the implementation process has been a very slow one in the USA. As pointed out by Williams (2011), the USA *shall*-reform seems to be still ongoing:

In brief, then, while there are many tangible signs that Plain language has made substantial inroads in the US, particularly as regards its use in court procedures and in federal government, the ethos of modernizing the legislative drafting style has still not penetrated the US Establishment to the extent that it has in Australia, New Zealand or – much more recently – the United Kingdom, despite the passing of the US Plain Writing Act 2010 and the Executive Order of 18 January 2011. ... Nevertheless, legislative texts on a national level in the US still tend to conform to a rather traditional style of drafting. Even the US Plain Writing Act of 2010 includes instances of *shall*. (Williams 2011: 145)

SHALL-REFORM IN THE UK

In the UK *shall*-reform process starts within the implementation of the *Tax Law Rewrite Project*. Originally initiated in 1997, the main purpose of this project was “to rewrite the UK’s primary direct tax legislation to make it clearer and easier to use, without changing the law.”¹¹ This was an extremely demanding task dealing with the revision of 6,000 pages, which lasted for 13 instead of 5 years, as initially planned. However, the discussions as to the use of *shall* in the UK drafting practice did not happen until 2008 when the *Group at the Office of the Parliamentary Counsel in Westminster* finally produced the report simply titled *Shall* (2008). However, it is worth mentioning that two years before (2006) the Scottish Parliament produced the booklet *Plain Language and Legislation*, thereby defining its own in-house legal drafting style in which the *shall*-reform was explicitly pointed out only in terms of the replacement of *shall* by *must*, whilst other alternatives are considered rather optional:

¹⁰ Drafting Manual. New Zealand Government: Parliamentary Counsel Office, 2009: 29. At <http://www.pco.parliament.govt.nz/assets/Uploads/pdf/clear-drafting.pdf> (accessed 24 September 2013).

¹¹ UK Tax Law Rewrite Project. HM Revenue & Customs. 2013. At <http://www.hmrc.gov.uk/rewrite/> (accessed 8 September 2013)

Debate rages over use of “shall” or “must” when imposing duties. Preference for “must” is gaining momentum: many consider using “shall” to indicate the imperative mood to be more ambiguous as it is more commonly understood as a way of making a statement about the future than as a means of imposing an obligation. Other options may be available if there is disagreement on preferred style (e.g. “it is for”, “is to” or “are not to”).¹²

On the other hand, the Tax Law Rewrite Project Group (hereinafter *Group*) produced a 24 pages long report devoted exclusively to this modal auxiliary. The report starts with a statement by which the Group acknowledges that the use of *shall* in British legal language has been strongly influenced by the Plain English reform since “Some recent Acts use *shall* freely whilst others avoid it altogether, or perhaps reserve it for textual amendments to Acts in which it already appears.”¹³ In addition, the Group also recognizes that such a situation is actually a consequence of different opinions among legal drafters as to the use of *shall*, thus urging the taking of an official standpoint in terms of the standardization in use of this modal auxiliary in legal drafting practice. In order to come up with final conclusions, the Group first provided a detailed classification of all the provisions in which *shall* was detected. The findings revealed 10 different kinds of provisions, thus confirming an immense overuse of *shall* in legal texts, as follows:

- provisions imposing obligations;
- provisions creating a statutory body, office, tribunal, etc.;
- provisions about application or effect;
- amendments;
- repeals;
- provisions introducing schedules;
- financial provisions;
- provisions about orders and regulations;
- provisions about extent; provisions about commencement¹⁴.

¹² Plain Language and Legislation. UK: The Scottish Government, 2006. At <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/93488/0022476.pdf> (accessed 20 September 2013)

¹³ Shall. Drafting Technique Group Paper 19. UK: Office of the Parliamentary Council, 2008: 1. (accessed 16 September 2009).

¹⁴ Ibid.

In order to identify potential alternatives as preferable *shall*-replacement choices, the Group proceeded with an in-depth examination of provisions, taking into consideration the use of *shall*-alternatives which were previously adopted in some other English-speaking jurisdictions (replacement of *shall* by modals *may*, *must*, modal idiom *be to*, *Present Simple Tense*). In the end, the Group concludes that:

- a) *shall* is to be replaced by *must* in provisions prescribing obligations, where an obligation is understood in general, i.e. “an obligation on someone to do something (or refrain from doing something).¹⁵;
- b) *shall* is to be replaced by “*is/are to be formula*” in financial provisions, where *be to* is understood in “the sense of willing a certain outcome of bringing something about.¹⁶”;
- c) *shall* is replaced by *is/are to be formula*, *must* or *may* in provisions about orders and regulations (“provisions about requiring orders/regulations to be made by statutory instruments, requirements to be obeyed by the person on whom the power to make the subordinate legislation is conferred”¹⁷)
- d) *shall* is to be replaced by *Present Simple Tense* verb forms in all other provisions, where the Present Simple Tense emphasizes “that the Act itself brings about the legal result.”¹⁸

As to the use of *may*, the Group also confirms that although this modal auxiliary denotes *obligation* (in a sense of *permission/prohibition*), the most typical meaning of this modal in British statutory acts is the meaning of *discretionary power*¹⁹:

“May” has been held to impose an obligation, but it would be perverse to use “may” for this purpose. Clearly when drafters in this Office say that “the Secretary of State may do X” they mean to confer a discretion on the Secretary of State.²⁰

The fact that the Group finally agreed on a total elimination of *shall* from the drafting practice in which *shall* has been used for centuries has finally marked

¹⁵ Ibid, p. 3.

¹⁶ Ibid, p. 11.

¹⁷ Ibid, p. 22.

¹⁸ Ibid, p. 16.

¹⁹ “*Shall* imposes a duty or an obligation, *may* confers a discretionary power. Thus *shall* is mandatory while *may* is discretionary.” (Crabbe 1993: 76)

²⁰ Shall. Drafting Technique Group Paper 19. UK: Office of the Parliamentary Council, 2008: 4.

an official victory for the Plain English reformists, who managed to convince even the British legal drafters that the time for the revision of the old-fashioned tradition has finally come.

Furthermore, the Group's recommendations have also been recently acknowledged by the *Office of the Parliamentary Counsel*, being summarized in *Drafting Guidance* (2011) as follows:

OPC policy is to minimise the use of the legislative “shall”. There are various alternatives to “shall” which can be used, depending on context – “must” in the context of obligations (although “is to be” and “it is the duty of” may also be appropriate alternatives in certain contexts); “there is to be” in the context of the establishment of new statutory bodies etc.; use of the present tense in provisions about application, effect, extent or commencement; “is amended as follows” in provisions introducing a series of amendments; “is repealed” in the context of free-standing repeals; “is to be” in the context of provisions relating to statutory instruments (and, if appropriate, “may not” as an alternative to “shall not”).²¹

Since the use of *shall*-alternatives has been officially prescribed standard in British legal drafting practice, it is not surprising that many linguists were curious about its actual implementation in British legal acts. Therefore in 2013 Christopher Williams in *Changes in the verb phrase in legislative language in English* presents the findings of an impressive diachronic and comparative corpus-based study dealing with the verb phrase change in British, Australian and EU legal acts (drafted in a period between 1970 and 2010). As the author concludes, *shall* has almost completely vanished from those British acts that were enacted as of 2010, appearing rarely only in the case of amendment provisions:

In the UK the decision to oust *shall* only became operative relatively recently, some time between 2001 and 2010, as can be seen by comparing the figures for 2000 (10.6 per 1,000 words) with those of 2010 (0.2 per 1,000 words). It should be borne in mind that of the few occurrences of *shall* in 2010 some are simply due to textual amendments, as in (6):

(6) In section 24 (1) of the Broadcasting Act 1990 (Channel 4 to be provided by C4C), for “The function of the Corporation shall be to” substitute “The Corporation must.” (Williams 2013: 361)

²¹ Drafting Guidance. UK: Office of the Parliamentary Counsel, 2011: 2. At <http://www.transblawg.eu/index.php/?archives/4118-Shall-or-must-recommendations-for-UK-parliament.html> (accessed 6 September 2013).

In addition Williams also remarks on a massive increase in the use of *must*, *may*, modal idiom *be to* and the use of *Present Simple* forms of the main verbs²².

Finally, in order to illustrate the implementation of the *shall*-reform recommendations in the latest UK acts enacted in 2013, we have examined a few acts taken from an official web-page of the UK legislation (<http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2013>). As expected, the rules prescribing the use of *shall*-alternatives are systematically followed, including also more consistent replacement of *shall* by Present Simple Tense verb forms in amendment provisions (see (3)). Examples are given as follows:

- a) Replacement of *shall* by *Present Simple Tense* forms of main verbs in *declaratory provisions* (e.g. application or effect, amendments, repeals, introducing Schedules, extent and commencement).

APPLICATION

- (1) Sections 1216DA and 1216DB **apply** to a company that is the television production company in relation to a relevant programme. (Finance Act 2013: 283) (cf. *shall apply (to)*)

INTRODUCING SCHEDULE

- (2) Schedule 1 (conciliation: minor and consequential amendments) has effect. (Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Act 2013: 7) (cf. *shall have effect*)

AMENDMENTS

- (3) In section 70A (5) of that Act (“relevant application” includes an application for approval under section 60(2)) after “60(2)” **insert** “, (2A) or (2B)”. (Growth and Infrastructure Act 2013: 7) (cf. *shall be inserted*)

COMMENCEMENT

- (4) The other provisions of this Act **come into** force on such day or days as may be appointed by Treasury order. (Public Service Pension Act 2013: 27) (cf. *shall come into*)

- b) Replacement of *shall/shall not* by *must/must not* in provisions prescribing *obligation/prohibition*.

²² Williams, Christopher. Changes in the verb phrase in legislative language in English. *The Verb Phrase in English: Investigating Recent Language Change with Corpora*. 353-371, 2013.

- (5) The Mayor of London **must consult** the local planning authority before exercising any function under this section. (Growth and Infrastructure Act 2013: 10 (cf. *shall consult*)
- (6) A report under subsection (4) **must be published**. (Public Service Pension Act 2013: 12) (cf. *shall be published*)
- c) Replacement of *shall/shall not* by *may/may not* in provisions prescribing *obligation (discretionary power)/prohibitions*.
- (7) The Secretary of State, with the approval of the Treasury, **may** by regulations **specify** conditions which must be met by a relevant programme before it may be certified as a British programme. (Finance Act 2013: 126) (cf. *shall specify*)
- (8) Where an order has been made under section 2, the UK Green Investment Bank **may not make** any alteration to the objects in its articles of association unless -
- (a) the alteration is made to give effect to an order of a court or other authority having power to alter the Bank's articles of association, or
- (b) the making of the alteration has been approved by the Secretary of State by order under this section. (Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Act 2013: 2) (cf. *shall not make*)
- d) Replacement of *shall* by *is/are to be* formula in *declaratory provisions (provisions prescribing the creation of a statutory body, office; provisions relating to statutory instruments)*
- (9) There **is to be** a body corporate known as the Competition and Markets Authority. (Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Act 2013: 19) (cf. *shall be*)
- (10) The reference in subsection (1) to a major interest in land **is to be read** in accordance with section 117 of FA 2003. (Finance Act 2013: 95) (cf. *shall be read*)

CONCLUSION

In summary, the *shall*-reform can be defined as the most fascinating transformation of legal English due to the fact that it has made the most glorious word of authority²³ start vanishing from legal texts, thereby proving not only that legal language can be made more comprehensible, but also that a new tradition of legal writing can be created. Such a transformation has shed light on some important observations as to the nature of legal language and the

²³ G.S., Thornton, *Legislative Drafting* (4th Ed.). West Sussex: Tottel Publishing, 1996.

reform thereof. In short, legal language is not incomprehensible because of the language itself. Its incomprehensibility is the result of the legal professions' resistance to change, which is usually justified by tradition. In addition, compared to other specialised registers, legal language seems to be the most "sensible" one since it is created by legal experts, but, on the other hand, it is addressed to the public. This observation suggests that despite being prescriptive in its nature, legal language is at the same time dialogical, functioning as a communication channel between the legislator and the public. From this standpoint it is quite clear that the reform starts by a "communication breakdown", i.e. lack of understanding which is usually experienced by those who are not legal experts.

However, no reform comes into being until the communication breakdown is clearly signalled by those who are affected by it. Furthermore, the *shall*-reform has also pointed out that a successful reform of legal language is, by definition, a slow process since it is aimed at changing tradition, which is a "habit" created over a long time period of time. Moreover, it is at the same time a painful process being initiated by those seeking the reform, who must be persistent in both presenting their arguments and searching for alternatives to get the attention of law-makers. In other words, the reform starts once both sides (legal drafters and public) realise that legal language is not the privilege of either, but belongs to both sides, whose cooperation should result in producing a language that is readable and understandable by all.

To sum up, although there is no doubt that there is plenty of room for further improvements in the sphere of legal English, the establishment of the Plain English movement, as well as a successful reform of *shall*, clearly highlights that the traditional approach has started changing, thus also announcing a new dimension of legal drafting practice which is no longer exclusive but inclusive-oriented, being also shaped by the voice of common people.

REFERENCES

Books

1. Asprey, Michelle. *Plain Language for Lawyers*. Annandale, NSW: The Federation Press, 2003.
2. Butt, Peter and Castle, Richard. *Modern Legal Drafting: A Guide to Using Clearer Language*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2001.
3. Cutts, Martin. *The Plain English Guide*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1999.

4. Cutts, Martin. *Lucid Law*. (2nd Ed.). Plain Language Commission, 2000.
5. Garner, Bryan. *A Dictionary of Modern Legal Usage* (2nd Ed.). Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1995.
6. G.S., Thornton, *Legislative Drafting* (4th Ed.). West Sussex: Tottel Publishing, 1996.
7. Tiersma, M. Peter. *Legal Language*. Chicago: Chicago University Press, 1999.
8. V.C.R.A.C. Crabbe, *Legislative Drafting*. London: Cavendish Publishing Limited, 1993.

Articles, Reports and Conference Proceedings

1. Asprey, M. Michele. Shall Must Go. *Scribes Journal of Legal Writing* 3: 61-79, 1992.
2. Cutts, Martin. Unspeakable Acts Revised. *Information Design Journal* 9, 1: 39-43, 1998.
3. Hunt, Brian. Plain Language in Legislative Drafting: Is It Really the Answer? *Statute Law Review*, Volume 23, No.1: 24-26, 2002.
4. Kimble, Joseph. The Many Misuses of *Shall*. *The Scribes Journal of Legal Writing* 3: 61-64, 1992.
5. Kimble, Joseph. Answering the Critics of Plain Language. *The Scribes Journal of Legal Writing* 5: 51-85, 1994-1995.
6. Sullivan, Ruth. The Promise of Plain Language Drafting. *McGill Law Journal*: 97-128, 2001.
7. *Shall*. Drafting Technique Group Paper 19. UK: Office of the Parliamentary Council, 2008.
8. Tanner, George. Imperatives in drafting legislation: a brief New Zealand perspective. *Clarity* 52: 7-11, 2004.
9. Williams, Christopher. Legal English and Plain Language: An Update. *ESP Across Culture* 8: 139-151, 2011.
10. Williams, Christopher. Legal English and the 'modal revolution'. *Proceedings of the Second International Conference on Modality in English*: 199-210, 2009.

11. Williams, Christopher. Changes in the verb phrase in legislative language in English. *The Verb Phrase in English: Investigating Recent Verb Change with Corpora*: 353-371, 2013.

Internet Sources

1. Plain English Manual. Australian Government: Office of Parliamentary Counsel, 1993. At https://www.opc.gov.au/about/docs/Plain_English.pdf (accessed 16 September 2013).
2. Drafting Manual. New Zealand Government: Parliamentary Counsel Office, 2009. At <http://www.pco.parliament.govt.nz/assets/Uploads/pdf/clear-drafting.pdf> (accessed 24 September 2013).
3. An Official Home of UK Legislation. 2013. At www.legislation.gov.uk (accessed 3 August 2013).
4. Plain English Campaign. About Us. 2013. At <http://www.plainenglish.co.uk/about-us.html> (accessed 23 September 2013).
5. UK Enterprise and Regulatory Reform Act. 2013. At http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2013/24/pdfs/ukpga_20130024_en.pdf (accessed 3 August 2013).
6. UK Finance Act. 2013. At http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2013/29/pdfs/ukpga_20130029_en.pdf (accessed 3 August 2013).
7. UK Growth and Infrastructure Act. 2013. At http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2013/27/pdfs/ukpga_20130027_en.pdf (accessed 3 August 2013).
8. UK Public Service Pension Act. 2013. At http://www.legislation.gov.uk/ukpga/2013/25/pdfs/ukpga_20130025_en.pdf (accessed 3 August 2013).
9. UK Tax Law Rewrite Project. HM Revenue & Customs. 2013. At <http://www.hmrc.gov.uk/rewrite/> (accessed 8 August 2013).
10. Drafting Guidance. UK: Office of the Parliamentary Counsel, 2011. At <http://www.transblawg.eu/index.php?archives/4118-Should-or-must-recommendations-for-UK-parliament.html> (accessed 6 August 2013).
11. Plain Language and Legislation. UK: The Scottish Government, 2006. At <http://www.scotland.gov.uk/Resource/Doc/93488/0022476.pdf> (accessed 20 September 2013).

O REFORMI MODALA *SHALL* U PRAVNOM ENGLESKOM

Rezime

Kao što je poznato, modalni glagol *shall* smatra se “zaštitnim znakom” pravnog engleskog koji je u upotrebi u ovom registru stoljećima. Međutim, tokom proteklih trideset godina upotreba ovog modalnog glagola znatno je reducirana što je dovelo do kreiranja tzv. *shall-free* verzije pravnog engleskog. Ovaj rad daje pregled najznačajnijih činjenica koje su obilježile proces reforme modala *shall*, fokusirajući se pri tom na *shall-free* preporuke koje se danas smatraju uvaženim standardom u postupku izrade britanskih pravnih propisa.

Ključne riječi: *shall*, pravni engleski, *shall-free*, preporuke

Merima Osmankadić

THE STRATEGY OF NEGATIVE OTHER-PRESENTATION IN POLITICAL DISCOURSE

Abstract: The aim of this paper is to analyse covertly negative lexical items, such as expressions of failure, avoidance, omission, prevention, prohibition, denial, counter-expectation, etc. as a means of achieving the overall strategy of positive self-presentation and negative other-presentation in political discourse, as described by van Dijk (2006). The methodology used in this research is qualitative corpus analysis. The data consist of 20 reports sent by the High Representative in Bosnia-Herzegovina to the Secretary General of the United Nations in the period from March 1996 to September 2001. These documents have been analysed as part of a wider extra-linguistic context set in the post-Dayton Bosnia and Herzegovina. The results obtained in this study show that covertly negative lexical items can, because of their capacity to trigger entailments or implicatures involving the negation of the subordinate clause or of the lexical item itself (in case of lexical items such as *fail, forget, lack*, etc.), be effectively used as a means of achieving the strategy of negative other-presentation for the purpose of manipulating the addressee.

Key words: covertly negative lexical items, strategy of negative other-presentation, manipulation, political discourse, entailment, implicature

INTRODUCTION

This paper takes as its starting point two assumptions: the first assumption is that negation, and in particular implicit negation, has enormous pragmatic potential in natural language in terms of the various functions it can perform in discourse in general, and the second assumption is that because of that potential, negation can be used in political discourse as a means of achieving

the strategy of negative other-presentation, as van Dijk (1992, 2006) describes it.¹

Negation in English can be explicit and implicit. In explicit negation, the negative marker *not* or some other overt negative device is used (*no, nothing, never, none, nowhere, nobody, no one, neither, nor*, negative affixes), alongside with adverbs that are negative in meaning but not in form (*barely, hardly, scarcely; rarely, seldom*), and quantifiers (*few, little*). The latter are called approximate negators by Huddleston and Pullum (2002) because they denote imprecise quantification, which is close to zero or approximate to zero in contrast to absolute negators (*never, no*, etc.) and verbal negation expressed by *not*, which denote the zero point (Huddleston and Pullum 2002: 815-816).² Implicit negation includes covertly negative lexical items that trigger entailments or implicatures involving negation of the subordinate clause (*avoid, fail, forget, lack; ban, hinder, prevent; deny, reject; doubt, be sceptical; amaze, shock, surprise; absurd, ridiculous*); downward entailing quantified NPs (e.g. *few of the bees, at most ten students*); prepositions *against, before, without*; adverb *only*; degree adverb *too*; comparative and superlative constructions; overt and covert conditionals (Huddleston and Pullum 2002: 835-838).

This paper focuses only on covertly negative lexical items and their function in political discourse. Huddleston and Pullum (2002) classify these items as follows: expressions of failure, avoidance, and omission (e.g. *fail, forget, avoid, decline, omit, neglect, refrain*), expressions of prevention and prohibition (*ban, block, hinder, keep, obstacle, obstruct, prevent, prohibit, restrict, stop*), expressions of denial (*deny, refuse, reject*), expressions of doubt (*doubt, doubtful, scepticism*), expressions of counter-expectation (*amaze, astonish, astound, bowl over, flabbergast, shock, surprise*), and expressions of unfavourable evaluation (*absurd, excessive, foolish, monstrous, ridiculous, silly, stupid, unacceptable, unwise*) (Huddleston and Pullum 2002: 835-837).

¹ Giora (2006) mentions a number of discourse roles or functions of negation. Apart from the denial of propositions asserted in the text and denial of presuppositions, beliefs, and expectations, there are also rejection, implicating the opposite of what is said, eliminating concepts within the scope of negation so that their accessibility is reduced, producing metalinguistic negation, effecting mitigation rather than elimination of concepts, intensifying, suggesting comparisons, etc. (Giora 2006: 982). Tottie (1991) mentions, besides denial, refusal and rejection, also the use of negatives as supports in conversation, use of negatives in direct questions to express speaker's opinion, self-correction or repair as causes for repetition, repetition for emphasis, etc. (Tottie 1991: 35-36).

² *Barely, hardly, few, little*, etc. are called approximate negatives by Jespersen (1917) as well.

THEORETICAL BACKGROUND

The present analysis takes an interdisciplinary approach towards data, i.e. it combines semantic and pragmatic insights into the phenomenon of negation with the results obtained in the field of critical discourse analysis (CDA).³ Van Dijk (2008) claims that discourse analysis (and, by analogy, critical discourse analysis) is not a method itself but a field of scholarly practice, a cross-discipline distributed over all the humanities and social sciences (van Dijk 2008: 2). The theoretical model that has been used in the analysis of political discourse illustrated by the reports of the High Representative in Bosnia and Herzegovina is van Dijk's model of the analysis of manipulative discourse as presented in van Dijk (2006).⁴ This model takes into account social, cognitive and discourse aspects of manipulation. At the social level, manipulative discourse is present in those situations when the writer or speaker has power, most notably political power, i.e. when he or she has access to the mass media and public discourse, when he or she belongs to the social elites (powerful groups or institutions), and when such discourse is in the interest of powerful groups and individuals and against the interest of the majority of people who do not possess any political power.

Manipulative discourse has to be analysed from the cognitive point of view as well, since manipulating people involves manipulating their minds, i.e. their beliefs, such as the knowledge, opinions, and ideologies (van Dijk 2006: 365). Manipulation occurs at three levels of cognition: short term memory, episodic memory, and social cognition. Discourse in general involves processing information in short term memory at the linguistic level (i.e. at phonetic, phonological, morphological, syntactic and lexical levels), and each of these processes may be influenced by different means. Thus, slower pronunciation, less complex syntax, the use of basic lexical items, a clear topic on a subject that recipients know well will tend to favour understanding, whereas faster pronunciation, more complex sentences, the use of more elaborate lexical items, a confused topic on a subject that is less familiar to recipients will

³ In particular, CDA focuses on those properties of discourse that are most typically associated with the expression, confirmation, reproduction or challenge of the social power of the speaker(s) or writer(s) as members of dominant groups (van Dijk 2008: 5).

⁴ De Saussure (2005) proposes the following working definition for manipulative discourse: "A manipulative discourse is a discourse produced in order to persuade the addressee of a set of propositions $P_1 . . . P_n$ of type T with appropriate strategies S ." (de Saussure 2005: 120) He argues that when a proposition P is conveyed by a manipulative discourse, either P is false, or half-true, or a relevant implicature the addressee infers from P or the context is false (de Saussure 2005: 121).

generally hamper understanding (van Dijk 2006: 366). However, understanding is not merely associating meanings to words, sentences, and discourses, but constructing mental models in episodic memory, including our own personal opinions and emotions in connection with an event we hear or read about. Van Dijk claims that it is the mental model that is the basis of our future memories, as well as the basis of further learning, such as the acquisition of experience-based knowledge, attitudes and ideologies (van Dijk 2006: 367). Manipulation may be thus especially targeted at the formation, activation, and uses of mental models in episodic memory. If manipulators want recipients to understand a discourse as *they* (i.e. the manipulators) see it, it is crucial that the recipients form the mental models the manipulators want them to form, thus restricting their freedom of interpretation. The fundamental discourse strategies that are used in this kind of manipulation are those that discursively emphasize those properties of models that are consistent with our interests (e.g. details of our good deeds, and details of their bad deeds), and discursively de-emphasize those properties that are inconsistent with our interests (e.g. details of our bad deeds, and those of their good deeds). These strategies are an integral part of the overall strategy of positive self-presentation and negative other-presentation.

The most influential form of manipulation is the manipulation of social cognition, which is an aspect of long term memory. This form of manipulation focuses on more general and abstract beliefs such as knowledge, attitudes and ideologies. These general beliefs are more permanent than mental models, and they do not change easily once they have been implanted into our minds. They are sometimes called social representations (van Dijk 2006: 369). Social representations are essential for interaction and discourse, and this is why manipulation will generally focus on social cognition, and hence on groups of people, rather than on individuals and their unique mental models. One of the discourse strategies that is generally used to influence socially shared beliefs is generalisation. In the case of generalisation, one concrete specific example that has made an impact on people's mental models is generalised to more general knowledge or attitudes, even ideologies (van Dijk 2006: 370).

In principle, the "same" discourse (or discourse fragment) may be manipulative in one situation, but not in another situation. So, discourse structures as such are not manipulative, they only have such functions or effects in specific communicative situations and the way in which these are interpreted by participants in their context models (van Dijk 2006: 372). The manipulative meaning of text and talk depends on the context models of the recipients. Manipulative discourse typically occurs in public communication controlled by dominant political, bureaucratic, media, academic or corporate elites. In this sense, we can say that covertly negative lexical items are not manipulative *per*

se, but entailments and generalized conversational implicatures that they trigger, and which are negative, contribute to their being used as a means of presenting others as negative.

DATA AND METHODOLOGY

The corpus on which the present analysis has been made consists of twenty reports (187,926 words) that the High Representative in Bosnia-Herzegovina sent to the Secretary-General of the United Nations in the period between 14 March 1996 and 13 September 2001. The global context in which this discourse is situated is the post-Dayton Bosnia-Herzegovina in which, at least for the period immediately after the war in Bosnia-Herzegovina, the High Representative, according to the UN Resolution from 15 December 1995, has been “the final authority in theatre regarding interpretation of Annex 10 on the civilian implementation of the Peace Agreement”, and the person who has enjoyed “such legal capacity as may be necessary for the exercise of his functions, including the capacity to contract and to acquire and dispose of real and personal property” (UN Resolution S/RES/1031, 1995, para. 27-28). The reports he sends to the Secretary-General of the United Nations, and as of 2002 to the European Parliament (as an EU Special Representative for Bosnia-Herzegovina), belong to the institutional genre, except that they are accessible to the general public on the OHR web page (www.ohr.int), unlike many other types of institutional genre, e.g. different contracts, government documents, international treaties, etc.⁵ Also, these reports can be said to be part of political discourse, although the real addressee is not the public in general, as is usually the case with political discourse, but the Secretary-General of the United Nations and the European Parliament. In sending the reports and thus describing the situation in Bosnia-Herzegovina, the High Representative is creating a mental model or a representation of the reality for his superiors, upon which they make their decisions regarding Bosnia-Herzegovina. According to Chilton (2004), political discourse involves, among other things, the promotion of representations. It involves the use of language oriented to the communication of conceptualisations of “the world”. People communicate

⁵ “Genres are conventionalized discursive actions, in which participating individuals or institutions have shared perceptions of communicative purposes as well as those of constraints operating on their construction, interpretation and conditions of use. In this sense, genres are socially constructed, interpreted and used in specific academic, social, institutional and professional contexts, and have their own individual identity.” (Bhatia 2004: 87).

among themselves partly in order to coordinate their world conceptions (Chilton 2004: 201).

The local context of the reports that the High Representative sends to his superiors looks like this: its overall domain is politics, its overall action is reporting about the High Representative's work and the work of his Office in Bosnia-Herzegovina during a certain period of time, and its immediate participants are the High Representative and the Secretary-General of the United Nations, while indirect participants are other members of the International Community in Bosnia-Herzegovina, politicians and political parties in Bosnia-Herzegovina, and, of course, its citizens. The High Representatives in the said period were Carl Bildt (1996-1997), a Swedish diplomat, Carlos Westendorp (1997-1999), a Spanish diplomat, and Wolfgang Petritsch (1999-2002), an Austrian UN representative and diplomat.⁶

All the High Representative's reports have identical wording in their title, except for the number of the report and the period of time which the report covers, as illustrated below:

11th Report of the High Representative for Implementation of the Peace Agreement to the Secretary-General of the United Nations

Pursuant to Security Council Resolution 1031 of 15 December 1995, which requested the Secretary General to submit reports from the High Representative in accordance with Annex 10 of the Peace Agreement and the Conclusions of the London Peace Implementation Conference of 8-9 December 1995, I herewith present the eleventh report to the Council

The Report covers the activities of the Office of the High Representative and developments in the areas listed below during the period from the beginning of July 1998 to the end of September 1998.

As Bilbija (2005) says, the presence of this preamble is very important because it marks the entire body of text as legitimised discourse (Bilbija 2005: 53). As far as the format of the reports is concerned, it changed slightly during the said period of time, but in general the reports contain sections on the developments in different areas, such as law, return of displaced persons and refugees, elections, media, human rights, mine clearance, etc. in both the Federation and Republika Srpska, as well as in Brčko District.

⁶ See also Majstorović (2007) for an overview of the High Representative's discourse in Bosnia-Herzegovina.

The methodology that has been used in this study is qualitative analysis of data.⁷ All 20 reports were downloaded from the OHR's web site www.ohr.int, they were carefully read, and all the examples that contain covertly negative lexical items were excerpted, alongside with the neighbouring text, classified, and then analysed in detail, taking into account linguistic, i.e. textual context, as well as social or situational context as has been described above. The main goal of such analysis is not the analysis of the contents of the chosen corpus as an objective in itself, but, as Partington (2003) says, as an instrument for studying what participants in discourse do under certain circumstances (Partington 2003: 4-5).

DATA ANALYSIS AND RESULTS

In interaction, people try to act, and hence to speak, in such a way that their interlocutors construct an impression of them that is as positive as possible, or at least speakers try to avoid a negative impression (van Dijk 1992: 90). This claim is in accordance with the politeness theory developed by Brown and Levinson (1987), and the concepts of positive and negative face of both the speaker or writer and the addressee. Generally, in any kind of communication, people try to create an image of themselves that will be appreciated and approved of by others (positive face), and on the other hand to preserve their freedom of action and freedom from imposition, i.e. they want that their actions be unimpeded by others (negative face) (Brown and Levinson 1987: 61-62). It seems that in order to present oneself as positively as possible by using different strategies, one needs to present the others as negatively as possible. When compared to the negative actions of the others, one's own positive face will appear even more appealing.

The reports analysed belong to written discourse. Written discourse, and in particular these reports, is explicitly planned, and therefore better controlled on the part of the writer. Written discourse is in most cases public, and this may imply that in texts, meaning and intentions of the writer may need to be expressed in more indirect, veiled and formalised ways, and covertly negative lexical items offer ample opportunities to do that.

In the data that are analysed in this paper, covertly negative lexical items are used to implicitly present others in the negative light, and simultaneously to

⁷ For a detailed account of the use of qualitative corpus analysis in discourse analysis see Lee (2008). Other authors that have extensively dealt with the use of corpora in discourse analysis are Hardt-Mautner (1995), Partington (2003), and Biber (2008), among others.

present the writer (the High Representative) in the positive light. We shall start with the expressions of *failure*, *avoidance*, and *omission*. The most frequent of these expressions that are used in the analysed data are *fail*, and its nominalization *failure*. Other expressions from this group, such as *avoid*, *lack*, and *omit*, are not frequent in this corpus and generally do not contribute significantly to the negative other-presentation. The following examples illustrate how the expressions *failure* and *fail* contribute to creating a negative image of others:

- (1) 69. Human Rights Institutions: I remain extremely concerned by the continued *failure* of the authorities in Bosnia and Herzegovina to ensure that the decisions and recommendations of Human Rights Chamber and the Human Rights Ombudsperson are implemented. This particularly applies to property-related cases involving apartments purchased by former members of the Yugoslav National Army (JNA); continued *failure* to comply with these decisions will have negative implications for Bosnia and Herzegovina's accession into the Council of Europe. Some progress has been seen in other areas, however, including an investigation into the persons responsible for the shooting death and injuries in Mostar on 10 February 1997, pursuant to recommendations by the Office of the Ombudsperson. Further, the reporting period has seen greater co-operation between the government agents to the Human Rights Institutions and those institutions. (Carlos Westendorp, 13th Report, 7 May 1999)
- (2) 1. State institutions, with the notable exception of the Council of Ministers, continued to meet regularly but *failed* to take significant decisions or adopt legislation at a satisfactory pace. The years since the signing of the Dayton-Paris Accords have largely *failed* to overcome the ruling political parties' opposing visions of the State. Delayed contributions by the Entities, who finance almost entirely the State budget, also undermine the functioning of the state institutions. (Wolfgang Petritsch, 16th Report, 3 May 2000)

In (1) the two italicised instances of the noun *failure* have the following negative entailments: "The authorities in Bosnia and Herzegovina *did not ensure* that the decisions and recommendations of Human Rights Chamber and the Human Rights Ombudsperson are implemented."; "The fact that they *did not comply* with these decisions will have negative implications for Bosnia and Herzegovina's accession into the Council of Europe." The negative entailments of the two instances of the verb *fail* in (2) are the following: "State institutions, with the notable exception of the Council of Ministers, continued to meet regularly but *did not take* significant decisions or *adopt* legislation at a

satisfactory pace.”; “The years since the signing of the Dayton-Paris Accords *have not overcome* the ruling political parties’ opposing visions of the State.” Due to the negative entailment, these expressions implicitly convey negation and thus contribute to our perceiving of local institutions and authorities as negative and incompetent.

The expressions of *prevention* and *prohibition* (e.g. *ban, hinder, keep, prevent, prohibit, stop, block, obstruct, impede*) are by far the most frequent covertly negative items in the corpus. We can illustrate their use with the following examples:

- (3) 81. Border Service: My Office drafted a working copy of the Law on State Border Service and submitted it to the German Interior Ministry for independent review. In February, My Office presented the State Border Service project to the PIC Steering Board and to a pre-donor’s conference in Brussels. My Office and UNMIBH continued with technical preparations for the Border Service project and developed training curricula, organization charts, and deployment schedules for the yet-to-be created force. Serb *blockade* of the Common Institutions in early March *halted* progress on the political front. (Carlos Westendorp, 13th Report, 7 May 1999)
- (4) 49. Following the arbitration of my Office on the establishment of the new municipality of Usora, the Law on Split and New Municipalities was adopted by the Parliamentary Assembly in January. The adoption of this law had been *blocked* for nearly a year and was a cause of serious disputes between the Party of Democratic Action (SDA) and the Croatian Democratic Union (HDZ) which *hindered* progress on other important issues. (Carlos Westendorp, 9th Report, 9 April 1998)

In (3) we see how the strategy of negative other-presentation is achieved first by presenting the High Representative’s good deeds, which are placed first in the paragraph, and then by the expressions of prevention *blockade* and *halt* in the second part of the paragraph. These expressions entail that there was *no progress* on the political front in spite of all those good things that the High Representative did. In (4) the expression *blocked* entails that the law on split and new municipalities *had not been adopted* for almost a year, and that it was finally adopted due to the arbitration of the OHR (positive self-presentation). The expression *hindered* entails that there was *no progress* on other important issues either, which are not specified. All these expressions are used to present the other in a very negative light.

The expressions of *denial* are also present in the corpus, albeit to a lesser degree than those of *prevention* and *prohibition* and those of *failure* and

avoidance. The following examples illustrate the use of these expressions for the purpose of negative other-presentation:

- (5) 68. The failure by the responsible authorities, particularly of the Republika Srpska, to cooperate with ICTY, has continued unabated. The authorities of Republika Srpska *have refused* to arrest persons indicted by the Tribunal, relying on a provision of their legislation which is clearly superseded by the Constitution of Bosnia and Herzegovina and other Annexes of the Peace Agreement. At the same time, with disregard for their legal obligations, Bosnian Croat authorities have failed to arrest the numerous indicted persons who reside in or visit areas of the Federation previously under the control of the HVO. (Carl Bildt, 4th Report, 10 December 1996)
- (6) 4. The situation in the Federation remained difficult. There was instability in Drvar, causing OHR and OSCE to decertify the municipal election; and Mostar remains in serious deadlock. There are difficulties in education, with minorities *being denied* their schooling rights, although there has been some success in developing a co-ordinated curriculum, and in removing objectionable material from textbooks. (Wolfgang Petritsch, 15th Report, 1 January 1999)

In (5) the expression *have refused* entails that they *did not arrest* persons indicted by the Tribunal, which is a very negative thing. In (6), *being denied* entails that minorities *do not have* their schooling rights due to the local authorities who do not grant these rights to them.

There is only one example of the expressions of *doubt* that contributes to the negative other-presentation:

- (7) ANTI-CORRUPTION 36 Following the Hercegovacka Bank operation on 6 April and the criminal acts committed against the personnel assisting the PA, the Federation authorities started an investigation, with the cooperation of the IC. On 26 April I decided to transfer jurisdiction for the investigation and prosecution of offences to the Cantonal Court of Sarajevo, because of the well-grounded suspicions of local police involvement in the organized rioting and the *doubts* about the local prosecutors and judges' ability to act impartially in an environment of pressure and intimidation. (Wolfgang Petritsch, 19th Report, 18 July 2001)

The expression *doubts* implicates that local prosecutors and judges *are not able* to act impartially in an environment of pressure and intimidation.

The expressions of *unfavourable evaluation* (*absurd, excessive, foolish, monstrous, ridiculous, silly, stupid, unacceptable, unwise*) are represented by

only one example in the corpus, probably because they are rather informal, and the High Representative's reports use the formal style of expression. The expression that has been found is *naïve*, as can be seen in the following example:

- (8) 86. In spite of all the obvious problems that we have to deal with, I remain convinced that the goals of the Peace Agreement can be achieved. It would however be *naïve* to believe that this can be done fully in just one short year, and that it will happen without an active involvement by the international community over time. (Carl Bildt, 2nd Report, 10 July 1996)

The clause in which the expression *naïve* appears has the following implicature: “We *should not believe* that the Peace Agreement can be achieved in just one short year, and that it will happen without an active involvement by the international community over time”. In this case, the negative implicature has the function of justifying the presence of the International Community in Bosnia-Herzegovina and presenting it as an indispensable factor in implementing the Dayton Peace Agreement in this country. In this way, the local government and politicians, as well as Bosnian-Herzegovinian citizens in general, are presented as incompetent of achieving sustainable peace and normal life conditions in their own country.

As far as the expressions of *counter-expectation* (*amaze, astonish, astound, bowl over, flabbergast, shock, surprise*) are concerned, we have not found any instances of such expressions in the analysed corpus.

If we now apply van Dijk's model of manipulative discourse to the data analysed, we can see that the discourse of the High Representative in Bosnia-Herzegovina as presented in his reports satisfies certain requirements of such discourse. The High Representative can be said to have substantial power – his power has been defined by the above-mentioned paragraphs 27 and 28 of UN Resolution from 15 December 1995, and further reinforced by giving the High Representative special powers by the Bonn Declaration adopted at the Peace Implementation Conference held in Bonn on 9 and 10 December 1997. The Bonn powers give the High Representative the legal right to impose laws in Bosnia-Herzegovina, to make decisions related to the implementation of laws, to introduce new national symbols such as the new currency, anthem, flag, coat of arms, and passports for all the citizens in the country, and to remove politicians and other high-ranking officials from their positions. The High Representative is also the head of the Office of the High Representative, which was formed by the United Nations. The High Representative has unrestricted access to the mass media (newspapers, magazines, television, radio, Internet) – he gives interviews, writes articles in leading local and international

newspapers and magazines (for a period of time, he even wrote a diary for a daily in Sarajevo, *Dnevni Avaz*), calls press conferences and issues press releases, gives speeches, etc. Not only does the High Representative have unrestricted access to the mass media, he also has control over some of them – through his intervention, many broadcasting public services in the country were reformed, new management boards were set up; he created the Communications Regulatory Agency, which issues broadcasting licenses conditional on the adherence to journalistic and technical standards; he even established a television network called The Open Broadcast Network (OBN) and a radio station FERN.

At the cognitive level of manipulative discourse, the High Representative can affect the episodic memory of his recipients by imposing his mental models of reality. The mental and context model of Bosnia and Herzegovina that he tries to impose on his recipients is the following: the presence of the International Community in Bosnia-Herzegovina is crucial lest this country should lapse back into another war or disintegrate; the High Representative does his best to improve the situation in Bosnia-Herzegovina, to introduce national symbols, to create state institutions, to return refugees and displaced persons to their pre-war homes, to demine the country, to exhume mass graves; local politicians and officials obstruct his efforts, and the peace implementation and progress of the country in general; Bosnian citizens are represented as passive bystanders; there is notorious lack of funding for implementing the Dayton Peace Agreement on the one hand, and billions of dollars invested into that same implementation on the other hand. The manipulation of mental models that is being conducted through the High Representative's reports does not have as its objective domination over the recipient, but recipient's approval of the further presence of the OHR in Bosnia-Herzegovina and the funding for the implementation of the Dayton Peace Agreement. The discourse strategy that has been used to achieve such manipulation is the overall strategy of positive self-presentation (OHR and the High Representative himself) and negative other-presentation (Bosnian and Herzegovinian politicians and officials). Covertly negative lexical items prove to be very efficient means for achieving this strategy because they allow the writer to implicate rather than assert the positive characteristics of himself and negative characteristics of the other, thus enabling him to create certain mental models without having to commit himself to telling the truth by using direct assertions. The High Representative tries to create such a mental model that will present the situation in Bosnia-Herzegovina as negative as it is necessary for the International Community to justify its role in it, and just as positive as to justify the money spent in the implementation of the Dayton Peace Agreement.

CONCLUSION

In conclusion, we can say that covertly negative lexical items can contribute to the negative other-presentation in political discourse, partly because of their ability to trigger negative entailments and implicatures, and partly because of the way they are positioned in discourse together with other strategies used to present others in a negative way, e.g. macro speech act implying our “good” acts and their “bad” acts, semantic macrostructures which include topic selection: (de-)emphasize negative/positive topics about us/them, lexicon: select positive words for us, negative words for them, etc. (van Dijk 2006: 373).

REFERENCES

1. Bhatia, V. K. *Worlds of written discourse: A genre-based view*. London and New York: Continuum, 2004.
2. Biber, D. Corpus-based analysis of discourse: dimensions of variation in conversation. In V. K. Bhatia, J. Flowerdew, and R. H. Jones (eds.), *Advances in discourse studies* (pp. 100-114). London and New York: Routledge, 2008.
3. Bilbija, S. Linguistic and pragmatic properties of the discourse of the High Representative in the Republic of Bosnia and Herzegovina. In L. E. Breivik and O. Øverland (eds.), *The power of language: A collection of essays* (pp. 53-63). Oslo: Novus Press, 2005.
4. Brown, P., and S. C. Levinson. *Politeness: Some universals in language usage*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1987.
5. Chilton, P. *Analysing political discourse: Theory and practice*. London and New York: Routledge, 2004.
6. van Dijk, T. A. Discourse and the denial of racism, *Discourse & Society*, 3 (1), 87-118, 1992.
7. van Dijk, T. A. Discourse and manipulation. *Discourse & Society*, 17 (2), 359-383, 2006.
8. van Dijk, T. A. *Discourse and Power*. Basingstoke and New York: Palgrave Macmillan, 2008.
9. Giora, R. Anything negatives can do affirmatives can do just as well, except for some metaphors. *Journal of Pragmatics*, 38, 981-1014, 2006.

10. Hardt-Mautner, G. 'Only Connect': Critical discourse analysis and corpus linguistics. *UCREL Technical Paper*, 6, 1995. http://ucrel.lancs.ac.uk/tech_papers.html
11. Huddleston, R. and G. K. Pullum. *The Cambridge grammar of the English language*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
12. Jespersen, O. *Negation in English and other languages*. Copenhagen: A.F. Høst, 1917.
13. Lee, D. Y. W. Corpora and discourse analysis: New ways of doing old things. In V. K. Bhatia, J. Flowerdew, and R. H. Jones (eds.) *Advances in discourse studies* (pp. 86-98). London and New York: Routledge, 2008.
14. Majstorović, D. Construction of Europeanization in the High Representative's discourse in Bosnia and Herzegovina. *Discourse & Society*, 18 (5), 627-651, 2007.
15. Partington, A. *The linguistics of political argument: The spin-doctor and the wolf-pack at the White House*. London and New York: Routledge, 2003.
16. de Saussure, L. Manipulation and cognitive pragmatics: Preliminary hypotheses. In L. de Saussure, and P. Schulz (eds.) *Manipulation and ideologies in the twentieth century: Discourse, language, mind* (pp. 113-145). Amsterdam and Philadelphia: John Benjamins, 2005.
17. Tottie, G. *Negation in English speech and writing – A study in variation*. San Diego: Academic Press, 1991.

STRATEGIJA NEGATIVNOG PREDSTAVLJANJA DRUGOG U POLITIČKOM DISKURSU

Sažetak

Cilj ovoga rada jeste analiza inherentno negativnih leksičkih jedinica kao što su izrazi koji označavaju nečinjenje, izbjegavanje i propust, sprečavanje i zabranu, poricanje, suprotstavljanje očekivanju itd. kao sredstava za postizanje opće strategije predstavljanja sebe u pozitivnom svjetlu i drugog u negativnom

svjetlu u političkom diskursu. Model za analizu je preuzet iz van Dijkovog rada *Discourse and manipulation* koji je objavljen u časopisu *Discourse & Society* 17 (2), 2006. Metodologija koja je korištena u ovome radu bazira se na kvalitativnoj analizi korpusa. Korpus se sastoji od 20 izvještaja koje je Visoki predstavnik u Bosni i Hercegovini slao Generalnom sekretaru Ujedinjenih naroda u periodu od marta 1996. do septembra 2001. godine. Ovi dokumenti su u radu analizirani kao dio šireg izvan-lingvističkog konteksta smještenog u postdejtonskoj Bosni i Hercegovini. Rezultati dobiveni analizom jasno pokazuju da se inherentno negativne leksičke jedinice mogu vrlo efektivno koristiti kao sredstvo za postizanje opće strategije negativnog predstavljanja drugog u svrhu manipuliranja recipijenata. Inherentno negativne leksičke jedinice su naročito pogodne da se upotrijebe u ovakve svrhe upravo zbog svoje sposobnosti da funkcioniraju kao okidači za implikacije i implikature koje uključuju negaciju zavisne klauze ili same inherentno negativne leksičke jedinice (kao što su *fail, forget, lack*, itd.).

Ključne riječi: inherentno negativne leksičke jedinice, strategija negativnog predstavljanja drugog, manipulacija, politički diskurs, implikacija, implikatura

Amira Sadiković and Selma Đuliman

DIZDAR AND JONES: CONGRUENCE OF SOUND, SIGN AND MEANING

Abstract: The intertextual foundation of Dizdar's poetry reveals a rich and versatile pattern of cultural memory. Hence, any translation of his work presents a particular challenge – to identify and convey the literary tradition underlying his work. Dizdar's poetry has often been described as untranslatable, primarily due to the specificity of his language and poetic expression, strongly rooted in medieval Bosnian historiography. Selected examples of translation by Francis R. Jones show how unfounded this claim is. Jones' commitment to understanding all the layers of meaning of a poet as complex as Dizdar and his determination to use the translation process and the devices available in his own language, English, allowed him to create a superb piece of writing in its own right. The intensity of experience of time travel is one may say the same when reading the original and when reading Jones' superb work.

Key words: Mak Dizdar, Francis R. Jones, *Stone Sleeper*, poetry, translation

The intertextual foundation of Dizdar's poetry reveals a rich and versatile pattern of cultural memory (Dizdar, *Antologija starih bosanskih tekstova*, 1997). Hence, any translation of his work presents a particular challenge – to identify and convey the literary tradition underlying his work.

In his early work, Mak Dizdar can be said to be referring to the universal patterns of the European culture. Namely, in his poems "Plivačica" and "Povrtak" and particularly in the collection *Okrutnosti kruga* there is an evident Homeric cultural tradition resemanticized and resemioticized through his own articulation. In *Okrutnosti kruga*, the mythical aspect is deconstructed by the scepticism of the modern man and the existentialist experience of absurdity of human toil. While Homer positions Odysseus as an epic hero who reaches his goal by overcoming any temptation life may present, Dizdar positions Odysseus as a man condemned to travel through the absurdity of a

cruel life. The translator therefore must understand how Dizdar's resemantization of the Homeric world introduces a subversive dialogue. This dialogue unfolds through the confrontation of the traditional cultural code on one hand and the contemporary experience typical of European culture of mid-twentieth century on the other.

This is easily explained as the poetics of intertextuality best defined by Renate Lachmann who says that intertextuality demonstrates that culture is inscribed over and over as the culture of the book and the sign forever redefined through its own signs. Writing is, therefore, an act of memory and a new interpretation of culture (Lachmann, 2002: 209).

In 1966, Dizdar published his celebrated collection *The Stone Sleeper*, which quickly became the seminal work of poetry in contemporary Bosnian literature. He resorts to Bosnian medieval culture as his primary intertextual cultural repository. Any attempt to understand the genius of his work clearly requires an understanding of medieval Bosnian texts, primarily texts found on the tombstones (*stećak*). He himself later published a collection of those texts (o.c.) In washed-out carvings and messages left by unknown authors on tombstones across the country, Dizdar recognizes and inscribes a very direct existential experience of modern culture. Any reader and thus any translator identifies easily that this combination of fragments of epitaphs and medieval Bosnian documents, private and public, serves as the poet's vehicle for facilitating a dialogue between a contemporary and the past of his own culture.

The translator must then resort to adequate "cultural archives" and seek similar processes of entering a dialogue with the cultural past of the target language.

An important element of Dizdar's poetry is the versatility of rhythm and melody and the devices used to achieve them. This applies equally to poems that rely on the phonetic power of the verse to achieve rhythm and those where the dynamic syntax dictates the melody (i.e. poems where both meaning and rhythm are articulated through couplets.) This congruence of sound, sign and meaning is a particular element of Dizdar's poetry, but equally an important element of Jones' translation.

An example of how successful Francis R. Jones was in expressing rhythm and melody phonetically are "Kolo" ("Kolo"), "Dažd" ("Rain") ili "Zapis o vremenu" ("A Text about Time").

In the poem "Kolo", a South Slav round dance (Dizdar/Jones, 1999: 249), the original clearly presents the rhythm pattern of a round dance.

Dizdar's *kolo bola* is not played but rather walked in circles; silence is its background and its mythical basis. (Prohić, 1974: 97)

Although he opted for foreignization in a sense that he kept the word *kolo* in the translation (not finding an adequate equivalent in English), Jones achieves the same impression: that the poem is, in fact, the backdrop for the dance itself giving it rhythm, spinning in circles and suggesting the inevitable transience of life:

Ruka do ruke
luka do luke
Ruka u ruci
muka u mucu
Zemlja priteže
nebo visoko
O da sam ptica
da sam soko (Dizdar/Jones, 1999: 48)

In translation:

Hand in hand
bound in a bond
Hand on hand
salt on a wound
Earth pulls down heavy
heaven is high
Were I a falcon
then I would fly. (Dizdar/Jones, 1999: 49)

In “Zapis o vremenu” (“A Text about Time”), the rhythm and the melody are expressed as alliteration – the sound of the voiced dental plosive /d/ as the first sound in the word *davno* (*long ago*) – and the slow rhythm of the verse, pointing to a long period of time. The beginning of the poem is illustrative enough:

Davno sam ti legao
I dugo ti mi je
Ležati (Dizdar/Jones, 1999: 58)

Reading the original, one feels the need to take a pause before starting a new verse, resulting in the required slow rhythm. Jones’ translation uses the alliteration of /l/ in the verb *lie* (in all the forms required by the tense) and in the word *long* – which in this case is a time adverb. Thus, reading both the original and the translation, one has the same impression of the permanence of death and of time standing still at its very moment of occurrence. This makes Jones’ translation all the more successful:

Long have I lain here before thee
And after thee
Long shall I lie (Dizdar/Jones, 1999: 59)

In the original, Dizdar uses the personal pronoun *ti* (*you*) in order to invite the attention of the listener, using the language's expressive function (Katnić-Bakaršić, 1999: 2). Namely, the sleeper cries out to be heard. Jones' translation however, changes the direction of the message – as if speaking to a particular person standing in front of a tombstone and reading the epitaph. This can be said to soften the solitude of *the sleeper* in the original.

A more joyous rhythm permeates “Dažd” (“Rain”). An intimate interpretation of this poem allows the reader of the original, familiar with the culture and the history of Bosnia and Herzegovina to almost see an image of a necropolis of medieval tombstones, a collection of a dozen of them, with raindrops trickling down the ancient carvings. The verb *padati* at the beginning of the original creates a sense of tenderness of fine raindrops as they touch the white surface of the stone:

Trebalo bi opet naučiti
da slušamo kako dažd pada pada (Dizdar/Jones, 1999: 60)

As the rain intensifies, the alliteration manages to intensify the experience: as if the dead are awakened by the gentle touch of the rain wishing to embrace all that is living, to feel the sun and to see their own shadow. The nasal /m/ is repeated in the verse “zagrliti panične makove i mrave” (lit. to embrace the panicking poppies and ants); the voiceless fricative /s/ in “sa sjenkom svojom stasati”; the voiceless velar plosive /k/ creates the effect of footsteps of the dead “kroz kamenu kapiju ovog kamenog grada” (lit. through the stone gate of this city of stone) – all this builds an impression of a summer shower intensifying and brimming with life. The shower almost stops towards the end of the poem, felt through the repetition of the verb *padati* and after the peak of intensity, it decelerates, leading to a full stop – of the rain and the dead.

In his translation, Jones uses the rain and repeats it to achieve the same effect of the onset of the shower:

We need to learn again
to listen to the rain (Dizdar/Jones, 1999: 61)

and the liveliness transpires through the translation by means of alliteration of English plosives which not only reflect the intensity of the rain but also the footstep of the dead and their desire to rise again and re-enter the cycle they had ended long ago:

We need to caress the poppies and ants
panicking in this plenty of plants
We need to wash ourselves anew
And dream in clean drops of dawn dew
(Dizdar/Jones, 1999: 61)

Following the original, Jones ends the poem in tranquillity though using the noun rain as the element of repetition, and the alliteration of /r/ in the last verse slows down the rhythm. This is aided by the adjective *righteous* between the repetitions: “the rain the rain the righteous rain” marks the end of the rain and the “return” of the sleeper to the round.

This kind of “resurrection” of bringing back to life the static images and symbols found on the actual Bosnian medieval tombstones can be found in many of Dizdar’s poems: transformation of images to words is a particular feature of Dizdar’s poetry and his translator Jones not only understood the devices the poet used, but also found adequate responses to the challenge. That is why “Zapis o petorici” (“A Text about the Five”) deserves particular attention.

Četvorica jednog vode
Jednog gone četvorica

Četvorica mrka lica
Preko vode preko žica

I od ića i od pića
I od ruha i od kruha

Kroz živice kroz ižice
Od svobode do slobode (Dizdar/Jones, 1999: 128)

Translation:

Four men leading one man bound
One man whom the four men hound

Four men’s faces dour and dire
Over water over wire

On they scoff and on they through
Through each thread and through their bread

Through each hedge and through each Y
Until freedom untie (Dizdar/Jones, 1999: 129)

The first part of this poem alone brings together all the phonetic and phonological values of Dizdar's verse. Reading the original, one feels as if reading a carving on a tombstone. Compact language usually found in epitaphs, a storyline as if from an old manuscript. The lively alliteration (/r/ – *četvorica mrka lica*, /ž/ – *kroz živice, ižice ...*), allows Dizdar to build an atmosphere of war where man is prey and where a prisoner is being escorted. All that he is deprived of (*iće i piće* – food and beverage), the path he's taken on (*živice i ižice* – *hedgerows*) make the reader feel sorry for the prisoner – but the comfort is equally in the possibility of freedom or the possibility of death (*od svobode do slobode*).

In terms of lexical choices, the original puts archaic forms against their modern versions (*svoboda* – arh. *freedom/sloboda* – *freedom*; *živice* – *hedgerow/ižice* – arh. *hedgerow*). Here Dizdar again articulates the timeless value of the medieval Bosnian tombstones and the sleepers they once covered.

In translation, Jones reflects impeccably the atmosphere of the original: a manuscript telling the story of a man captured in battle and being escorted by enemy soldiers. The faces, which are *dour* and *dire*, the situation of a man bound allow the reader of the English translation to feel the same dreary atmosphere of the original. Naturally, the archaic lexical devices Dizdar used were not a viable option for translation equivalence. For example, *hiža* and *greb* were translated literally as home and tomb because no archaic words could have been used to maintain the semantic marking of the original. However, this in no way deprives the reader of feeling the hardship temporally located in medieval times.

In that sense, the prisoner's hope of freedom through life or death articulated through the confrontation of an archaic and a modern word for freedom is achieved in the couplet by the letter Y, easily understood as both the link with medieval Bosnia (the translator himself explains that the letter Y was a medieval clerical intervention to remove the silent /y/ from old Slavonic script to make the language of the Church more accessible to ordinary man) and the universal symbol of the mystery of human life.

In both the original and the translation, one prisoner counts *his four captors* – revenge is an option. Notwithstanding the fact that he is but one and outnumbered, the original clearly expresses a sense of fear in the captors, saying that *četiri se jednog boji* (lit. *four fears one*). This sense of heavenly justice is expressed even more clearly in the final verse of the poem, through the intensity of the verb *dread* expressing the same sense of balance between the fate of the one prisoner and the fate of the four captors, equally uncertain.

As indicated above, syntax is often the primary device for the rhythm of the poem. Such poems tend to be more narrative and a full sentence is incorporated into a full stanza – unlike previous examples where couplets are the primary device. In the poem “Putovi” (“Roads”), we see again the form of an epitaph. It describes the struggle between good and evil in form of a narrative, an address to a stranger passing by. The three stanzas of the poem have full syntactic cohesion in the original and the same cohesion is reflected in the translation. The second stanza in the original reads:

Ti si nakanio da me pod svaku cijenu uništiš
Ali nikako da nađeš
Istinski put
Do mene (Dizdar/Jones, 1999: 18)

In translation:

You've decided to root me out at any price
But nowhere will you find
The real road
To me (Dizdar/Jones, 1999: 19)

A clear link between Dizdar and the mainstream of the 20th century European poetry is evident in the poems with identifiable elements of lettristic poetry. Such is, for example, “Slovo o smijehu” (“A Word about Laughter”), with a seemingly lettristic concept – seemingly because the actual meaning of the poem is satire. In the original, the narrator is Mravac (a minstrel) who expresses his subversive attitudes towards authority and speaks about the meaning of humour. The actual story is based on a letter by a medieval Bosnian nobleman describing a visit by his minstrels to the neighbouring territory (Dizdar, 1997: 261).

A minstrel is, naturally, allowed to entertain by expressing what others must not utter – to disagree with authority but only through humour. In this particular case the minstrel uses *grijuh* (*sin*) and *smijeh* (*grin*) as the lettristic basis. The sarcasm is easy to recognize:

Al od grijeha čuj ti smijeha posta smijeh
Grijuh smijeha Smijeh grijeha (Dizdar/Jones, 1999: 166)

In translation:

If grinning's a sin it makes me grin
The sin of grinning the grin of sinning (Dizdar/Jones, 1999: 167)

The lexical choices in translation intensify the sarcasm, since English possesses a set of nouns and verbs to describe different types of laughter. In this case, *grin* is the most appropriate choice. However, the first verse contains a conditional expressing a balance: if not x, then y. This is in slight contrast with Dizdar's original, which uses a tense that denotes immediate past (*aorist*). The original ridicules a prohibition and although articulated differently, the translation essentially does the same thing.

Another interesting example is a couplet from the same poem:

Kad se smijah tim se grijah
Sve u svemu kad se smijah tad i bijah (Dizdar/Jones, 1999: 166)

In translation:

Well laughter was my life after all
I laughed a storm to keep myself warm (Dizdar/Jones, 1999: 167)

In this instance, Jones reversed the sequence of the verses in the interest of rhythm, but in no way affecting the meaning. It is interesting that the translation contains an idiomatic expression *to laugh up a storm*, though without the preposition. In this way, Jones manipulated standard language to achieve a metaphoric charge – lots of laughter as a means to fight evil. Although it seems unnecessary in terms of sheer equivalence, this translation method enriches the verse to reflect the strength in clarity of the original.

When speaking to an average poet lover with no translation skills or affinities, many will say that Dizdar is one of those poets who are simply untranslatable. This is primarily due to the specificity of his language and poetic expression strongly rooted in medieval Bosnian historiography. Even for a Bosnian reader, understanding of Dizdar's poetry requires considerable insight into the sources of his inspiration. He himself not only researched medieval Bosnian writings (manuscripts, epitaphs, etc.) but also made them available to the public. The translation by Francis R. Jones shows how unfounded it is to claim that something is untranslatable. His commitment to understanding all the layers of meaning of a poet as complex as Dizdar and his determination to use the translation process and the devices available in his own language, English, allowed him to create a superb piece of writing in its own right. The intensity of experience of time travel is one may say the same when reading the original and when reading Jones' superb work.

SOURCES

1. Dizdar, Mak. *Antologija bosanskih tekstova*. Sarajevo: Alef, 1997.
2. Dizdar, Mak. *The Stone Sleeper*. Translated by Francis R. Jones. Sarajevo: Did, 1999.
3. Katnić-Bakaršić, Marina. *Lingvistička stilistika*. Budimpešta: OSI, 1999.
4. Lachmann, Renate. *Phantasia/Memoria/Rhetorica*. Zagreb: Matica hrvatska, 2002.
5. Prohić, Kasim. *Apokrifnost poetskog govora*. Sarajevo: Veselin Masleša, 1974.

DIZDAR I JONES: KONGRUENTNOST ZVUKA, ZNAKA I ZNAČENJA

Rezime

Intertekstualni osnov Dizdarove poezije otkriva bogatu i raznovrsnu kulturalnomemorijsku teksturu. Stoga i prevod njegovih djela predstavlja poseban izazov – identificirati i prenijeti književnu tradiciju na koju se naslanja. Često se kaže da je Dizdar jednostavno neprevodiv, prvenstveno zbog specifičnosti jezika i poetskog izraza, snažno ukorijenjenog u historiografiji srednjevjekovne Bosne. Odabrani primjeri prijevoda Francisa R. Jonesa ukazuju na neosnovanost takve tvrdnje. Jonesova predanost razumijevanju značenjske višeslojnosti ovog pjesnika i njegova riješenost da u prevodilačkim postupcima posegne za svim sredstvima koja mu pruža njegov jezik, engleski, omogućile su mu da svori vrhunsko djelo. Intenzitet iskustva putovanja kroz vrijeme je, može se reći, skoro isto pri čitanju izvornika i pri čitanju Jonesovog vrhunskog prevodilačkog uratka.

Ključne riječi: Mak Dizdar, Francis R. Jones, *Kameni spavač*, poezija, prijevod

Nataša Stojaković

MOOD AND TENSE IN HYPOTHETICAL NARRATIVE IN THE PERIOD OF MODERN ENGLISH

Abstract: This article deals with the use of mood and tense in hypothetical narrative throughout the period of Modern English. It uses examples from the first half of the 16th century to the beginning of the 21st century to examine what hypothetical narrative may show in respect to the changes that took place in the verb system of English. The changes that are discussed are primarily those related to the earlier use of the subjunctive and the later modal use of the past tenses of the indicative.

Key words: subjunctive, past tense, history of English

INTRODUCTION

The term hypothetical narrative is used in this article to refer to a series or cluster of related hypothetical situations expressed by finite verbs in different syntactic contexts, as in the following example from the beginning of the 20th century:¹

- (1) Suppose that **whenever we heard** of walking in England **it always meant** walking forty-five miles a day without fatigue. We **should** be perfectly certain **that only a few men were walking** at all, and **that all the other British subjects were being wheeled** about in Bath-chairs. (Chesterton 1908: 62)²

The hypothetical is typically associated with the use of modal verbs and the modal use of the past tenses. In describing how past tenses are used to express

¹ The term *situation* is used as a general term to cover actions, processes, states, events, etc., after Comrie (1976: 13).

² The relevant forms and sections are marked in bold type, otherwise the quotations are as found in the sources.

modal meanings, certain dependent clauses are usually given as examples, i.e., remote conditionals, as in (2) and (3), or content clauses after *wish*, as in (4) and (5).³

- (2) **If he was here**, he'd be upstairs.
- (3) **If it had come yesterday**, he would surely have told her.
- (4) **I wish he was here**.
- (5) **I wish I had accepted her offer**.

Although these contexts were historically characterised by the use of the subjunctive mood (*If he were here...* and *I wish he were here*), what remains of that mood today is described by Quirk et al (1985: 155) as 'an optional and stylistically somewhat marked variant of other constructions'.

The modal use is found combined with the so-called *backshifting*, which is usually mentioned as a property of reported speech, as in dependent clauses within dependent clauses in (6) and (7). The situations in the content clauses in these examples are real situations but the verb form is backshifted, as are some of the instances in (1), which are all unreal situations.⁴

- (6) **If he knew** she **had** too many commitments, he would do something about it.
- (7) **I wish he realised** that she **had** too many commitments.

This paper presents some findings of an investigation into the use of the subjunctive in the period of Modern English (ModE, 1500–present-day), which was based on a corpus of texts published from the first half of the 16th century to the beginning of the 21st century⁵, and which also collected examples of the usage outlined above. The forms discussed are those of the present and past tenses of the subjunctive and indicative.

³ Examples (2)–(7) are from Huddleston (2002: 148–152).

⁴ Huddleston (2002: 152) considers that the backshifting found in such examples is the same use of the past tenses that is found in reported speech. A different interpretation is suggested by Declerck (2003), who argues that what he calls 'modal backshifting' or 'distancing' is different from the use found in reported speech.

⁵ The six centuries covered by the corpus are represented with texts published in the first half of the century, and the 21st century is represented with texts published in the period 2000–2006.

The sections that follow first present the historical background and some descriptions of usage in Present-day English (PdE). Hypothetical narrative is not specifically discussed in any of the sources consulted, so these sections present those elements of description that can be related to the subject of the article.

HISTORY OF THE ENGLISH SUBJUNCTIVE

The subjunctive is a category with a reduced set of inflections when compared with the indicative already in Old English (OE, c. 450–1100). It has one form for the singular and one for the plural, both in the present and the past tense. The use of the subjunctive in that period is usually explained in comparison with the other two moods, the indicative and imperative, in specific sentence structures.

Traugott (1992: 184) says that in OE, '[i]n general, indicative is used to present a proposition as true, and subjunctive is used to cast some doubt on the truth of the proposition or to express obligation, desire and so forth'. The author also points out that 'there are many counter-instances'. The domain in which the subjunctive is contrasted to the indicative is dependent clauses, and the types that are described as being typically with the subjunctive are some adverbial clauses, particularly those of purpose, concession and condition, although conditional clauses with *if* are also mentioned among notable exceptions. (1992: 234–73).

The subjunctive is also used in reported speech, which is a common property of the early Germanic languages, and it may have resulted from the reporter's wish 'to avoid commitment to the truth of what was reported, or wished to cast doubt on it' (1992: 240). This use seems to be conventional in OE because many of the instances cannot be interpreted in that way. Another reason for considering the use of the subjunctive in reported speech as conventional, and not representative of some meaningful distinction, is the fact that some reported clauses which appear in a sequence have different moods.

The further reduction in the system of inflectional marking begins already at the end of the OE period, which leads to simplification and eventual loss of many inflectional categories by the end of the Middle English (ME) period (1100–1500). The indicative and subjunctive forms become non-distinct in many contexts, and two new developments in the verb system are considered to be directly related to this loss of distinctions: they are the increase in the use of periphrastic constructions with modal meanings and the use of the so-called modal preterite. Fischer (1992: 247) explains the modal preterite as 'a

continuation of the Old English past subjunctive'. Since the past tense forms of the indicative and subjunctive cannot be distinguished for the most part, the marking of the past tense itself becomes an indicator of modal meaning. Fischer further explains:

When in Middle English this past form comes to be used in present-tense contexts, its function as a modal marker becomes clear-cut. In Late Middle English this development, called 'tense-shift', is also found in past-time contexts, where, in contrast, a pluperfect comes to be used to give the clause modal colouring... (1992: 247)

Fischer and van der Wurff (2006: 146) include the past tense forms of modal verbs in this development and explain that '[s]ince past-tense indicative modal verbs were also used in such hypothetical situations in OE, the past tense of modals acquired a similar role' and state that 'the past tense of modal verbs gradually lost their "pure" past-time reference'.

Backshifting seems to have been established in reported speech by the beginning of the Early Modern English (EModE) period (1500–1700).⁶ Its use in modal contexts is not specifically discussed in literature on the history of English, apart from what can be found in the descriptions of specific types of clause regarding the use of the subjunctive mood. For instance, in a description of ME, Fischer (1992: 311) discusses the use of mood in relative clauses, and states that 'the subjunctive is also used when the relative clause is part of a hypothetical or potential situation'. She provides an example from *Piers Plowman* (written in the second half of the 14th c.), which is a relative clause with the past subjunctive in a clause of hypothetical comparison with a non-distinct past tense form:

Fele of yow fareþ as if I a forest hadde/ That were ful of faire trees
'many of you act as if I had a forest that was full of faire trees'

Many OE uses of the subjunctive are still found in ME, and continue into the EModE period, but the range of contexts in which it is found is continually being reduced in favour of modal auxiliaries and the modal preterite. This process is parallel to a further reduction in the number of forms that are distinguished in the inflectional system, which makes it more similar to the situation in PdE. Görlach (1991: 95) states that '[t]he ModE system of inflexional morphology was already present in outline by 1430 and reached its final form by 1630'.

⁶ Rissanen (1999: 227) states that it 'is fairly consistently followed in Early Modern English although there is variation'.

SUBJUNCTIVE IN PRESENT-DAY ENGLISH

There are two sources that describe the use of mood in dependent clauses that may exhibit tense shift in PdE. They are Huddleston (2002) and Declerck and Reed (2001).

Huddleston (2002: 172) presents an analysis of the English verb system in which only *were* is recognised as a remnant of the earlier subjunctive mood, and it is called ‘irrealis’:

As far as English is concerned, historical change has more or less eliminated mood from the inflectional system, with irrealis mood confined to 1st/3rd person singular *were*, which is moreover usually replaceable by the ordinary preterite form *was*...

Irrealis *were* is examined in terms of one of the uses of the preterite, modal remoteness, which ‘is found (with lexical verbs) only in a few subordinate constructions’. It is noted that *were* is used in ‘remote conditionals (with *if, as if, as though, etc.*)’ and as ‘the complement of *wish, would rather, etc.*’. However, *was* is found in those clauses as well, especially in informal style. Irrealis *were* also appears in some contexts that are similar to those with modal remoteness, i.e. ‘certain backshift and past time uses’. The examples presented are as follows (2002: 87):

- | | | | |
|-----|--|---|-------------|
| i | % <i>She phoned to ascertain whether he were dining at the Club.</i> | } | [backshift] |
| ii | % <i>He looked at me as if he suspected I were cheating on him.</i> | | |
| iii | % <i>If he were surprised, he didn't show it.</i> | | [past time] |

What seems to trigger the use of *were* in reported yes–no questions are *if* and *whether* by the nature of it being replaceable with *if*. The author seems to regard these uses as possible cases of hypercorrection. The explanation that he offers is that ‘prescriptive grammar used to insist on *were* rather than *was* in modal remoteness constructions, and this may have led to the avoidance of *was* in certain neighbouring constructions’ (2002: 87). It is remarked that examples (i) and (ii) are ‘generally treated as incorrect’ in the usage manuals that mention them, but it is also mentioned that ‘they are found in the writings of highly prestigious authors’ (2002: 87f). Another example subsumed under the ‘extended uses’ is the following:

The two theoretical extremes of such a scale of a formal explicitness would be (a) the case where no information at all were expressed formally, and (b) the case where no information were expressed pragmatically. (2002: 87f)

The explanation states that ‘[w]ere is here in a relative construction embedded within a main clause containing a modal remoteness use of *would*’ (2002: 87f).⁷

Declerck and Reed (2001) present a study on the use of conditionals in PdE based on corpora. Among the things they investigated is the use of the past form *were*, which is described as ‘generally preferred to *was* in a more formal style’ adding in a footnote that ‘[i]n the Cobuild corpus we found a ratio of 61.6% *was* versus 38.4% *were*. The former is pretty much confined to informal registers’ (2001: 198). They compare the use of *were* and *was* in several respects and one of them is subordinate clauses within *if*-clauses:

It is worth noting that whilst the past subjunctive can replace the past tense in the *if*-clause of a pattern 2 conditional, it cannot always do so in a subclause depending on that *if*-clause. In fact, in subclauses depending on an *if*-clause, *were* is a regular alternative to *was* only in reported questions i.e. clausal complements of *ask*, *wonder*, *doubt*, etc.):

- a. If he were certain that Julia {was / ?were} in America, would he feel happier?
- b. If he {wondered / asked himself} whether anything {was / were} wrong with the project, he would probably keep his doubts to himself. (2001: 200)

USE OF SUBJUNCTIVE *WERE*

Were is sometimes treated as the only ‘subjunctive’ or irrealis form in PdE (cf. above), but its use in the type of context investigated in this contribution shows that it is not as genuine as it was in the earlier periods. In EModE, *were* seems to have been the form of all morphologically distinct instances of *be* in different types of clause in a modal context with past tense forms, as in the following examples from the first half of the 16th century:⁸

⁷ The instances discussed by Huddleston (2002: 87) could also be explained as late retentions of some of the earlier uses of the subjunctive. The investigation of which this paper presents some results found similar examples in EModE and the instances ‘found in the writings of highly prestigious authors’ may have been those similar uses preserved through the literary tradition. The example with the relative construction can be compared to the instances that are the subject of this article, though there is also a possibility that the presentation of the two cases that are extremes is understood as similar to conditional constructions in stating under which conditions the two theoretical extremes occur. The subjunctive could then be just part of formal use.

⁸ *The* is occasionally represented by *y^e* and *that* by *y^t* in the 16th century examples.

- (8) **If** there **wer** two both condemned to deth, both caried out at ons toward execucion: of which two y^e tone **wer** sure yⁱ the place of his execucion **were** wⁱn one mile, y^e tother .xx. mile of, ye an hundred & ye wil, he yⁱ **were** in the cart to be caried an .C. mile, wold not take much more plesure, than his felow in the length of his waye, notwithstanding yⁱ **were** .C. times as long as his felowes, & that he had therby C. times as long to liue, beinge sure and out of al question to dye at the ende. (More [1522] 1997: 150)
- (9) **Put case**⁹ this man **loved** a woman such one
 Who **were** in his lykyng the thyng alone,
 And that his love to her **were** not so myckyll
 But her fancy towarde hym **were** as lyttyll,
 And that she **hyd** her selfe so day and nyght
 That selde tyme whan he **myght** come in her syght...
 (Heywood [1534] 1991: 168)

The use of the subjunctive derives from the hypothetical contexts in which these clauses are found. Particularly frequent in this use are relative clauses and *that*-clauses. A similar use is found in the examples from the first half of the 17th century, but the examples from the beginning of the 18th century show a change. The subjunctive is still the mood typically used with certain subordinators, e.g. two instances with *if* in (10), which also introduce the hypothetical context, but the instances that come later in the elaboration of the context are not likely to be realised as *were*, as is the case with *was capable* in (10), or with *was done* in (11).

- (10) Fields of corn make a pleasant prospect, and **if** the walks **were** a little taken care of that lie between them, **if** the natural embroidery of the meadows **were** helped and improved by some small additions of art, and the several rows of hedges set off by trees and flowers, **that the soil was capable of receiving**, a man **might** make a pretty landscape of his own possessions. (Addison [1712] in Bond 1970: 185)
- (11) Oh! **had I been the Master** but of Yesterday,
 The World, the World **had felt** me; and for thee,
I had us'd thee, as thou art to me,—a Dog ...
I would have taught thy Neck to know my weight,
 And mounted from that Footstool to my Saddle:
 Then, **when thy daily servile Task was done**,
 I would have cag'd thee, for the Scorn of Slaves,
 'Till thou had'st begg'd to die ... (Rowe [1702] 1720: 25)

⁹ *To put case (that)* 'to propound a hypothetical instance or illustration, to suppose'. In the entry for *case*, n¹ in the *Oxford English Dictionary*, 2nd ed.

Some other subordinators associated with the use of the subjunctive in the earlier periods were also found with the subjunctive in hypothetical narratives, as is the case with *whether* in (12) and *as if* in (13). They suggest that the subjunctive is used with them regardless of their place in the narrative for as long as that mood is typically found with these conjunctions.

- (12) Now 'tis certain that sometimes we may have this *subordinate Desire* of the Happiness of others, conceived as the *Means* of our own; **as suppose** one had laid a *Wager* upon the Happiness of a Person of such Veracity, that he would own sincerely **whether** he **were** happy or not... (Hutcheson 1728: 20)
- (13) Hence it follows that **if** an English swindler **wished** to impress us, the last thing he **would think** of doing **would be** to put on a uniform. He **would put** on a polite slouching air and a careless, expensive suit of clothes; he **would stroll** up to the Mayor, be so awfully sorry to disturb him, find he had forgotten his card-case, mention, **as if he were ashamed** of it, that he **was** the Duke of Mercia, and carry the whole thing through with the air of a **man who could get** two hundred witnesses and two thousand retainers, but who **was** too tired to call any of them. (Chesterton 1908: 141–2)

The use of the forms in (13) seems to show that *were* is marked even when used with the modal preterite: other instances of *be* are expressed with *was*.

Examples (14) and (15) present some additional instances for illustration, one from the 19th century and the other from the beginning of the 21st century.

- (14) ... an observer, not without experience of our time, has said: **Had** I a man of clearly developed character (clear, sincere within its limits)... —it **were** rather among the lower than among the higher classes that I **should** look for him.¹⁰
 A hard saying, indeed, seems this same: that he, whose other wants were all beforehand supplied; **to whose capabilities no problem was presented** except even this, How to cultivate them to best advantage, **should** attain less real culture than he **whose first grand problem and obligation was nowise spiritual culture**, but hard labour for his daily bread! (Carlyle [1832] 1904b: 141)
- (15) I had hoped, when I wrote mine, that even **if I were to** allow myself the indulgence of writing in detail about 1960s League Cup finals,

¹⁰ Example (14) begins with a conditional sentence in which the main clause is with the subjunctive, which is a usage typical of the earlier periods. It has been replaced by *would be*. Also see the first lines in example (11).

people might be prepared to put up with it **if they thought there was** something else going on as well ... (Hornby 2007: 120)¹¹

It should be noted that, in the earlier periods, subjunctive *were* is a sufficient marker of modality on its own, and as such is found in both main and dependent clauses, as e.g. in (16):

- (16) With suche thinges as this, and many mo **that were to long to rehearse here**, haue those good fathers answered thys matter... (More [1535] 1976: 33)

USE OF TENSES

These modal contexts seem to show developments in the use of tenses as well. Some examples from the first half of the 16th century combine the use of the past and present tenses in ways that are found only in that subperiod in the corpus.

The first such example presented here, (17), begins with the subjunctive, and the narrative is elaborated with past tense forms that are either non-distinct or with second person marking¹². In the middle of the narrative there is a present tense indicative form, *kepeth*.

- (17) **If** it so **were** that thou **knewest** a great Duke, kepyng so great estate and princely port in his howse, that **y^u** being a ryght meane manne, **haddest** in thyne heart great enuy thereat, and specially at some special daye, **in which he kepeth for the mariage of his chylde**, a gret honorable court aboue other times, **if** thou beyng thereat and, at the syght of the rialty and honoure **shewed** hym of all the country about resorting to hym, whyle they knele & crouche to hym, & at euerye word barehed bigrace him, **if** thou **sholdest** sodeinly be surely advertised, **yⁱ** for secret treason lately detected to the king he **shold**

¹¹ However, these contexts may combine several factors. In (15), one of them may be the type of conditional clause and the structure used. Declerck and Reed (2001: 218) found that in the examples from the Cobuild corpus '*if I was to* is not used in the highest registers but is about twice as frequent as *if I were to* in the more informal registers'.

¹² Second person singular indicative marking appears in some subjunctive contexts in EModE in a way that distinguishes it from other indicative forms. In some past tense examples, it seems to be used merely to mark the second person singular, and it possibly develops into solely second person marking accompanying *thou*, which is becoming increasingly rare.

vndoutedly be taken the morow, his courte al broken vp, ... himselfe caste in prison, broughte furth & arrayned, the matter out of question, & he **should** be condemned, his cote armour reuersed, ... howe thinkest thou by thy fayth amyd thyne enuy, **shouldeste** thou not sodaynly change into pity? (More [1522] 1997: 160–1)

Another 16th century instance, again with a relative clause, is presented in (18):

- (18) Of all these thre, **yf** eche mannes tale
 In Poules Churche yarde **were** set on sale
 In some mannes hande, **that hath the sleyghte**,
 He **shulde** sure sell these tales by weyght,
 For as they wey so be they worth.
 (Heywood [1544?] 1991: 136)

There are other ways in which the past and present forms are combined. The following two 16th century examples depict how a past tense conditional clause may appear with present indicative clauses:

- (19) Now tel me than **if thou wer going out** of an howse **whither arte thou goynge** out onely **whan thy fote is** on y^e vttermost ynch of the threshold thy body halfe out of the doore, or else **whan thou beginnest** to set the firste foote forward to goe out, **in what place of the house so euer ye stand whan ye buskle** forward? (More [1522] 1997: 148–9)
- (20) For **yf euer the mind wer emptye**, it would bee empty **whan** the bodye **sleepeth**. But **yf it wer than al empty**, we shoulde haue no dreames. (More [1522] 1997: 136)

Instances of the cases in (17)–(20) possibly reflect earlier patterns of use. There are some other instances of combined use of the present and past tenses in EModE, but they show similarities with the present-day use. The following passage contains a hypothetical situation within a hypothetical situation. The main situation is in the present tense and introduced with *consider*, while the one contained within is a conditional sentence in the past tense, which shows the earlier usage of the subjunctive in the main clause. The conditional clause is with inversion:¹³

¹³ All the present tense forms are morphologically non-distinct because of the plural agreement, including the form *be*, which is also used as a plural indicative in that period, and the past tense forms are one non-distinct (the plural agreement in *the strongest were*) and the other subjunctive (*were it not*).

- (21) **Consider** that our bodies **haue** so sore a sickenes and such a continual consumption in themselves, that **the strongest wer not hable to endure and continue .x daies together, wer it not y^t once or twice a day**, we **be** fayne to take medicines inwarde to cloute them vp with al, & **kepe** them as longe as we can. (More [1522] 1997: 146)

The following instance from PdE was found on the Internet outside the investigation. The main situation is introduced with *suppose* and described in the present tense forms, while the hypothetical situation within is described in the past tense forms of modals and a conditional sentence, in this case with an *if*-clause.

- (22) I'm going to construct a hypothetical narrative. **Suppose** that young Beras, or more specifically, a representative of Beras, **decides** to forge his birth date by one year in order to improve his prospect standing. Things **are** going along smoothly with that plan until the new CBA **clamps** a lid on future international bonuses. What **could** have been a \$5 million or better payday **would** now be limited to about \$2.5 million. But, **if Beras were suddenly to become his real age**, he could then earn a \$4.5 million bonus since teams **are** desperately binging on talent while they still **can**. (Johnson 2012)

One other way in which the present and past tenses can be combined was found in a 21st century example. It begins with a description of what might be understood as a typical real situation; then, a hypothetical situation is introduced, in this case too, with a conditional sentence with past tense forms. The *if*-clause contains coordinated adverbial clauses with the present tense:

- (23) Morning has broken? Good. I hate morning. You wake, soaked in your own filth, your face raw from last night's tears, shards of shattered shot-glass peppering the bedspread, and you ask yourself what difference **it would** make **if** instead of going to work **you spent** the day banging your head against the kitchen table and howling **till** your skull **bursts** open and the pain **flops** out. Or is that just me? (Brooker 2005: 263)

The author possibly 'slips' into the present tense as part of the humour. The usage may be manipulated to suggest a different possibility of realisation, thus revealing more of the author's state of mind. Another possibility is that the present tense clause could be seen as similar to the temporal clause in (20).

The investigation also found instances in which the present subjunctive is used to introduce a hypothetical narrative, as can be seen in (21) above. The present tense forms in (21) are morphologically non-distinct, but those instances that

contain morphologically distinct forms show a use different from the one in the case of subjunctive *were*, i.e. the subjunctive is not used throughout the narrative. In (24), another example from the 16th century, the passage begins with coordinated *if*-clauses. Even though they are coordinated, the mood is not the same. The first verb form is subjunctive, the other is indicative:

- (24) And **if the childe be of a perfecte inclination and towardnes to vertue**, and very aptly disposed to this science, **and ripely dothe understande the reason and concordance of tunes**, the tutor's office shall be to persuade hym to haue principally in remembrance his astate... (Elyot [1531] 1883: 42)

The passage in (25) is from the 17th century and has two subjunctive forms, one after *suppose* and the other after *if*. Other present tense verb forms are indicatives:

- (25) For **suppose a Decree be made first in this Manner**, That such a One shall have the Sovereignty for his Life, and that afterward they will chuse a-new. In this Case, the Power of the People **is** dissolved, or not; if dissolved, then after the Death of him that **is** chosen, there **is** no Man bound to stand to the Decrees of them that shall, as Private Men, run together to make a new Election; and consequently, **if there be any Man**, who by the Advantage of the Raign of Him that **is** dead, **hath** Strength enough to hold the Multitude in Peace and Obedience, he may lawfully, or rather is by the Law of Nature obliged so to do... (Hobbes [1650] 1684: 167)

The instances in (24) and (25) are found in different types of clause, but they possibly suggest that present tense hypothetical narratives are different from past tense narratives in the use of mood already at the beginning of the ModE period. The latest example of such use was found in the 19th century part of the corpus. It also has two coordinated clauses at the beginning, but they are both subjunctive in this case. The narrative continues in the present indicative:

- (26) This man, I know him well, clings with too fond
Too sick a dotage on his mother's health
To blaze her secret guilt ...
Or **say he make his love**
A servant to his duty, and give tongue
To that he would have secret; then she **dies**,
And dying so by him, there **springs** a thought
As I shall work it, to compel his sense
To the full top and madness of despair. (Soane 1817: 12)

However, most of the instances of elaborated hypothetical contexts in the corpus usually appear only with the past tenses and past tense forms of modals, as in (27) and (28):

- (27) His friends? his fiends. S'lud, they doe nothing but hant him, vp and downe, like a sort of vnluckie sprites, and tempt him to all manner of villanie, that can be thought of. Well, by this light, a little thing **would** make me play the deuill with some of 'hem; **and 'twere not more for your husbands sake**, then any thing else, I'd make the house too hot for the best on hem: they **should** say, and sweare, **hell were broken loose, e're they went hence**. (Jonson [1601] 1616: 45)
- (28) The pure and starry perfection of impartiality **would** be reached by people who not only **had** no opinion **before** they **had heard** the case, but who also had no opinion **after** they **had heard** it. (Chesterton 1908: 211)

Main clauses appear with modal verbs, especially in the later subperiods, while dependent clauses are with the past tenses and the modal verbs. In the instances that were collected, hypothetical narratives are usually introduced by imperatives such as *suppose*, main clauses with modal verbs, and conditional clauses (*if*-clauses or clauses with inversion). Conditional clauses are most frequently found in that role.

The past tense forms of the perfect and the progressive may be found in the same uses that are described for the 'indicative' in these hypothetical contexts. The past progressive indicating 'a happening IN PROGRESS at a given time' as described for PdE (Quirk & al 1985: 187) is found in e.g. (29):

- (29) ... and **if** the sun on some portentous morn **were to** make his first appearance in the West, I verily believe, that, **while all the world were gasping in apprehension about me**, I alone **should** stand unterrified, from sheer incuriosity and want of observation. (Lamb [1821] 1850: 63)

Instances of the past perfect usually indicate anteriority, which is part of the description of that category in PdE (e.g. in Quirk & al 1985: 190). Some instances with the adverbs *before* and *never* are presented in (30) and (31):¹⁴

- (30) ... **if** a Man **could** be alive, and all the rest of the World annihilated, he **should** nevertheless retain the *Image* thereof; and all those Things

¹⁴ Example (28) also contains such an instance of the past perfect, and another one which is used to 'emphasise completion' as described by Alexander (1985: 175).

which he had before seen or perceived in it... (Hobbes [1650] 1684: 3)

- (31) **If** the Evil **did** befall us, we **should** never chuse to increase it, by the Sensations of *Sorrow* or *Despair*; we **should** consider what **was** the Sum of Good remaining in our State, after subtracting this Evil; and **should** enjoy our selves as well as a Being, **who had never known greater Good, nor enjoyed greater Pleasure**, than the *absolute Good* yet remaining with us... (Hutcheson 1728: 45–6)

The examples presented above illustrate some typical hypothetical contexts and uses of the past perfect; however, the past perfect is also found as a ‘backshifted’ preterite. The *as if* clause in (32) exhibits tense shift in relation to the past time context in which it occurs and the preterite used to express it:

- (32) O! she abhors him, loaths his very name;
Yet still her filial piety prevail’d;
She hung upon my neck; pray’d for my life,
My honour, my success; and took her leave
In such endearing strains, **as if she never
Had been to see me more.** (Lillo 1775: 276)

CONCLUSION

This paper has presented examples of hypothetical narratives found in texts in the period of Modern English. Throughout the period, most of them are with past tense forms. The most conspicuous change is the decrease in the use of the subjunctive. The early examples in the corpus show the use of *were* in all past tense instances of *be* that are morphologically distinct. The examples from the beginning of the 18th century and later show that *were* is less likely to appear further away from the introduction, even in formal writing from which many of the examples are taken. The subjunctive is typically found only at the beginning or near the introduction of a narrative, and in certain types of clauses associated specifically with the use of the subjunctive.

The present tense instances that were excerpted show that the use of present tenses in such contexts may have developed differently. Indicative forms are found in the present tense narratives that are introduced with subjunctive forms already in the 16th century.

The use of tenses in the 16th century possibly retains some earlier patterns; however, today’s uses can be compared to many of those early examples.

It should be noted that hypothetical narratives are typically elaborations. They are expanded to the point at which the modal context is fully presented and in as much detail as necessary.

PRIMARY SOURCES

1. Bond, D. F. (Ed.). *Critical Essays from The Spectator by Joseph Addison with four Essays by Richard Steele*. Oxford: Oxford University Press, 1970.
2. Brooker, C. *Screen Burn*. London: Faber and Faber, 2005.
3. Carlyle, T. *The Works Of Thomas Carlyle In Thirty Volumes*. Vol. XXVIII (*Critical And Miscellaneous Essays In Five Volumes*. Vol. III). New York: Charles Scribner's Sons, 1904.
4. Chesterton, G. K. *All Things Considered*. Third edition. London: Methuen & Co, 1908.
5. Elyot, T. *The Boke Named The Governour. Devised by Sir Thomas Elyot, Knight*. Edited from the first edition of 1531 by Henry Herbert Stephen Croft. Volume I. London: Kegan Paul, Trench & Co., 1883.
6. Heywood, J. *The Plays of John Heywood*. Edited by Richard Axton and Peter Happé. Cambridge: D.S. Brewer, 1991.
7. Hobb[e]s, T. *Hobbs's Tripos, In Three Discourses: The First, Humane Nature, The Second, De Corpore Politico, The Third, Of Liberty and Necessity*. The Third Edition. London: Printed for Matt. Gilliflower, Henry Rogers, and Tho. Fox, 1684.
8. Hornby, N. *The Complete Polysyllabic Spree*. London: Penguin Books, 2007.
9. Hutcheson, F. *An Essay on the Nature and Conduct of the Passions and Affections With Illustrations On the Moral Sense*. London: Printed by J. Darby and T. Browne, for John Smith and William Bruce, Booksellers in Dublin, 1728.
10. Johnson, B. 'MLB expands playoffs to 10 teams in 2012'. *The Hardball Times, Let there be news – Volume 11*. March 05, 2012. <http://www.hardballtimes.com/let-there-be-news-volume-11/> (last accessed 1 December 2013)
11. Jonson, B. *The Workes of Beniamin Jonson*. London: Imprinted by Will Stansby, 1616.

12. Lamb, C. *The Works of Charles Lamb to Which are Prefixed His Letters and a Sketch of His Life*. By Thomas Noon Talfourd. Vol. II. New York: Harper & Brothers, 1850.
13. Lillo, G. *The works of Mr. George Lillo; with Some Account of His Life*. Volume I. London: T. Davies, 1775.
14. More, T. *The Complete Works of St. Thomas More: Volume 1*. Edited by Anthony S. G. Edwards, Katherine Gardiner Rodgers and Clarence H. Miller. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1997.
15. More, T. *The Complete Works of St. Thomas More: Volume 13*. Edited by Garry E. Haupt. New Haven: Yale University Press, 1976.
16. Rowe, N. *The Dramatick Works of Nicholas Rowe, Esq, Volume the First*. London: T. Jauncy, 1720.
17. Soane, G. *Bohemian: A Tragedy in Five Acts*. London: C. Chaplle, 66, Pall Mall. In *Collection of Plays. Vol. II* (editor and publisher unknown, undated), 1817.

REFERENCES

1. Alexander, L. G. 1987. *The Longman English Grammar*. London: Longman.
2. Comrie, B. *Aspect*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1976.
3. Declerck, R. Distancing vs backshifting: modal indicative forms in English. *Leuvense bijdragen: tijdschrift voor Germaanse filologie*, 92, (3–4), 13–22, 2003.
4. Declerck, R. & S. Reed. *Conditionals: A Comprehensive Empirical Analysis*. Berlin: Mouton de Gruyter, 2001.
5. Fischer, O. Syntax. In N. Blake (Ed.). *The Cambridge history of the English language Volume II. 1066–1476* (pp. 207–408). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992.
6. Fischer, O. & W. van der Wurff. Syntax. In Richard H. & D. Denison (Eds.). *A History of the English Language* (pp. 109–198). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2006.
7. Görlach, M. *Introduction to Early Modern English*. Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1991.

8. Huddleston, R. The verb. In R. Huddleston & G. Pullum (Eds.). *The Cambridge Grammar of the English Language* (pp. 71–212). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 2002.
9. *Oxford English Dictionary*. Edited by J. A. Simpson and E. S. C. Weiner. Second Edition on CD-ROM (v. 4.0). Oxford: Clarendon Press. [1989] 2009.
10. Quirk, R. et al. *A Comprehensive Grammar of the English Language*. London: Longman, 1985.
11. Rissanen, M. Syntax. In R. Lass (Ed.). *The Cambridge history of the English language, Volume III, 1457–1776* (pp. 187–331). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1999.
12. Traugott, E. C. Syntax. In R. M. Hogg (Ed.). *The Cambridge history of the English language Volume I. The Beginnings to 1066* (pp. 168–289). Cambridge: Cambridge University Press, 1992.

GLAGOLSKI NAČIN I GLAGOLSKO VRIJEME U HIPOTETIČKOM PRIČANJU U PERIODU MODERNOG ENGLESKOG

Sažetak

Rad se bavi upotrebom glagolskog načina i vremena u hipotetičkom pričanju tokom perioda modernog engleskog. Koriste se primjeri od prve polovine 16. do početka 21. stoljeća da bi se istražilo šta hipotetičko pričanje može pokazati u pogledu promjena koje su se dogodile u glagolskom sistemu engleskog jezika. Promjene o kojima je prvenstveno riječ su one koje se tiču ranije upotrebe konjunktiva i kasnije modalne upotrebe prošlih vremena indikativa.

Ključne riječi: konjunktiv, prošlo vrijeme, historija engleskog jezika

Edina Špago-Ćumurija

HYBRIDITY IN GLOBAL COMMUNICATION: LANGUAGE OF CNN FINANCIAL ADVERTISEMENTS

Abstract: Advertising is an economic and cultural activity in the global world we live in today. Due to the global context of communication, language and promoted values in advertising messages influence understanding and selection of signs in communication, which results in new links between conventional signs and new ideas, and consequently creation of new, often hybrid quality of language and conveyed meaning. This paper uses CNN as a prototype of a global media with carefully selected symbols and associations in its advertisements. Financial advertisements are analyzed, to show hybridity in the contrast between the nature of practical financial business and human associations intentionally attached to the business world.

Key words: advertising, mass media, globalization, meaning

COMMUNICATION IN TODAY'S WORLD

Today's communication is global, since the world itself has become a *global village* a long time ago¹. The Internet as the newest information tool enabled communication in the global context (Lewis, 2003: 95). Communication goes beyond national boundaries. At the same time, great importance is laid on individual users, since each person has a possibility to create their messages written in their own style, and send them immediately to the global network of communication. Thus globalization and individualization are two opposite but parallel processes in modern, mass communication.²

¹ McLuhan coined the term in 1962 (*Razumijevanje medija*, Mc Luhan, translated by D. Prpa, 2008: 320).

² Oberlander and Gill (2006) call the language used on the internet *language with character* due to the great influence of individual characters of users in a computer-mediated communication.

Culture in a globalized world becomes a network of different perspectives, an open debate between the center and its periphery (Wunderlich and Warriar, 2010: 90). Culture as a context where language is created, is being replaced with a virtual world that, by itself, is not only postmodern, but already *post-human*³ environment with permanent replication of values and goods (Brstilo, 2009: 290).

Thinking about communicative potential of the internet and today's media, the most significant fact is that a message from one place can reach unlimited number of users around the world.

Such a network of communication affects our daily lives, and, thinking about mass media, a good example of it is the so-called *CNN effect*. CNN was the first media to offer ongoing coverage of the most important events, focusing viewers' attention more intensively in that way, which very often results in more prompt actions by relevant bodies in real life, in political and other structures worldwide (Gilboa, as cited in Groshek, 2008: 52-68). Media today are a powerful tool to initiate changes and create certain climates and even actions on a global level.

In such a globalized world, meaning and use of language change, following changes in values and associative systems of different cultural communities.

UNDERSTANDING AND SELECTION OF LANGUAGE SIGNS

Language is always culture-related. In the globalized world, this can complicate communication, due to the changes in cultural settings, as mentioned above.

Within one culture, most of basic values are directly related to metaphorical structure of concepts in that culture. Individual variations appear, depending on subculture one belongs to, and his or her individual experience. However, they are always based on the same, basic value system of that cultural and language community. People understand the world around them through language, but also use language to construct the meaning (Lakoff, 1984: 149).

Biological theory of language, which seems to be very suitable for today's world of fast changes and spreading of communication globally, says that a language community uses signs for communication depending on the level of their conventionality.

³ Brstilo points out that body and technology are not strictly separated any more.

A conventional sign is one that is being used by speakers and hearers to serve a certain cooperative function because it has successfully served that function before. (Millikan, 2004: 140)

A sign is becoming more useful and conventional by its usage. To be conventional, a sign has to be reproduced, becoming a *meme*, and spreading in a way similar to the behavior of viruses⁴. Signs are being replicated in line with still not clearly defined principles of selection. Memes are integrated into conceptual understanding of the world within one community, enabling further reproduction of its values and cultural potential. It is not clear how memes as cultural elements can function like that, but Millikan assumes that they have cooperative function which makes social coordination easier. In this way, we can explain uniformity within one community, such as manners, greetings, phrases used in formal situations etc. It seems that people find conformity very comforting and continue to build the convention by their own use of language. It might be that inclination to conformity originates from a biological need to identify and isolate intruders within a community (Millikan, 2004: 20-21).

In line with this, biological understanding of language, goes understanding based on psychological background of language functioning, which Hudson calls *language network*. Language is a network due to its characteristics of *spreading* and *default inheritance*. Spreading within the network is possible thanks to the wholeness of human abilities and interrelatedness of brain areas processing language, music, perception etc. Humans use the logic according to which everything is first considered default and thus truthful unless the opposite information appears (Hudson, 2007: 5).

Both psychology and linguistics today consider language one of the abilities networked with others. It is another way of perception, thus we are inclined to believe first, and only after to think about the meaning of what we hear. Signs can be traced back toward the original one, which in the end enables understanding of situations people don't have in their experience (Millikan, 2004: 113).

This characteristic of human mind is very interesting to the mass media and advertising.

⁴ Richard Dawkins, a biologist, coined the word, as cited in Millikan (2004:17).

CULTURE-SPECIFIC CONVENTIONAL SIGNS IN THE GLOBAL NETWORK OF COMMUNICATION

In the process of understanding of a message, people rely on its conventional value. The question is what happens when conventional signs are used in a new context. It can be assumed that we associate the same, original meaning to such signs and messages, continuing to use it in the new situations, even if it is not useful and appropriate any more. Having in mind the psychological mechanism of *default inheritance* mentioned earlier, it is obvious that we fill up the gaps in meaning and assume that the message is authentic.

This mechanism is especially active in advertising and other messages that promote certain values and ideas.

HYBRIDITY AS A NEW PRINCIPLE IN THE GLOBAL WORLD

In today's global communication, where economic markets dictate the scope of communication and links between countries, conventional signs are intentionally used to create certain meaning. Advertising has become the marketing of imaginary quality, and consequently not only economic, but also a cultural activity. Advertisements cannot be understood properly unless they bring the same associations to the receivers of the messages, which can be proven by difficulties in translating of advertisements. Translation becomes even impossible if the two cultures do not have identical signs and associative meaning in their communicative systems (Goddard, 2002: 2). Sennett calls advertising selling of associations (2007: 122).

Today global media broadcast around the globe, and we can observe existence of the two parallel processes: increased influence of the global, powerful media, such as CNN, which usually represent Anglo-Saxon culture⁵, and on the other hand, modifications in its original value systems, language signs and their associative potentials.

In this paper, CNN advertisements will be used to represent a typical global media present in the US, but also on other continents and countries worldwide⁶.

⁵ Wierzbicka seays pragamtic research of these influences and relations are still ethnocentric, in favor of the English language and culture, and she calls it anglocentric (2006: 32).

⁶ CNN has a share of 25% of the world viewers, according to the Global Capital Market Survey, 2006.

It will analyze advertisements from the field of finances to show the processes and changes in construction of meaning and associative links between conventional signs and new ideas in global communication.

CNN FINANCIAL ADVERTISEMENTS GLOBALLY

The greatest share of the advertisements on CNN belongs to the field of finances⁷, usually banks, investing and other financial institutions, companies and products.

Looking at language signs, associative meanings and metaphors used in these messages, we can find interesting information on usage of finance-related associations and symbols:

- a) Diners Club International uses the metaphor of key. Key is a conventional sign, used in the Bible which is itself the key to knowledge. *You have the key* is the main part of the message. Other interesting symbols are: *Revolutions in thoughts; Wonders of opportunity; Opening of new worlds of opportunity*.⁸

There are no words directly indicating the finances except the very name of the card.

- b) The Bank of New York Mellon uses the slogan: *Who's helping you?*, promoting the idea of support and friendship.
- c) Master Card uses lexemes and concepts directly linked to finances: money, card etc: *There are some things money can't buy. For everything else there's Mastercard*.⁹
- d) The City Bank engages paradox and plays with denotative vs. connotative meaning, together with epiphora, in order to create a

⁷ Out of 200 analyzed advertisements, almost 18% are financial ads (doctoral thesis, Špago-Ćumurija, 2010).

⁸ The full text is: *Passage ways. Opening of new worlds of opportunity. Linking what is with what can be. The world is open for business, and you have the key. Diners Club International; Grand entrances. Revolutions in thought...and technology. Wonders of opportunity. The world is open for business. And you have the key. Diners Club International.*

⁹ *Laptop: 600 euro, salsa lessons: 200 euro, Taxi to Rome: 3,000 euro, A fan first and foremost: Priceless. There are some things money can't buy. For everything else, there's MasterCard.*

message that dreams can come true. In their message we can find: *your dreams are wide awake, aspirations, goals, hopes, opportunities* etc¹⁰.

- e) Michigan Economic Development Corporation – *Michigan can give you the upper hand*. The concept of friendship and support comes to mind.

There is a group of non-American financial institutions advertised on CNN, which offers an interesting selection of symbols:

- f) UBA – *The Mona Lisa – much more than just art; the Ocean – much more than just water; gold – much more than just metal; UBA – more than just a bank. We are Africa’s global bank. New York *London*Africa*

Symbols are Mona Lisa – an ideal woman, an unsolved riddle of art, Ocean – the largest water surface, and gold – an ancient symbol of perfection and purity, matter of gods (Biedermann, 2004). These three symbols connect the three main branch offices – Mona Lisa representing European one, Ocean American and gold African office.

- g) Zenith bank plays with the meaning of the lexeme *interest* that can be understood as both help and support and interest with a financial connotation: *In your best interest*.
- h) Intercontinental Bank is a Nigerian bank represented through the concept of unity and partnership, together with leadership, which result in a *happy customer*, and a *happy bank*.¹¹
- i) Allianz, a German investing company, uses *confidence* as a key concept and it is more direct in meaning: *Whatever your moment, Allianz gives you the confidence you need. Financial solutions from A to Z. Allianz*
- j) FORTIS¹² (Italian *forte* – *strong*) uses the metaphor *Life is a curve* (with graphic representation in its advertisements. Key words are: *stop*,

¹⁰ *Every night you sleep...but your dreams are wide awake. Because ambition never sleep. Aspirations never sleep. Goals never sleep. Hopes never sleep. Opportunities never sleeps. The world never sleeps. That’s why we work around the world, that’s why we work around the clock. To turn dreams into realities. That’s why City never sleeps.*

¹¹ *This is the point where our goals converge. This is the point where our passion connect. This is the point where we’re always ahead. This is the point where leadership thrives and deepens. This is the new face of leadership. Leadership...together. Always ahead. happy customer, happy bank.*

¹² Benelux owned it in 2007, the 20th biggest investment company, in 2008 sold to a French bank.

think, evaluate, ups, downs etc.¹³ with a final message: *Getting you there.*

- k) ING, originally Dutch but rather an international investing company, uses Formula 1 for promotion of team values and cooperation. The F1 driver Alonso appears in their ads, emphasizing the *confidence in the team*.¹⁴ ING is in that analogy obviously a *pit stop*, which is visible from their link: ingwholesalebanking/pitstop, meaning that ING is a place where drivers/customers come and get all needed help and support from the entire team.
- l) HSBC Holding¹⁵ merges local and global in its message, calling itself *the world's local bank: Have you ever wonder where your life might take you? Banking above boundaries with the world's local bank.*
- m) AQABA, the paradise for investors built in Jordan, is a destination where you can *turn sand into gold*.¹⁶

The metaphor of gold is used again, a very conventional sign for the purest matter but also with a value of spiritual (Biedermann, 2004). The alchemical formula will bring the customer to the destination where the ancient human dream, the treasure, is found.

- n) Credit Suisse engages vision in its message: *Whatever your vision, we add Credit Suisse seek new perspectives to make it a reality, with a slogan: Thinking new perspectives.*

They organize language of their ads in the form of poetry. Here is an example with anaphora:

*Some think breakfast. We think research.
Some think privilege. We think customized solution.
Some think two generations. We think succession planning.*

¹³ *Life is a curve for ups and downs, and you don't have to follow this curve...fade, take your time to stop, to think, to evaluate. What could you do to start a new upward curve?...maybe...ask yourself. Where are you today? Where do you want to be tomorrow? FORTIS Banking/Insurance*

¹⁴ *Have you ever noticed how much easier life is when you can concentrate on things that really matter? Seventy five million people can. Because in ING we believe that saving, investing and preparing for your future should just be easier. When you need to seize the opportunity...you've got to have confidence. Confidence in the team behind you. Don't hope. Know.*

¹⁵ London, the biggest world banking group according to Forbes magazine (Wiki).

¹⁶ *Aqaba, your destination for business. and Invest into Aqaba today and turn sand into gold.*

- o) Ajman Envision mentions dreams, adventures, and possibilities, with the slogan: *Vision is the art of seeing invisible*¹⁷, so one can get a feeling that the advertisement is not linked to money and finances.
- p) Dubai Financial Center – *Your Gateway to Growth* suggests passage to a better world.
- q) ARTOC is another financial company that brings more artistic than financial associations to mind: INVESTING IS AN ART. THE ART OF EXPLORING NEW OPPORTUNITIES AND DISCOVERING NEW HORIZONS. THE ART OF CREATIVITY. THE ART OF CREATING A BOLD VISION. AND WITH A PORTFOLIO OF DIVERSE INVESTMENTS, THERE IS AN ART TO CREATING SUCCESS. ARTOC, ART OF INVESTMENT.¹⁸
- r) Stanford Financial Group uses financial signs and direct meaning, with lexemes such as *management, clients* etc., but also *vision, value, commitment*.¹⁹
- s) Bahrain – *Business friendly*.
- t) South Africa – *And if you think this is Monaco, think again. It's South Africa. Invest in the country, alive with possibility.*

CONCLUSION

Having analyzed adverting messages of some of the most influential financial institutions globally, we can find some common language and meaning-related features and processes:

- All of the banks and investing companies are related to the US and international financial market and investors, so their advertising message are oriented globally.

¹⁷ *With every year dawn, a larger dream, a powerful hope, ahead of...wealth of untapped opportunities, unseen promises, of an exceptional adventure...to look beyond what we see. To dare and take a step forward, a firm step into the future. Power of belief paves the way for achievement. Vision is the art of seeing the invisible.*

¹⁸ This message is written the way it appears in the original advertisement, in capital letters.

¹⁹ *There's a powerful global network that sets Stanford wealth management apart. It's our people and uncompromising commitment to serve our clients. An unique... an uncommon vision, and a promise that goes back 75 years. Hard work. Clear vision. Value for the client.*

- In terms of concepts and language used in these messages, very often, untypical symbols such as vision, novelty, future, possibilities, growth, emotions, pleasure, creativity etc. which makes financial business friendly and even fun and relaxing. Very conventional signs are used, but from other conceptual fields related to spiritual, cognitive, emotional and creative. The entire concept of business is made in this way very dynamic but also very *human*, at least in advertising. Generally speaking, the world of business has become more spiritual and esoteric, closer to religious and artistic emotions than anything else. What provide credibility to these messages are people with names and surnames who appear in the ads, celebrities or experts who very often send the message to clients.
- Very often, it is not easy to recognize the product or the field of finances. Too many symbols do not belong to the business world, but, as already mentioned, to the world of art, emotions etc.

CNN can be considered as a prototype of the contemporary media that reflects changes of the globalized world. Money flows over national markets, and individuals find themselves in changing contexts which are *stretching* and *shrinking* according to the scope of economic activities.

In the global economic contacts, cultures come into contact too, as well as value systems of various societies. That affects use of language signs and hopefully can lead to better understanding among different cultures. The conventional signs are so far used in advertising messages with awareness and careful planning, to add conventionally accepted values to new products and phenomena in mainly business world. Traditional and new qualities mix, creating new, often hybrid values: spiritual becomes material and manipulative, used to sell material values. On the other hand, this material world, at least in the domain of language, is getting more human colors and associations.

REFERENCES

1. Biedermann, Hans. *Knaurs Lexikon der Symbole/Rečnik simbola*, Munchen: Droemer Knaur, 1998, Beograd: Plato, 2004.
2. Brstilo, Ivana, Tijelo i tehnologija u postmodernoj perspektivi. Zagreb. *Soc. ekologija* vol. 18, No.3-4. 2009. hrcak.hr.
3. Goddard, Angela. *The Language of Advertising*, Routledge: New York, 2002.

4. Groshek, Jacob. Homogenous agendas, disparate frames: CNN and CNN International coverage online. *Journal of Broadcasting & Electronic Media*, 52:1, 2008.
5. Hudson, Richard. *Language Networks*. Oxford University Press, 2007.
6. Lakoff, George and Mark, Johnson. *Methaphors we live by*. Chicago: University of Chicago Press, 1980.
7. Lewis, Diana M. Online news: A new genre?. Jean Aitchison and Diana M. Lewis (Eds.). *New Media Language* (pp. 95-103). NY: Routledge, 2003.
8. McLuhan, Marshal. *Razumijevanje medija*. Zagreb: Golden Marketing-Tehnička knjiga, 2008.
9. Millikan, Ruth Garrett. *Varieties of Meaning*. Cambridge, Massachusetts: A Bradford Book, 2004
10. Oberlander, J. and Gill, A.J. Language with character: A corpus-based study of individual differences in e-mail communication. *Discourse Processes*, 42(3) 239-270, 2006.
11. Senet, Ričard. *Kultura novog kapitalizma*. Beograd: Arhipelag, 2006.
12. Špago-Ćumurija, Edina. *Jezični element koda reklame CNN-a kao refleksija ukupnog komunikacijskog koda američkog društva*, doktorski rad, Univerzitet "Džemal Bijedić" u Mostaru, 2010.
13. Wierzbicka, Anna. Anglo scripts against "putting pressure" on other people and their linguistic manifestations. Cliff Goddard (Ed.). *Ethnopragnatics: understanding discourse in cultural context* (pp 31-36). Walter de Gruyter GmbH & Co. KG, D-Berlin, 2006.
14. Wunderlich, Jens-Uwe and Warriar, Meera. *A Dictionary of Globalization*, London and New York. Routledge, 2010.
15. Global Capital Markets Survey, 2006. <http://www.gcmsurvey.com>
16. The Economist, Media Information, http://ads.economist.com/fileadmin/PDFs/Research/GCM_2006.pdf
17. CNN, <http://www.cnn.com/>
18. Encyclopedia, www.encyclopedia.com/
19. Wikipedia, <http://www.wikipedia.org/>

HIBRIDNOST U GLOBALNOJ KOMUNIKACIJI: JEZIK CNN REKLAMA O FINANSIJAMA

Rezime

Komunikaciju u savremenom svijetu odlikuje hibridnost. Paralelni procesi su u toku: globalizacija komunikacije zahvaljujući masovnim medijima, pogotovo internetu, i povećavanje važnosti pojedinaca koji se sa bilo kojeg mjesta na svijetu mogu uključiti u globalnu komunikaciju.

Reklama kao moćno sredstvo komuniciranja na globalnom planu izašla je iz okvira ekonomskog i postala kulturološki fenomen. Veliki mediji poput CNN-a kreiraju reklamne poruke za globalno tržište, pokušavajući pomiriti globalne i lokalne vrijednosti i asocijativne sisteme pojedinih kulturnih i jezičnih zajednica.

Lingvistički zanimljiva pojava u reklamiranju u globalnim okvirima je susret znakova čija se konvencionalna značenjska i asocijativna vrijednost javlja u novom kontekstu, tjerajući primatelja poruke da pravi nove značenjske veze i asocijacije.

S obzirom na stav biološke teorije jezika, ali i kognitivne lingvistike da je jezik još jedan oblik senzorne percepcije svijeta, primatelj poruke najprije povjeruje a tek potom provjerava njenu istinitost. Tako će nedostajući elementi biti nadograđeni, a poruka biti smatrana vjerodostojnom ukoliko nema dokaza za suprotnu tvrdnju. Upravo na tom principu funkcioniše i reklamna poruka koja postaje kulturološki mem i kreira nove vrijednosti.

Rad daje primjere iz reklama iz oblasti finansija kao najbrojnijih na CNN-u. Analizom je uočeno izostajanje tipičnih asocijacija i značenja direktno povezanog sa novcem i materijalnim, a umjesto toga, pronađene su lekseme, koncepti i asocijacije tipične za duhovni i emotivni svijet čovjeka.

Na ovaj način ekonomski kontakti dviju ili više kultura nužno utiču i na kulturološke kontakte i jezičnu upotrebu, kreirajući drugačije spojeve konvencionalnih značenja i novih ideja, stvarajući tako nove, hibridne vrijednosti. Ovakvi procesi su dvosmjerni, pa duhovno postaje manipulativno, prodajući materijalno, ali u isto vrijeme se i jezik povezan sa materijalnim svijetom obogaćuje novim, humanim konceptima i idejama.

Ključne riječi: jezik reklame, masovni mediji, globalizacija, značenje

